



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

This thesis has been submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for a postgraduate degree (e.g. PhD, MPhil, DClinPsychol) at the University of Edinburgh. Please note the following terms and conditions of use:

- This work is protected by copyright and other intellectual property rights, which are retained by the thesis author, unless otherwise stated.
- A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge.
- This thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the author.
- The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the author.
- When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, awarding institution and date of the thesis must be given.

Desire for Perpetuation:
Fairy Writing and Re-creation of National Identity in the Narratives of
Walter Scott, John Black, James Hogg and Andrew Lang

Yuki Yoshino

A Thesis Submitted to
The University of Edinburgh
for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Department of English Literature

2013

Abstract

This thesis argues that ‘fairy writing’ in the nineteenth-century Scottish literature serves as a peculiar site which accommodates various, often ambiguous and subversive, responses to the processes of constructing new national identities occurring in, and outwith, post-union Scotland. It contends that a pathetic sense of loss, emptiness and absence, together with strong preoccupations with the land, and a desire to perpetuate the nation which has become state-less, commonly underpin the wide variety of fairy writings by Walter Scott, John Black, James Hogg and Andrew Lang. The disappearing fairies and elusive fairy queens who haunt subterranean realms, together with the immaterialised and etherealised homeland, are frequently depicted in the works of fairy writing explored in this study. While they metaphorise the loss of the state, the rightful monarch and the old national identity, they also serve to symbolically, and strategically, immortalise the Scottish nation through mythification and romanticisation within the subliminal textual layers of fairy writing.

Choosing four authors in Scottish literature, this thesis explores the spectrum of the wide range of fairy writing created during the long nineteenth century, shedding new light on the contrast, as well as the echoes, between Romantic and Victorian writing. It specifically suggests that fairy narratives by Black and Hogg display ironic self-consciousness of those who were involved in the processes of cultural nation-building in the post-union Britain.

This thesis also contends that Scottish fairy writing serves as a problematic site of experimentation where different genres, values and ideas clash and conflict, generating intensified tension, and rarely bringing negotiation without haunting aftertaste. It is contended that genre-mixing is a common methodological feature employed by the four authors, and moreover, that the act of genre-mixing itself is metaphorical of the creation of new and hybrid national identity, which also foregrounds its artificiality, inventedness and internal cracks.

This study reassesses a long-forgotten material: *The Falls of Clyde* (1806) by John Black. It also draws attention to the relatively ‘marginal’ texts by Scott and Hogg, and attempts a radical interpretation of Langian works, arguing that Lang played a significant role in the processes of the diasporic re-imagining of Scottishness which were arguably undertaken outside Scotland by Britishised elites, and are a neglected yet important part of post-Union Scottish nation writing.

Drawing on a wide range of texts and paratexts, this study foregrounds a profound complicity in the conceptions of Scotland and national identity inscribed in fairy narratives, perceiving the sub-genre as a site of realism rather than fantasy.

Acknowledgement

I would sincerely like to thank my supervisor Dr Sarah Dunnigan, whose inspiring supervisions and generosity have enabled me, in many aspects, to continue working on the thesis even through difficult moments. Without her warm encouragements, wide knowledge and insightful advice, this thesis would have remained but an unrealised fantasy.

I am deeply grateful to Ms Christianson, whose advice helped me to materialise this project at the earliest stage. Professor Gerard Carruthers, Professor Penny Fielding and Dr Robert Irvine provided illuminating feedbacks during my thesis defence, and helped me deepen the understanding of the poets, novelists and their works explored in the thesis.

I wish to express my gratitude towards Professor Ian Campbell for his warm and insightful encouragement. I also appreciate the supports provided by Dr Olga Taxidou and Dr Simon Malpas. Commentaries from Dr William Bell, together with the Edinburgh Book History Seminars, substantially widened my perspective. I was fortunate that I had numerous opportunities to learn from lectures and seminars given by Professor Peter Garside, Professor Harry Dickinson, Dr Emily Lyle and Dr Adam Budd, which were full of intellectual stimuli. I thank the rest of the staff at the University of Edinburgh, and in particular Ms Kate Marshall, Ms Anne Mason and Ms Louise Wilson for their helpful assistance. My gratitude extends toward the late Professor Julia Briggs and the late Professor Susan Manning.

I am profoundly indebted to Professor Kazuhisa Takahashi at the University of Tokyo, whose insightful advice and encouragement supported my longest exploration of the rhetoric of fairies. It was in his classes and researches that I first encountered the

inexplicable enchantment of literary studies and the richness of Scottish literature. I also wish to express my deep gratitude towards Professors Stephen Clark and George Hughes, for their generous supports and enlightening feedbacks. I am deeply grateful to Professors Hiroshi Ebine, Yoshiyuki Fujikawa, Takaki Hiraishi, Noriko Imanishi, Yoichi Ohashi, Motoyuki Shibata, Masahiko Abe and Nahoko Alvey-Miyamoto for the intellectual stimuli and encouragement they provided me. My sincere thanks also go to Professors Akira Noda, Takashi Akaiwa, Atsuko Oda, Toshihiro Inoue, Noriko Hattori, Seiki Ayano, Etsuko Yoshida, Koji Sugisaki, Osamu Sawada and the staff at the Faculty of Law, Economics and Humanities, Mie University, whose diverse academic pursuits widened my perspective at the final stage of the project.

Thanks are also due to Rotary Foundation which provided financial support for the first year of the project. Ms Christina Orr kindly encouraged me throughout my stay in Edinburgh. Rotary Clubs in Galashiels, Selkirk, Linlithgow and Portbello provided opportunities to visit several sites related to this project including Eildon Hills. I also thank the staff of the University of Edinburgh Library, the National Library of Scotland, the City of Edinburgh Library, the British Library, the Bodleian Library, Oxford, the University of Tokyo Library and Mie University Library, for their expert assistance.

Finally, my gratitude goes to my parents Yoshihiro and Kazuko Yoshino, and the rest of my family. This thesis is dedicated to my family.

Declaration

I hereby declare that the thesis has been composed by myself, that the work contained herein is my own except where explicitly stated otherwise in the text, and that the work has not been submitted for any other degree or professional qualification.

Table of Contents

<i>Abstract</i>	ii
<i>Acknowledgment</i>	iii
<i>Declaration</i>	v
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	1

Volume I

<u>Introduction</u>	4
<u>Part I: The Romantic Period</u>	19
Chapter One: Walter Scott	21
1.1 Introduction	
1.1.1 Fairies in Scott's Writing in the Context of Romantic Cultural Nationalism	21
1.1.2 Reception of Scott's Elfin Writing beyond Scotland	27
1.1.3 'My Native Country' and 'Our Immortal Shakespeare': Contradicting National Identities	32
1.1.4 Previous Studies of Fairies in Scott's Writing	34
1.1.5 Poet versus Folklorist: the Problem of Authenticity	38
1.2 <i>Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border</i> (1802)	
1.2.1 Ballad, Antiquarianism and the Literary Invention of Tradition	45
1.2.2. Genealogy of Fairies and National Culture: 'Introduction to the Tale of Tamlane: on the Fairies of Popular Superstition' ...	54
1.2.3. Invention of an Epical Ballad: 'Thomas the Rhymer'	62
1.3. 'The Lay of the Last Minstrel' (1805)	
1.3.1 Vernacular and Hybrid Epics	68

1.3.2	Enchanted Landscape and Nationalised Spirits	77
1.3.3	Changeling, Transformations and the Sense of Loss: Magical Beings and Problematised National Identity	83
1.3.4	Glamour and Grammarye: Illusions and Disillusions	100
1.4	<i>The Monastery</i> (1820): Exorcism of the Fairy as a National Soul	
1.4.1	Background, Setting and Sources of Inspiration	104
1.4.2	The White Lady	114
1.5	Conclusion	124
Chapter Two: John Black	126
2.1	Introduction	126
2.2	<i>The Falls of Clyde</i> as a War of Genres	128
2.3	Imagined Beings: Fairies Disenchanted	131
2.4	Changeling, Heir and Transformation: Anxiety of Existence, Problematised Identity and the Future of the Nation	136
2.5	Vanishing People and the ‘Decaying Dialect’: Cultural Nationalist View of Language and its Danger	143
2.6	‘A Scotchman’s Right to Adopt Fairy Way of Writing’: Fairy Writing as a Strategy of National Perpetuation	148
Chapter Three: James Hogg	162
3.1	Introduction.....	162
3.2	Farewell to Knowledge: a Subversive Exploration of the Origin of the Fairies..	164
3.3	Vanishing Fairies and Absence of Explanation: Sense of Emptiness in the ‘Elfin Athens of the North’	170

3.4	Aerial Fairies, Slipping Identities and Etherealised Scotland: Preoccupations with Land and Nation	176
3.5	The Ship and the Ruby: Representation of the British Empire	183
3.6	Part I Conclusion	188
	<u>Part II: The Victorian Period</u>	192
	Chapter Four: Andrew Lang	211
4.1	Introduction	211
4.2	Lang and the Scottish Tradition.....	227
4.3	Disenchanted Fairies: <i>The Princess Nobody</i>	246
4.4	A ‘Real’ Fairytale: <i>The Gold of Fairnilee</i>	250
4.5	Fairy Gifts and Commodity Culture: ‘Chronicles of Pantouflia’ and <i>The Rose and the Ring</i>	259
4.6	Part II Conclusion	275
	<u>Conclusion</u>	276
 Volume II		
	<u>Notes</u>	280
	<u>Bibliography</u>	303

List of Abbreviations

Part I: The Romantic Period

CSD: Concise Scots Dictionary.

Child *TL*: Child, Francis James, ed. ‘Tam Lin’.

Child *TR*: Child, Francis James, ed. ‘Thomas the Rhymer’.

DDV: The Doom of Devorgoil. (the *Devorgoil*)

Demonology: Scott, Walter. *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft.*

Dwarf: Scott, Walter. *The Black Dwarf.*

Eildon: Hogg, James. *The Hunt of Eildon.*

FC: Black, John. *The Falls of Clyde.*

ITRI: Scott, Walter. Introduction to ‘Thomas the Rhymer: Part First’.

ITRII: Scott, Walter. Introduction to ‘Thomas the Rhymer: Part Second’.

ITRIII: Scott, Walter. Introduction to ‘Thomas the Rhymer: Third Part’.

JGL Memoirs: Lockhart, John G.. *Memoirs of the Life of Sir Walter Scott, Bart.*

JGL Note: Lockhart, John G. Notes on *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border.*

Lake: Scott, Walter. *The Lady of the Lake.*

Lay: Scott, Walter. *Lay of the Last Minstrel.*

Monastery: Scott, Walter. *The Monastery.*

MSB: Scott, Walter. *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border.* (the *Minstrelsy*)

OED: The Oxford English Dictionary.

OF: Scott, Walter. ‘Introduction to the Tale of Tamlane: on the Fairies of Popular Superstition’ . (*On the Fairies*).

Origin: Hogg, James. ‘Origin of Fairies’.

Pilgrims: Hogg, James. 'The Pilgrims of the Sun'.

Rhymer: 'Thomas the Rhymer'.

STL: Scott, Walter, ed. 'The Tale of Tamlane'

STRI: Scott, Walter, ed. 'Thomas the Rhymer: Part First'.

STRII: Scott, Walter, ed. 'Thomas the Rhymer: Part Second'.

STRIII: Scott, Walter. 'Thomas the Rhymer: Third Part'.

Tamlin: 'Tam Lin'

Part II: The Victorian Period

Alice: Carroll, Lewis. *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland*

Blue: Lang, Andrew. *The Blue Fairy Book*

Brown: Lang, Andrew. *The Brown Fairy Book*

Crimson: Lang, Andrew. *The Crimson Fairy Book*

ODNB: *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*

Fairnilee: Lang, Andrew. *The Gold of Fairnilee*

Fairy Court: Lang, Andrew. *Tales of a Fairy Court*

FL: The Folk-Lore Society. *Folk-Lore: A Quarterly Review of Myth, Tradition,
Institution, & Custom*

Green: Lang, Andrew. *The Green Fairy Book*

Grey: Lang, Andrew. *The Grey Fairy Book*

In Fairyland: Doyle, Richard and William Allingham. *In Fairyland: Pictures from the
Elf World*

LFT: Lang, Andrew. 'Literary Fairy Tales'

Lilac: Lang, Andrew. *The Lilac Fairy Book*

Longmans: Longmans, Green, and Company

MFT: Lang, Andrew. ‘Modern Fairy Tales’

MND: Shakespeare, William. *A Midsummer Nights’ Dream*

OED: *Oxford English Dictionary*

Orange: Lang, Andrew. *The Orange Fairy Book*

Pink: Lang, Andrew. *The Pink Fairy Book*

Poetical Works: Lang, Andrew. *The Poetical Works of Andrew Lang.*

Preface to Blue: Lang, Andrew. Preface to *The Blue Fairy Book*

Preface to Brown: Lang, Andrew. Preface to *The Brown Fairy Book*

Preface to Crimson: Lang, Andrew. Preface to *The Crimson Fairy Book*

Preface to Green: Lang, Andrew. Preface to *The Green Fairy Book*

Preface to Grey: Lang, Andrew. Preface to *The Grey Fairy Book*

Preface to Lilac: Lang, Andrew. Preface to *The Lilac Fairy Book*

Preface to Orange: Lang, Andrew. Preface to *The Orange Fairy Book*

Preface to Violet: Lang, Andrew. Preface to *The Violet Fairy Book*

Preface to Yellow: Lang, Andrew. Preface to *The Yellow Fairy Book*

Prigio: Lang, Andrew. *Prince Prigio*

Princess: Lang, Andrew. *The Princess Nobody*

Red: Lang, Andrew. *The Red Fairy Book*

Ricardo: Lang, Andrew. *Prince Ricardo*

Rose: Thackeray, William. *The Rose and the Ring*

Violet: Lang, Andrew. *The Violet Fairy Book*

Yellow: Lang, Andrew. *The Yellow Fairy Book*

Introduction

This thesis explores literary representations of fairies in the narratives of Walter Scott, John Black, James Hogg, and Andrew Lang. Through the examinations of the wide range of fairy narratives weaved by these authors, it argues that their act of writing about fairies was a creative response to, among other various issues, the on-going processes of the construction of an ‘enlightened’, ‘modernised’, and arguably in reality, anglicised new national identity of the Scottish nation as ‘North Britain’.

In her study of literary as well as visual representations of fairies in British art and literature in the Victorian period Nicola Bown aptly demonstrates that the representations of fairies in the period, characteristically convey a sense of loss, anxiety, fears, and disillusionments towards the modernised and industrialised world: ‘The Victorian dreamed of fairies, who worked a small enchantment for them, and gave them back the wonder and mystery modernity had taken away from the world. They made the fairies into imaginary versions of themselves, and imagined fairyland as a version of the world they themselves inhabited’ (1). Bown’s view of fairies is applicable to the analyses of Scottish fairy narratives. Yet, from a careful reading of the works by Scott, Black, Hogg and Lang, an amplified view emerges that the ‘anxieties’, ‘fear’, ‘disillusionment’ and ‘sense of loss, absence and emptiness’ saturating the text of Scottish fairy writing are profoundly haunted by their concern with the fate and future of their nation, which are imbued with cultural nationalistic sentiments and values.

It is my contention that ‘fairy writing’, in nineteenth-century Scotland, served as a peculiar site which accommodated various, and very often ambiguous, ironic, pathetic or nostalgic, kinds of anxieties, desires and dilemma. The emotional turmoil primarily arose out of the ‘national matters’ in the aftermath of the Act of Union in 1707,

which made the Scottish nation state-less. Being a marginal, and often despised genre of writing, fairy writing served as a 'subterranean' outlet, to accommodate the ambivalent, emotional, and cultural nationalistic responses towards the nation and the union, which could not be voiced in other more 'legitimate' and canonical genres: those 'serious' genres which, written in the 'Standard' English, were designed for those 'enlightened' readers, who were eager to learn Standard English and negotiate with Britishness, to play active parts in the brave new world of the British Empire.

Significantly, the loss of the Scottish 'state' particularly affected the way fairies and fairylands were depicted. The commonly evoked motifs in Scottish fairy narratives, that is, the peculiar preoccupations with the land, the numerous imageries of exceedingly immaterialised, etherealised and dissolving Scotlands and fairylands, elusive and disappearing fairies and the Fairy Queens haunting the shadowy and deadly subterranean realm, echo the loss of the state, and the absence of a rightful monarch. Further, fears of dissolution and absorption by England are also inscribed in the figures of airy and vanishing spirits. Arguably, confusion was caused by the imposed new 'North British' identity; to a varying degree, it conflicted with the old identity of the community as Scotland, disrupted the self-definition of the community, and disturbed the sense of where the people of Scotland belonged. Such confusion is projected onto the figure of a 'hybrid' and 'cosmopolitan' goblin; the character shaped under the influence of various kinds of fairy representation sourced from international traditions.

Significantly, numerous works of fairy writing revolve around a peculiar desire; a desire to perpetuate, though symbolically, the Scottish nation. Through the mythification, romanticisation, or 'elf-fashioning' of the nation in their narratives, authors of fairy narratives strategically sought to create their own myths, which

symbolically immortalise the ‘national soul’ and its identity, within the subliminal and subterranean layers of writing.

This thesis also contends that fairy writing served as a problematic site of experimentation where different genres, values, and ideas clash and conflict, generating intensified tension, and rarely bringing negotiation without a haunting aftertaste. Genre-mixing, in particular, is the methodological feature commonly employed by the four authors examined in this study. Materials from disparate genres, including traditional ballads, invented ballads, disproportionately lengthy ‘dissertations’ which deconstruct the romanticised image of fairies, justifications and apologies, are stitched together to fabricate an apparently unified whole: a book. A book, which in reality generates contradictions, tensions and discordances between the different kinds of material within it. Significantly, the hybrid ‘fairy book’, full of contradictions and disenchantments, together with the act of genre-mixing to produce it, metaphorises the creation of hybrid national identity in Britain in the name of ‘British’ identity in the real world. Further, it also foregrounds the artificiality and, even, fabrication in its making. Through the analysis of a wide spectrum of fairy writing created during the long nineteenth century, covering both the Romantic period and the Victorian period, this study aims to capture the transitional as well as unchanging features of fairy representations, as well as the creativity of each author. Further, its ultimate aim is to uncover and consider the complexity and multilayered-ness in the processes of the construction of ‘Britishness’ in the nineteenth century.

The term ‘fairy writing’ was often used by the scholars exploring representations of fairies to refer to the wide range of narratives across diverse genres,

which deal with the subject of fairies. The examples of the usage of the term include those in Stella Beddoe's study (1997), where she does not provide a definition of the term. Sarah Dunnigan defines it as a form of 'writing which directly portrays fairies, goblins, and other such supernatural creatures' (unpublished conference paper, 2007). In this study, by the same term, I refer to a wide range of written narrative including both fictional and nonfictional ones, para-texts and the main bodies of text, which deal with fairies both directly and indirectly.

Some works of fairy writing deploy fairies as a subject matter, a key constituent character, and an emphatic motif, and accord them a strong presence in the textual space. On the other hand, there are other narratives which seemingly use fairies merely as a figurative ornament to give the text an airy touch, a decorative framing of the narrative in pseudo Greco-Roman style or, as in various satires, a metonymy pointing to human beings existing in reality such as monarchs and politicians. In Hogg's *Brownie of Bodsbeck* (1818), fairies appear only figuratively as an underworld slang, which was used by the people in a village in the Borders to shelter a group of Covenanters.

Regardless of what kind of roles elfin characters or metaphors are given in it, I consider a literary work as fairy writing if it contains any reference to fairies. This method is based on the view that even the figurative fairies could have some role, at least in the linguistic dimensions of the text, adding subtle nuances.

'Fairy writing' is distinguished from the term 'fairytale' in that the former covers both fictional, non-fictional, traditional and original texts. Fairy writing also includes para-textual materials such as apologies, justifications, prefaces, introductions, notes and letters.

In numerous previous studies, primarily in the discipline of folklore, the term ‘fairy’ has been regarded as problematic, because of its ambiguity. Many studies found it difficult to define it. The high-degree of ambiguity of it is one of the defining features of fairies.

Fairies tend to be defined as various kinds of supernatural beings, often imagined as possessing fantastic capacities. Conventionally, the definition includes the sub-categories of fays, elves, dwarfs, spirits, goblins, orks, giants, dryads, naiads, fauns and devils. Very often, distinctions between these sub-categories are unclear. The widely accepted consensus is that they are magical, supernatural and of ‘middling sort’, blurring the borders between deity and human. From a euhemerizing perspective, they are viewed as reminiscences of pagan deities and indigenous people.

Often imagined as fallen angels, devils, diminished figures of deities, they tend to be more magical than human beings, but much less powerful and noble than deities. Gods and ghosts are conventionally not regarded as fairies, because fairies are far less powerful and divine than gods, and because they are not representations of dead human beings. The closer distance between fairies and human beings is another distinguishing feature leading to numerous depictions of fairies intervening in everyday life of human characters. Characteristically, fairies tend to be closely linked to a specific locality. They often help or tease human beings. They can be friendly, though sometimes they are imagined as perilous. Furthermore, in a similar manner to the ghosts described in literature, fairies are often selective, and can be seen by only a limited number of human characters. They thus blur the border between visibility and invisibility, materiality and immateriality, and presence and absence.

It has often been argued that Shakespeare made fairies smaller. Many fairy representations created during the Victorian period endorse Shakespeare's tradition and portray small, lovely, childlike and playful figures of fairies. Those imagined in Scottish traditional ballads, are, however, tall, fearful, perilous and gigantic. Numerous works, including Robert Kirk's *The Secret Commonwealth of Elves, Fauns and Fairies* (c.1692), imagine fairies as constituting their own kingdom with a Fairy Queen or King reigning. Significantly, the 'Fairy Queen' is an emblematic character recurrently depicted in numerous works of Scottish fairy writing in the nineteenth century. Further, as depicted by Christina Rossetti, grotesqueness is another common feature of fairies. Bown argues that fairies, especially 'grotesque' ones, serve to disrupt the culturally and socially constructed sense of harmony and scale. In addition, she aptly points out that they are representations of the local rather than the exotic, and, self rather than other.

By the term 'cultural nationalism', I refer to a form of ideology which seeks to define and claim the antiquity, authenticity, uniqueness, legitimacy, and in extreme cases, 'purity' and 'superiority' of a nation by means of various kinds of cultural artefact which include language, history, tradition, custom, myth and folklore. Anthony D. Smith aptly argues that cultural artefacts including myths, allegedly 'shared' memories, and nationalised 'heroes', are conventionally employed to create and strengthen the unity of the community. Cultural nationalists often show sentimental and emotional attachment towards their often mythified nation. In extremist cases, as shown by the instances of Nazism, they discriminate the cultural other on account of their alleged

‘impurity’.

This study has drawn on, in particular, the following studies on literary representations of fairies, in order to determine and refine its interpretive methodology. The conceptions employed in this study to determine and refine its interpretive methodology are those developed in the following studies, such as: ‘sense of loss’ and ‘response to modernity’ by Nicola Bown; ‘elf-fashioning’, ‘fairies as a panegyric device’, ‘inscription of the self-consciousness of the poet as a participant of mythmaking process’ by Mathew Woodcock; Stephanie Barczewski’s formulation of ‘national heroes’ as ‘agents of cultural nationalist discourse’ playing crucial roles in the making of myths, and of their foregrounding of the ‘cracks’ in the assumed unity of the nation; David Duff’s analyses of the significance of genres and genre-mixing in the Romantic literature; and, finally, Penny Fielding’s study of the inscriptions and implications of geography and spatial identity in the writing of Burns, Scott and Hogg, which explores the question of how their narratives destabilised and problematized Romantic conceptions of the place, space and the local, while also disrupting the processes of the conceptual British nation building.

First, Bown’s *Fairies in Nineteenth Century Art and Literature* (2001) is an interdisciplinary study which mainly covers ‘British’ materials. Though she uses the term ‘British’, paying attention to their imperialist ideological underpinnings, the materials examined in her study tend to be those published in England. In the study Bown makes an important claim that visual and literary fairy representations in

nineteen-century Britain reflect anxieties, a sense of loss, disenchantment and nostalgic sentiments, as a response to the processes of modernization, urbanisation, industrialization and development of science and technology. This thesis started from the careful consideration of the following two assertions made by Bown: that fairies are ‘local rather than exotic, and many saw them as peculiarly British, part of a national culture’ (2), and that ‘Nationalism, particularly in relation to Scotland and Ireland, was an important political and social issue during the period, and the representation of fairies was much affected by nationalist ideas’ (4). Bown’s definition of fairies as ‘local’ beings overlaps with the argument by Lizanne Henderson and Edward J. Cowan, pointing out an important feature of fairy representation, that fairies are characteristically associated with land and locality. My thesis places these two important claims in the context of cultural nationalism. It chiefly argues that the ‘sense of loss’, together with the artificial and often forceful ‘linkage of fairies’ to particular locality, are also crucial features of Scottish fairy narrative. Further, it contends that these features operate as vitally important constituents of Romantic cultural nationalist discourse, which effectively appeal to emotions and serve to reinforce patriotic feelings.

Second, *Fairy in The Faerie Queene: Renaissance Elf-Fashioning and Elizabethan Myth-Making* (2004) by Matthew Woodcock examines the ‘textual ontology of fairies’ in Spenser’s *Faerie Queene*, exploring the way they are literally represented and employed in the epic. In particular, Woodcock’s study reveals a crucial role of fairies as a panegyric as well as mythopoetic device, which can be used to celebrate and authenticate a particular monarch through the effect of ‘fashioning’, deliberately associating the monarch with elves and fairies. Woodcock’s conception of

mythmaking as a process of fashioning is clearly underpinned by Stephen Greenblatt's formulation that in sixteenth century England, human identity was perceived as something fashioned, dressed and performed, and 'the fashioning of human identity' was seen as a 'manipulable, artful process' (Greenblatt 2). Such views deny essentialist definition of the self, and also negates essentialist conceptions of nation and national character. Through the denial of essentialist conceptions of self and identity, Greenblatt seems to be complicit with a series of studies by Benedict Anderson and Hugh Trevor-Roper, both of whom stressed the inventedness and constructedness of community, tradition and culture.

Significantly, Wood's conception of 'elf-fashioning' serves to anatomise the process of myth-making, revealing the crucial roles of poets in it. While the term 'elf-fashioning' does not only refers to the monarch who is fashioned, it also foregrounds the roles and self-reflexiveness of the poet who serves to dress the monarch with the verbal costume designed and created by himself.

Spenser does not present a straightforward, unmediated representation of Elizabeth as Gloriana, but offers instead a more reflexive commentary on the process of using fairy to represent the queen, and in doing so foregrounds his own role within this process. Spenser's 'elf-fashioning' is therefore a vital part of his authorial self-fashioning. (Woodcock vi)

Wood thus deconstructs the political process of mythmaking as the one which involves the act of fashioning, and the one in which the dressed-monarch is complicit with the poet who designs and dresses her. His claim that Spenser inscribes his self-consciousness as the maker of the poem within the text of *The Faerie Queene* is

applied to my analysis of self-reflexiveness found in the works of Black and Hogg.

Further, the conceptions of dressing and fashioning formulated by Greenblatt serve to foreground arbitrariness in the processes of self-definition, clearly negating the idea of essentialist self-definition: “in sixteenth-century England there were both selves and a sense that they could be fashioned” (Greenblatt 1); and

as a term for the action or process of making, for particular features or appearance, for a distinct style or pattern, the word had been long in use, but it is in the sixteenth century that *fashion* seems to come into wide currency as a way of designating the forming of a self. (Greenblatt 2, the author’s emphasis)]

In addition to human individuals who endorses in self-fashioning—‘after all, there are always selves [...] and always some elements of deliberate shaping in the formation and expression of identity’ (Greenblatt 1)—communities, including nation, are also perceived as something which can be dressed, fashioned, manipulated and performed:

Woodcock’s argument seems to presuppose that fairies as a conception have positive and powerful connotations, which can benefit the monarch through self-fashioning—that is, through the association with fairies. In fact, his claim that fairies in the Spenserian epic serve as an agent of myth-making is clearly applicable to a number of works of Scottish literature, which implicitly allude to Mary Queen of Scots through the figure of ‘Fairy Queen’. Nevertheless, Woodcock does not make clear why fairies—imagined beings which, in traditional fairy beliefs deriving from various different civilisations, are characteristically evoked as ugly, grotesque, perilous and marginal—could have such important roles, powers and authorities. Further, Woodcock does not seem to answer his central question of ‘why in particular Spenser

should use fairy mythology in the celebration and glorification of Elizabeth' (v).

Third, *Myth and National Identity in Nineteenth-Century Britain: the Legends of King Arthur and Robin Hood* (2000) by Stephanie L. Barczewski analyses the 'essential' role of mythic and heroic figures in the processes of mythmaking and creation of national identity, primarily covering materials from England and Wales. Her argument that the mythmaking efforts through the deployment of mythic figures 'reveal some severe cracks in the façade of national unity' (2) is useful in the consideration of the function of fairies in the construction of Scottish national identity.

David' Duff's recent study *Romanticism and the Uses of Genre* (2009) is an innovative work on genre theory, which explores the Romantic use and 'preoccupation' with genre. It is beneficial to the understanding of the significance of genre-mixing in the fairy narratives.

Finally, this thesis also consulted Penny Fielding's *Scotland and the Fictions of Geography* (2008). Chapter Six from her study explores the problematised spatial identity in Hogg's 'arctic' works. The chapter helps to clarify the implication of the peculiarly immaterialised textual space in Hogg's fairy narrative, which evokes etherealised fairyland and Scotland, underpinned by strong preoccupations with land and a sense of directionless-ness.

In addition, to acquire fundamental knowledge regarding literal, historical, cultural, geographical, editorial and interpretative background of Scottish fairy writing, this thesis draws on the following works: *An Anthology of Scottish Fantasy Literature* (1996) edited by Colin Manlove; *Scottish Fairy Belief* (2001) by Lizanne Henderson and Edward J. Cowan; *Fairies and Folk* (2007) by Emily Lyle; and a series of recent

papers by Sarah Dunnigan: *The Scottish Ballads* (2005), 'Scottish Fairy Tale: Collectors and Creators in the Early Nineteenth Century' (Unpublished Conference Paper, 2007), and 'Fairy Tales and Scottish Culture' (Unpublished Lecture, 2007). Conducted by scholars of Scottish literature, culture and/or oral tradition, with differing methods and perspectives, these works constitute a spectrum of studies on fairies in Scottish culture and literature, offering exhaustive insights. Manlove's anthology draws a historical chart of Scottish fantasy literature, and provides a corpus of original texts with literary analysis. The study by Henderson and Cowan is an encyclopaedic work which covers diverse materials of both orality and writing, offering detailed information. Lyle's research into Scottish fairy ballad also provides exhaustive information and analyses regarding the historical, cultural, geographical and editorial backgrounds. Each of the studies by Dunnigan focuses on a specific topic, developing in-depth case studies.

In addition, this thesis is also a response to the following suggestion by David Buchan: '[T]he Romantics' transmutation of folk literature and their creation of seemingly folk-ish elements of the Romantic apparatus together constitute a complex but potentially rewarding topic of research, one which could reveal significant strand in the artistic imagination of Romantic writers' (92). This thesis chiefly aims to explore how each author creatively responded to various issues and concerns in their contemporary world through their representations and appropriations of fairies. Its primary aim is not to identify the sources of inspirations for writers weaving fairy narrative in an old-historicist fashion. It revalues invented fairy narratives as a form of verbal art, though they were once rejected as 'fake-lore' by the Victorian folklorists.

Through the examination of the spectrum of fairy writing by the four different authors, this thesis draws an epitomised chart of the discourse and rhetoric of fairies in nineteenth-century Scotland. It has drawn on a wide range of primary texts, which includes a number of paratextual materials because the contrast and tension between the paratext and the main body of fairy writing are often highly significant. It also calls for renewed attention to a long-forgotten text: *The Falls of Clyde* (1806) by John Black, which is an exceptional piece of fairy writing. This work displays extraordinary indifference toward the subject of fairies, as well as ironic self-reflexiveness foregrounding the artificiality of the act of writing fairies. Immediately after he deconstructs fairies in a most disillusioning fashion, Black goes on to create a fairy narrative of his own.

In addition, attempts to reevaluate relatively ‘marginal’ texts by Scott and Hogg are also made. Works by Andrew Lang, which have tended to be neglected by critics, are also explored in detail. Drawing on a wide range of primary texts, including a number of paratextual materials, it foregrounds the contrasts and tensions between contradictory attitudes towards the Scottish national identity, which conflict and clash with one another, in the enchanted realms evoked by fairy writing.

This thesis is divided into two parts. Part I covers the Romantic Period, followed by Part II: Victorian period.

Part I comprises three chapters: Chapter One: Walter Scott; Chapter Two: John Black; and Chapter Three: James Hogg. Part I starts with the establishment of the interpretative framework of the thesis through the examination of backgrounds and fundamental issues raised by a close reading of various fairy narratives by Scott.

Chapter One comprises detailed and comparative analyses of fairy writing by Scott. The analyses, through the contextualisation of fairy representations within the framework of Romantic cultural nationalism in Europe, explore how individual authors in Scotland creatively responded to various contemporary, and in particular the ‘national’ issues surrounding them. Further, Chapter One will also discuss key conceptions and issues raised by the reading of Scott’s works, which are resonant throughout various works of fairy writing in the nineteenth century.

Chapters Two and Three explore experimental works of fairy writing by John Black and James Hogg. They will demonstrate that, while Scott’s profound influences are recognizable in their treatments of fairies both as subject matter and literary device, their works display exceptional originality, complexity, experimentation and self-reflexiveness which foreground the artificiality and constructedness of national identity.

Part II attempts a comparative study through focusing on fairy writing in the Victorian period. As a case study, Chapter Four explores the fairy narratives by Andrew Lang, a literary figure and folklorist who was engaged in writing mostly in London in the late Victorian period. This part aims to undertake a comparative study of fairy narratives in different periods. In doing so, it demonstrates that Lang’s works present striking differences from the works by the other three authors. While the influence of Scott is resonant, and his fairy narratives are clearly underpinned by cultural nationalist ideology, Lang’s fairy writing is loaded with other kinds of concerns and anxieties as a response to the drastically disparate environment. Chapter Three will explore the various kinds of issues foregrounded by Lang’s fairy narrative. These issues include industrialization, commodity culture and literary market in London,

folklorists, anthropologists and the problem of authenticity, preoccupation with the idea of child, and commodity culture.

Part I: The Romantic Period

Part I undertakes a comparative study of fairy writing by Walter Scott, John Black and James Hogg. The period they inhabited witnessed the radical and rapid development of cultural nationalist discourse across Europe, which culminated in the ‘folk revival’, a movement of national myth-making through the ‘discovery’, collection, textualisation, appropriation, fabrication and even forgery of orally related traditional material.

Recent studies examining the history and characteristics of Romantic cultural nationalism often emphasise that grass-root ‘folk’ was actively involved and complicit in the development and justification of the ideology. Various movements of ‘folk revival’ by middle-class intellectuals and antiquarians, including the Brothers Grimm in Germany, constitute a characteristic feature of the ‘grass-root’ development of Romantic cultural nationalism. In Scotland, David Hume, among other intellectuals, played a significant role in the ‘promotion’ of Macpherson, which reveal ‘his desire, and that of other Scottish intellectual figures, to orchestrate and articulate a canon of Scottish literature which would vindicate that nation’s cultural maturity to the outside world’ (Carruthers and Whyte 113).

Scotland occupies a significant and exceptional place in the Romantic period. While it made an interesting parallel with Germany, which was another state-ness nation, it attracted various artists and literary figures across Europe, not only enthralling Hans Christian Andersen, but also inspired numerous composers, who had never visited Scotland at all, to compose pieces of idealised ‘ecossaise’.

It could be said that Scotland during the period was still in the aftermath of the Act of Union in 1707, which drastically shaken their conception and representation

of national identity. Predating, and interacting with, the 'Folk Revival' in the European continent, but with clearly different methods and attitudes, middle-class intellectuals and antiquarians were involved, with enthusiasm and often with ironic self-consciousness, in the processes of cultural 'nation-building', through the collection, appropriation and invention of various forms of 'national' and 'traditional' cultural artefacts. Reflecting the political, social and cultural milieu, fairy writing during the period is shaped as national mythography. Significantly, the sense of loss, together with the fear of dissolution, is a crucial motif which commonly characterises fairy writing by Scott, Black and Hogg.

Chapter One: Walter Scott

1.1 Introduction

1.1.1 Fairies in Scott's Writing in the Context of Romantic Cultural Nationalism

This chapter seeks to demonstrate the vital and problematic roles of fairies in the construction and exploration of Scottish national identity, as agents of cultural nationalist discourse, in selected works by Walter Scott. It argues that his representation of fairies, together with his reinvention of fairy tales, can be perceived as a neglected, yet nonetheless important part of Scottish and European Romantic nationalism. The following works will be primarily examined: *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border* (1802), *The Lay of the Last Minstrel* (1805) and *The Monastery* (1820); with references also to *The Lady of the Lake* (1810), *The Black Dwarf* (1816) and *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft* (1830)¹. These texts have been selected because the featured fairies, who play crucial roles both in terms of character and narrative device, serve as a significant vehicle by which Scott explored his anxieties regarding the Scottish nation and its national identity. Written at different stages of his creative life and incorporating a variety of different genres, considerations of these texts reveal that fairies occupied an important place in Scott's literary imagination and accounted for a significant part of his motivation throughout his career. As this chapter will demonstrate, fairies in these works, often intentionally nationalised, reflect the course of Scott's changing ideas about fairies, which in turn mirrors the transition of his ideas about the nation. It seems plausible that there was something about fairies and the genre of 'fairy writing' which had a capacity to liberate Scott from his official, 'rational' standpoint as a unionist. As a genre inevitably dealing with the 'other world',

fairly writing may well have served as a literary subliminal or subterranean realm which accommodated Scott's more emotional responses to the issues of the nation and the union, and which would otherwise have remained unspoken and repressed in contexts where he was perhaps required to assume the guise of unionist.

A well established consensus found in the scholarship pertaining to Walter Scott (1771-1832) is that issues surrounding the subject of the nation played vital roles as both the motivation behind his body of works and its subject matter. As Cairns Craig aptly argues, Scott investigated 'the new forms of the nation to which the nineteenth century gave birth' ('Scott's Staging of the Nation', n.pag.). In particular, the *Waverley Novels*, the genre wherein he attempted a variety of innovative experimentations, served as the crucial vehicle by which Scott represented the nation and explored the issues concerning national identity in a dynamic manner. Their influence reached beyond Scotland, even inspiring some nineteenth-century English novelists to write 'Anglo-Saxon' historical novels which narrated the process of nation-building, clearly emulating Scott's novels as exemplified by *Ivanhoe* (1820).²

A variety of studies exploring a range of Scott's works have inevitably paid their central attentions to the concept of the nation and national identity from a variety of perspectives, often culminating in the debate questioning his attitude toward the union of Scotland and England. Subverting an established consensus founded by David Daiches, that Scott was fundamentally a unionist with 'ambiguous', sentimental and nostalgic view of the pre-Union Scotland, a radical study by Julian Meldon D'Arcy aptly foregrounds 'Scott's nationalist feelings'(21), highlighting his desire to symbolically perpetuate the Scottish nation. D'Arcy convincingly argues that though Scott 'begrudgingly' accepted the '(then) apparent necessity of the Union', he was

‘determined to maintain a distinct Scottish presence within the United Kingdom’(21). Significantly, from a careful reading of the wide range of fairy writing across diverse genres by Scott, emerges a view which supports D’Arcy’s argument.

Scarcely any attention has been paid to the idiosyncratic roles which fairies often played in Scott’s ‘imagining’ of the nation. When Scott’s fairies were to receive critical attention, in a considerably limited number of studies, they have tended to have been perceived as symbols of imagination, as exemplified in Patricia Harkin’s study of *The Monastery*. Through paying particular attention to how Scott creatively appropriates traditional ballads, and how he experimentally mixes genres in the presentation of his fairies, this chapter attempts a new reading of Scott’s fairy writing, and to reconsider his ‘ambiguous’ attitude towards the nation and union as reflected in the figure of elves.

Fairies in Scott’s works often embody Scottishness and its national identity. His fairy narratives are often saturated by a sense of loss, disappearance and directionless-ness, revealing anxieties of existence and identity accompanied by contradictory attitudes and forced attempts to negotiate or repress the dilemma. I interpret all of these emotional complexities as responses to Scotland’s loss of the state, independence and her old identity, resulting from the Act of Union. His creations of ‘hybrid’ fairies inspired by international fairy beliefs, as well as his depictions of the disappearance of traditional fairies, echo the creation of a new national identity as ‘North Britain’ in the world in reality, and can be perceived as an ‘enlightened’ attempt to adjust to the ‘modernised’, ‘progressing’, seemingly ‘cosmopolitan’ but arguably, in reality, anglicising environment in the post-Union Scotland. Paradoxically, fairies in Scott’s works also manifest a desire to perpetuate the national identity of Scotland.

Perceived as reminiscences of indigenous people and pagan deities, fairies in Scott's works are closely linked to numerous specific locations in Scotland, as though the ethereal and supernatural fairylands are pinned down to the solid geography of Scotland. Often depicted as a monarch or nobility ('Fairy Queen' and 'White Lady'), they evoke an imagery of an independent kingdom with the rightful monarch. Created in such a manner, fairies represent Scott's cultural nationalistic attempts to perpetuate the Scottish nation through mythmaking and an emphasis on its antiquity, legitimacy and unique culture and tradition. Paradoxically, the elusiveness of fairies and their tendency to disappear, which constitute common features of fairies in traditional fairy belief across Europe, ironically metaphorise the loss of the state, with the sense of absence intensified.

As rightly argued by Sarah Dunnigan, Scott occupied a central position of the Scottish Romantic fairy writing context, amongst numerous antiquarians and literary figures who contributed to the early phases of the 'revival' of fairytales and folklore in late eighteenth and nineteenth century Europe: 'if you unravel the web of connections between all the writers interested in Scottish fairies, or the connection between fairies and Scotland, whether from literary, antiquarian, historical, folkloristic perspectives [...] all threads lead back to Scott' ('Fairy Tales and Scottish Culture' 15). Scott's influence was resonant throughout the nineteenth century; his influence can be located in the works of John Leyden, Allan Cunningham, John Black and James Hogg, as well as Andrew Lang in the late Victorian period. The traces of his influence can even be detected in the definitions of terms in the field of folklore studies up to the twenty-first century. Furthermore, the fundamental methodological and ideological features of his fairy writing, that is, creative appropriation, genre-mixing and cultural nationalist

anxieties, also underpin the works of Black, Hogg and Lang.

It is significant that fairy writing by Scott often became a target of sharp criticism primarily because of his appropriation of the ‘authentic’ material. His invention of original and pseudo-ancient ballads, and the mixed presentation of authentic and invented ballads in *The Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border* (1802) often led to negative evaluation and indifferences from later folklorists whose concern was centred on the question of authenticity and forgery; authenticity was a cultural value which haunted many of the antiquarians and folklorists in nineteenth century Britain. Significantly, Scott’s apparent indifference to reproducing the ‘tradition’ in his fairy narrative in its authentic state is shared by Black, Hogg, and Lang. None of them seem to prioritise the preservation of authentic materials, but instead, they are rather willing to weave their own original fairy narrative inspired by traditional ones—possibly because of their awareness of the need of appropriation in the rapidly changing and, arguably, anglicising Scotland. Nevertheless, it is significant that they consistently allude to the traditional fairy belief, historic figures and geographic features of Scotland; in short, though they are willing to creatively appropriate the traditional narrative, and freely use the genre of fairy writing as a site to experimentally explore their own literary, political or private concerns, their original writing is never completely detached from Scotland, her landscape and her tradition. They tend to make sure to preserve a kind of symbolic link to the traditional narrative, which they perceive as a root of their imagination with a sense of belonging. They are eager to nationalise and antique their original works, frequently presenting them with arbitrary subtitles such as ‘A Scottish Tale’ and ‘An Ancient Tale’. Fairy narratives created by them are thus complicit with cultural nationalist discourse. While their national *and* hybrid fairies

invoke Herderian conceptions of nation as an entity rooted in, as well as authenticated by, the ancient past and specific territory, they reveal and highlight its inventedness and arbitrariness.

Notably, the act of appropriation has historically and often characteristically been associated with cultural nationalist biases, and has been repeated by various authors beyond Scotland across disparate periods.³ For instance, focusing particularly on England of the Anglo-Saxon period, John D. Niles argues that the Anglo-Saxon period ‘abounds’ with examples of ‘creative’ appropriation (206). It has been argued that appropriations of Anglo-Saxons, underpinned by anglo-saxonism, have been repeated in English literature from the thirteenth to the twentieth century (Scragg and Weinberg).⁴

Another feature which characterises Scott’s fairy writing is his innovative genre-mixing which occurred in the construction of various works of fairy writing. For instance, in the *Minstrelsy*, Scott frames the mixture of his original ballads and traditional ones by lengthy ‘Introductory Essays’. The methodology of genre-mixing in his construction of fairy narrative is deeply related to his conception of Scottish national identity. The old ballad representing the old identity, and the newly invented ones, are not only juxtaposed, but are stitched together and framed by the lengthy and logically written ‘Introductory Essays’, to fabricate a book as a unified whole. Significantly, the ‘Introductory Essays’, though seemingly rational, are in fact ambiguous. Scott draws a genealogical chart of the traditional fairy belief in Europe and Middle East in an enlightened and cosmopolitan manner, stressing the common ancestry and characteristics between Scottish tradition and European ones. At the same time, he also insists on the uniqueness of Scottish fairies. Further, the text of the

Minstrelsy, conflating disparate genres, is not seamless. The ‘borders’ between different genres are clearly left visible, foregrounding the artificiality and inventedness of the ‘unity’ of the book. In short, the composition of the book of the *Minstrelsy* can be interpreted as a metaphor for Scotland: the old and new identities represented by ballads, which are fundamentally disparate to each other, are forcefully stitched together by the ‘logical’ and ‘rational’ prose to fabricate a unified Britain, but the border remains exposed, generating tension. Significantly, the methodology of genre-mixing in the creation of fairy narrative is emulated by Black, Hogg and Lang. As the following chapters will argue more extensively, the debatable textual realm in the fairy writing of Black and Hogg, created by genre-mixing, causes even more intensified tension between the constituting texts of disparate genres.

1.1.2 Reception of Scott’s Elfin Writing beyond Scotland

As is rightly observed by Carol Silver, Scott evidently played a significant part in ‘legitimizing’ the study of fairies in early nineteenth century Britain (‘Sir Walter Scott’ 456). Although abundant evidence suggests that he occupied a vital place in the circulation of international fairytales inside Britain, and his influence reached far beyond Scotland, he is hardly mentioned in Jennifer Schacker’s study of the circulation of fairytales in nineteenth-century England. It is difficult to understand why the omission occurred because Schacker includes analyses on the collections of Irish fairy tales by Thomas Crofton Croker (1798-1854).⁵

The dedicatory letters to Scott from Edgar Taylor (1793-1839) and Croker, both of whom produced most popular and canonical fairytale collections which, reprinted and republished recurrently in Britain throughout nineteenth century, represent the

cultural climate of the period. One of the later editions of *German Popular Stories and Fairy Tales* (first published in 1823), Taylor's translation of the Brothers Grimm's collection of *Kinder- und Hausmärchen* (1812), includes, at the end of the book, quotations from a letter from Scott to Taylor. The letter is dated 16 January 1823, and was written upon the reception of the first edition of the book (1823) sent by Taylor. In the letter, Scott wrote: 'I have to return my best thanks for the very acceptable present your goodness has made me, in your interesting volume of German tales and traditions. I have often wished to see such a work undertaken by a gentleman of taste sufficient to adapt the simplicity of the German narratives to our own, which you have done so successfully' (Scott, 'To Edgar Taylor, Esq' 214). The anonymous editor of the edition published in 1839, presumably Taylor himself, not only included the quotation from this letter in his edition, but also mentioned Scott in his Preface. The editor thus emphasises the link between his book and Scott, presumably in order to give his book 'weighty' authority by quoting favourable comments of the famous 'Author of the Waverley'. Further, the editor possibly sought to corroborate his views on fairytale as a genre which deserves an adult (and 'gentleman') readership, rather than being limited exclusively to children: 'In this feeling the Translators did not hesitate to avow their own participation; added years have left them pretty much in the same position; and Sir Walter Scott, in his letter to one of the translators (which will be found at the end of this volume), has given to their feelings the sanction of his weighty authority' (Taylor, *German* [1888] iii). Thomas Crofton Croker also dedicated the second volume of *Fairy Legends and Traditions of the South of Ireland* (1828) to Scott, sent him a copy of the book, and included quotations from his letter in the later edition published in 1834.

Sir, I have been obliged by the courtesy which sent me your very

interesting work on Irish Superstitions, and no less by the amusement which it has afforded me, both from the interest of the stories, and the lively manner in which they are told. [...] *The beautiful superstition of the Banshee seems in a great measure peculiar to Ireland, though in some Highland families there is such a spectre [...]*.

(Scott, 'Letter to the Author of the Irish Legends' 342, my emphasis)

These episodes suggest that Scott occupied a profoundly significant place in the British literary world, whose commentaries were appreciated by other authors as 'weighty authority' which could add value to their books.⁶ Furthermore, the fact that Croker dedicated the second volume of his collection to Scott, and the third volume to Wilhelm Grimm, suggests that his contemporary publishers, authors and readers perceived Scott as an overwhelmingly significant figure in the genre of fairytales, whose presence and authority are equivalent to those of highly respected Brothers Grimm.

It is of note that Scott profoundly inspired the 'giants' in the genre of European fairytales, who include the Brothers Grimm (Jacob: 1785-1863; Wilhelm: 1786-1859) and Hans Christian Andersen (1805-1875). Andersen, who is often evaluated as 'the father of modern fairy tales' (Nikolajeva 13), respected Scott to such an extent that early in his literary career, he used the pseudonym 'Walter', in homage to Scott.⁷ As Alastair Durie observes, Andersen was 'an enthusiast' for Scott, once remarking that 'no author has filled me more' (Durie 317). On the other hand, Scott and the Brothers Grimm can be seen to have established an extraordinary link in the history of Romantic fairy writing. The Brothers Grimm were engaged in producing a collection of traditional ballads in which they sought to 'locate, record, and publish nationally distinctive *Märchen*' within Germany (Schacker 3), at a similar time to Scott's work on

a closely-related endeavour. The publication of Scott's *Minstrelsy* (1802) predated *Kinder-und Hausmärchen* (1812-15) by ten years, and was read by and provided inspiration for the Brothers Grimm (Brill). Whilst Scott was inspired by international fairy beliefs including those of the German Romantic movement, Jacob Grimm was eager to correspond with Scott, and eventually they exchanged letters and books (Brill). Although, as Dunnigan observes, they eventually came to be 'more enchanted' by works by other Scottish figures including *Popular Superstitions and Festive Amusements of the Highlanders of Scotland* (1823) by William Grant Stewart (Dunnigan, 'Enchanting the Nation'), it was the *Minstrelsy* which initially inspired the Brothers Grimm, maintaining as they did a curiosity about Scottish folklore and folktales.

Considering that the Grimms, Andersen, Croker, and Taylor are figures of utmost significance in the history of fairytale and folklore, it is striking that these profoundly eminent figures were all inspired by and respected Scott. This implies that Scott occupied a far more significant place in the map of Romantic fairytales (which includes both traditional and literary ones) as charted beyond Scotland and indeed across Europe, than he has been accorded by later scholars. It is indubitable that, although the reception of Scott's works by these giants of European fairytale makes a significant subject of discussion with regard to the European reception of Scott's works, it has been neglected by previous studies until recently.⁸ Similarly, a biographical study of the Brothers Grimm also seems to have overlooked the link between Scott and them, though it mentions MacPherson and his *Ossian*.⁹

As is observed by Edward Brill, Scott and the Brothers Grimm shared a 'common interest in the past of their respective countries' (Brill 505). Significantly, both of their nations were then stateless, and were culturally threatened by neighbouring

(and southern) nations.¹⁰ Both Scott and the Grimms sought to create a cultural monument of their stateless nations, and explored issues of national identity through their collection, compilation and literisation of oral tradition. Nevertheless, in spite of the similarities, there lies one striking difference between them in their attitudes toward the material they collected, as well as toward their respective nations. Whilst both parties appropriated the original material, Scott was more often an artist than a collector and an antiquarian: as mentioned in the earlier section, he was relatively indifferent to the preservation of the ‘authentic’ material, but was willing to invent his original fairy writing consisting of poems and novels. The difference in their attitude toward the question of authenticity led to the Grimms’ relative indifference toward his works afterwards. Furthermore, as Jack Zipes suggests, the Brothers Grimm attempted to ‘glorify the greatness of the German popular tradition’ in a more straightforward manner with their collections of fairytales showcasing their ‘utopian vision for Germany’ (*The Brothers Grimm* xi). Scott’s attitude toward the Scottish nation reflected in his fairy writing is, in contrast, more ambivalent: the elfin characters evoked in the Scotland constructed in his works often suffer from identity crises, or simply vanish, leaving a sense of emptiness behind.

In addition, Scott’s influence in the circulation of fairy representations in contemporary British and Irish culture can also be discovered in music. Among a number of music scores of Scottish ballads published in nineteenth century London and Dublin, there are scores of musical adaptations of Scott’s fairy poems, which feature fairy characters. The British Library holds scores of ‘The Goblin Page: Scene from The Lay of the Last Minstrel’ (1813), ‘Is It the Roar of Teviot’s Tide: the Poetry from The Lay of the Last Minstrel’ (c1835) composed by John Clark, and ‘The Erl King, a

Song: The Words translated from the German [i.e. Goethe] by Sir Walter Scott' (c1835) by A. Cowell.

1.1.3 'My Native Country' and 'Our Immortal Shakespeare':

Contradicting National Identities

In his introduction to the *Minstrelsy*, Scott passionately manifests his desire to locate and preserve the popular superstition 'peculiar' to Scotland:

In the Notes and occasional Dissertations [included in the *Minstrelsy*], it has been my object to throw together, [...] a variety of remarks, *regarding popular superstitions, and legendary history, which, if not now collected, must soon have been totally forgotten.* By such efforts, feeble as they are, *I may contribute somewhat to the history of my native country; the peculiar features of whose manners and character are daily melting and dissolving into those of her sister and ally.* And, trivial as may appear *such an offering, to the manes of a kingdom, once proud and independent, I hang it upon her alter with a mixture of feelings, which I shall not attempt to describe.* 'Hail, land of spearmen! Seed of those who scorn'd / To stoop the proud crest to Imperial Rome! / Hail! Dearest half of Albion, sea-wall'd!' (Scott, Introduction to *Minstrelsy* 175, my emphasis.)

In distinct contrast to the Brothers Grimm's celebration and glorification of the German culture, this quotation, imbued with pathetic as well as elegiac overtones, is charged with a heightened sense of impending crisis: the Scotland evoked here is 'daily melting' and 'dissolving into [...] her sister and ally', and faces the danger of being 'totally

forgotten'. The 'popular superstitions' are here clearly perceived as a vital component of the national heritage and one of the constituents of the national character of Scotland, which was 'once proud and independent', but now finds itself stateless and threatened by absorption.

While fairies have conventionally been represented as 'disappearing' and 'vanishing' beings in numerous tales from various countries, the cause of their disappearance is usually ascribed to the process of modernisation. To make a striking contrast with this, Scott here ascribes the disappearance of ancient superstitions to the union of Scotland and England. Significantly, Black, Hogg, and Lang also associate the disappearance of fairies with the loss of the nation-state resulting from the union. For instance, as demonstrated in Chapter Three, Hogg often depicts Scotland as a peculiarly immaterial and ethereal realm, which often appears to be dissolving, and is imbued with a sense of absence. It is my contention that the peculiar association of the disappearance of fairies with the loss of the nation-state is a significant characteristic of nineteenth-century Scottish fairy writing.

Thus, Scott's emotional commentary here is clearly informed by his ideas of cultural nationalism; the disappearance of 'popular superstitions' metaphorises the loss of the distinctive national character, and further, of national identity; fear and anxiety over its loss are emphatically foregrounded.

It is vitally significant that Scott's self-identification in another piece of fairy writing included in the *Minstrelsy* is contradictory to the above-mentioned particular case, in which Scott overtly identifies himself as Scottish.

There remains yet another cause to be noticed, which seems to have induced a considerable alteration into the popular creed of England,

respecting Fairies. Many poets of the sixteenth century, and, above all, *our immortal Shakespeare, deserting the hackneyed fictions of Greece and Rome, sought for machinery in the superstitions of their native country.* [...] In such employments, as raising the drooping flower, and arranging the disordered chamber, *the Fairies of South Britain* gradually lost the harsher character of the dwarfs, or elves. [...] *While the fays of South Britain received such attractive and poetical embellishments, those of Scotland, who possessed no such advantage, retained more of their ancient and appropriate character.* [...] [T]he character of the Scottish Fairy is more harsh and terrific than that which is ascribed to the elves of our sister kingdom. (Scott, Introduction to the ‘Tale of Tamlane’ 349-351, my emphasis)

This single paragraph epitomises ambivalence in Scott’s construction of his national identity: both as a Briton who respects ‘our immortal’ Shakespeare, calls England ‘South Britain’, and subverts the Graeco-Roman yoke, and as a Scot desiring to be distinct from the English by emphasising the differences between English and Scottish fairies. The elaborate mixture of anxieties and emotions brought up by the question of his national identity is further expanded and explored in his fictional fairy writing, in which he creates his own original elfin characters and fairylands.

1.1.4 Previous Studies of Fairies in Scott’s Writing

There have only been a few studies which examine fairies in Scott’s writing: *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott’s Fiction* (1964) by Coleman O. Parsons, and *Scott the Rhymer* (1988) by Nancy Moore Goslee. These studies, though pioneering and

informative, do not examine the complexity of the issues regarding national identity which, as this chapter argues, underlie Scott's fairy writings. Whilst Parsons' encyclopaedic study covering the whole corpus of Scott's writing is invaluable, it does not go further than demonstrating Scott's 'firm bedding in the tradition and culture of his own land' (v), through the identification of traditional motifs in his works in an old-historicist way. Goslee's study is focused on the narratological and feminist reading of Scott's elfin representations. Another study worth mentioning is 'The Upright Corpse, Hogg, National Literature and the Uncanny' (1994) by Ian Duncan, whereby Duncan aptly states that Scott '[worried] over a schism between the letter of romance revival [...] and its spirit [...], which is in turn the sign of an epistemic schism between ancient and modern cultural mentalities' (30). Fairies in Scott's writing *per se* thus have failed to receive the benefit of recent development in the study of Scottish literature, which attempts to employ new perspectives 'beyond' Scotland, situate Scottish literature in wider international contexts rather than confining it to contradictions within it, and consider various issues pertaining to the nation and regions in the devolved Scotland: the nation which currently witnesses the renewed nationalistic impulse, as well as the on-going processes of canon making as represented by the creation of new Edinburgh-North Carolina edition of Hogg's works.

The lack of recognition of the significance of the issues of Scott and fairies is caused by a number of reasons, which will be examined in the following sections. Firstly, there has been a general lack of fundamental recognition that a Scottish tradition of fairy writing even exists. As Dunnigan points out, the genre has profoundly been overlooked, both within and outside Scotland ('Fairy Tales and Scottish Culture'). The notable example is Jack Zipes, who no doubt is one of the most recognised scholars

covering the wide adjacent and overlapping genres of international fairytale, folklore and fantasy. Zipes seems to overlook the significance of, as well as existence of, Scottish fairy belief; Once he made a debatable claim that ‘there was no such thing as a Scottish fairy tale tradition’ (qtd. in Dunnigan, ‘Fairy Tales and Scottish Culture’). Further, his edition of *The Oxford Companion to Fairy Tales* is criticised as ‘a work which incidentally minimises the Scottish contribution to the genre’ (Henderson and Cowan 214).

Whilst Scottish fairy writing has thus failed to be adequately recognised by scholars of international folklore as represented by Zipes, the importance of fairies within Scottish literature might perhaps been overlooked by scholars of Scottish literature as well. Colin Manlove, in his pioneering work, points out that Scottish fantasy literature, a genre which is adjacent to and overlapping the genre of fairy writing, has not received sufficient attention: ‘Fantasy literature, that is, fiction involving the supernatural, has often been a neglected or undervalued side of national cultures: and this is particularly the case with Scotland. Despite the fact that Scotland is rich in fantasy, no work on the subject yet exists’ (*Scottish Fantasy Literature* 1). In his observation, Manlove aptly foregrounds the crucial link between the genre of fantasy literature and cultural nationalist discourse. As exemplified by ‘canonical’ works of fantasy in twentieth century, including *Chronicles of Narnia* (1949-54) by C.S. Lewis and *The Lord of the Rings* (1937-49) by J.R.R. Tolkien, lands and nations evoked in the genre are often partial and nostalgic projections of a particular national culture, replicating, celebrating and propagating particular philosophies, values and aesthetics. Like epic, fantasy literature is almost inseparable from war and conflict. While both Narnia and Hobbits were originally written in the aftermath of the World War II, they

start *in media res*, homeland of central characters is threatened by other countries. In the course of fantastical narrative, with the help of magical and iconic creatures functioning as semi-gods, a particular nation is authenticated and patriotic desires are justified. In short, fantasy literature acts as national myth, and is increasingly becoming a powerful agent of cultural nationalist discourse. Fairies in the genre are crucially important because they serve to reveal a variety of characteristics and key constituents of cultural nationalist discourse. Such usage of fairies in nation writing was exceedingly and experimentally developed in the Romantic period, under the significant influence of Scott.

After the history of profound neglect of fairies and fantasies in Scottish literatures and cultures, there have recently been a few comprehensive studies following Manlove's work. *Scottish Fairy Belief* (2001), by Lizanne Henderson and Edward J Cowan, is a monumental work fundamentally undertaken from a folkloristic perspective which overview traditional Scottish fairy belief. It also covers fairies evoked in literature, together with the literary figures engaged with the theme, poignantly criticising the problem of authorship in Scott's *Minstrelsy*, defending Hogg and his mother. Like Manlove's study, it also proposes the importance of fairies in Scottish literature and culture: 'A book could easily, and should, be written about fairies in Scottish literature. If Scotland was the land of Calvin, oatcakes and sulphur, it was also, during the century and a half following Macpherson, the country of couthy sentimental poetry which was frequently fixated on fairies [...]'(195).

It is remarkable that recent critical moves in the field of literary studies examine the significance of fairies in broader cultural contexts. Pioneering examples can be found in a series of studies by Dunnigan, which cover and contextualise works of

Hogg, Robert Kirk, representations of mermaid, and so on. Whilst these studies started to bridge the huge critical gap, the genre still requires studies from various approaches. In particular, the roles of fairies in cultural nationalist discourse bears particular significance in the twenty-first century. As the devolving processes within the United Kingdom have entered a new stage, with the idea of breaking up of Britain getting less illusory and more imaginable, attentions and questions pertaining to the Scottish nation both within and outside Scotland seem to have been increasingly directed not only outward but also inward, posing questions regarding what is Scotland in the first place, and tracing the process of how its national consciousness and self-definitions have been formed.¹¹ Scotland, as it were, has also been anatomised and broken-up; as exemplified by Colin Kidd and Cairns Craig, the presence and role of Lowland-Scotto-centric perspectives in the formulation and appropriation of national history have been more recognised than ever.

A careful examination by Cairns Craig challenges and deconstructs the notion of hybridity which has been formulated by Homi Bhaba and has indeed become a hegemonic perspective often universally and uncritically employed in post-colonialist literary studies. It seems that Scott's creations of apparently 'hybrid' fairies, which shall be examined in this thesis, can serve as a key to analyse the issue of nation and hybridity in Scottish literatures and cultures in the romantic period.

1.1.5 Poet versus Folklorist: the Problem of Authenticity

Narrowing the focus on previous studies on the place of Scott in British and Scottish fairytale and folklore, while previous studies on both British and Scottish folklore acknowledged Scott's significance and influence, their evaluation given to him

has often been negative, or, with reservation. To some extent, Scott has been regarded as significant in the history of 'British' folklore: Richard Dorson positively regards Scott as one of the first Scottish folklorists, with his 'towering influence' which 'sparked interest in Scottish traditions in the opening decades of the nineteenth century' (107). Dorson's evaluation of Scott as 'the first major figure to cultivate *the literary uses of* folklore with sympathy and comprehension' (107, my emphasis) aptly captures Scott's inclination to deviate from authenticity, creating his original fairytales. Similarly, Carol Silver rightly evaluated Scott as a precursor of the British folklorists who contributed to the formation of the discipline. In contrast, a more recent study by Jeniffer Schacker, which considers the remaking of fairytales in nineteenth-century England (2003), almost entirely ignores Scott's influential roles in the circulation of fairytales in nineteenth-century English culture, even though she mentions the earlier-mentioned translation of the works of Brothers Grimm by Taylor, and gives much space to Croker's collection of Irish tales. The inclusion of Croker in Schacker's study foregrounds the imperialist ideology imbuing 'English' fairytale circulations. Together with the exclusion of Scott from the work, it also reveals, perhaps unconsciously, a problematic aspect of 'Englishness' which arguably overlaps with, or is even synonymous with, 'Britishness', and which has differing distances and attitudes towards each of the three other constituting nations of Great Britain. Considering its coverage of materials, perspectives, and the supposed readership of the tales mentioned in it, it would be more appropriate to regard it as a work exploring a British cultural phenomenon, rather than a work whose interest is confined in England.

Henderson and Cowan, in a sarcastic tone, regards Scott as 'the great doyen of Scottish fairy belief' (28), rightly recognising both his influential place and the

debatable problems of authorship and appropriation. Scott, as Henderson and Cowan pointed out, did not acknowledge the contributions of figures, including Leyden and Hogg, to the editorial task of the *Minstrelsy*. Although Robert Jamieson was planning to publish his collection of ballads at the same time, Scott ‘beat him to it’ (Henderson and Cowan 195-196), perhaps abusing his authoritative position in the contemporary literary world. Scott’s inclusion of appropriated text and his original fairytales were criticised as ‘fake-lore’ by folklorists (Henderson and Cowan 195-197), and presumably became the main cause of the neglect of Scott from them. Ironically, Scott’s creation of ‘fake-lore’ contributed to the creation of romanticised, and arguably, exoticised images of Scotland, which eventually became popular in England and elsewhere, though they might not necessarily have been welcomed within Scotland.

For antiquarians, who later evolved into folklorists, the issue of authenticity served as a dominating preoccupation, which led to devaluation of works by Macpherson and Musäus.¹² Andrew Lang, who invented original fairytales, was also fiercely attacked by his colleagues at the Folk Lore Society in late Victorian period. For them, the ‘orality’ and ‘authenticity’ of fairytales, as opposed to ‘literary fairytales’ and ‘fake-lore’, were often mythologised and perhaps fetishized cultural value. Frequently, they were hostile to literacy, which was perceived as a threat to the survival of ‘authentic’ folk tradition, even though some fairytales were written and read as early as the Chaucerian period: ‘The Wife of Bath’, for example, implies the existence of even earlier *written* records of fairy belief: ‘In th’olde days of the King Arthour, [...] / All was this land fulfild of fayerye, / The elf-queen with hir joly companye / Daunced ful ofte in many a grene mede. / This was the olde opinion, as I rede’ (857-62, my emphasis). There are abundant examples of hostility toward the conversion of

fairytale into letters by folklorist, which can be discovered in as early as John Aubrey (1626-1697):

Before Printing, Old-wives Tales were ingeniose, and since Printing came in fashion, till a little before the Civill-warres, the ordinary sort of People were not taught to reade. Now-a-dayes Bookes are common, and most of the poor people understand letters; and the many good Bookes, and variety of Turns and Affaires, have put all the old Fables out of doors: and the divine art of Printing and Gunpowder have frighted away Robin-goodfellow and the Fayries. (Aubrey, qtd. in Dorson 6)

Notably, textualisation of oral tradition, an iconic progress towards modernity, is seen as the cause of disappearance of fairies. Likewise, Alan Dundes, a twentieth-century folklorist, wrote:

Once a fairy tale or any other type of folktale, [...] is *reduced* to written language, one does not have *a true fairy tale* but instead only a pale and inadequate reflection of what was originally an oral performance complete with raconteur and audience. From this folkloristic perspective, one cannot possibly read fairy tales; one can only properly hear them told. (259 emphasis added)

These extracts evidently suggest that the persistent hostility towards the writing down of oral tradition, and towards invention of original fairytale, was one of the prominent features in British culture, widely shared and supported by many people. These also suggest that Scott's *Minstrelsy*, which committed the fatal errors of appropriation and invention, was provoking to some intellectual communities.

One of his essays included in *Minstrelsy* suggests that Scott was totally disenchanted with the myth of ‘authenticity’ because he was realistically aware of the intervention of, and appropriation by, numerous transmitters and audiences. Ironically, though Scott himself appropriates traditional narrative, he is hostile to other appropriators in the past, depicting them as responsible for the ‘degradation’ of ballads. Scott sees ‘modern’ ballads as ‘mutilated’ and in a ‘degraded state’ caused by ‘faults of transmitters’ and ‘reciters’ who ‘simplified [ballads] and deprived them of poetic effect’ for an ‘inferior audience’, whilst he shows considerable respect for the ‘early poets’ who ‘almost uniformly display a bold, rude, original cast of genius and expression’ (I: 2). Similarly, he argues,

The stall copies of both these romances, as they now exist, are very much abbreviated, and probably exhibit them when they were undergoing, or had nearly undergone, the process of being cut down into ballads. Taking into consideration the various indirect channels by which the popular poetry of our ancestors has been transmitted to their posterity, it is nothing surprising that it should reach us in a mutilated and degraded state, and that it should little correspond with the ideas we are apt to form of the first productions of national genius [...]. (*Minstrelsy* I: 15)

Contradictory to his recognition of ballads as ‘popular poetry’, Scott assumes the presence of individual authors of the ‘first productions’ in the past, romanticising them as ‘talented poets’ and ‘geniuses’. He does not ascribe the authorship of ballads to the collective and anonymous notion of the ‘oral tradition’. In Scott’s conception expressed above, there is an obvious mismatch between the two concepts of ‘popular

poetry' and 'a talented individual author'. The mismatch reveals Scott's inclination to be a poet, or a 'maker' in the original sense of the word in Greek, even in his treatment of traditional ballad. Probably, it is such a poetic, and creative, inclination of Scott which reportedly disappointed the Brothers Grimm.

It is worthy of note, though, that this attitude of Scott eventually changed later in his life, when he came to regret his alteration ('I think I did wrong, myself in endeavouring to make the best possible set of an ancient ballad out of several copies obtained from different quarters, and that in many respects if I improved the poetry I spoiled the simplicity of the old song' [Scott, Letter to Motherwell, 3 May 1825. qtd. Dunnigan, *The Scottish Ballads* 56]).

It is thus that Dorson describes Scott's attitude to ballads as exhibiting 'disharmony', whereby he was 'continually torn between his ethnographical and literary bents', and 'recognized that they frequently led from the same starting point in different directions' (109-10). Significantly, Scott's treatment of fairies is also underpinned by the 'disharmony', or the tension between representations of fairies in two conflicting modes: traditional and 'authentic' fairytales based on oral tradition, and original and literary tales. It may be argued that Scott's artistic inclination has the potential to subvert what Mathew Woodcock terms the 'phonocentric hierarchy' that 'the folklorist tradition, so inextricably at the heart of fairy studies to date, implicitly predicates' (13):

Such a hierarchy foregrounds the presence of fairy as it exists in popular belief and is perpetuated in oral narrative, and *affords the most authority to the representations of fairy that are judged to come closest to the nebulous core of fairy belief*. Accordingly, Shakespeare's fairies attract the most critical attention, whilst the more 'literary'

conception of fairy found in medieval romance, to which Spenser is heavily indebted, received summarily scant treatment. (Woodcock 13, my emphasis)

The flexibility and ambivalence in Scott's attitude towards fairies, both as an antiquarian and an artist, serves to enable the richness, diversity and complexity in his fairy narratives which are constructed in a variety of genres from differing standpoints. Whilst his essays were written primarily from an antiquarian perspective, in poems and novels Scott took the liberty of creating his original fairies and fairytales as an artist. At the same time, this flexibility foregrounds and highlights the 'invented' aspect of the 'tradition', 'national culture' and even the 'nation' itself as an artefact, of which fairy 'beliefs' constitute a part; it discloses that the 'tradition' claimed to have derived from the ancient period is actually a modern invention appropriated in order to suit 'modern' demands, and, even an index of modernity.

Even though these issues of authorship and authenticity caused negative evaluation of the *Minstrelsy* by folklorists, it is argued by Carol Silver that Scott played a vital role in legitimizing the nineteenth-century study of fairies. Although Silver states that Scott's most important contribution to the discipline of folklore was the analysis and theory found in *Letters on Witchcraft and Demonology*, it should not be overlooked that the 'first hints' of the 'contribution' made later in *Letters* are evident in his Introduction to 'The Young Tamlane' in the *Minstrelsy*, an essay written much earlier than *Letters*, wherein Scott examines the origin of the fairies from a genealogical as well as a multi-cultural perspective. It may be inferred, then, that the *Minstrelsy* bears more significance than it has been conventionally accorded.

1.2 *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border* (1802)

1.2.1 Ballad, Antiquarianism and the Literary Invention of Tradition

This section explores the questions of how Scott employs fairies in his *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border* (1802). First, it is helpful to summarise the ideological as well as the formal characteristics of the ballad collections created primarily by antiquarians in Scotland in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries,¹³ with reference to previous studies.

As Dunnigan notes, it has been widely acknowledged that ballads are ‘not unique to Scotland’ but ‘are found as song types in popular, folk cultures across the world’ (*The Scottish Ballads* 4). Even within the specific category of the ‘Scottish ballads’, some of them have ‘strong links with England’ (Lyle, Introduction to *Scottish Ballads* 13) blurring the national borders. For instance, *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads* (1882-98) compiled by Francis James Child, a canonical ballad collection published in the nineteenth century, includes both Scottish and English ballads. However, there has been an arguably cultural nationalistic impulse, even amongst recent scholarship, which perceives ballads as a key constituent of Scottish culture and literature representing its cultural uniqueness, and which even claims that ballads embody ‘the impossibly “pure” or “authentic” Scottishness’ (*The Scottish Ballads* 54). Emily Lyle, for instance, argues:

One broader, less immediate, context [of Scottish ballads] is the national one. The early Scottish collectors were driven by a conscious desire to preserve an element of their national heritage and their publications proudly presented their discoveries. The ballads had been Scottish in the sense that they had been collected in Scotland,

but they soon *became something that provided extra nourishment for Scottish identity*. (Introduction to *Scottish Ballads* 12, my emphasis)

By situating this established consensus in the context of a range of recent studies on the processes of myth-making and the invention of tradition as artefact, as exemplified by *The Invention of Scotland: Myth and History* by Hugh Trevor-Roper,¹⁴ it may be inferred that, in a fashion analogous to the popularisation of tartan for which Scott was also responsible,¹⁵ the perpetuating recognition and canonisation of the ballad as a typical index of distinctive ‘Scottish national character’ was constructed during the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, through a variety of antiquarian mythopœtic practices of the ‘invention of tradition’, in which Scott and his *Minstrelsy* played a vital role.

Ballad collections can thus be perceived as a genre imbued from the first with national sentiment, whether of a nationalist or unionist bent. They were in vogue in the period spanning the eighteenth century and early nineteenth centuries, and have been regarded as a quintessential example of antiquarianism, which, as delineated by Susan Manning, was ‘the study of a lost past’ or ‘the recovery and reconstitution of a continuous, developing national tradition’ (‘Political Discourse of the *Edinburgh Review*’ 107). Manning rightly suggests that antiquarianism was ‘politically charged’, and held a ‘pivotal’ position in the literary politics of Edinburgh in the first decade of the nineteenth century, due in part to its ideological roots in the issues surrounding the nation and the union (‘Political Discourse of the *Edinburgh Review*’ 104). However, her argument that union was the ‘prior condition’ for the ‘safe’ retrieval of a past which survived as ‘fragmented remains’ would require careful consideration. It would be indubitable that the enthusiasm for collecting can serve as an important ‘agent of social

cohesion' in certain environments, as in eighteenth-century England. However, collection, as well as fabrication, of materials, which are typically classified as 'folk', 'oral' and 'regional' tradition, could potentially have an effect of subverting and dismantling social cohesion. Potentially they could subvert and provide alternative narratives to the written and authorised histories, often revealing the concealment and distortion constituting the 'official' versions of national history. Manning is right in her claim that in Scotland, accumulating the objects of material culture 'more readily expressed resistance to the political *status quo*' ('Political Discourse of the *Edinburgh Review*' 104). But potentially, the 'resistance' might not always target the union and England, but could mean the rise of regionalism which can lead to the dismantling of the Scottish nation itself. For example, it could be said that Scott's 'Border' *Minstrelsy* foregrounded the potential tension between the national identity of Scotland and the regional identity of Borders; its exclusion of orally narrated materials in the Gaelic language could also highlight the border between Highland and Lowland, as well as the potential discordances between gaelic-scottish, celtic-scottish, and anglo-scottish. In addition, if dangerously applied by extreme movements as exemplified by Nazism, which made extensive use of appropriated folklore collections by the Brothers Grimm, the 'enthusiasm for collecting' in an attempt to achieve 'social cohesion', even forcefully and with violence, could bring devastating results. It is vitally important to bear in mind the established formulation that the past, as well as myth, is repeatedly rewritten, manipulated and appropriated throughout human history by various agents of differing ideologies, in order to justify and reinforce themselves, or suppress and subvert opposing ideologies. Bearing this in mind, it is dubitable whether the past could be ever be retrieved 'safely' under any environment, regardless of whether it is a unionised one

or not.

In terms of their format, ballad collections compiled during the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries were often characterised by ‘scholarly excess’; that is, a ‘typically excessive number of headnotes, footnotes, and introductory essays’ (Rowland 233). Significantly, the format adopted by Scott for the *Minstrelsy* is regarded as a characteristic example of these ballad collections. While the *Minstrelsy*, edited with the assistance of Richard Heber, John Leyden, William Laidlaw and James Hogg (T Henderson, ‘Editor’s Prefatory Note’ xiii-xiv), primarily consists of traditional ballads from the Border region, some of which had ‘never been printed at all before’ (*JGL* 104),¹⁶ it also includes original ballads penned by the editors and drawing on ancient ballads for inspiration, as well as detailed introductory essays and notes which are not necessarily directly related to the ballads themselves. For instance, the ‘Introductory Essay to the “Tale of Tamlane”’ concerns the genealogy of traditional fairy beliefs of both Scottish and other origins.

The significance of these ‘Introductory Essays’ has been interpreted as follows: holding that they were ‘customary’ for the contemporary ballad collections, Ann Wierda Rowland has pointed out that they served as a ‘scholarly apparatus’ which formed ‘a way of *not* [the author’s italics] reading or responding to the contents of popular literature’, modelled ‘how a “refined” editor and reader might appreciate popular poetry while still maintaining a proper, critical distance’, and provided ‘authenticity and authority for the antiquarian project’ (227). On the other hand, Ian Duncan, Leith Davis and Janet Sorensen detect the ‘structural tension’ between orality and literacy in the idiosyncratic format common to a range of works created during ‘the vernacular revival’:

The consolidation and diversification of the vernacular revival brought no release—quite the contrary—of the structural tension between its (vulgar, heterogeneous, dissident) materials and the official frames (nationalist, historicist, canonical, philological) set up to contain them. (Duncan et al, Introduction to *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism* 12)

Applying this formulation to the particular case of the *Minstrelsy*, Fielding reads the work as ‘a site in which contradictory uses of orality come into conflict’ with literacy (*Writing* 45), and suggests:

[I]t is not the ballads themselves that are to contribute to Scotland’s national history, but the editor’s notes and dissertations. Throughout the edition Scott is concerned to show off the ballads, yet he displays a marked reluctance to let them speak for themselves. (*Writing* 51).

From these previous studies, it can be concluded that the essays in the *Minstrelsy*, representative of the ‘literary’ side of the literary/orality dichotomy latent in the work, establish an authoritative framework within which the ballads contained in the collection should be appreciated: a framework which, being charged with the Scott’s own preoccupations, may actually be in discordance with the ballads framed by it. These essays are strategically employed as devices for the historicisation, canonisation and ‘nationalisation’ of the ballads; through this process, the ballads are accorded the status of an indispensable part of ‘national’ culture, contributing to the invention of the ‘national tradition’. Furthermore, the presence of these ‘Essays’ could be perceived as an embodiment and living example of the process of incorporation, and perhaps forced fabrication of a new Scottish Identity in the post-union Scotland by anglo-scottish elite

intellectuals.

The texture of the *Minstrelsy* is thus far from monolithic and seamless, but, to borrow Matthew Woodcock's words, is a 'pieced-together construct'.¹⁷ Here and there, the borders between disparate texts generate tension, though these tensions latent in Scott's works are far milder than those in the works of Black and Hogg. Significantly, the 'traditional' and 'invented' figures of fairies in it, which can be construed as one of the primary themes and motifs shared by the disparate constituents of the *Minstrelsy* (ancient ballads, original ballads and essays), play a synthesising role in the 'invention' of national tradition, and further, metaphorise the mythopœtic and artificial construction of national identities undertaken in the work.

From a biographical perspective, critical evaluation of the *Minstrelsy* in Scott scholarship placed it as a significant work which did not only serve as the threshold for Scott's arrival into the literary world, determining his vocation as a poet and novelist, but also prophetically contained and epitomised 'the endless variety of incidents and images' 'expanded and emblazoned by his mature art' in the body of his future literary creations (*JGL Memoirs* 104):

[The *Minstrelsy*] has derived a very large accession of interest from the subsequent career of its Editor [Scott]. One of the critics of that day said that the book contained 'the elements of a hundred historical romances;'—and this critic was a prophetic one. [...] [H]e had, before he passed the threshold of authorship, assembled about him, in the uncalculating delight of native enthusiasm, almost all the materials on which his genius was destined to be employed for the gratification and instruction of the world. (*JGL Memoirs* 104)

Significantly, the issue of ‘popular superstition’, including traditional fairy belief, constituted one of the primary topics which the *Minstrelsy* sought to address. The following ballads, notes and essays concerning fairies occupy a substantial amount of the overall volume of the book: two profoundly important ballads featuring fairies (‘Thomas the Rhymer’ and ‘The Young Tamlane’), invented ballads (‘The Mermaid’ by John Leyden and ‘Water-Kelpie’ by Robert Jamieson) and introductory essays and notes (‘Introduction to the Tale of Tamlane: on the Fairies of Popular Superstition’, Introductions to the three parts of *Rhymer*, Introduction to ‘The Mermaid’ by Leyden, and Notes on ‘The Water-Kelpie’ by Jamieson).¹⁸ These works reveal that the subject of fairies served as an important imaginative stimulus for Scott’s literary activity from the outset of his writing career, though, as observed by Lockhart, some of his ideas about fairies as expressed in them were later changed, as in *The Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft* (1830).¹⁹ Further, the significance which *Rhymer* and *Tamlin*, the ‘two “eerie” fairy tales’ (Dunnigan, *The Scottish Ballads* 35), bear in the history of Scottish literature cannot be overestimated. The resonant influence of ‘enduringly popular and well-loved ballads’ which are ‘thematically linked in their stories of a mortal ([...] a young man) who is abducted by fairies’ (Dunnigan, *The Scottish Ballads* 35) can be detected in Scott’s original works as exemplified by ‘The Shepherd’s Tale’ (1799), Scott’s earliest original ballad, and as well as in the works of nineteenth-century Scottish writers dealing with the subject.²⁰ As Dunnigan suggests, Scott contributed to their circulation as well as canonisation (‘[Scott] had given the Scottish ballads a new status as literary art and a far wider audience, or “readership”, than they had ever enjoyed’ [*The Scottish Ballads* 56]), and in this capacity it is undeniable that the *Minstrelsy* had a vital role to play.

The *Minstrelsy* was not, however, the sole project of this kind undertaken in Scotland at the opening of the nineteenth century. As noted by Thomas Henderson, precursory collections as exemplified by *Reliques of Ancient Poetry* (1765) by Thomas Percy provided inspiration for Scott's compilation of the *Minstrelsy*: 'Its [the *Minstrelsy*'s] influence in stimulating the industry of ballad collectors was also remarkable, though it can hardly be maintained that in this respect it surpassed the *Reliques*, if it be borne in mind that but for the *Reliques*, Scott might never have prepared the *Minstrelsy*' ('Editor's Prefatory Note' ix). Scott's contemporaries, including Robert Jamieson,²¹ were also enthusiastically collecting local ballads, and often exchanged ideas with Scott.

As mentioned earlier, it has been argued that 'antiquarian research' and 'ballad and song collection', both categories into which the *Minstrelsy* falls, should themselves be regarded as the 'nationalist genres of the post-Enlightenment' (Duncan, et al, Introduction to *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism* 12), and that Scott's preoccupation as manifested in the *Minstrelsy* is 'not that of an historian' but 'that of a nationalist antiquarian whose sense of the past is both of that which is in danger of being lost and that which is capable of being rescued and recovered' (Rowland 233).

Crucially, Scott's ideas about fairies as manifested in the *Minstrelsy* are underpinned to a remarkable degree by a national sentiment. As the following sections will demonstrate, some fairies in the *Minstrelsy* could be perceived as variations of mythic figures which, as delineated by Anthony D. Smith, function to unite and bind the population together in the 'homeland' as one of the 'vital elements' in the conceptions of national identity (Smith, *National Identity* 11).²²

Smith names 'common myths and historical memories' as well as 'a common,

mass public culture' as the 'fundamental features of national identity'; fairy belief, a body of beliefs transmitted through oral tradition concerning those beings often conceived as reminiscences of pagan deities, with an easily identifiable iconic figures ('Fairy Queen' and 'Thomas the Rhymer') and a strong link to the locality ('Eildon Hills' and 'Borders'), doubtless merit a similar categorisation. Scott's experimental construction of fairy narratives in the *Minstrelsy* can thus be interpreted as a form of desiring, re-creating and perpetuating national identities. The examination of the origin and characteristics of Scottish 'traditional' fairy belief undertaken in it, which comprises genealogical and comparative elements, serves as a form of ethnography, is a manifestation of Scott's anxieties regarding the place of Scotland. Significantly, Scott 'nationalises' fairies in the essays. He links fairies to particular nations, classifying them according to their nationality: 'Scottish fairies', and 'English fairies', seen as embodiments of national character and soul.

It is my contention that the peculiar preoccupations with land and place, echoing the loss of the Scottish nation-state by the union, underpin numerous fairy narratives in nineteenth century Scottish literature, and are a common feature of works by Black, Hogg and Lang. Landscapes evoked in fairy narratives are often saturated with a sense of emptiness, direction-ness, and immaterial-ness. For instance, Hogg depicted numerous images of immaterialised and etherealised Scotland, wherein only place-names are given a certain sense of existence and solidity. Scott, in the *Minstrelsy*, evidently seeks to re-consider the place Scotland has historically occupied in the international cultural-historical context from the past through until the present. Here, and again, Scott reveals his famous 'ambiguity' regarding Scottish national identity. He seemingly consoles himself through drawing the genealogical chart of

fairy beliefs, and persuades himself that Scotland and England share many common features, and mixture is inevitable in the course of history, even in the realm of fairy belief. In contrast, he also reveals his anxiety in his attempts to explore the nature of Scottish cultural individuality, by looking for the unique features of Scottish fairies.

1.2.2. Genealogy of Fairies and National Culture:

‘Introduction to the Tale of Tamlane: on the Fairies of Popular Superstition’

The ‘Introduction to the Tale of Tamlane: on the Fairies of Popular Superstition’, a long and detailed essay which reaches eighty-eight pages, is significant in that Scott explores the origin, history and characteristic features of fairy beliefs originating from Scotland and other cultures.²³ It is worth noting that in the essay Scott does not exclude literary fairy representations, including those by Shakespeare and Spenser, from his observation, making a clear contrast to the Victorian folklorists who were preoccupied with the idea of authenticity and would often show considerable antipathy toward ‘literary fairytale’.²⁴ The essay is significant in that it reveals a salient feature of Scott’s treatment of fairies. In a seemingly cosmopolitan attitude, Scott observes that belief in fairies is a universal ingredient of humanity (‘the general idea of spirits, of a limited power, and subordinate nature, dwelling among the woods and mountains is, perhaps, *common to all nations* [OF 300, my emphasis]). Yet, his primary interest seems to lie in considering the issue of ‘national’ identity projected onto fairy beliefs by different civilisations. Scott peculiarly ‘nationalises’ fairies, placing them in the particular context of nations and nationalism, and thereby employing them as the agents of cultural nationalist discourse. Fairy beliefs are antiquated and mythified thorough the claim that they derive from the ‘childhood of the

nation': its ancient, pristine, idealised and, for some extremists, 'pure' past, before its 'degeneration'.

Remarkably, the conception of 'childhood' was important to antiquarian representations of oral tradition, as Rowland aptly writes: 'The figure of the child [...] represents not only the authenticity of national, oral literature, but also the way in which such primitive poetry might remain part of the lived, albeit dimly remembered, experience of the modern, refined nation' (232).

Further, Scott emphatically attributes fairies with significance as a constituent of national cultural heritage:

In a work, avowedly dedicated to the preservation of the poetry and tradition of the 'olden time', it would be *unpardonable* to omit this opportunity of making some observations upon so interesting an article of the popular creed, as that concerning the Elves, or Fairies.
(*OF* 300, my emphasis)

Scott thus conceives fairies as a vital component of national character, and uses them as a vehicle for reflection on the issues concerning nations, with a fusion of ambiguous attitudes both characteristically Enlightenment-cosmopolitan and Romantic-cultural nationalistic. Such an approach to fairy beliefs is clearly underpinned by a romantic cultural nationalistic desire which, as argued by Hutchinson and Smith, sought quintessentially to discover the roots and identity of the nation:

It [the early ideological phase of nationalism in North America and Western Europe in the latter half of the eighteenth century permeated by neo-classicism] was quickly succeeded by more varied currents, generally subsumed under the rubric of romanticism, which

emphasized [...] the need to find one's own identity through a return to authentic experience, the importance of discovering one's roots and true nature and, in the case of national communities, of rediscovering their pristine origins and golden ages. (Hutchinson and Smith, Introduction to *Nationalism* 5)

Fairies in Scott's writing thus play the role of what Smith defines as the 'sacred centres': objects of spiritual and historical pilgrimage, that reveal the uniqueness of the 'moral geography' of the nation (Smith, *National Identity* 16). Further, it may be argued that Scott does not only 'nationalise' essays, as already argued, but consciously 'elf-fashions' the Scottish nation. He strengthens the associations between Scotland and fairy belief, creating a romanticised and mythicized image of it as a land of fairies; in his fictional works including the *Lay* and the *Monastery*, he constructs Scotlands populated with a variety of elves and spirits. Significantly, conscious 'elf-fashioning' of the Scottish nation is a common feature of the works of four authors explored in this thesis. For instance, Andrew Lang created an image of 'fairy knowe of the north'. Scott elf-fashioned a particular location: Selkirk, the place where he served as a Sherriff-Clerk: 'In no part of Scotland, indeed, has the belief of Fairies maintained its ground with more pertinacity than in Selkirkshire' (*OF* 378). Clearly, this claim is subjective, if one considers the rich tradition of fairy belief in the Highlands. His biased comment reveals that he perceived the link with fairies as a positive attribute.

Whilst Scott identifies the 'prototype of the English elf' as the '*berg-elfen*' of Gothic origin as well as the '*duergar*' of the Scandinavians (*OF* 301), it is noteworthy that Scott places particular emphasis on the 'intermixture' of elements of different fairy beliefs from a variety of origins which, as assumed by Scott, took place in the course of

European history:

[T]he intermixture of tribes, of languages, and religion, which has occurred in Europe, renders it difficult to trace the origin of the names which have been bestowed upon such spirits, and the primary ideas which were entertained concerning their manners and habits' (*OF* 300-301)

Scott's quest for the origin of Scottish fairy belief, or to be more precise, his anxieties regarding the identity and place of the Scottish nation, cut across Europe, connecting with it not only Greek and Roman myths, but also Gothic and Scandinavian beliefs:

The memory of the Pagan creed [of Greece and Rome] was not speedily eradicated, in the extensive provinces through which it was once universally received; and in many particulars, it continued long to mingle with, and influence, the original superstitions of the Gothic nations. Hence, we find the elves occasionally arrayed in the costume of Greece and Rome, and the Fairy Queen and her attendants transformed into Diana and her nymphs, [...]. (*OF* 325)

Scott's etymological examination of the term 'fairy', which has been criticised as 'fanciful' (T. Henderson, *Note* 307), even establishes a link between Scottish fairy belief and the tradition of the East:

[T]he term *Fairy* or *Faërie*, is derived from *Faë* [...]. It is more probable the term is of Oriental origin, and is derived from the Persic, through the medium of the Arabic. In Persic the term *Peri* expresses a species of imaginary being which resembles the Fairy in some of its qualities [...]. Now, in the enunciation of the Arabs, the

term *Peri* would sound *Fairy*, [...]. (*OF* 307-308, the author's italics)

The cultural map of traditional fairy belief charted by Scott is thus a cosmopolitan as well as synthesising one, emphasising the inevitability of dynamic interactions between beliefs from different civilisations in the course of history:

[T]he intercourse of France and Italy with the Moors of Spain, and the prevalence of the Arabic, as the language of science in the dark ages, facilitated the introduction of their mythology amongst the nations of the West. Hence, the romances of France, of Spain, and of Italy, unite in describing the Fairy as an inferior spirit, in a beautiful female form, possessing many of the amiable qualities of the eastern *Peri*. (*OF* 309)

Further, Scott stresses the hybridity of Scottish fairy belief, by regarding it as sharing common origin and attributes with fairy beliefs of other origins. Such a 'cosmopolitan' attitude makes a clear contrast to German and French nationalism which would wish to claim its 'purity'. Smith observes that in France under the Jacobins, a linguistic nationalism emerged which reflected 'pride in the purity and civilizing mission of a hegemonic French culture' (*National Identity* 13). It should be noted that the appropriation of the Grimms' collection of fairytales and folklore by the Nazis, an extreme form of German nationalism, claimed and celebrated 'the antiquity and value of native German traditions' (Niles 216), though, as John D. Niles rightly argues, 'the claim that there exists any "original" cultural site, the source of later appropriations but the beneficiary of none, is either deceit or an illusion' (216). Scott, at least here in the *Minstrelsy*, seemingly stands in a different position from German and French

nationalistic movement, as he accepts the heterogenic identity of Britain, which overlaps Leith Davis' description of 'the Border way of life': 'The Border way of life exists as an indication of heterogeneity in Britain, a heterogeneity to which the ballads bear witness' (*Acts of Union* 155). Nevertheless, as observed later, he also reveals potentially dangerous sentiments which could share something in common with the above mentioned conception of 'purity', when he claims that Scottish fairies are more antique and authentic the English ones, which Scott subtly regards as degenerated through the processes of creative textualisation by authors including Shakespeare and Drayton.

One could interpret Scott's conscious creation of 'hybrid' fairies as an attempt to negotiate and console his dilemma arising from the union of Scotland and England. Scott even creates a new unified identity of 'Britain' by claiming its 'uniqueness':

While, however, the Fairy of warmer climes was thus held up as an object of desire and of affection, those of Britain, and more especially those of Scotland, were far from being so fortunate; [...]. Indeed so singularly unlucky were the *British Fairies*, [...] they seem to have preserved, with difficulty, their own distinct characteristics, while, at the same time, they engrossed the mischievous attributes of several other classes of subordinate spirits, acknowledged by the nations of the north. (*OF* 311-12)

Again, his claim is subjective and biased. He neglects the influences the 'British' traditional belief received from Scandinavian belief, and overlooks the fact that the 'border' between different cultures and traditions does not always coincide with national, political and geographical borders.

Further, Scott also seeks to create and explore a new ‘British’ identity, though subtly foregrounds the difference between ‘Scottish’ and ‘English’ ones:

[T]he Fairies of *South Britain* gradually lost the harsher character of the dwarfs, or elves. [...] The Fairies of Shakespeare, Drayton, and Mennis, therefore, at first exquisite fancy portraits, may be considered as having finally operated a change in the original which gave them birth. While the fays of South Britain received such attractive and poetical embellishments, those of Scotland, who possessed no such advantage, *retained more of their ancient and appropriate character.* (OF 350-51, my emphasis)

The above extract reflects ambiguity in Scott’s attitude toward Scotland and England as well as toward their traditional cultures. Ostensibly, Scott describes traditional fairy belief in the two nations in a distanced and pedagogic fashion. Scott here employs the highly politicised term ‘South Britain’, together with the word ‘North Britain’, which can be viewed as emblematic of Unionist discourses, because both terms connote a willingness to share the same island with the neighbouring nation. However, through his claim that ‘considerable’ alteration to English fairies occurred through literary fairy representations by canonical English sixteenth century poets including Shakespeare, Scott subtly implies that English fairies has been, arguably, degenerated through textualisation, and lost their ‘purity’. Further, arguably to a dangerous extent, Scott also antiquates and authenticates Scottish fairies, which are alleged to have ‘more of their ancient and appropriate character’, very subtly claiming that Scotland is more ancient and authentic than England, which has lost its ‘purity’.

The Introduction to ‘The Young Tamlane’ includes some of the significant

motifs and topics employed in Scott's fictional fairy writings: the *Lake*, *The Monastery* and *The Black Dwarf*. These motifs include the depiction of the fairies as dwarves, as inspired by Scandinavian mythologies (as in the *Black Dwarf*), and direct as well as indirect allusions to Melusine (as in the *Lake* and the *Monastery*). It also displays a sense of loss, by mentioning the disappearance of local fairy beliefs:

the subterranean people have derived no further credit, than to be confounded with the devils and magicians of the dark ages of Christianity; a degradation which [...] has been also suffered by the harmless fairies of Albion, and indeed by the whole host of deities of learned Greece and mighty Rome. (*OF* 304)

Through the juxtaposition of 'Albion' with 'learned Greece and mighty Rome', Scott subversively equates Scotland, a nation at a marginal corner of Europe and widely regarded as vernacular, with the ancient and prosperous empires which gave birth to gigantic civilisations.

Scott reiterates his remarks that Christianity is responsible for the eradication of fairies, placing particular emphasis on the role of the Reformation: a crucial period which drastically changed the Scottish national identity.

The Reformation swept away many of the corruptions of the Church of Rome; but the purifying torrent remained itself somewhat tintured by the superstitious impurities of the soil over which it has passed. [...] The Fairies were, therefore, in no better credit after the Reformation than before, being still regarded as actual demons, or something very little better. (*OF* 337)

Scott emphasises that even after the passage of the 'waves' of Reformation, which were

the waves of exorcism, Scottish fairies survived. Through the emphasis, he reveals his persistent desire for national perpetuation and fear of the loss of national character. This motif of disappearance of fairies as a result of Reformation, echoing the fear of national loss, is emphatically employed in *The Monastery*. As demonstrated later in this chapter, the version of the national past on the eve of the Reformation as represented in the novel is haunted by the presence of fairies; the White Lady, an elfin character symbolising the national soul has a considerably ambiguous role: whilst she promotes the advance of modernity as represented by the Reformation, she is ultimately exorcised by the Protestant priest at the end of the novel.

1.2.3 Invention of an Epical Ballad: ‘Thomas the Rhymer’

In this sub-section I will interpret Scott’s edition of ‘Thomas the Rhymer’ in the *Minstrelsy* as a mark of his mythopoeitic motivation to create an epical ballad. By the term ‘epical ballad’, I am referring to a fusion of epic and ballad, or, a ballad playing the role of an epic as ‘national literature’. As epitomised by a plethora of epics featuring King Alfred written and circulated in England, epics enjoyed considerable popularity during the Romantic period in Britain, partly due to cultural nationalistic anxieties (Pratt 138). In this context, I will argue that, in contrast to Hogg’s *Queen’s Wake* (1813, 1819) which falls into the category of an epic more easily, Scott responded to this vogue, in a not straightforward manner, by his presentation of *Rhymer* in the *Minstrelsy*, to which is added a further Scottish cultural nationalistic touch, in that it is intended to be a fusion of epic and ballad, stitched together by introductory essays: whilst epic is largely a classic invention imported from Ancient Greece and the Roman Empire, ballads are a vernacular form of art, locally inherited.

Scott's editorial method of *Rhymer* in the *Minstrelsy* is controversial. His edition of *Rhymer* comprises three parts, each framed by a short and scholarly 'introductory essay' with an appendix. The process of editing ballads through a collage of disparate elements, including 'invented' materials, is indeed an idiosyncratic one. It epitomises, to borrow Woodcock's descriptions applied to Spenserian *Faerie Queen*, the 'pieced-together' and 'interspliced' construction of the whole body of the *Minstrelsy*.²⁵

To this old tale [the 'Part First', based on the corrected and enlarged version of Mrs Brown's MS], the Editor has ventured to add a Second Part, consisting of a kind of Canto, from the printed prophecies vulgarly ascribed to the Rhymer; and a Third Part, entirely modern, founded upon the tradition of his having returned, with the hart and hind, to the Land of Faërie. To make his peace with the more severe antiquaries, the Editor had prefixed to the Second Part some remarks on Learmont's prophecies. (*ITRI* 84).

Thus only the 'Part First' out of the three parts is sourced from the 'authentic' version of the ballad provided by Mrs Brown. However, Thomas Henderson notes that its phraseology and arrangement, 'differs a good deal' from Mrs Brown's MS (Henderson *Note*, IV: 84). Thus only the 'Part First' relates the encounter between the protagonist True Thomas and the Fairy Queen, followed by his abduction to the Fairyland, and his subsequent return after seven years' absence. The 'Second Part' is a 'modified version' of the popular 'prophetic verses', concerning the prophecies ascribed to Thomas, who was believed to have been granted the prophetic power by the fairy. The 'Third Part' is purely Scott's own invention.

Considering the text in the light of Woodcock's study on *The Faerie Queen* by Edmund Spenser, there are significant inter-textual parallels between Scott's presentation of *Rhymer* in the *Minstrelsy* and *The Faerie Queen*. Both have a 'Fairy Queen' as their respective central character. They also employ a human poet as a key-constituent character, onto whom both Spenser and Scott self-consciously project their own images as a poet. Further, it may be argued that through their representation of the fairy 'queen' and fairy 'land', they both explore issues concerning the nation and national identity, as well as the roles of art and artist in the process of nation building.

With a range of devices employed in his introductions to *Rhymer*, some of which can also be discovered in his other works including his historical novels, Scott accords to the ballad a position of an authoritative Scottish national cultural and literary monument. Indeed, the Introduction to the 'Part First' of *Rhymer* is primarily concerned with the authentication of the ballad, as well as the examination of the identity of Thomas the protagonist and the places in the Border region portrayed in the ballad, rather than with any kind of observation about fairies and supernatural phenomena.

Few personages are so renowned in tradition as Thomas of Ercildoune, known by the appellation of *The Rhymer*. Uniting, or supposed to unite, in his person, the powers of poetical composition, and of vaticination, his memory, even after the lapse of five hundred years, is regarded with veneration by his countrymen. [...] It is agreed on all hands, that the residence, and probably the birth-place, of this ancient bard, was Ercildoune, a village situated upon the Leader, two miles above its

junction with the Tweed. The ruins of an ancient tower are still pointed out as the Rhymer's castle. (*ITRI* 79, the author's emphasis)

It is through these descriptions that Scott historicises the ballad. His references to specific real-life places and ruins said to be related to Thomas strengthen the sense of continuity between the ancient past, as invoked by the ballad, and the present. As epitomised by the example of the 'Eildon Tree Stone', they also serve materially to reinforce the verisimilitude, as well as the authenticity, of the ballad. At the same time, they in turn serve to 'elf-fashion' specific places and objects, transforming them into the 'remains' of the mythic past:

The Eildon Tree, from beneath the shade of which he [Thomas] delivered his prophecies, now no longer exists; but the spot is marked by a large stone, called Eildon Tree Stone. A neighbouring rivulet takes the name of the Bogle Burn (Goblin Brook) from the Rhymer's supernatural visitants. (*ITRI* 83)

Further, in a manner analogous to the openings of his historical novels, as exemplified by *The Monastery*, Scott introduces the sources of *Rhymer* in his introduction to the 'Part First': 'It [the ballad] is given from a copy, obtained from a lady, residing not far from Ercildoune, corrected and enlarged by one in Mrs. Brown's MSS' (*ITRI* 84). In so doing, he emphasises the authenticity of the ballad, not in terms of its accuracy, but in terms of its genesis, though the identity of 'the lady' is obscure.²⁶

Thomas acquires his 'prophetic powers' through 'the intercourse between the bard and the Queen of Faëry' in the 'Fairy Land' (*ITRI* 83). Scott argues that the popular prophetic verses, which concern the 'Scottish wars of Edward III' and are

conventionally regarded as prophecies by Thomas, are ‘a forgery, and not the production of our Thomas the Rhymer’ (*ITR* 100). In his Introduction to the ‘Part Second’, Scott is preoccupied with examining the authenticity of the prophecies ascribed to Thomas, exhibiting little interest in the description of supernatural elements surrounding the act of prophecy. This is because these prophecies characteristically narrate the fate and future of the Scottish nation:

His [Lord Hales] attention is chiefly directed to the celebrated prophecy of our bard, mentioned by Bishop Spottiswoode, bearing, that the crowns of England and Scotland should be united in the person of a king, son of a French queen, and related to Bruce in the ninth degree. Lord Hales plainly proves, that this prophecy is perverted from its original purpose, in order to apply it to the succession of James VI. [...] The prophecy, put in the name of our Thomas the Rhymer, [...] refers to a later period. [...] They [visions shown by Thomas] chiefly relate to the fields of Flodden and Pinkie, to the national distress which followed these defeats, and to future halcyon days, which are promised to Scotland. [...] Who can doubt, for a moment, that this [prophecy] refers to the battle of Flodden, and to the popular reports concerning the doubtful fate of James IV. (*ITR* 104-07)

Scott thus emphasises that the supernatural power of prophecy belonging to Thomas, which is a fairy gift, has traditionally been associated with the power to predict the future of the nation. By this association, the supernatural power is nationalised, and in turn, the future vision of the nation is elf-fashioned.

Scott recurrently presents Thomas as a profoundly significant figure in the consideration of the Borders Tradition ('It cannot be doubted, that Thomas of Ercildoune was a remarkable and important person in his own time, since, very shortly after his death, we find him celebrated as a prophet and as a poet' [*ITRI* 81]; 'a person so important in Border tradition' [*ITRI* 83]), idealising Thomas as a bardic figure, poet and prophet, representing both poesy and imagination. Scott's inaccurate identification of Thomas as the poet and author of *Sir Tristram* serves to intensify this idealisation:

Thomas the Rhymer was renowned among his contemporaries as the author of the celebrated romance of *Sir Tristrem*. [...] [I]f it [Scott's publication of *Sir Tristrem* in 1804] does not revive the reputation of *the Bard of Ercildoune*, [it] is at least the earliest specimen of Scottish poetry hitherto published. (*ITRIII* 125, my emphasis)

Scott created the 'Third Part' of *Rhymer* in an 'attempt to commemorate the Rhymer's poetical fame, and the traditional account of his marvellous return to Fairy Land' (*ITRIII* 127). Significantly, in the 'Third Part', Thomas is depicted as a 'harper bard' and 'minstrel': typical motifs emblematising both Greek myths and Romantic cultural nationalism:²⁷ 'True Thomas rose, with harp in hand, / When as the feast was done: In minstrel strife, in Fairy Land, / The elfin harp he won [*TRSIII* 129]). Scott, thus, does not only convert the protagonist of the traditional ballad into an entirely Romantic icon, but also fashions True Thomas as an epical and mythic figure.

From the examination of Scott's construction of fairy narratives in the *Minstrelsy* which has been undertaken in this section, it can be concluded that Scott's primary focus was placed in the issues of the nation, its authenticity, its identity and its future

course as portrayed through the medium of ‘fairy narratives’, rather than in the subject of fairies and the supernatural *per se*. Fairies for Scott in the *Minstrelsy*, then, are defined as a crucial vehicle for the exploration of ‘national matters’, rather than the subject of his writing. There are still questions which remain to be posed: what was Scott’s motivation for ‘elf-fashioning’ the nation? What significance did fairies actually have for him? The following sections will attempt to answer these questions by examining his original fairy representations in poems and novels.

1.3. *The Lay of the Last Minstrel* (1805)

1.3.1 Vernacular and Hybrid Epics

This section is designated to explore the portrayal of fairies in Scott’s epic poems written during the earliest stage of Scott’s literary career, primarily in *The Lay of the Last Minstrel*, with reference also to *The Lady of the Lake*. In this section, as in other sections, I will treat Scott’s fairy narrative as his original mythopoetic project which, through the construction of a national past, investigates issues concerning the nation and national identity, probing the roots and the present status, as well as the future course of, the Scottish nation. Significantly, in his fairy narratives, Scott often populates his versions of historic Scotland with fairies deriving from a plethora of international sources including traditional belief and contemporary literature, most prevalently those originating from Scotland, as well as North European regions including Scandinavia and Germany. This suggests that Scott views Scotland in a wider international perspective which reaches beyond the British Isles, presumably with more sympathy for the North European regions. In this context, Scott’s fairy narrative could be interpreted as an attempt to subvert the classic as well as hegemonic

civilisations and cultures from outer nations and empires, which he quintessentially metaphorised as the ‘Norman yoke’. These ‘yokes’ were presumably regarded by Scott as imposed by hegemonies established by the ‘southrons’: the Normans, England and also Greek and Roman empires, whose gigantic authority across their respective civilisations was subverted by numerous kinds of vernacular cultures particularly in Europe during the Romantic period. Importantly, fairies, as I will demonstrate in this section, do not merely play a crucial role in Scott’s mythopoetic project, but also serve to foreground the complexity and ambiguity in his attitude toward the nation. Scott, in accordance with contemporary antiquarians and later folklorists, regarded fairies as reminiscent of pre-Christian deities exorcised as a result of Christianisation. As opposed to the epical Greek gods and goddess, as well as the Christian God responsible for the exorcisation of pagan deities, fairies in Scott’s fairy narrative are deployed above all to represent the ‘national’ and ‘local’ deities which embody some sense of community spirit, symbolising as well as celebrating the individuality, antiquity and authenticity of Scottish culture and, hence, the cultural independence of the nation. In so doing, they offer new perspectives from which to consider national identity, versions of history and visions for the future of the nation, as liberated from the Norman and Greco-Roman, as well as English yokes.

Significantly, Thomas Hardy once described *Marmion* as ‘the *most Homeric poem* in the English language’ (qtd. Alexander 31, my emphasis), implying that he perceived the poem not merely as a verse romance, but as a kind of epic. It has been argued that epics, particularly in Europe during the Romantic period as well as throughout the nineteenth century, served as a highly politicised genre, profoundly underpinned by cultural nationalist ideologies. (Carruthers, *English Romanticism and*

the Celtic World 22). Together with myths, legends, folklore and traditional fairytales, epics were used to construct, as well as reinforce notions of national identity, serving as an emblem of the distinctive national character. Quintessential to these genres of ‘ancient’ and ‘traditional’ literature, which represent the ‘golden ages’ of each nation, is the deployment of heroic figures, as Anthony D. Smith argues in his analysis of myths and nationalism:

While definitions of grandeur and glory vary, every nationalism requires a touchstone of virtue and heroism, to guide and give meaning to the tasks of regeneration. The future of the ethnic community can only derive meaning and achieve its form from the pristine ‘golden age’ when men were ‘heroes’. [...] The epoch in which they [heroes] flourished is the great age of liberation from the foreign yoke, which released the energies of the people for cultural innovation and original political experiment. (Smith, *Myths and Memories of the Nation* 65)

Smith’s formulation is corroborated by a wide range of recent studies exploring the relationship between ‘traditional’ literature and cultural nationalism. These studies examine how national ‘traditions’ were longed for and thus forged by the Romantic cultural nationalists as part of their construction of national identities, whose influences were resonant throughout the nineteenth century. Said studies suggest that the genres of epic, myth and folklore, which abound with mythic, heroic as well as patriotic figures, played significant roles in constructing, as well as mythifying, the past and the traditions of a nation. Stephanie L. Barczewski, for instance, argues that the legends of King Arthur and Robin Hood were integral to ‘both displaying and shaping British national

identity in the nineteenth century', contributing to, as well as challenging, 'the attempt to build a consensual, celebratory national "history" based on the notion of Britain's uniquely felicitous political evolution and a related sense of a distinctive national character' (1). Barczewski's study is revealing in its suggestion that the legends of King Arthur and Robin Hood were 'utilized in literary efforts to identify and promote certain elements considered essential to British national identity' (2). It should not be overlooked, however, that although Barczewski's study criticises what she perceives to be a predominantly Anglo-centric approach in previous studies on the construction of 'British' national identity, her own work on the same topic does not proceed beyond examination of British national identity from an overwhelmingly Anglo-centric perspective. The study focuses on the processes of identity construction occurring within England, as well as the supplantation of an English national identity in the place of a British one. It neglects entirely these processes as they occurred in Scotland. For example, Barczewski writes that 'nineteenth-century Britons [...] came to see themselves as Anglo-Saxons, a race that was destined to dominate the world due to its superior vigour and strength' (8), and that 'Few others, however, shared his [James VI's] enthusiasm [for the union of England and Scotland], *especially in his new English realm*' (3, my emphasis), failing to mention the responses, as well as the considerable tension, within Scotland, as well as in Ireland and Wales, which persisted into even the twenty-first century, leading to the development of the devolutionary process as epitomised by the re-establishment of the Scottish Parliament in 1999. Further, it should also be noted that Robin Hood and King Arthur are just two of truly numerous 'traditional' iconic figures revived and reconstructed in Britain throughout the nineteenth century: as is argued throughout this entire thesis, a similar kind of

mythopoetic construction of identities (Scottish as well as British) occurred in Scotland, and employed different mythic and legendary figures as exemplified by Thomas the Rhymer and Mary Queen of Scots, together with a plethora of fairy characters representing Scottish cultural independence. The profound ambiguity and complexity in the construction of identity as it occurred in nineteenth-century Scotland is indeed an important aspect in the examination of British national identity, as illustrated by Scott's construction of 'British', 'North British' and 'Scottish' identities in his writing, between which there exists a considerable amount of tension.

Further, Barczewski, in her study, considers *Ivanhoe* as an example of Scott's construction of British identity. It should be noted that, considering *Ivanhoe* alone is in one important sense, evidence of a somewhat one dimensional approach; as Fielding points out, when Scott was writing *Ivanhoe*, he was also working on *The Monastery* ('Essay on the Text' 355-359):

So far, the story of *The Monastery* [...] is relatively self-contained. However, having once decided to bring forward the new novel to take advantage of the enforced hiatus of the *Ivanhoe* paper shortage, Scott could not keep the two works entirely separate. [...] Scott's stated intention was to publish *Ivanhoe* in Edinburgh and *The Monastery* in London as unconnected works, and with no clue as to the authorship of either [...]. (Fielding, 'Essay on the Text' 358-359)

The two novels, thus, stand like twins serving as mirror images of each other. The inter-textuality of the two simultaneously-written texts suggests that Scott's national narrative created in *Ivanhoe*, in fact has an un-narrated and repressed layer, which is accommodated in *The Monastery*. As the following section on *The Monastery*

demonstrates, the novel serves to accommodate the ‘ambiguity’, that is, cultural nationalist anxieties, which were repressed or ‘exorcised’ in the processes of the construction of British identity. *The Monastery* was thus written to accommodate Scott’s complex, contentious and emotional responses towards the union of the two nations which was repressed in *Ivanhoe*, as the latter is primarily written from a unionist standpoint. As manifested by *The Monastery*, as well as by the *Lay*, Scott tended to hide his cultural nationalist sentiment in his ‘mainstream’ prose popular amongst the English readers. At the same time, he subtly displayed the ‘ambiguous’ sentiment in his more marginal textual space evoking peculiar other-worlds, which is often represented as a dark subterranean recess haunted by fairies. In Scott’s works, as in fairy narratives by other authors, ‘haunting’ serves as a subtle and strategic mode of existence, survival and perpetuation of the ‘dissolving’ nation.

Taking a similar approach to the process of the construction of national identity through ‘traditional literature’, Lynda Pratt, in her study on the popularity of epics in eighteenth-century and early nineteenth-century England, suggests that newly created national epics featuring King Alfred the Great enjoyed considerable popularity: some of these new Alfred-epics were published in the *Anti-Jacobin Review*, a considerably scotophobic medium, and were favourably reviewed by the *British Critic*.²⁸ Further, the discovery and construction of national tradition was accompanied by the development and refinement of those academic disciplines concerned with them: Jennifer Schacker, for example, traces the roots of folklore studies in nineteenth-century England to ‘the quest for national identity and cultural purity that began in the late eighteenth century’ (2).

In this context, James Hogg's *The Queen's Wake* can be defined uncontroversially as a subversive counter-response to the Anglo-centric cultural climate in England, as well as in Britain. By featuring Mary, Queen of Scots as the Fairy Queen, Hogg fashions the poem as a Scottish vernacular epic, standing provocatively in opposition to the contemporary English epics featuring King Alfred, as well as *The Faerie Queene*, an epic by Edmund Spenser written much earlier which depicts Queen Elizabeth I as the Faerie Queene.²⁹ Significantly, all of these monarchs are not merely made into emphatic national icons, but are also closely associated with art and literature, with Alfred being a promoter of literary renaissance, and Mary herself a poet, representing the flourishing of the Scottish Renaissance.³⁰

With the term 'vernacular epic', I intend to refer to verses narrated in 'vernacular' languages as opposed to the hegemonic languages including Greek and Latin, as well as, in the particular case of Scottish Literature, the Standard English. In a similar manner to 'mock epics', epitomised by *The Rape of the Lock*, vernacular epics emulate classical epics in their style, plot and setting. Further, as genres, both vernacular epics and mock ones can be regarded as highly politicised as well as subversive, disseminating satirical comments on various aspects of their extra-textual situation. Vernacular epics, however, stand in stark contrast to this in their persistent concern with national matters, often with cultural nationalistic ideological underpinnings, which are latent in their persistent representation, as well as celebration, of the vernacular.

In the *Lake*, for instance, Scott opens the narrative with the figure of an old minstrel equipped with the vernacularised 'Harp of the North' (*Lake* i. 'The Chase' 1).

The harp, often accompanied by a minstrel, is an important instrumental motif traditionally employed in ancient literature including epics and elegies. Presumably for this reason, it was a popular motif among the Romantic poets, who often saw it as a symbol of inspiration and poesie. The old minstrel with his 'harp of the north', whom Scott possibly modelled on himself to some extent, evokes the national past, linking the present to the traditions which are specifically defined as Scottish: 'The last of all the Bards was he, / Who sung of Border chivalry;' (*Lake* Introduction 7-8). As C. M. Bowra argues, poets such as Milton, in writing literary epics, 'add grandeur and complexity to their contemporary themes by relating them to the past and producing a scheme which explains the present through its remote origins' (16); the act of evoking the past mirrors the Romantic nationalistic quest for national identity.

Further, in his description of the protagonist Ellen's beauty in the *Lake*, Scott even claims the superiority of vernacular images of beauty over classic ones: 'Like monument of Grecian art, / In listening mood, she [Ellen] seem'd to stand, / The guardian Naiad of the strand' (*Lake* I.xvii.22-24). The classic, or 'universal' ideal of beauty represented by the Grecian urn is subverted by his creation of Ellen, a Scottish character whose beauty, enhanced by her vernacular language is depicted as surpassing the classic and universal ideal of beauty embodied by the Greek goddesses and fairies:

What though upon her speech there hung
 The accents of the mountain tongue,—
 Those silver sounds, so soft, so dear,
 The listener held his breath to hear! (*Lake* I.xviii.17-20)
 And ne'er did Grecian chisel trace
 A Nymph, a Naiad, or a Grace,

Of finer form, or lovelier face! (*Lake* l.xviii. 1-3).

The depiction of Ellen's 'Scottish' beauty, as surpassing the beauty of the emblematic symbol of Greco-Roman civilisation, epitomises that vernacular epics challenge and subvert the cultural hegemonies represented by the 'classic' epics. By employing and celebrating voices, languages, iconic figures, motifs and locations which are attributed to the specific nation in question, vernacular epics serve to construct and mythify the past, the shared memories and the traditions, which are perceived to authorise the alleged cultural independence of their nation.

In this context, I shall interpret the *Lay* as Scott's attempt to create a vernacular epic, which serves to aid in the construction of national identity, representing the individuality, authenticity and independence of the nation. In spite of these fundamentally cultural nationalist ideological underpinnings, however, it should be noted that there are profound ambiguities and complexities pertaining to national identity latent in Scott's fairy representations in this poem, which are not only vernacular, but also hybrid. In creating them, Scott intentionally drew on a variety of sources, not only turning for inspiration to traditional Scottish belief but also to Scandinavian myths as well as contemporary German literature employing fairies, most conspicuously, *Undine* by Fouqué. Underlying this eclecticism, there lies an intention *not* to construct a 'purely Scottish' epic, in other words, an extremely cultural nationalist one. Unlike some of the Alfred epics, the political messages conveyed by the *Lay* as represented by its elfin characters are profoundly ambiguous. They sometimes bear traces of 'unionist' sentiment, contrived to reconcile oppositions between the two nations, though there are also cultural nationalistic motivations latent in the text of the

Lay which resist and subvert reconciliation.

Reflecting the political as well as cultural situation faced by Scotland in Scott's own time, fairies in his vernacular-hybrid epics thus serve to foreground the tension between cultural nationalist, cosmopolitan and unionist ideologies; the form of fairies function as the stage upon which disparate ideologies, as well as cultures, clash.

1.3.2. Enchanted Landscape and Nationalised Spirits

The *Lay* takes place over a period of three days and three nights in the Borders region in the middle of the sixteenth century.³¹ The textual landscape in Canto I is riddled with elves and spirits.³² The mountain and the river are personified as the 'Mountain Spirit' and 'River Spirit', and their conversation is presented in the form of a dramatic dialogue.

It was the Spirit of the Flood that spoke,

And he call'd on the Spirit of the Fell.

[.]

RIVER SPIRIT

'Sleep'st thou, brother?' —

MOUNTAIN SPIRIT

—'Brother, nay—

On my hills the moon beams play.

By every rill, in every glen,

Merry elves their morris pacing,

To aerial minstrelsy,

Emerald rings on brown heath tracing,

Tip it deft and merrily.

Up, and mark their nimble feet!

Up, and list their music sweet!’ (*Lay* I.xiv.1-xv.11)³³

It is significant that amongst a plethora of natural components which make up the landscape, the river and the mountain were specifically selected as those to be brought to life. Although animism is a widely-known feature witnessed in a wide range of myths and legends originating from all over the world, Scott’s choice to animate the river and the mountain in particular can be regarded as influenced by traditional Scottish fairy belief. Whilst Samuel Egerton Brydges criticises the spirits’ dialogue as ‘needless and unpoetical’, forming ‘no part of the local superstition of the Lowlands’ (qtd. in Parsons 58), Marian F. McNeill states that animation of mountains and rivers can be characteristically found in the fairy belief in the Highlands:

Traces of the old animism linger in the tales of [...] the Cailleachan or storm-hags, who together represent the elemental forces of nature, particularly in a destructive aspect; [...] [and] in the legend of river spirits [...]. Many a mountain has its Cailleach. The *Cailleach nan Cruachan* [italicised by the author], for example, dwelt on the summit of Ben Cruachan. [...] Many a river, too, has its spirit. ‘Glen Cuaich, in Inverness-shire’, writes Professor Watson [W. J. Watson, author of *Celtic Place-Names of Scotland* (1926)], ‘is—or was till lately—haunted by a being known as Cuachag, the river sprite.’ (McNeill 124)

In Canto VI of the *Lay*, close to the end of the narrative, Scott lays a section of notable patriotism and emotional input, wherein mountains and rivers are employed as

components of the ingenious national character, representing the homeland itself:

O Caledonia! Stern and wild,
 [.]
 Land of the mountain and the flood,
 [.]
 Land of my sires! what mortal hand
 Can e'er untie the filial band,
 That knits me to thy rugged strand! (*Lay* XI.ii.1-7)

In this context, Scott's deployment of the mountain and the river is apparently underpinned by cultural nationalist ideology. However, surprisingly, the political views voiced through these animated sprites are indubitably unionist.

As in many of Scott's fictional works, the region depicted in the poem is in a heightened state of conflict. Although shadows of England are represented as threatening, the perils threatening the region in the poem are depicted as stemming primarily from the discordance and disintegration within the region itself, as represented by the tension between the clans of Carr and Scott.

Can piety the discord heal,
 Or stanch the death-feud's enmity?
 Can Christian lore, can patriot zeal,
 Can love of blessed charity?
 No! vainly to each holy shrine,
 In mutual pilgrimage, they drew;
 For chiefs, their own red falchions slew;

While Cessford owns the rule of Carr,
 While Ettrick boasts the line of Scott,
 The slaughter'd chiefs, the mortal jar,
 The havoc of the feudal war,
 Shall never, never be forgot! (*Lay* I.viii.1-13)

Scotland is rendered considerably vulnerable by its state of dissolution, and therefore faces the utmost danger when it is attacked by the English. However, it escapes this danger at the critical moment, after Lord Craunston, a knight serving the clan of Carr, rescues the heir of Scott from the English, followed by reconciliation and union represented by a marriage. The ideological underpinning of this main plot appears to be straightforwardly unionist, reflective of the political situation in extra-textual reality, with the outbreak of the Napoleonic Wars (1803-15). The Scots clans in conflict in the narrative metaphorise contemporary Scotland and England, while the English, 'the Other' which serves as the unifying force,³⁴ represents France.

Significantly, the Mountain Spirit and the River Spirit are depicted as seeing the state of affairs in the world of humans from an omniscient perspective. Through their dramatic dialogue, they express lamentations as well as pessimistic prophecies pertaining to the outcome of the conflicts within the nation:

'Tears of an imprison'd maiden
 Mix with my polluted stream;
 [.]
 Tell me [the River Spirit] thou [the Mountain Spirit], who view'st the
 stars,
 When shall cease these feudal jars?'

[.]

‘Ill may I [the Mountain Spirit] read their [the stars’] high decree!

But no kind influence deign they shower

On Teviot’s tide, and Branksome’s tower,

Till pride be quell’d, and love be free. (*Lay* I.xvi.1-xvii.10)

The message conveyed by the utterance of these spirits is thus considerably politicised, concerned with the most beneficial direction for the nation. Clearly influenced by elements of unionist ideology, they regard reconciliation between the clans, as well as the unity within the Scottish nation, as straightforwardly beneficial for the nation, and the disintegration and endless conflicts as productive of a perilous outcome. Although the presence of the Mountain Spirit and the River Spirit are reduced to voiceless components of the background landscape after this scene positioned in an early part of the poem, their prophesy echoes throughout its entire body. Later in the climactic moments of the narrative, it influences Lady Scott’s decision as to whether she should let her daughter marry Henry Cranstoun, a knight serving the opposing clan: she finally permits their marriage, and thus makes a ‘unionist’ decision (‘She [Ladye Scott] look’d to river, look’d to hill, /Thought on the Spirit’s prophecy’ [*Lay* V.xxvi.1-2]).

It would be, however, a one-dimensional reading if one interprets the *Lay* simply as an epic poem promoting enlightened and unionist ideologies. As I will demonstrate in the following sub-sections, Scott subtly reveals his profoundly ambiguous, contradictory and complex, as well as subversive attitude to the issues pertaining to the nation and national identity, in the other-worldly textual space haunted by fairies.

The enchanted textual space as described by the Mountain Spirit is filled with ethereal and gay elfin characters dancing in the moonlight. The moonlight, closely associated with both the fairies and the dead, plays a significant role in the *Lay*, as an alternative source of the light ('The Monk gazed long on the lovely moon, / Then into the night he looked forth; / [...] / He knew, by the streamers that shot so bright, / That spirits were riding the northern light' [*Lay* II.viii.5-14]). As opposed to the sunlight which is depicted as hegemonic, the moonlight is used to provide alternative viewpoints and discloses hidden objects, truth, prophecies, memories and desires:

If thou wouldst view fair Melrose aright,
 Go visit it by the pale moonlight;
 For the gay beams of lightsome day
 Gild, but to flout, the ruins grey; (*Lay* I.ii.1-2)
 The silver light, so pale and faint,
 Show'd many a prophet, and many a saint,
 Whose image on the glass was dyed;
 [.]
 The moonbeam kiss'd the holy pane,
 And threw on the pavement a bloody stain (*Lay* II.xi.9-16)
 When the bell toll'd one, and the moon was bright,
 And I dug his [Michael Scott's] chamber among the dead,
 When the floor of the chancel was stained red. (*Lay* II.xv.8-10)

Together with the fairies, the moonlight in the *Lay* creates an alternative, other-worldly and potentially subversive textual space, which has the capacity to accommodate opinions and emotions, particularly concerning Scottish

nationalism, that cannot be voiced elsewhere. The creation of the moon-lit elfin space in the *Lay* echoes the creation of an ‘obscure corner’ (394-95 qtd. Lee) in *Redgauntlet*, which, as Yoon Sun Lee suggests, serves as a kind of hideout wherein the ‘not forgiven’ ‘questions and demands of Scottish nationalism’ might be asked: ‘the questions and demands of Scottish nationalism were not forgiven, only deferred, as recent history demonstrates’ (Lee, ‘Giants in the North: Douglas, the Scottish Enlightenment, and Scott's *Redgauntlet*').

1.3.3 Changeling, Transformations and the Sense of Loss:

Magical Beings and the Problematised Identity

This sub-section explores those problems of identity dramatised by the Goblin page and the Mighty Book: two kind of magical beings employed in the *Lay*, who play crucial roles in its dramatic development. The Goblin page, in particular, is a strikingly important character amongst a plethora of supernatural characters and objects deployed in Scott's fairy narrative, because it serves as a vehicle with which Scott voiced his profoundly ambivalent views pertaining to national identity, as well as the future course of the Scottish nation.

In the narrative of the *Lay*, the imagery of conflict and disintegration is represented by multiple sets of dichotomies. For instance, Margaret of Branksome and Lord Henry of Cranstoun, that is, lovers who are initially torn between the two opposing clans in a manner analogous to *Romeo and Juliet*, yet are eventually united in the happy-ending of the poem, symbolise the negative and tragic aspect of the conflict, together with the benefits brought by reconciliation and union. Lord Cranstoun, on the other hand, stands in a relationship of tension with Lady Scott, who is the mother

of Margaret, because they are both representative figures from the two opposing parties in the battle. Significantly, both of them are associated with magical beings. Whilst Lady Scott attempts to retrieve the 'Mighty Book', a magical object created by her wizard ancestor, Lord Henry is served by his 'Goblin page', an elfin character named Gilpin Horner. Furthermore, the Goblin page is presented as opposed to Lady Scott, and these two characters establish another dichotomy, in that the Goblin page is the demonic fairy, whilst Lady Scott is a human witch who has knowledge of 'mystic art': magic and charms.

It is of profound importance that Scott also refers to the Goblin page as a dwarf (*Lay* VI.viii.1), confusing and conflating goblins with dwarfs, which are different, though overlapping, categories of fairies from disparate origins. It is highly possible that Scott did this intentionally for two reasons. First, there are many traces in his fairy writing, not limited to the *Lay*, that Scott consciously created hybrid fairies deriving from a plethora of international fairy beliefs and writing. Second, Scott was clearly aware that goblins and dwarfs derive from different origins. In the *Demonology*, as in *On Fairies*, Scott explores the origin and development of Scottish fairy belief from an international perspective. Quoting John Leyden's observation, he refers to the 'first idea of the elfin people': 'Dr Leyden [...] found the first idea of the elfin people in the Northern opinions concerning the duergar, or dwarfs' (*Demonology* 76). In the argument that follows, Scott draws a map of diminutive supernatural beings dwelling in 'dark and solitary', as well as subterranean places, in the Northern half of Europe from an euhemeristic perspective. He refers to small fairies traditionally believed in Finland, Germany, England and Scotland, as well as 'Drows' in

the ‘Orkney and Zetland [Shetland] Islands’:

Duergar were originally nothing else than the diminutive natives of the Lappish, Lettish and Finnish nations, who, flying before the conquering weapons of the Asae, hid themselves from their Eastern invaders. [...] These oppressed yet dreaded figures obtained, naturally enough, the character of the German spirits called *Kobold* [italicised by the author], from which the English goblin and the Scottish bogle, by some inversion and alteration of pronunciation, are evidently derived. (*Demonology* 76-77)

From this paragraph, it may be fairly inferred that, in his creation of the Goblin page, Scott intentionally avoided drawing on Scottish bogles, but mixed instead ideas of Teutonic dwarfs and duergar, as well as English goblins. Significantly, Scott’s deployment of Teutonic dwarfs as his source of inspiration overlaps with his use of Teutonic mercenaries in the narrative of the *Lay* as metaphors of wandering and loss of homeland (*Lay* IV.xviii). The origin, as well as the identity, of the Goblin page can thus be defined as hybrid, cosmopolitan and ambiguous, as well as experimental, presumably designated to represent Scott’s views on Scottish national identity. One could interpret the figure of the ‘hybrid’ fairy, who also suffers from a sense of loss and anxiety of existence, metaphorises the new national identity of Scotland as ‘North Britain’. It is therefore vital to consider the significance of the Goblin page, and consider the problems of origin and identity which the character foregrounds in more detail.

It is worthy of note that neither dwarfs nor goblins can be found in traditional

Scottish fairy belief: there are no entries for either of them in the index of McNeill's *The Silver Bough*, which includes more 'typically' Scottish fairies as can be found in oral tradition, such as kelpies, selkies, bogles and brownies (219-34). Further, although representations of diminutive supernatural beings can be found in traditional Scottish fairy belief, they are generally not called 'dwarfs', but pygmies, leprechauns and 'the Wee Wee Man' (HC 47-55). Significantly, as Scott himself observes, and Katharine Briggs corroborates, dwarfs derive primarily from Scandinavian and German myths: 'Germany is the great home of dwarfs, and *the Isle of Rügen has dwarfs both black and white*. [...] but though there are many stunted and grotesque figures in English fairy-lore, it is doubtful if they were ever explicitly called 'dwarfs' (*A Dictionary of Fairies* 115, my emphasis). Further, it is of note that although they may not be generally called 'dwarfs', small fairies are often considered as a distinctive feature of English fairies as opposed to Scottish ones: 'Scotland's southern neighbour certainly seems to have had a smaller type of fairy' (HC 47). In Scotland, dwarfs can therefore be defined as literary fairies inspired by international sources: when Henderson and Cowan mention elfin figures precisely called 'dwarfs', they tend to appear in chapters on 'writing' of fairies (163, 197). Similarly, as pointed out by Parsons, goblins derive from English fairy belief ('the mischievous and even malignant English cousins of bogles [...] [which] sometimes migrate' [P 257]). They can rarely be discovered in Scottish fairy belief and writing; even in Scott's works, their appearance is 'infrequent' (P 256).

It may be inferred, then, that Scott intentionally created the Goblin page as an un-Scottish fairy from sources external to Scotland. Furthermore, both dwarfs and

goblins are recurrently employed as central characters throughout Scott's work, bearing profound significance in his writing. A 'black dwarf', indubitably inspired by the fairy belief in the Isle of Rügen, plays the vital role in the eponymous historical novel *The Black Dwarf* (1816), as well as, as pointed out by Parsons, in *The Pirate* (1822) and *Peperil of the Peak* (1822). Though they are often employed figuratively, goblins occupy significant places in both the *Lake* and *The Doom of Devorgoil* (1830), a 'melodrama' which is also called 'tales of goblinry'. Significantly, Scott's usage of the words 'goblinise' and 'goblinry' are quoted with the earliest examples in the *OED* definition of the word 'goblin', suggesting that Scott indeed coined these two words.

The common features shared by representations of goblins and dwarfs can be summarised by their diminutive form, their grotesqueness and maliciousness, together with their ingenious skills in creating artefacts, in particular from underground treasures including jewels and metals. In modern folkloristic definitions, in which Scott's influence can be detected, a goblin is defined as 'a grotesque, diminutive, and generally malicious earth spirit or sprite' (Rose 128), and a dwarf as '*a type of elf or goblin* [my emphasis]' which is generally described as having a 'humanoid' and diminutive, as well as deformed shape, being associated with underground treasures including jewels and metals, and having an ability to 'shape shift at will' (Rose 93). As this example suggests, goblins and dwarfs have often been conflated. Carole Silver, for example, argues that '[T]hroughout the Victorian period, dwarfs—*natural or supernatural*—had been conflated with each other and equated with goblins [...] and thus malice and evil' (117, emphasis mine). Considering the fact that Scott uses the terms 'goblin' and 'dwarf' to point to the same character, the processes of conflation of these two categories must already have occurred before the Victorian period, originating either

with Scott himself or with his predecessors.

It should be noted, however, that there are important differences between goblins and dwarfs from a lexical as well as a folkloric perspective. The goblins, with the earliest example of usage in 1327, originally signified '[a] mischievous and ugly demon' ('Goblin', *OED* def.1). Thus representing a minor form of deity, goblins definitely belong to the realm of the supernatural, the nonhuman and the monstrous. 'Dwarf', on the other hand, is a profoundly ambiguous term, blurring the boundary between 'natural' and 'supernatural', as well as between 'human' and 'fairy'.³⁵ The word has been commonly used to refer to both human and supernatural beings: the *OED*, for instance, defines a dwarf both as human and as supernatural: '[a] human being much below the ordinary stature or size; a pygmy' ('Dwarf', *OED* def. A.1.a), and 'One of a supposed race of diminutive beings, who figure in Teutonic and esp. Scandinavian mythology and folk-lore; often identified with the elves, and supposed to be endowed with special skill in working metals, etc' ('Dwarf', *OED* def. A.1.b). Carole Silver argues that the term 'dwarf', which includes both 'natural' and 'supernatural' types, has historically been profoundly ambivalent, largely because of its complicated relationships to the 'human being': whilst some of the dwarfs are imaginary, others were nothing but human. Further, Silver suggests that historically, 'smaller' people were made into pets for aristocracy: together with the indigenous people as well as the pagan deities, these dwarfs are thought to have partly inspired the belief in the 'supernatural dwarfs'. In the Victorian period with its high obsession with the spectacular, it was not uncommon to see people masquerading as 'supernatural dwarfs' in exhibitions in order to make a living (Silver).

Reflecting the historical and cultural context as observed above, whilst goblins

are definitely categorised as belonging to the realm of the supernatural and monstrous, dwarfs tend to be depicted as more ‘natural’ and humanlike both in terms of appearance and behaviour. Although grotesqueness and maliciousness are quintessential to goblins, dwarfs are not necessarily hideous or malicious. There are examples of both ‘good’ dwarfs and ‘bad’ ones even within the corpus of *Kinder- und Hausmärchen*: in ‘Snow White and Seven Dwarfs’, dwarfs serve as kind helpers for the heroine, whilst in ‘Snow White and Rose Red’, a ‘wicked dwarf’ steals the prince’s treasures and transforms him into a bear with his spell (774). Dwarfs can thus be regarded as ambiguous characters and, in reflection of this comes Scott’s ambivalent depiction of the Goblin page in the *Lay*, who is alternately referred to as goblin and dwarf at different times.

Importantly, dwarfs bear considerable significance in Scott’s writing, not only because they are, as Katharine Briggs suggests, ‘often mentioned as attendants on ladies in Arthurian legends’ (*A Dictionary of Fairies* 115), but also because of their origin and antiquity. In *On the Fairies*, an essay wherein he traces the origins of British fairies, Scott identifies dwarfs as one of the most ancient ‘races’ of fairies, as well as constituting the ‘prototype’ of the English elf:

[T]he prototype of the English elf is to be sought chiefly in the *berg-elfen*, or *duergar* [italicised by the author] of the Scandinavians. From the most early of the Icelandic Sagas, as well as from the Edda itself, we learn the belief of the northern nations in a race of dwarfish spirits, inhabiting the rocky mountains, and approaching, in some respects, to the human nature. (*OF* 301)

This extract reveals an important feature of Scott’s treatment of fairies. He associates

fairies with the issues of nation, and treat them as an emblematic symbol of national culture through which he reflects on various issues concerning national identity. Through the figures of elves and fairies, Scott here foregrounds the cultural and historical link between England the Scandinavian countries, forming a wide group of nations covering the Northern part of Europe. In this extract, fairy belief is implicitly viewed as an embodiment of national culture. His search for its origin can thus be perceived as equivalent to the quest for the roots of the nation, its people and its culture. Scott's identification of dwarfs as the most 'ancient race' of fairies constitutes the chief reason why dwarfs, among other varieties of fairies, are given crucial roles in his fairy writing. Dwarfs in part represent ancestors, emphasise the rootedness of the national culture in the ancient and pre-historic past, and also foreground how Scottish culture has traditionally interacted with, and shared many things in common with international cultures in Northern Europe. They also embody Scott's anxieties regarding national identity, which underlies his quest for national identity through tracing back the genealogy of fairy belief.

These [dwerger] were, however, it must be owned, spirits of a coarser sort, more laborious vocation and more malignant temper, and in all respects less propitious to humanity, *than the fairies (properly so called), which were the invention of the Celtic people and displayed the superiority of taste and fancy which, with the love of music and poetry, has been generally ascribed to their race, through its various classes and modifications.* (*Demonology* 76, my emphasis)

Here it is revealed that Scott's partiality towards those fairies in the Celtic tradition is responsible for a certain amount of distortion on Scott's part of these beings. Although

some fairies imagined by the Celtic people, epitomised by the Fairy Queen in the ballad ‘Thomas the Rhymer’, are indeed nothing but perilous and malicious to a considerable degree, Scott here implies that they are ‘less’ coarse and malicious than dwergers. Similarly, Scott also claims the superiority of ‘British’ fairies over German Kobolds:

[I]t was a bolder stretch of the imagination which confounded this reserved and sullen race [i.e. Kobolds] with the livelier and gayer spirit which bears correspondence with the British fairy. Neither can we be surprised that the duergar, ascribed by many persons to this source, should exhibit a dark and more malignant character than the elves that revel by moonlight in more southern climates.
(*Demonology* 77)

Further, on the basis of their fairy beliefs, Scott claims and celebrates the superiority of the imagination of the ‘Celts’ over those of the Scandinavians and Germans:

We have already observed, *what indeed makes a great feature of their* [‘the Celts’] *national character, that the power of the imagination is peculiarly active among the Celts*, and leads to an enthusiasm concerning national music and dancing, national poetry and song, the departments in which fancy most readily indulges herself. The Irish, the Welsh, the Gael or Scottish Highlander, all tribes of Celtic descent, assigned to the Men of Peace, Good Neighbours, or by whatever other names they called these sylvan pigmies, more social habits, and a course of existence far more gay, than the sullen and heavy toils of the more saturnine Duergar. (*Demonology* 78, my emphasis)

Scott’s ideas about dwarfs are thus profoundly underpinned by his ideas about nations,

national characters and national identity. As the following sub-section will demonstrate, the Goblin page, Scott's original elfin character created in the *Lay*, serves to dramatise his complex responses to these issues pertaining to the nation.

It is of note that two significant leitmotifs of the *Lay* are generated by the Goblin-page and the Mighty Book: the mysterious identities of the Goblin-page and the Mighty Book, as well as the quest for the Mighty Book by William of Deloraine, a human bandit whom Lady Scott orders to retrieve the Book hidden in Melorse Abbey at the outset of the poem. Deloraine plays a quintessential role in triggering the deconstruction of the sets of binary oppositions devised in the narrative. Depicted as an outlaw in double senses, belonging to neither the English monarch nor the Scottish one ('[f]ive times outlawed' both by 'England's King, and Scotland's Queen' [*Lay* I.xxi.15-16]), Deloraine ambivalently embodies anxieties with regard to national identity. Further, by *failing* to deliver the retrieved Mighty Book to Lady Scott, but instead, being defeated by Henry Cronstoun and having the Book stolen by the Goblin page, Deloraine unintentionally prevents Lady Scott from using the Mighty Book, thus contributing to the avoidance of the perilous clash between the two clans. Before he sets out on his quest, Lady Scott forbids Deloraine to look at the Mighty Book with a fearful warning: 'Be it scroll, or be it book, /Into it, Knight, thou must not look; / If thou redest, thou art lorn! / Better hadst thou ne'er been born' (*Lay* I.xxiii.3-6). Because Ladye Scott does not receive it, the Book remains unused throughout most of the narrative, and its power and function, hence its identity, remain unknown.

The Goblin page can also be considered a narrative element designated to dramatise problems with regard to national identity. Although the character is often

associated with an oak, the symbol of the ancient past “Beneath an oak, moss’d o’er by
eld, / The Baron’s Dwarf his courser held, / And held his crested helm and spear: / That
Dwarf was scarce an earthly man’ (*Lay* II.xxxi.1-5); ‘And now, in Branksome’s good
greenwood, / As under the aged oak he [the Goblin] stood, / The Baron’s courser pricks
his ears, / As if a distant noise he hears’ [*Lay* III.xxxiv.1-4]), his identity is represented
as obscure. Importantly, as observed in the previous sub-section, the character was
concocted as a hybrid character, inspired by a variety of international sources, and can
thus be regarded as a representation of Scott’s experimental construction of a new and
cosmopolitan Scottish national identity. The Goblin page, therefore, serves to
represent vital issues pertaining to Scottish national identity as observed by Scott: the
need to construct a new identity suitable for the contemporary cosmopolitan world, as
well as the need to negotiate the tension between the newly constructed identity and the
old one. Significantly, the behaviour of the Goblin page within the narrative, which
includes self-transformation, the leaving of changelings and identity theft, accompanied
by the peculiar sense of loss which he recurrently exhibits, foregrounds anxieties caused
by these issues with regard to Scottish national identity in Scott’s time.

In spite of his euhemeristic identification of the origin of dwarfs in the
ingenious people in Scandinavia in the *Demonology* quoted earlier, Scott definitely
represents the Goblin-page as a fairy, in other words, a non-human. The character is
consciously de-humanised, as well as de-Christianised: he is depicted as having
‘unchristen’d’ hands (*Lay* III.ix.6), and as looking like ‘scarce an earthly man’ (*Lay*
II.xxxi.1-4). Echoing the representation of Undine by Fouqué as a water spirit without
a soul, the Goblin in the *Lay* is depicted as a soulless and inhuman spirit, devoid of the

faculty to understand either love or sympathy:

Oft have I mused, what purpose bad
 That found malicious urchin had
 To bring this meeting round;
 For happy love's a heavenly sight,
 And by a vile malignant sprite
 In such no joy is found;
 [.]
 But earthly spirit could not tell
 The heart of them [Margaret and Henry] that loved so well.
 True love's the gift which God has given
 To man alone beneath the heaven:
 [.]
 It is the secret sympathy,
 The silver link, the silken tie,
 Which heart to heart, and mind to mind,
 In body and in soul can bind. (*Lay* V.xiii.13-24)

Further, as well as maliciousness, the Goblin page is typified by deformity and ambivalence in his appearance. Lying somewhere between that of a small animal, an ape and a human being, his appearance is characterised by a lack of balance and harmony: 'He was waspish, arch, and litherlie' (*Lay* II.xxxii.7); 'And, like tennis-ball by racket toss'd, / A leap, of thirty feet and three, / Made from the gorse this elfin shape, / Distorted like some dwarfish ape' (*Lay* II.xxxi.10-13). He is thus described as hideous creature with grotesque body and 'foul' hands (*Lay* V.xxvii.131), as well as superhuman

strength, who is malignant towards human characters other than his master Henry:

Could he [the Goblin] have had his pleasure vilde,
 He had crippled the joints of the nobel child;
 Or, with his fingers long and lean,
 Had strangled him in flendish spleen:
 But his awful mother he had in dread,
 And also his power was limited;
 So he but scowl'd on the startled child,
 And darted through the forest wild: (*Lay* III.xiii.5-12)

Whate'er he [the Goblin] did of gramarye,
 Was always done maliciously;
 He flung the warrior on the ground,
 And the blood well'd freshly from the wound. (*Lay* III.xi.14-19)

The Goblin page's malicious behaviours toward the humans using his magical powers include stealing a child, leaving a changeling in its place and transforming himself as well as others. When he steals the heir of the clan of Scott, he leaves the stolen boy in the woods. Accordingly, the Goblin page transforms himself into the shape of the stolen heir and stays within the Hall: 'Although the child was led away, / In Branksome still he seem'd to stay, / For so the Dwarf his part did play' (*Lay* III.xxi.1-3). The Goblin's abduction and transformation undermines the order within the castle of the Scott clan, his master's enemy, causing considerable political upheaval: 'And, in the shape of that young boy, / He [the Goblin] wrought the castle much annoy./ The comrades of the young Buccleuch / He pinch'd, and beat, and overthrew; / Nay, some of

them he well-nigh slew' (*Lay* III.xxi.3-8);

Well may you think, the wily page [in disguise]

Cared not to face the Ladye sage.

He counterfeited childish fear,

And shriek'd, and shed full many a tear,

And moan'd and plain'd in manner wild.

[.]

She [Ladye Scott] blush'd blood-red for very shame:—

[.]

'Sure some fell find has cursed our line,

That coward should e'er be son of mine!' — (*Lay* IV.xiv.1-16)

The stolen child, on the other hand, is eventually saved by an English yeoman, toward whom he is hostile: “‘Yes! I am come of high degree, / For I am the heir of bold Buccleuch; / And, if thou dost not set me free, / False Southron, thou shalt dearly rue!’” (*Lay* III.xix.1-4). Significantly, the Goblin page's magic of transfiguration is destroyed by the river: ‘The running stream dissolved the spell, / And his own elvish shape he took’ (*Lay* III.xiii.3-4); ‘The elf, amid the running stream, / His figure changed, like form in dream, / And fled, and shouted, “Lost! Lost! Lost!”’ (*Lay* IV.xv.10-12).

All of these features of the Goblin page as we have observed can be defined as typical traditional fairy tale motifs, including those in the collection by the Grimms, as well as ‘The Wee-Wee Man’³⁶. Just as giants in traditional European fairy belief are often considered to be representations of the devil, dwarfs, together with hobgoblins and brownies, also are often depicted as diabolic.³⁷ It should be, however, noted that

Scott's representation of the Goblin page is acutely underpinned by anxieties pertaining to national identities. The hybrid Goblin page embodies the new, cosmopolitan and modernised national identity. That the Goblin page plays the crucial role in uniting the separated lovers through a series of transformations of his own figure as well as of other human characters suggests that, in order to consummate the Union, it is inevitable to transform national identities, even though the new form of the nation, along with that of identity, might appear to be deformed, grotesque and soul-less.

Importantly, the depiction of the Goblin-page as deformed, grotesque and soul-less, together with the peculiar sense of loss which he recurrently exhibits, metaphorises fears and anxieties arising from the changes occurring to the nation as well as national identity: 'Twas said, when the Baron [Henry] a-hunting rode/ Through Reedsdale's glens, but rarely trod, / He heard a voice cry, "Lost! lost! lost!"' [*Lay* II.xxxi.7-9]; 'Little he [the Dwarf] ate, and less he spoke, / Nor mingled with the menial flock: / And oft apart his arms he toss'd, / And often mutter'd, / Lost! lost! lost!' [*Lay* II.xxxii.3-6]; 'The woodland brook he bounding cross'd, / And laugh'd and shouted, "Lost! Lost! Lost!"' [*Lay* III.xiii.13-14]). The repeated imagery of the fairy's being lost overlaps with that of wandering, perhaps as well as rootless-ness, evoked by the figures of the old minstrel, the narrator:

Breathes there the man, with soul so dead,
 Who never to himself hath said,
 This is my own, my native land!
 Whose heart hath ne'er within him burn'd,
 As home his footsteps he hath turn'd,
 From wandering on a foreign strand! (*Lay* XI.i.1-6)

It also echoes in the depiction of Teutonic mercenaries employed by the English:

Behind the English bill and bow,
 The mercenaries, firm and slow,
 Moved on to fight, in dark array,
 By Conrad led of Wolfenstein,
 Who brought the band from the distant Rhine,
 And sold their blood for foreign pay.
 The camp their home, their law the sword,
 They knew no country, own'd no lord:
 They were not arm'd like England's sons,
 [.]
 All, as they march'd, in rugged tongue,
 Songs of Teutonic feuds they sung. (*Lay* IV.xviii.1-16)

The greatest catastrophic moment within the narrative of the *Lay* arrives when the Goblin page opens the Magical Book, and is 'found' by Michael Scott, the ghostly creator of the device: 'The elvish page fell to the ground, / And, shuddering, mutter'd, "Found! Found! Found!"' (*Lay* VI.xxiv.15-16). The identity of the Goblin-page is doubly revealed in this scene: whilst Michael Scott, his former master, 'finds' it by using the Mighty Book, the readers also discovers it by Scott's footnote: 'his magician master [Michael Scott], through the Lady's contrivance [the Mighty Book], has found and recalled him' (Scott, Notes on *Lay* 146). It is also revealed that the function of the Mighty Book, which has been obscure, is no other than identifying a person. Standing in stark contrast with the magical power of the Goblin page, which serves to change, transform and hide one's identity, the Mighty Book serves to find one's true identity.

Significantly, these magical beings and their powers, both of which deal with identities, are persistently depicted as dark and ominous throughout the narrative. The sense of fear and anxiety pertaining to creating as well as finding identities is intensified when the Goblin page finds his original identity, which leads to his hysteric responses and dramatic disappearance:

Then sudden, through the darkn'd air
 A flash of lightning came;
 So broad, so bright, so red the glare,
 The castle seem'd on flame.
 Glanced every rafter of the hall,
 Glanced every shield upon the wall;
 Each trophied beam, each sculptured stone,
 Were instant seen, and instant gone;
 [.]
 It [the lightening] broke, with thunder long and loud,
 Dismay'd the brave, appall'd the proud,—
 From sea to sea the larum rung;
 On Berwick wall, and at Castle withal,
 To arms the startled warders sprung.
 When ended was the dreadful roar,
 The elvish dwarf was seen no more! (*Lay* VI.xxv.1-19)

The disappearance of the dwarf, immediately after the discovery of his identity, is ironical and problematic. It emphatically leaves an intensified sense of emptiness in the textual space.

1.3.4 Glamour and Grammarye: Illusions and Disillusions

In the previous sub-section, I have argued that the magical powers of the Goblin page and the Mighty Book are concerned with transforming and discovering identities. It is worthy of note that, both of these magical powers are also depicted as evoking ‘glamour’ and ‘grammarye’: Scots words, idiosyncratically deployed in Scott’s fairy narrative, meaning deceptive illusions invoked by ominous magical powers, which tend to be soon destroyed. For example, Henry Cronstoun ‘sought her [Lady Scott’s] castle high, / [...] because of gramarye’ (*Lay* V.xxvii.7). Likewise, the Monk at Melrose Abbey describes Michael Scott’s magic as ‘the dark words of gramarye’ (*Lay* III.xiv.94). Further, when the Goblin page opens the Mighty Book, it conjures up glamour:

A moment then the volume spread,
And one short spell therein he [the Goblin] read,
It had much of glamour might,
Could make a ladye seem a knight;
The cobwebs on a dungeon wall
Seem a tapestry in lordly hall;
[.]
All was delusion, nought was truth. (*Lay* III.ix.9-18)

Significantly, the *OED* definition of the word describes it as ‘Originally Sc. [Scots], introduced into the literary language by Scott’, though it quotes earlier examples of the use of word by Allan Ramsay (1720) and Robert Burns (1789). In a stark contrast to Scott’s conscious association of the word with its Scottish origin, Burns uses it to describe the behaviour of a ‘gipsy-gang’: ‘Ye gipsy-gang that deal in glamor, And you deep read in hell’s black grammar, Warlocks and witches’ (‘Captain Grose’s

Peregrinations' 317). This might imply that Scott contributed to the circulation of the word by his conscious use of it in his writing to the greater extent, by emphasising its Scottish origin.

Later in the narrative, though, Scott uses another Scots word to represent the magical power of the Goblin: 'Whate'er he [the Goblin] did of *gramarye*' (*Lay* III.xi.14, emphasis mine).³⁸ In a manner similar to its definition for the word 'glamour', the *OED* definition of the word 'gramarye' again states that Scott was responsible for the revival of the word: 'Occult learning, magic, necromancy. Revived in literary use by Scott' ('Gramarye', *OED* def. 2). In Andrew Lang's edition of the poem (1898), Lang adds a footnote for both of these words. Considering that Lang is generally perceived to have written mainly for late Victorian English readers, his footnotes imply that both 'glamour' and 'gramarye' were unfamiliar words to the English readership. This evidence might suggest that both the *Mighty Book* and the *Goblin* are deployed to represent Scottishness. Scott's 'rediscovery' of glamour and gramarye could be perceived as the revival of Scottish culture and identity. Scott thus intentionally posits these supernatural beings and conceptions in the national context, 'nationalising' their magical power.

Further, Scott's depictions of these magical powers as glamour and gramarye might also imply that, the ideas pertaining to the nation and national identity, which were regarded as most important and pressing issues within the extra-textual reality, could also reveal the artificiality, fabrication and even deceptiveness of the conception of the 'nation'. Implicitly, they might suggest that 'nation' might perhaps be a kind of illusion, the spell of which could soon be destroyed.

In this section I have demonstrated how the Goblin page and the Mighty Book represent Scott's ambivalent views toward the nation and national identity. Through the depiction of the conflict between the two nations, Scott emphasises that the union is a sensible solution. Nevertheless, he also explores the 'cost' Scotland has to pay for it, particularly in terms of its national identity. In presenting the possible new form of national identity projected onto the figure of the Goblin page, Scott also discloses fears and anxieties arising from new forms of identities.

Significantly, the enchanted narrative of the *Lay* is frequently disrupted by the old minstrel's lamentation. Although peace might have been achieved in the implicitly modernised world to which the minstrel belongs, there is a peculiar sense of loss and emptiness saturating the voice of the minstrel, echoing the dwarf's lamentation.

Sweet Teviot! on thy silver tide
 The glaring bale-fires blaze no more;
 No longer steel-clad warriors ride
 Along thy wild and willow'd shore;
 [.]
 All, all is peaceful, all is still,
 As if the waves, since Time was born,
 Since first they roll'd upon the Tweed,
 Had only heard the shepherd's reed,
 Nor started at the bugle-horn. (*Lay* III.i.1-10)

Who died at Jedwood Air?
 He died!—his scholars, one by one,

To the cold silent grave are gone;
 And I, alas! survive alone,
 To muse o'er rivalries of yore,
 And grieve that I shall hear no more
 The strains, with envy heard before;
 [.]
 He [the minstrel] paused: the listening dames again
 Applaud the hoary Minstrel's strain.
 With many a word of kindly cheer,—
 [.]
 Of ancient deeds, so long forgot,
 Of feuds, whose memory was not;
 Of forests, now laid waste and bare;
 [.]
 The Harper smiled, well pleased; for ne'er
 Was flattery lost on poet's ear: (*Lay* IV.xxxv.6-34)

This might suggest that Scott's enclosing of cultural nationalistic desires and conflict between the nations within the ancient past, which has often been considered as 'safe', may not be necessarily safe at all. The safety is presented as hollowness, from which the fairies have departed; the lively natural landscape animated with spirits is transformed into 'Mute Nature' (*Lay* V.i.3) consisting of 'things inanimate' (*Lay* V.ii.2), emphatically metaphorising the price the union had cost.

It should be noted that although the Goblin page, as observed in this sub-section, contributes to the happy union of Margaret Scott and Henry Cranstoun,

hence the restoration of peace and unity within the community, it nonetheless destabilises the restored order and harmony:

The Goblin page, omitting still
 No opportunity of ill,
 Strove now, while blood ran hot and high,
 To rouse debate and jealousy
 [.]
 Riot and clamour wild began;
 Back to the hall the Urchin [goblin] ran;
 Took in a darkling nook his post,
 And grinn'd, and mutter'd, 'Lost! lost! lost!' (*Lay* VI.vii.1-ix.22)

The Goblin-page thus destroys dream-like harmony established by the wedding ceremony epitomised by the song of celebration by Albert Græme, the minstrelsy: “‘It was an English ladye bright [...] / And she would marry a Scottish knight, / For Love will still be lord of all’” (*Lay* VI.xi.1-4). In so doing, the elfin character metaphorically undermines the Union of the two nations, rendering its apparently prosperous state as merely illusory, or, glamour.

1.4 *The Monastery* (1820): Exorcism of the Fairy as a National Soul

1.4.1 Background, Setting, and Sources of Inspiration

This section examines the role of fairies in the construction and exploration of Scottish national identity as it occurs in *The Monastery*, which will here be regarded as a fusion of historical novel and literary fairytale, rather than as a work of Gothic literature as previously characterised in the Introduction.³⁹ *The Monastery* is a work

which has received little attention from Scott scholarship in general. Further, it has also been practically overlooked by those studies which specifically consider issues with regard to the nation and national identity in the Waverley Novels, which have tended to focus on ‘canonical’ works for their debate, including *The Waverley* (1814) and *The Heart of Midlothian* (1818), as well as *Ivanhoe* (1820). However, this section demonstrates that *The Monastery* is a highly significant work which can provide a new and contentious insight into these ‘national’ issues, particularly in consideration of the idiosyncratic relationship between fairy representations and cultural nationalist discourse constructed in it.

The Monastery was devised and written between 1816 and 1820, a period which has itself been perceived as controversial, and wherein major changes are supposed to have taken place in Scott’s attitude towards the nation and the union, culminating, as Julian Meldon D’Arcy persuasively argues, in his disappointment with the union and his intensified concern with Scottish national identity (D’Arcy 31-32).⁴⁰ The period between 1820 and 1825 is also recognised as a period of ‘restless activity’ and experimentation for Scott (Mitchell 138). This view is endorsed by Penny Fielding’s observations on the genesis of *The Monastery*. Fielding notes that Scott wrote the novel (first published by Longmans in 1820) and *Ivanhoe* (first published by Ballantyne’s in 1820) almost simultaneously for different publishers. She also observes that whilst Scott’s initial decision to write *The Monastery* for Longmans was motivated by financial concerns when his writing of *Ivanhoe* had to be suspended due to a paper shortage taking place at Ballantyne’s, he took the opportunity to undertake an ‘experiment with the reading public’:

[T]he change of publishers was to be an experiment with the reading

public. Scott's stated intention was to publish *Ivanhoe* in Edinburgh and *The Monastery* in London as unconnected works, and with no clue as to the authorship of either, in order to see whether readers would guess that they were written by the same person. (Fielding, 'Essay on the Text' 359)

Further, Fielding suggests that the 'material circumstance of the novel's inception', as quoted above, affected 'the body of the novel itself', resulting in the inter-connectedness of the texts of *The Monastery* and *Ivanhoe*: 'So far, the story of *The Monastery* [...] is relatively self-contained. However, [...] Scott could not keep the two works entirely separate' ('Essay on the Text' 358-59). The inter-textuality and inter-connectedness between *Ivanhoe* and *The Monastery* could shed a new light to the consideration of the 'just but provocative' interpretation of *Ivanhoe*; that, *Ivanhoe* is 'a treatise on nationality' which should be distinguished from Scott's other 'national tales' because it is 'something more—a novel about the making of England' (Sutherland 229, qtd. Sanders 157-58).⁴¹ One could contend that the distinguishedness of *Ivanhoe* as a national tale may in part arise from its implicit inter-connecteness with *The Monastery*. *Ivanhoe* shares its underlying nationalistic consciousness with *The Monastery*. While *Ivanhoe*, as Sanders notes, depicts England as a nation 'being forged' in the twelfth century (157), *The Monastery* illustrates the dissolution of the outdated establishment as well as the creation of a new national identity occurring in sixteenth century Scotland. At the centre of the novel lies the White Lady, the fairy who is ambivalently engaged with the processes of both the destruction and the re-creation of the Scottish nation.

Coinciding with these perceptions of the period in which the novel was created, Patricia Harkin evaluates *The Monastery* as an experimental work, wherein '[t]he fop

[Piercie Shafton] and the fairy [the White Lady]' exist as 'marks of Scott's generic experimentation' (178). Harkin interprets *The Monastery* as a *Bildungsroman*, in which the central characters Halbert Glendinning and Piercie Shafton learn to 'regulate' their imagination in 'a socially acceptable way' through their encounters with the White Lady (178-79). Whilst in this section I will agree with Harkin's view in that the characterisation of the White Lady, as well as that of Piercie, is experimental, and also in that *The Monastery* is a work of 'generic experimentation', I will offer a reading of the novel from a different perspective, situating it in the context of Romantic fairytale: a genre which closely interacted with cultural nationalist discourse. I will thereby define *The Monastery* as an idiosyncratic fusion of fairytale and historical novel underpinned by Scott's 'intensified concern' with the nation, and will interpret the 'growth' of Halbert not only as a sign of his 'maturity' as is suggested by Harkin, but as a mark of the ambivalence in Scott's attitude toward the nation and the union. I will argue that the significant 'changes' in Scott's attitude toward the nation and the union, as discussed by D'Arcy, are given a defiant voice in his creation of the White Lady, a highly unconventional—as compared not merely to contemporary fairy representations but also to supernatural characters deployed in other works by Scott—elfin figure who haunts the pages of *The Monastery*. By preserving and protecting with her 'immortal fire' the 'Black Book', that is, the Holy Scripture written in Scots, itself an emblem of national religious consciousness in Europe particularly during the period of the Reformation,⁴² the transcendental elfin character serves as a symbolical protector of the Scottish identity, and represents the 'soul' of the nation.

Scott once indicated that his main purpose in writing *The Monastery* was to

narrate the specific historical event of the dissolution of the monasteries in the Borders region. The novel is specifically set in the period between the aftermath of the Battle of Pinkie (1547) and the outbreak of the Reformation (1560), the period which Scott describes as ‘that bustling and contentious age’ (Introduction to *The Monastery* xxi). Both of these events bear considerable significance with regard to the construction of the self-definition of the Scottish nation, which is often passively as well as relatively described in terms centring around ‘not being English’ (Mason 438): as noted by Finkelstein, ‘Scottish character’ was often ‘presented as having been formed and forged primarily through opposition to England’ (328).⁴³ It is of note that the required existence of the ‘other’ for the definition of the ‘self’ is not a particular case idiosyncratically detected in the construction of Scottish identity. In his criticism of the concept of the ‘Orient’ and the ‘West’, Edward Said argues that ‘the idea of Europe’ as a collective notion identifies ‘us’ Europeans as against all ‘those’ non-Europeans (7), and proclaims that ‘partly affirmation, partly identification’ of the Other is necessary to create each of the distinct European nations (xvii). Accordingly, in the case of Scottish national identity, it has primarily identified England as ‘the other’ in order to define itself, and is thus haunted by England in its self definition.

Thus it is that those battles fought against England, such as the Wars of Independence as noted by Mason, largely served to create ‘a coherent account of the past and shared myths and memories’, which were ‘crucial’ to sustaining and developing ‘the Scots’ sense of who and what they were’ (438). Though it might have been overshadowed by greater, more heroic, tragic, and perhaps more ‘canonical’ wars, namely the Wars of Independence and Battle of Flodden which served as popular subject matters in Scottish art and literature, the Battle of Pinkie undeniably contributed

to the creation and reinforcement of Scottish identity, amongst other numerous battles fought between Scotland and England.

With regard to the role of the Reformation in the formation of Scottish national identity, there is a well established consensus that the Reformation has been regarded as a particularly crucial event in the formation of national consciousness in Europe, not just limited to Scotland. As argued by Benedict Anderson, vernacular Bibles, starting with Luther's translation, played an extraordinarily significant role in the creation of national consciousness in Europe during the Reformation period (37-46). Although one recent study in Scottish literature draws attention to the significance of the pre-Reformation past in the examination of Scottish national identity,⁴⁴ the Reformation still bears considerable significance within it. Just as has been argued by Michael Lynch, it was after the Reformation that different versions of Scottish history as well as alternative versions of its future emerged:

[T]he Reformation of 1560 brought an end to the so-called 'Auld Alliance' with France [...] and opened up an alternative, new 'amity' with England. It also demanded a reworking of Scottish Identity. The two centuries between it and Culloden saw the emergence of different versions of Scottish past as well as alternative versions of the future. A new national church, a body of codified law, and the emergence of a historiographical tradition were the main ingredients of what has been termed a new 'imagining' of Scotland. (Lynch 440)

The setting of *The Monastery* is thus itself contentious, presumably revealing Scott's intention in writing it to represent and explore the unprecedented scale of the confusion prevailing over national identity. Several descriptions in the novel, as exemplified by

the following quotation relays to great effect the anxieties and confusions over national identity existing amongst the disorder and disintegrations of the society:

‘The men of Scotland were once Scotsmen, firm and united in their love to their country, and throwing every other consideration aside when the frontier was menaced—now they are—what shall I call them—the one part French, the other part English, considering their dear native country merely as a prize-fighting stage, upon which foreigners are welcome to decide their quarrels.’ (Monastery II.5.160, my emphasis)

Here, Scott subtly opposes the imagery of conflict with the nostalgic depiction of the past marked by stability, unity and harmony (*once Scotsmen, firm and united in their love to their country*) which are achieved by patriotic feeling amongst the people. Such view of the past, however, is nothing but forged and illusory: recent studies on the historical construction of Scottish national identity by Colin Kidd and Cairns Craig foreground heterogeneity as its crucial characteristics from the earliest period. In order to evoke such a deceptive image of the nationalistically utopian past wherein people are united through patriotism, cultural nationalistic discourse characteristically requires conflict. John Hutchinson argues that cultural nationalists view conflict as an essential component of social development:

cultural nationalists view conflict as an essential component of social development. Only out of struggle is the nation, always prone to decay, regenerated. [...] [C]ultural nationalism regularly crystallizes as a movement at times of social discord between traditionalists and modernists generated by the impact of external models of

modernization on the established status order, and it promotes the re-integration of the community at a higher level by means of a return to the inspiration of its national past. (*Dynamics* 33)

The Monastery invokes conflicts and entanglement between two opposing groups in multiple levels, including those conflicts between Scotland and England as represented by the Battle of Pinkie, between Catholicism and Protestantism by the Reformation, and between English courtly language and the vernacular by speeches of Piercie Shafton and Tibb. As Cameron, in his study of national identity, maintains that ‘language and religion can be seen as ethnic symbols’ (3), these conflict depicted in *The Monastery* are clearly centred around the problems of national identity.

In addition to the ‘loss’ of the ‘firm and united’ national identity in the assumedly pristine past, the disappearance of fairies also serves as a vital leitmotif in *The Monastery*. In his Introduction to the 1830 edition of the novel, Scott reveals that ‘writing fairies’ was one of his strong motivating forces behind the creation of *The Monastery*, by lamenting their disappearance from the contemporary world:

On the opposite banks of the Tweed might be seen the remains of ancient enclosures, surrounded by sycamores and ash-trees of considerable size. [...] Superstitious eld, [...] has tenanted the deserted groves with aerial beings, to supply the want of the mortal tenants who have deserted it. [...] The popular belief no longer allows the possibility of existence to the race of mysterious beings which hovered betwixt this world and that which is invisible. The fairies have abandoned their moonlight turf; the witch no longer holds her black orgies in the hemlock dell. (Introduction to *Monastery*)

xxii-xxviii)

It may be argued that Scott deployed fairies, together with the nation in conflict and confusion on the eve of the Reformation, as one of the central concerns in *The Monastery*. Further, one might conjecture that Scott's combination of the two significant motifs—fairies and the vernacular Bible representing national identity—is profoundly inspired by Robert Kirk (1644–1692), a seventeenth-century Gaelic minister in Aberfoyle, who was solely responsible for the creation of the first Gaelic translation of the Bible, and who was reportedly the first person to use the word 'fairytale'. His *Secret Commonwealth of Elves and Fairies* (1691), a 'tract' which collected and recorded the local and traditional fairy belief, is regarded as one of the earliest works in folklore. Further, the legend persists that he was eventually kidnapped by fairies, because he 'betrayed his secret' (Stott n.pag). Kirk's *Secret Commonwealth of Elves and Fairies* (1691) was drawn to Scott's attention through Patrick Graham (1750–1835) (Stott n.pag). As Stott notes, Scott mentioned him in *Rob Roy* (1818), and either himself or Robert Jamieson transcribed and published the first printed edition of the book in 1816, which was later revived by Andrew Lang in 1893.⁴⁵ A strong sense of national identity is manifested in Kirk's creation of the Gaelic Bible, as well as in his tract of fairy belief which he claimed to be 'peculiar' to the nation. Its original title, *Secret Commonwealth, or, a Treatise Displayeing the Chiefe Curiosities as they are in Use among diverse of the People of Scotland to this Day; Singularities for the most Part peculiar to that Nation*, evidently presents the local fairy belief as 'national' culture, and declares its individuality and distinctiveness. The White Lady with the Black Book in *The Monastery*, that is, a fairy with a vernacular Bible, is therefore a motif derived from Scotland in the past, and is profoundly underpinned by cultural nationalistic overtones.

In part as a response to his nostalgic lament of the ‘disappearance’ of fairies from his contemporary world, Scott populated the landscape of the Borders region depicted in *The Monastery* with fairies:

As our Glendearg did not abound in mortal visitants, superstition, that it might not be absolutely destitute of inhabitants, had peopled its recesses with beings belonging to another world. The savage and capricious Brown Man of the Moors, a being which seems the genuine descendant of the northern dwarfs, was supposed to be seen here frequently, [...]. The Scottish fairies, too, a whimsical, irritable, and mischievous tribe, who, though at times capriciously benevolent, were more frequently adverse to mortals, were also supposed to have formed a residence in a particularly wild recess of the glen, of which the real name was, in allusion to that circumstance, *Corri-nan-shian*, which, in corrupted Celtic, signifies the Hollow of fairies. (*Monastery* 37, the author’s italics)

It is of note that the supernatural beings mentioned here are of both Scottish and other origins. Scott thus constructed, as it were, a cosmopolitan fairyland in the Borders region. Even the White Lady, the central character, is in fact an amalgam of international fairy belief and literature, variously inspired by Undine, Melusine, Thomas the Rhymer and Tam Lin, as well as Kirk’s tract.⁴⁶ She could therefore be defined as a potentially cosmopolitan and hybrid character, to the extent that Andrew Lang, a keen folklorist born and bred in the Borders Region, did not recognise her as a ‘Scottish fairy’: ‘[I]n fact, she is in the literary German taste, and is no character of Scottish superstition’ (Introduction to *The Monastery*, xiv). In spite of her ostensible hybridity,

however, she is considerably Scotticised: she is presented as the White Lady *of Avenel*, a fairy who traditionally haunts generations of the Avenels, that is, a Scottish aristocratic dynasty, and is introduced to the textual space through the vernacular voice of Tibb, a Scottish servant.

‘The wean saw something like a white leddy that weised us the gate,’
 said Tibb, ‘when we were like to hae perished in the mire
 cleughs—Certain it was that Shagram resisted, and I ken Martin thinks
 he saw something.’ [...] ‘[A]nd as for the White Lady of Avenel, she
 is ken’d over the haill country. And she is aye seen to yammer and
 wail before ony o’them dies, as weas weel ken’d by twenty folk before
 the death of Walter Avenel, haly be his cast!’ (*Monastery* I.4.55-56)

Furthermore, as the following sections will demonstrate, portrayal of the fairy is imbued with echoes of Scott’s Scottish cultural nationalist preoccupations.

1.4.2 The White Lady

Scott deploys the White Lady in a most unconventional and question-provoking manner. Whilst she plays a pivotal role in the novel, her behaviour is curiously charged with cultural nationalistic overtones, often perceptibly aggressive in nature. The White Lady has an overwhelming presence in it, to the extent that she eclipses the presence of Mary Avenel, who is, as a result, often criticised as a ‘weak’ character (Mitchell), and in so doing prevents what Jerome Mitchell calls ‘the Chaucerian triangular relationships’ between Mary, Edward and Halbert from being fully dramatised.

The novel is underpinned by a story pattern conventional to fairytales, wherein

a human character (Halbert Glendinning) encounters a fairy who serves as a helper (the White Lady), and undergoes a series of challenges under her guidance. With the help of her magical fairy gifts (in this case, his command of language), he eventually matures and attains the love of a member of the opposite sex belonging to the aristocracy (Mary Avenel), just as he desires. The White Lady's behaviour is imbued in a striking way with cultural nationalistic features. She awakens national sentiments among human characters, transforms an Anglophobic, and wild boy with a poor command of language who suffers from inferiority complex, into a heroic and eloquent nationalist. The White Lady also indirectly contributes to the destruction of the old establishment in Catholic Scotland as represented by the Monastery, as well as to the creation of a new Protestant Scotland.

Whilst the historical setting of the novel in the Reformation period throws the idea of the nation which it symbolises into conflict, confusion, insecurity and vulnerability, the human characters, particularly priests from the monastery, are thrown into further confusion by the appearance of the White Lady who is represented as a malevolent spirit, illustrating considerable influence from Fouqué's *Undine*.

At length the restive brute [White Lady] changed her humour; [...] and dashed into the ford as fast as she could scamper. A new terror now invaded the Monk's mind—the ford seemed unusually deep, the water eddied off in strong ripple from the counter of the mule, and began to rise upon her side. [...] As his [Father Philip's] person flew hither and thither, his garment became loose, and in an effort to retain it, his hand lighted on the volume of the Lady of Avenel which was in

his bosom. No sooner had he grasped it, than his companion [White Lady] pitched him out of the saddle into the stream, where, [...] she gave him two or three good share of wetting [...]. (*Monastery* I.5.65-66)

As Father Eustace takes away the Black Book from Lady Avenel, its original owner, he encounters and is attacked by the White Lady. Not only does he lose the Black Book, he also suffers from the song of the White Lady, which keeps haunting him like a siren's voice:

'I wish him [Father Eustace] no worse lesson,' said the Sacristan [Father Philip], 'than to go swimming merrily down the river with a ghost behind, and Kelpie's night-crows and mud-eels all waiting to have a snatch at him. [...]' [...] 'but the tune hangs by my memory like a burr in a beggar's rags—it mingles with the Psalter— [...] and were you to put me to death at this very moment, it is my belief I should die singing it—"Now swim we merrily"—it is as it were a spell upon me'. (Scott, *The Monastery* I.7.77)

Furthermore, human disbelief in the existence of fairies is then depicted and dramatised to comic as well as satirical effect, disclosing corruptions within the monastery:

'Suppose, I [the Monk] say only suppose, that our Sacristan [Father Philip] met her at the ford [...], suppose he carried his familiarities farther than the maiden was willing to admit—and we may easily suppose, farther, that this wetting was the result of it.' (Scott, *The Monastery* I.7.75)

Further corruption is disclosed, as Father Philip, who initially did not believe in Father

Eustace's tale, encounters the White Lady himself, and experiences emotional turmoil with regard to his power and position within the monastery:

If I confess this strange visitation [i.e. encounter with the White Lady],’ thought the Sub-Prior [Father Eustace], ‘I become the ridicule of all my brethren— [...] I give the Abbot an advantage over me which I shall never again recover, and Heaven only knows how he may abuse it, in his foolish simplicity, to the dishonour and loss of Holy Kirk.—But then, if I make not true confession of my shame, with what face can I again presume to admonish or restrain others? [...]’ [...] To men of any rank the esteem of their order is naturally most dear, but in the monastic establishment, cut off, as the brethren are, from other objects of ambition, as well as from all exterior friendship and relationship, the place which they hold in the opinion of each other is all in all. (Scott, *The Monastery* I.10.97)

The monastery here is revealed to be a place of ambition, rivalry, jealousy and desire for power, rather than a sacred place dedicated to God.

It was remarkable, that after this memorable evening [when Father Eustace confessed that he saw a fairy], the feeling of the worthy Abbot towards his adviser were much more kindly and friendly than when he deemed the Sub-Prior the impeccable and infallible person, in whose garment of virtue and wisdom no flaw was to be discerned. [...] He began himself to be desirous of leaving the Monastery, or at least he manifestly declined to interfere with its affairs, in that marked and authoritative manner, which he had at first practiced. [...] Owing

to the circumstances which we have intimated in the end of the last chapter [i.e. fairy encounter], the Sub-Prior Eustace appeared to have altered considerably his habits of life. (Scott, *The Monastery* I.10.105-06)

The White Lady thus shows up the corruption within the monastery, and also causes the downfall of Father Eustace, who was initially a competent and powerful character. In so doing, she contributes to its eventual dissolution, which metaphorises the dissolution of the old establishment and birth of the nation in its new and modernised state.

Significantly, the White Lady chooses to protect Halbert, an immature boy who has a poor command of Latin and displays a strong sense of Anglophobia, rather than Edward, his younger brother who is endowed with a mild disposition and a good command of Latin. In depicting her preference as clearly charged with a strong sense of cultural nationalism and Anglophobia, exhibiting antipathy toward the union of the two nations, Scott displays cultural nationalist sentiment, which stands in stark contrast with his officially acknowledged pro-Union standpoint. It might perhaps be the reason why the White Lady has to be eventually exorcised from the text at the end of the *Monastery*: Scott presumably betrayed too much in the representation of her, to a dangerous extent.

With her immortal fire which is hidden in a subterranean recess, the White Lady preserves the black book, that is, the Holy Scripture written in Scots. In so doing she symbolically protects and immortalises the language of Scots, a vital constituent of the Scottish identity since the Anglicisation process of the Reformation. As Anderson argues, the dominance of Church Latin in the European Christendom before the

Reformation as the only and sacred ‘truth-language’, the sole means through which the ‘truth’ could be accessed, was undermined by the vernacular Bibles. Scott’s description of the Black Book in *The Monastery* clearly reflects this. It is kept in the ‘immortal fire’ which, according to the song of the White Lady, destroys anything but ‘truth’:

What was of all the most remarkable, the black volume so often mentioned lay not only unconsumed, but untouched in the slightest degree amid this intensity of fire, which, while it seemed to be of force sufficient to melt adamant, had no effect whatever on the sacred book thus subjected to its utmost influence. The White Lady, having paused long enough to let young Glendinning take a complete survey of what was around him, now said, in her usual chaunt, ‘There lies the volume thou boldly has sought; /Touch it, and take it, ‘twill dearly be bought.’ (Scott, *The Monastery* II.1.116-67)

The Bible in Scots, as well as the Scots language which constitutes it, is represented and immortalised as the book and language containing the ‘Truth’, evidently exhibiting national sentiment. This cultural nationalistic description makes a striking contrast to Pierce Shafton’s Euphuism, the English ‘courtly speech’, which is depicted as an empty and hollow language.

Halbert’s acquisition of the Black Book is the climactic scene of *The Monastery*, in which he also passes the ‘test of fire’, a conventional fairytale motif of a rite of passage. In so doing, he receives the gift of Scots language, and is transformed from a bold, impatient, and unread boy into a dignified, heroic, and patriotic figure with an intensified national consciousness:

‘Sir Knight [Sir Piercie]—we have in this land of Scotland an ancient Saying, ‘Scorn not the bush that biolds you. [...] Since your fate has sent you hither amongst us, be contented with such fare and such converse as we can afford you, and scorn us not for our kindness; for the Scots wear short patience and long swords.’ All eyes were turned on Halbert while he was thus speaking, and there was a general feeling that his countenance had an expression of intelligence, and his person an air of dignity, which they had never before observed. Whether it was that the wonderful Being with whom he had so lately held communication, had bestowed on him a grace and dignity of look and bearing which he had not before, or whether being conversant in high matters, and called to a destiny beyond that of other men, had a natural effect in giving becoming confidence to his language and manner, we pretend not to determine. But it was evident to all, that, from this day, young Halbert was an altered man; [...]. (Scott, *The Monastery* II.3.138)

Yet, after the climactic scene at the outset of Volume II wherein Halbert receives the black book from the fairy, the White Lady’s attitude becomes inconsistent and uncertain, and her presence grows weaker. Although she apparently instigates cultural nationalist impulses at the outset of the story, later on she gives sudden didactic and rational warnings against discordance between the two nations: ‘Disastrous passion, / Fierce hate and rivalry, are in the aspect / That lowers upon its fortunes.’ (Scott, *The Monastery* II.6.168). However, she does not actually go as far as to encourage the union of the two nations. Sighing melancholically, she eventually disappears, leaving the

Protestant Scotland behind: the new nation to whose construction she contributed, yet which ironically called for her banishment:

‘But it has pleased Heaven to call the maiden Mary Avenel to a better sense of faith than thou and all the disciples of Rome can teach. Her I [the Protestant preacher] have aided with my humble power—I have extricated her from the machinations of evil spirits, to which she and her house were exposed during the blindness of their Romish superstition, and, praise be to my Master, I have not reason to fear she will again be caught in thy snares.’ (*Monastery* III.12.340-41)

Further, it is of note that the plot of the White Lady’s exorcisation is based on Scott’s view of the consequence of the Reformation:

The Reformation swept away many of the corruptions of the Church of Rome, but the purifying torrent remained itself somewhat tainted by the superstitious impurities of the soil over which it had passed. The trials of sorcerers and witches, which disgrace our criminal records, become frequent after the Reformation of the Church; as if human credulity, no longer amused by the miracles of Rome, had sought for food in the traditionary records of popular superstition. (Scott, Introduction to the ‘Tale of Tamlane’ 337)

When considering the history of its reception, *The Monastery* is an exception amongst Scott’s works in that it is infamous for the negative evaluation it has been accorded, even by its author himself, who pronounced it a failure. The unpopularity of the novel among its readers is mainly due to Scott’s experimental characterisation of the White Lady and Piercie Shafton. As Harkin notes, Nassau Senior indicated in the

Quarterly Review published in 1822 that the White Lady ‘violate[s] contemporary norms of *vraisemblance*’ (177). Nassau’s comments pertaining to the White Lady, whilst evidently highly unfavourable in tone, serve to highlight the provocative elements of an unconventional and idiosyncratic character, which deserves examination even for this reason alone. Even Lang, a prominent connoisseur of fairytales in the late Victorian period who held considerable respect for Scott, poignantly rejected the novel, together with the White Lady, as a complete failure.

Till the date of the publication of ‘The Monastery’ (March 1820) Scott’s career as a novelist had been one of unbroken success. The critics, of course, had been critical, but the public devotion had never wavered. ‘The Monastery’, by its various defects, gave the reviewers an occasion for displaying their usual gratitude to a very successful writer, and Lockhart says that the book was ‘pronounced a failure’. [...] But Sir Walter, who had a strong belief that a novel is the better for novelty, made an experiment: it failed, and he did not repeat it, but left the White Lady out of the characters in ‘The Abbot’. (Lang ix-xv)

Whilst these negative comments emphasise the provocative potential of the White Lady and Piercie, it should be noted that their stated reason for the rejection of these characters are not convincing: it is unclear why the White Lady, for example, is any more incredible than elfin characters in contemporary literature, such as Fouqué’s *Undine*, whose behaviour is quite extraordinary. It might be inferred that, though disguised by proper ‘literary’ criticism which finds ‘lack of verisimilitude’ in the White Lady and Piercie Shafton, the critics’ dislike of the two characters actually stems from

the subversively cultural nationalistic character of the White Lady, as well as the provocatively caricatured and bizarre character of Englishman Piercie, both of which disrupt and subvert the ideological framework of the establishment based on the union. Furthermore, it is of note that Scott himself presumably did not dislike these two controversial characters, even though he termed the overall novel a failure: 'In his Introduction of 1830 he makes his apology for the two conspicuously unpopular characters, the White Lady and the Euphuist. It seems that he was by no means persuaded that they deserved to be unfortunate' (Lang ix-xiii). This might imply that these characters did occupy a significant place in Scott's imagination, and perhaps had a peculiar capacity to voice his 'mixture of feelings', which Scott might have found difficult to voice elsewhere.

The White Lady in *The Monastery* thus has a vital and contentious role to play in representing the complexity surrounding the issues of national identity. If we consider that fairies are conventionally conceived of as irrational beings, it is indeed ironic that the White Lady's behaviour, towards the end of the novel, is constrained by adherence to the 'rational' unionist standpoint, and that she is eventually banished by no other than the novel's Scottish characters. Although a variety of conflicts depicted at the outset of the novel might be resolved at the end of the novel, the loss of the fairy is depicted as being inevitable for the process of reconciliation to take place; the novel thus is concluded by two voices which represent different versions of pre-Reformation Scottish national identities, and which are eventually banished and forgotten: Edward as Catholic, and the White Lady as ancient, pristine, pagan, and autonomous.

1.5 Conclusion

In this chapter I have demonstrated that fairies in Scott's writing serve as an idiosyncratic medium by which he voiced his ambiguous views and emotions with regard to matters pertaining to the nation and national identity, which he found difficult to voice elsewhere.

Whilst Scott's hybrid fairies almost always invokes an ancient past dating back to the pre-Christian and pre-historic periods, they nonetheless often serve as agents of modernity, in the particular sense that their figure is a projection of the pressingly contemporary issues surrounding the Scottish nation. Further, while they embody various kinds of ambiguities, anxieties and dilemma arising from the processes of modernisation, they none the less, like the White Lady of Avenel, support the union of Scotland and England. Their roles are thus ambivalent: while they serve as promoters of unionist ideology, they also manifest fear and anxiety generated by the consequences of 'progress'.

Significantly, when the reconciliation between the conflicting communities is achieved, they are either exorcised or disappear by themselves, and thus erased out of the 'modernised' textual space. From a folkloristic perspective, the disappearance of fairies is a conventional feature commonly found in various kinds of fairy narratives. They are often imagined as inhabiting the ambiguous realm between the living and the dead. The disappearance of fairies in Scott's works, which are clearly placed in the national context, in part metaphorises the disappearance of Scottish national identity. However, the figure of Goblin Page, who seemingly vanishes out of the text, also implies that he could, none the less, still haunt, and might be revived and recalled, like so many fairies represented in the various kinds of traditional fairy narratives. Indeed,

although they have repeatedly been exorcised by a plethora of forces including Christianity, Enlightenment and modernity, fairies have recurrently returned, as they do in Scott's literary imagination. Fairies in Scott's narrative thus serve to disclose Scott's ambiguous responses towards the issues of the nation, and perhaps also his desire to shelter and perpetuate the Scottish national identity which he once described as 'dissolving'.

Chapter Two: John Black

2.1 Introduction

The Falls of Clyde, or the Fairies: a Scottish Dramatic Pastoral (1806, hereafter *FC*) is yet another work of Scottish literature which has remained forgotten and unexplored, let alone undervalued. Written by John Black (1777?-1826), the *FC* is indeed an exceptional and problematic work, which stands in a curious place in the history of Scottish fairy writing. In particular, its contradictory juxtaposition of paratexts ('Preliminary Dissertations') and the main body of text ('a Scottish Dramatic pastoral') is exceptionally radical and problematic. The clash of two contradictory genres, which manifests conflicting attitudes toward fairies, generates intense tension, and makes the *FC* a radically unusual site of conflict and war of differing genres, ideas, and values regarding fairies.

The *FC* was published at least twice: the National Library of Scotland currently holds two editions of the work, published in 1806 and 1871. The 1806 edition was published in both Edinburgh and London, and is today held by several major libraries in and outwith Scotland, including Stanford University Library in the United States. These facts suggest that the book was not of local and minor circulation, but was regarded as valuable enough to be acquired and preserved at least by above mentioned universities.

Although the text of the *FC*, including both prefatory dissertations and the main dramatic part, clearly exhibits that its author is a widely read person, whose interest covers classic literature, myths, philology, traditional fairy belief, science, and national issues, very little is known about him/her. Even *The Oxford Dictionary of*

National Biography does not contain an article about him, though it mentions a John Black (1783–1855), who was a journalist born and raised in Duns, Berwickshire, and worked in Edinburgh (Harrison, ‘John Black’ n.pag). There could be a possibility that the John Black of Duns, mentioned in the *ODNB*, is the same person as the author of the *FC*. Yet, the hypothesis contradicts the statement of the author of the *FC* that he/her was born near the Falls of Clyde: ‘As to the locality of the action I have chosen the Falls of Clyde [...] partly because they are near the place where I was born’ (Black, ‘Dissertation I’ 9).

Presumably, the following extract from *Notes and Queries*, published on 8 March 1862, is the only extant piece of writing which ever comments on the *FC*, and provides biographical information of the author of the *FC*:

The author of this work[*FC*] was John Black, LL.D. (of Glasgow), a native of Douglas, Lanarkshire, born about 1777. Through the influence of Mr. Hamilton, of Sundrum, in whose family Mr. B. was some time tutor, he became the Minister of Colyton, in Ayrshire, and died at Paris 26 Aug. 1826 [...]. His *Falls of Clyde*, says my informant, was a juvenile conception, although not published until 1806, and did not please the critics, who, although they commended the talent and research displayed in the author's ‘Dissertations on Fairies, the Scottish Language, and Pastoral Poetry,’ condemned the Scottish dialect, plot, and execution of the feeble dramatic imitation of the Gentle Shepherd, to which these learned Essays are tacked. (‘Reply: J. O. The “Falls of Clyde,” Etc.’, 194)

Another exceptional mentioning of the *FC* could be found in Nicola Bown’s *Fairies in*

Nineteenth Century Art and Literature (2001), where Bown quotes several lines from the *FC*. Nevertheless, Bown does not provide any comment nor information with regard to the work and its author.

Like so many other works of fairy writing discussed in this thesis, the *FC* offers notable examples of fairy discourse during the time of Scottish Romanticism, foregrounding what kind of issues, concerns, anxieties, and awareness were charged in the representations of fairies. Yet, my contention is that the *FC* is indeed an exceptionally problematic and radical piece of Scottish fairy writing, primarily because of the following three aspects: its generic experimentation, its strikingly disenchanted perception of fairies, and its cultural nationalistic concerns.

2.2 *The Falls of Clyde* as a War of Genres

In his recent study of *The Romantic Use of Genres* (2009), David Duff poignantly argues that ‘generic concerns’ are the defining feature of Romantic literature, evaluating ‘genre-mixing’ as a ‘pivotal’ concept in Romantic aesthetics and a recurrent feature of Romantic literary practice (*Genre* 22). Defining the Romantic period as ‘an era of unparalleled formal experimentation in both the “high” and “low” cultural spheres’ (*Genre* 5), Duff states that genre-mixing is ““a gay confusion” in which “False, true, old, modern, present, past combine”” (*Genre* 141). In Duff’s study, there is an echo of Murray Pittock’s *Inventing and Resisting Britain* (1997), a study of the process of construction of the British and Irish cultural identities. One significance of Pittock’s study is that he explores the processes of British nation building from multiple perspectives: while Linda Colley’s *Britons* monolithically focuses on the ‘inventing’ impulse, Pittock pays thorough attention to the resisting eddies and undercurrents which

resist the processes of invention as well as assimilation, emphatically foregrounding the tension between the conflicting forces. Presumably echoing Pittock's approach, Duff also emphasises the significance of the 'resistance to genre' (*Genre* 2) which coexisted and clashed with the 'innovation' and 'invention' of new genres. In so doing, Duff rightly emphasises the 'ambivalence' and the 'tension' between 'a desire to modernize genres and to convey (sometimes fraudulently) a sense of their antiquity', and 'the antiquarian desire to "make it old"' and 'a fresh aesthetic imperative to "make it new"' (Duff, *Genre* 22). Seen from this generic perspective, the *FC* can also be perceived as what Duff calls a 'dialectic of archaism and innovation that makes Romanticism's distinctive brand of generic revivalism' (Duff, *Genre* 22). As following sections demonstrate, the text of the *FC* serves as a site of radical generic experimentation. The tension between conflicting and clashing genres, values, and ideas is far more acute and intensified in the *FC* than in Scott's *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*, though the *Minstrelsy* clearly exerted a profound influence on the *FC* particularly in its textual composition, experimental genre-mixing and its nationalisation of the subject of fairies.

Clearly under the influence of Scott's *Minstrelsy*, the *FC* mixes different genres in one book: the dramatic main part is preceded by three prefatory "Dissertations" by the author. The first 'dissertation' is entitled 'On Fairies', the second one 'On the Scottish Language', and the third 'On Pastoral Poetry'. As the titles indicate, each dissertation discusses and justifies the author's choice of the subject (fairies), the language (the Scots dialect), and the genre (the pastoral drama) for the "Scottish Pastoral Drama" which comprises the main body of the text. The book of the *FC* also contains two engravings: both of which depicts a great water fall. One of the

engravings, placed as a frontispiece before the title page, is entitled ‘Bonniton Lin’: the location in which the play is set.

Each dissertation is accompanied by a detailed ‘Note’, and with abundant quotations from *Ode on the Popular Superstition of the Highlands* (1750) by William Collins and works by other canonical poets including Shakespeare, the three dissertations occupy more than 100 pages, and almost half of the book of the *FC*. Unlike Scott, who did not refer to the length of his essays in the *Minstrelsy*, Black himself seems to be aware that the essays are ‘disproportionately’ long: ‘the following Dissertations, which I will freely confess are of a length apparently very disproportionate to the work which they profess to introduce’ (Black, ‘Dissertation I’ 4). As this example implies, Black displays often ironic self-reflexiveness in numerous places in his writing, making a clear contrast with Scott who did not exhibit such self-consciousness.

These ‘dissertations’, intervening between the readers and the main dramatic and romantic part of the text, have an exceptionally disillusioning effect: they repeatedly emphasise the artificiality and inventedness of fairies, with a considerably enlightened and disenchanted attitude. They contain justifications, apologies, intentions, and explanations with regard to the author’s choice of fairies for the subject of the book. Significantly, these essays, which are designed to be read by the readers before they read the main dramatic part of the book, serve only to disenchant fairies, by solely dwelling on the origin and genealogy of European fairy belief, with a strong emphasis on the author’s awareness of the artificiality of fairy representation, consistently regarding fairies as artefact and embodiment of poetic imagination.

Such disenchanting dissertations stand in stark contrast with the main body of the text, which, being a mixture of historical drama and fairy tale, almost faithfully

evokes, replicates, and reinforces traditional and stereotypical fairy representations including ‘Queen Mab’ and the fairy queens in ‘Thomas the Rhymer’ and ‘Tam Lin’. It is indeed such exceptional juxtaposition, contradiction and tension arising from the problem of how to perceive fairies that renders the *FC* a radical and problematic work of fairy writing, which can be interpreted as a site where conflicting ideas and genres clash and war.

2.3 Imagined Beings: Fairies Disenchanted

As mentioned above earlier, Black’s rational, disenchanted and distanced attitude towards traditional fairy belief distinguishes the *FC* from any other works of fairy writing not limited to those produced in the eighteenth and nineteenth century. Compared with other literary figures who were engaged with fairy writing in the nineteenth century, including Scott, Hogg, Lang, Allan Cunningham, George MacDonald, and J. M. Barrie, Black can be said to have possessed by far the most disenchanted and distanced attitude toward fairies. Evidently, Black’s writing lacks in belief and enthusiastic interest in fairies. In the ‘Dissertation I: On Fairies’, Black discusses the origin, genealogy, and characteristics of traditional fairy beliefs in an approach clearly influenced by Scott’s *Minstrelsy*. However, unlike Scott, Black consistently and thoroughly regards fairies purely as human artefacts and products of imagination, and repeatedly, and often sarcastically, emphasises the artificiality and inventedness of fairies. For example, in his attempt to justify his choice of fairies as the subject of his pastoral drama, he argues as follows:

Nor have I only the greatest poets to support me in my choice of this subject [i.e. fairies], but likewise the ablest critics. Mr Addison

employs a paper in the *Spectator* (419) on the fairy way of writing, which, he justly observes, requires *a very odd turn of thought*. He bestows great praises on it; and says, ‘it is indeed more difficult than any that depends on the poet's fancy, because he has no pattern to follow in it, and must work altogether out of his own invention.’

(Black 5, the author's emphasis)

Further, in his argument of the origin of fairy belief, he boldly writes as follows:

[I]n all countries, in the infancy of physics, each phenomenon has a particular cause assigned it, to which is attributed intelligence and will. Nature is peopled with a world of spirits, like the sylphs of Pope, who fan the flowers, scatter the rain, and pour the stream. [...] But leaving these ladies who travel in chariots of carbuncles, drawn by flying cats, winged serpents, or birds of Paradise, we shall proceed to say something of the Scottish[sic] Fairies. who are a very different race, being derived from the superstitions of the Gothic nations. [...] The belief in the existence of such supernatural beings arose, *in these countries, not, perhaps as in happier climates, from a warm imagination communicating life to every object, or attempting to account for the phenomena of nature: It arose perhaps from their solitude, and wild romantic situation, amid lonely hills and dismal lakes. In such cases, where the ideas are few, fancy is ever busy to fill up the void* which the uniformity of external objects leaves in the mind. The imagination blends itself with the reality, the wonderful with the natural, the false with the true. The ideas acquire strength,

and mingle in such a manner with external impressions as hardly to be distinguished from them. *And as the laws of nature are yet unknown, the problem of probability is unlimited, and fancy grows familiar with chimeras which pass for truths.* (Black, 'Dissertation I' 12-13, my emphasis)

It is indeed extraordinary that Black here claims that fairies are purely the product of imagination, without mentioning pagan deities nor indigenous people as Scott did. He defines them as 'some system of ideal existence' created by 'all the poets' (Black, 'Dissertation I' 3). His claim, that fairies were 'created or adapted' (Black, 'Dissertation I' 3), displays that he is aware of the appropriating processes which intertwined the processes of handing down oral tradition. For Black, fairies are purely 'fancy' which were created to divert people from solitude and void, and which 'pass for truths' because of their ignorance and the backwardness of the country. Significantly, in a manner similar to Scott, Black nationalises fairies. Linking fairies to a particular nation, treating them as a form of national culture, Black argues that 'Scottish Fairies' were created primarily under the influence of the landscape and climate of the Scottish nation: *solitude, and wild romantic situation, amid lonely hills and dismal lakes.*

While a number of literary figures, including Scott and Lang, traced and discussed *how* fairies have been historically imagined, and often drew a chart of the genealogy of traditional fairy belief in Europe and Middle East, no one except Black rationally considered *why* fairies should be imagined. The above extract is important and exceptional, not only in that it nationalistically links fairies to a particular land and climate, but also in that it explains, in a most unromantic, rational and distanced attitude, why fairies came to be imagined in the first place:

The effect of solitude in realising the fictions of the imagination is well exemplified in the second sight of the highlands of Scotland; [...]. Indeed I have often thought it fortunate that, in ages of ignorance, the tales of fairies, and witches, and enchantments were credited; for it is difficult to imagine how the peerless dames and valiant knights of those days could have passed the winter evenings in their moated castles, without the help of such narrations. And I have sometimes thought that many of the ancient feuds and robberies arose from *ennui*, and in order to fill up the irksome vacancies of an empty mind. (Black, 'Dissertation I' 14)

In this extract, second sight, or clairvoyance, which is commonly believed to be a supernatural and 'supposed ability to perceive future or distant events' ('Second Sight', Oxford Dictionary of English) is rationally disenchanted by Black.⁴⁷ Black declares that second sight is purely a product of imagination, devised to divert from solitude. Furthermore, Black boldly declares that fairies are imagined as a device to kill time, relieve people from solitude, boredom and emptiness of mind. Black even puts the act of imagining fairies in the same category of 'feuds and robberies' which 'arouse from *ennui*'. In addition, Black even declares a fairytale cannot contain any trace of reality and naturalness:

Nothing is more wonderful in the stories in which they[*fairies*] are introduced than natural events; and indeed the most marvellous thing in a fairy tale, as Fontenelle observes, is when a person shipwrecked in the middle of the ocean has the misfortune to be drowned. In short, the philosophers who have written these tales seem to have excluded

nothing from their scenes except nature [...]. (Black, 'Dissertation I'
11)

Black thus emphatically de-constructs and de-naturalises fairies, and denies the possibility of their existence even in the past. With his unusually disenchanted and realistic attitude toward fairies, Black repeatedly, realistically, and persuasively stresses the artificiality and inventedness of fairies. Such a disenchanted, and perhaps sarcastic attitude toward fairies in the 'Dissertation I' is indeed unparalleled. It is also disproportionate to the dramatic part of the *FC* following it, which Black faithfully and rather simplistically emulates and reproduces conventional depictions of fairies as imagined in ballads and traditional fairy tales:

A FAIRY(alone). See the silver moon on high,
 Glidin' through the azure sky!
 Gleamin' on the roarin' floods
 Beamin' on the silent woods
 Shinin' on the mountains steep
 On the sleepin' lambs an' sheep.
 Fairies! Now's the time to sing,
 And trip it nimbly in a ring;
 Trip and sing these woods among!
 Silence is the friend of song
 CHORUS OF FAIRIES. *Oh how happy, happy, we,*
Little fairy bodies be. (Black, *FC* 111)

Black here portrays a group of fairies in a no other than conventional fashion. Though Black himself claims that he has depicted 'Scottish Fairies' in his pastoral drama, these

ethereal fairies, of tiny shape and dressed in green, singing happily and playfully dancing in the moonlight, are undeniably echoes of numerous works of classic fairy writing and traditional fairy belief including Shakespeare's *A Midsummer Night's Dream*. Thus, the textual space of the *FC*, once thoroughly disenchanted and exorcised by the preliminary dissertations, is again, problematically, elf-fashioned, and re-enchanted: replicating and reproducing the conventional portrayal of fairies, whose existence has been totally denied at the outset of the book.

2.4 Changeling, Heir and Transformation:

Anxiety of Existence, Problematized Identity and the Future of the Nation

The main dramatic part of the *FC* ('Scottish Pastoral Drama') can itself be perceived as an amalgam of multiple genres: historical drama, national tale and fairy tale. The textual space-time is specifically set in a village near Lanark and the Bonniton Lin, at the close of the sixteenth century: 'The scene is laid near Lanark; sometimes in a Cave behind the Bonniton Lin; sometimes in Bonniton House, in Adam's cottage, and the neighbourhood. [...] The period near the close of the 16th Century' (Black, *FC* 104). Obviously, it is one of the critical periods which determined the future of the Scottish nation: the reign of Mary Queen of Scots. Though the monarch herself does not appear in the play as a human character, Black obliquely alludes to her through the metaphorical figure of Queen Mab: the queen of fairies playing a crucial role in the play. Significantly, the absence of Mary Queen of Scots from the textual space of the *FC* overlaps with the absence of the monarch in the late sixteenth-century Scotland in reality. The historical setting of the drama, in particular its implicit allusion to Mary Queen of Scot, is emphasised by the description

that Sir John, the father of the heroine Jean, is an acquaintance of John Knox and George Buchanan:

SIR JOHN. George Buchanan wrote me late a letter,

He never saw a youth inform'd better.

JAMIE. I'm much oblig'd to George; and say (if e'er

You write) I'll read his poem on *the Sphere*.

[.....]

SIR JOHN. But auld John Knox,

Whose mind is savage as the waves and rocks,

Has at the kirk some anger made me feel— (Black, *FC* 141)

Remarkably, Queen Mab, together with other fairies, speaks the Scots language:

JEAN. I want to ken, Queen Mab, if I may gae

An' breathe the cauler air out o'er the brae,

The time that you're asleep; and in a crack,

As I was yesterday, I will be back

Q[ueen]. MAB. Do sae las—but ye maun keep

Far frae shepherds tendin' sheep;

Frae houses where the folk may see,

An' wonder Jeanie who you be.

But first attend to what I say;

This is a solemn, solemn day (Black, *FC* 125)

As clearly shown by its deployment of Queen Mab, the *FC* has fairytale dimensions.

The often moon-lit textual space is abundantly populated by a number of fairies including Queen Mab, who often commit mischiefs to human villagers. Furthermore,

the *FC* revolves around two themes: changeling and heirdom. The fairies steal Jean, the daughter of Sir John, leaving a grotesque imp behind. Not knowing who she really is, Jean is raised by the fairies. Sixteen years later, she is informed of her true identity, and is also told that she is to succeed Queen Mab, to be the next fairy queen, when Queen Mab dies, leaves the earth and goes to the moon: “We [Fairis] are mortal too, but suffer not decay/ Until a thousand years shall pass away/ My[Queen Mab’s] term is near—and Jean, you maun supply/ The place of Queen of Fairies when I die” (Black, *FC* 126).

Significantly, Queen Mab is not the only character in the play who is faced with the need to find an heir. Deprived of his daughter by fairies, Sir John is also heirless, and is preoccupied with the problem of how to secure their family lineage by finding an heir. One day, he almost drowns in the River Clyde, and is saved by Jamie, a good-natured son of a farmer. Sir John decides to make Jamie his own heir.

Jamie accidentally encounters and falls in love with Jean, and saves her from fairies before she is transformed into a fairy queen through fairy rituals. At the close of the play, it is implied that Jamie eventually marries Jean, and succeeds Sir John. The drama thus ends happily, with fulfilled wishes, as Jamie gains both wife and wealth, and Jean discovers her true identity. Sir John, the human landlord, and Queen Mab, the queen of fairies, present a striking contrast. Sir John succeeds in securing the continuity of his family lineage: he finds his long lost daughter, as well as an ideal heir who marries her. In contrast, Queen Mab fails to find an heiress. She leaves the earth as well as her throne, to move into the moon, with her lineage discontinued.

Operating as the two central motifs of the *FC*, the ideas of changeling and heir dramatize the anxieties regarding identity, existence, duration and future of the Scottish

nation. Metaphorising Mary Queen of Scots, Queen Mab symbolises the older, pre-Union national identity of Scotland. In stark contrast, Jean, the human girl who refuses to succeed Queen Mab, and eventually marries Jamie, could be interpreted as a metaphor of the post-Union Scotland. It is indeed significant that both of those two images of Scotland, as represented by the two female characters, experience the anxieties regarding identity, existence and disappearance. Furthermore, the motif of changeling is connotative of usurpation and the illegitimate monarch, whilst the marriage of Jamie and Jean at the close of the story metaphorises the union of two nations—as King James VI himself once used the word ‘marriage’ to describe the Union of the Crowns.

In ‘Dissertation I’, where Black explains his purposes, strategies and ideas behind his writing of the *FC*, he mentions Queen Mab’s anxiety regarding existence, which provokes a desire to ‘prove her own existence’: ‘[A]s to the existence of the genus[*fairies*], I need only refer to the convincing proof brought by Queen Mab herself, who endeavours, like Descartes, to prove her own existence in the first scene of the second act of this Pastoral’ (Black, ‘Dissertation I’ 10). In the scene mentioned by Black, where Queen Mab informs Jean of her true identity and her own fate, she expresses her anxieties as follows: ‘Now in the scale o’ reasoning life, it’s plain/ *That fairies must exist as well as man. / And hence, that every being may ha’e place, / Are worlds unnumber’d i’ the fields o’ space*’ (Black, *FC* 125, emphasis added). Here Queen Mab manifests a strong desire to exist, as well as preoccupations with a place and homeland. An intensely strong attachment to Scotland is also expressed at the close of the story, where she leaves, or vanishes from, Scotland:

Q[ueen]. MAB: Hasten: hasten! let us go—

Wither! fairy bowers below!—
 SCOTIA, country of my birth,
 Dearest, dearest land on earth!
 Scenes from which I must depart,
 For every scene now tears my heart:
 Scenes where pleas'd I wont to dwell,
 Native land!—Farewell! Farewell! (Black, *FC* 193)

Here Queen Mab emphatically reveals her patriotic attachment to Scotland, which is amplified by the chorus of other fairies, who also sing in the Scots language:

Q[ueen]. MAB. [...] Fairies! no more, no more we here will dwell;
 Sing a last song, and bid your haunts farewell.

[.....]

FAIRIES. Farewell, where we did reside,
 Rocky caves of Mouss[probably , Mouse Water] and Clyde!
 Never mair, by lunar gleam,
 Frae Bonniton we'll tread the stream,
 Down to where the Corra lin
 Tumbles o'er wi' rumbling din;

[.....]

Never, never mair we'll swim,
 On Douglas' wild and savage stream;
 Where the chieftain's castle slood,
 Who warm'd it with invaders blood:
 Never, hastening down the Clyde,

We'll track its passage to the tide;
 Down Stonebyres, at midnight hour,
 And passing Bothwell's massy tower,
 To where Dumbarton's castle steep,
 Frowns upon the glittering deep;
 Never up the Leven take

Our course to lovely Lomond's lake. (Black, *FC* 192-193)

Through mentioning a variety of specific place names in South West Scotland in detail, the Fairies' chorus blesses, mythifies and perpetuates their homeland. The repetition of the lamenting expressions 'never mair' intensifies the sense of loss and disappearance: the loss and disappearance of old and pre-Union Scotland. Finally, Queen Mab vanishes, together with the fairies, perhaps evoking the imagery of migration, and leaving a sense of emptiness behind:

They[Fairies] arrange themselves in the form of a semicircle, on each side of the Queen, and looking towards the mouth of the cave: Those on the one side sing one of the following songs, and those on the other the other; all join in the burthen.

[.....]

She[Queen Mab] enters into the cavern, followed by the Fairies: A melodious and melancholy symphony is for some time heard, which grows fainter and fainter, and at last dies away. (Black, *FC* 192-193)

Jean, a human girl, also experiences anxieties with regard to identity. Immediately after she is informed of her true identity, as a daughter of Sir John, she is told that if she is not saved by other human beings before the day she turns sixteen, she

will irreversibly be turned into a Fairy Queen to succeed Queen Mab.

JEAN. Deep in our fairy forest there's a well.

A fountain consecrate by many a spell—

[.]

I'll there the morn,

Thrice dipt, become a fay, unless I'm torn

Frae them this day; and frae that fatal hour,

I can be aided by nae mortal power,

But to the moon, I'm tald, like lightenin' fly,

To be the fairy queen when Mab shall die. (Black, *FC* 154-155)

Even if she is fortunate enough to be saved, she has to go through a series of magical transformations into the figures of various grotesque and earthy beings, before she finally recovers her old self:

SIMON. Then while you[Jamie] hald she[Jean]'ll change afore your

een,

And in successive horrid shapes be seen.

Now like a snake she'll twist a forked tail,

And now a brock wi' dreadfu' teeth assail;

In a' the shapes that breed disgust or fear,

A taid, an ask, an ather, she'll appear:

At ither times a blazing fire she'll seem,

Or glide before you like a murmuring stream:

But ay the mair she struggles ha'd mair fast,

An' she'll resume a woman's shape at last,

As naked as auld Eve. (Black, *FC* 122-123)

The motifs of changeling and heir in the *FC*, as well as those of transformation and migration, are profoundly significant, for they serve to foreground and dramatize the problem of the identity and continuity of the Scottish nation. The departure of Queen Mab at the close of the story, together with the happy marriage of Jean and Jamie, represents the loss and disappearance of old Scottish identity, followed by the birth and creation of new national identity, as well as confusion, ambivalent responses, and resistances to it.

2.5 Vanishing People and the ‘Decaying Dialect’:

The Cultural Nationalist View of Language and its Danger

As demonstrated in earlier sections, fairies in the *FC* serve as a metaphor of national identity. Black’s perception of fairies also overlaps with that of the Scots language: a more widely accepted symbol of national identity. Often commonly called the ‘vanishing people’, fairies are described by Black as beings who were ‘once generally prevalent’ but have ‘now lost [their] credit except in the nursery’ (Black, ‘Dissertation I’ 3). Echoing the statement, the Scots language is also viewed as something which is in an on-going process of being rapidly lost, and is ‘decaying daily’:

It may seem to require explanation why in the following Pastoral Drama, I have assumed a hypothesis which, though once generally prevalent has now lost its credit, except in the nursery, and why I have written it in a dialect which is decaying daily. This dialect, too, can already boast of the finest poem of the pastoral kind that perhaps has ever been written, and which by raising high the standard of this sort

of composition has rendered success extremely difficult. (Black, 'Dissertation I' 3)

In her study of the literary uses of the Scots language, Emma Letley aptly points out that in the novel from Scott, Hogg and Galt onwards, 'the presence of Scots' came to 'suggest meaning and resonances beyond the primary content conveyed by the dialectal words' (Letley, *Galt* 4). Indeed, the very basic linguistic feature of the *FC* is that all the fairies including Queen Mab speak the Scots language, is loaded with certain political implications. Bearing Letley's analysis in mind, this can clearly be interpreted as a manifestation of Black's cultural nationalistic attitude, and subversion of the processes of Anglicization, which would have been being advanced at an unprecedented scale in the Scotland in his time.

In his 'Dissertation II', Black attempts to justify his use of the Scots dialect as the primary medium of his pastoral drama. Here, Black reveals a dangerously nationalistic and almost extremist attitude toward language:

I proceed now to the second object of this Introductory essay; which is to justify my adoption of the Scottish[sic] dialect in the following Drama: And this apology will rest on two propositions which, as they may be repugnant to the opinions of the English reader, I shall be at some pains to establish. *The first is that the Scoto-Saxon dialect is superior to the Anglo-Saxon in point of purity; and the second is that it surpasses the latter in melody or sweetness of sound.* (Black, 'Dissertation II' 19, emphasis added)

Stressing that he is 'at pains' to establish propositions which 'may be repugnant' to English readers, Black claims that the Scoto-Saxon dialect is 'superior' to the

Anglo-Saxon ‘in point of purity’, and ‘surpasses’ the Anglo-Saxon in ‘melody or sweetness of sound’ (Black, ‘Dissertation II’ 19). Such an attitude, which evaluates languages in terms of ‘purity’, and claims that one language can be ‘superior’ to another, is profoundly dangerous. While this view, apparently an observation made within the linguistic sphere, is unscientific, partial and discriminatory, it in fact is a striking example of romantic cultural nationalist discourse, which was ultimately appropriated by and developed into Nazism.⁴⁸ Anthony D. Smith, for instance, argues:

All these movements of intelligentsia and opposition groups calling for the vernacular mobilization of ‘the people’ against a variety of evils: autocracy, bureaucracy, capitalism, and western ways. But such was the chameleon-like character of nationalism that it could be appropriated by the autocrats, bureaucrats, and capitalists. The classic instances are Germany and Japan. In Germany the 1848 revolutions of the intellectuals were divided and crushed, [...]. *Popular German nationalism accordingly migrated into Pan-German expansionism and the volkisch fantasies of an academic proletariat who dreamed of German conquest [...] in the footsteps of Teutonic Knights and medieval German merchants. It was from these fringe groups of intelligentsia that the Nazi movement developed, even if its racism was to leave far behind the original linguistic bases of German romantic nationalism.* (Smith, *Nationalism* 8, my emphasis)

In Black’s dissertations which clearly reflect the up-to-date intellectual climate in the contemporary European society, and which is undeniably racist and biased, one can also undeniably detect the ‘original linguistic bases of romantic nationalism’ which arguably

has a potential to be developed and appropriated into a form of Nazism. Black goes on to attack the English language in a partial manner:

[S]ince the age of Queen Elisabeth, they[the English] have gone on introducing words from foreign languages, snatching the possessions of others, while they rejected, like the dog in the fable, what they possessed themselves, though more valuable. It follows from this, that many of the words used by the most illustrious writers in Queen Elisabeth's time (though perfectly familiar in this country[Scotland]) cannot, by an Englishman, be understood without a glossary. Hence it has often been observed, that a Scotsman is apt to behold with contempt and wonder the erudition which has been expended by the commentators of Shakespeare, in explaining words familiar to him, but which they have often mistaken. (Black, 'Dissertation II' 22)

Such claims by Black could be perceived as subversion of the processes of anglicization, wherein the English language was often perceived as a 'pure' language:

[T]he attitude to regional language in major eighteenth-century fiction can be summed up by the persistent equation of non-standard speech and defect, either physical more moral, or more often, a combination of the two: regional speech, as in Fielding's fiction, is often given no more respect than the burlesqued variety of English spoken by foreign characters; 'good' characters are distinguished by their 'pure' English [...]. (Letley, *Galt* 3)

Black's characterisation of Queen Mab as a noble monarch, who speaks the Scots language and plays a key and tragic role in the text, can also be interpreted as a critique

of the literary conventions in eighteenth and nineteenth Britain, in which, as Letley summarises, '[d]ialect-speakers are disadvantageously placed on the peripheries of the novel's central concerns and fulfil an occasional and often "clownish" role' (Letley *Galt* 3). If one pays more attention to the significant link between fairies and language in the *FC*, both of which synonymously act as iconic symbols of Scottish national identity, one could recognise more importance in the setting of the *FC* text, which places the textual space-time on the eve of the Reformation. According to Letley, Reformation exerted a significant influence on the history of the Scottish language:

With the Reformation, Scotland's alliance with France was gradually superseded by one with England; religious works were written in English; Scots was threatened by the accession of James VI to the English throne and his own writings are significant. Before his accession he wrote in Scots: after 1603, his preferred medium was English and, in the main, Scottish writers followed his example. (Letley, *Galt* 5)

As Letley argues, the Reformation did not only exorcise fairies and other supernatural and superstitions associated with Catholicism, but also threatened to banish the Scots language from the literary sphere. Black, through the portrayal of Queen Mab speaking the Scots language, obviously criticised the Reformation, from a cultural nationalist perspective.

2.6 'A Scotchman's Right to Adopt Fairy Way of Writing' :

Fairy Writing as a Strategy of National Perpetuation

Clearly inspired by Scott's treatment, as well as nationalisation, of fairies in the *Minstrelsy*, Black to some extent nationalises fairies. Arguably, foretelling the rise and vogue of Darwinism and natural science later in the nineteenth century, Black treats them as a 'race' and 'species', drawing a genealogical chart. Probably reflecting the intellectual climate on the eve of the birth of anthropology as a discipline, Black also pay attention to the customs and manners of the elfin people. Echoing Scott's fairy writing, Black links fairies to particular nations which exist in reality, calling them 'Scotish fairies', 'English fairies' and so on, often perceiving them as an embodiment of a national character. He debates what kinds of characteristics and dispositions can be found in fairies of Scotland, England and other countries, making comparisons of each other and locating similarities and differences, often explaining the distinguishing features of fairies as a reflection of the climate and landscape of the nation they represent.

With respect to the species, there are three kinds of Fairies; the Continental Fairies, if I may call them so—the Scotch[sic] or Gothic Fairy—and the English, which is a sort of middle species, differing in some degree from each of the others. The Continental Fairies are very different indeed from the 'wee green coated bodies of Scotland. (Black, 'Dissertation I' 10)

The Scotch [sic] fairies are represented to us as diminutive old looking creatures, dressed in green, and living in green hills, or in the caverns of the rocks: in their dispositions they were capricious and

resentful, but at the same time fond of an intercourse with men, from whom they sometimes borrowed, [...]. The English fairies, though far less harsh and gloomy, had many analogies with the Scottish[sic] or Gothic fairies; such as being dressed in green, dancing by moonlight in a circle, withering the grass upon which they trod, and stealing away children. They were distinguished from the Scottish[sic] elves by their love of neatness, and by their harmless disposition, which was rather frolicksome and useful than malicious and hurtful. (Black, 'Dissertation I' 15)

Like Scott, Black also takes an euhemeristic approach, and mentions indigenous people as an 'origin' of fairies: 'In the north, [...] there was supposed to exist, in the caverns of the mountains, a dwarfish race of people, skilled in mechanical arts: these had often communication with men; stole away their children; and acted in many ways similar to the Scottish[sic] fairy' (Black, 'Dissertation I' 15). Further, Scott's influence on Black's perception of fairies can also be found in his recognition of the mixing and appropriating processes of different traditional and literary fairy beliefs, which supposedly occurred quite frequently in the history of fairy belief and writing at least in Britain: 'But the poets of England, Shakespeare, Drayton, and others, have joined, if I may say so, the attributes of the eastern and of the Gothic fairies; and instead of a disagreeable race of beings, have made of them the most whimsical creatures of the fancy' (Black, 'Dissertation I' 16).

Black's method of creating his original 'Scottish fairies' in the dramatic part of the *FC* is ambivalent and problematic. On the one hand, he faithfully emulates traditional ballads including 'Thomas the Rhymer' and 'Tam Lin': 'But I've been

tald—an irie tale to tell—/ Ilk seven year they pay a teind to hell' (Black, *FC* 121);

On Hallowe'en, whan fairy tribes resort,

Frae a' their caves and roun' green hills, to court;

Then in a grand procession they advance,

And upo' steeds wi' ringin' bridles prance:

Then stan' you near their path as still as death,

While they are hastenin' o'er the moonlight heath. (Black, *FC* 122)

On the other hand, Black mixes and appropriates traditional depiction of fairies in other countries, creating hybrid fairies:

In the following Pastoral, I have adopted fairies of a sort of middle nature between the Scottish and English elves; on the one hand, I thought the public had got enough of the waggon spokes of spinner's legs, with fly charioteers, glow worms, and bracelets of emmet's eyes; on the other hand, my fairies are not described as malicious and disagreeable; they are such as these beings appear to a person who joins the ideas he has derived from the traditions of his own country, with those which have been furnished by the authors among our neighbours. (Black, 'Dissertation I' 16-17)

Black's creation of hybrid fairies, which he calls 'Scottish', epitomises and metaphorises the processes of the creation of new national identity in the post-union Scotland. Further, the presence of hybrid fairies in the *FC* reveals that Black's motivations and purposes of writing the *FC* was deeply related to his interests in the nation and homeland, rather than his interests in fairies. In 'Dissertation I', Black makes clear that his intention in writing the *FC* is to celebrate the homeland, and make it 'durable',

disclosing a very strong attachment to, and preoccupations with, the land and 'locality'.

The usage of the word 'durable' reveals a desire to perpetuate the nation:

As to the locality of the action, I have chosen the Falls of Clyde, partly no doubt on account of the ancient tradition on which my pastoral is founded, partly because they are near the place where I was born, but principally on account of the sublime beauties of the scenery. In every country and with writers in I believe every modern language, a fairy land, or fairy prospect or scene, is synonymous with one of exquisite beauty; and in every country, too, such scenes, when they exist, should be celebrated by the poetical writers of the country.
(Black, 'Dissertation I' 8-9)

In this extract, Black declares that the local landscape, accompanied by emotional attachment to it, was the original source of inspiration, which motivated him into writing a pastoral drama. Disclosing strong preoccupations with the land and its landscape, Black further claims that it is a poet's mission to celebrate and perpetuate the landscape through creating literary works; revealing the perception that literature, together with fairies as a literary device, has a capacity to make a land and nation 'durable':

The ingenious editor [James Currie] of the Works of Burns, speaking of the Scottish songs says, 'The alliance of the words of the Scottish songs with the music has, in some instances, given to the former a popularity which otherwise they would not have obtained.' 'The association (continues he) of the words and the music of these songs with the more beautiful parts of the scenery of Scotland, contribute to

the same effect. It has given them not merely popularity, but permanence; it has imparted to the works of men some portion of the durability of the works of Nature. If, from our imperfect experience of the past, we may judge with any confidence respecting the future, songs of this description are of all others least likely to die. In the changes of language they may no doubt suffer change, but will perhaps survive while the clear stream sweeps down the vale of Yarrow, or the yellow broom waves on the Cowdenknows.’ (Black, ‘Dissertation I’ 9)

Quoting the words from ‘Essay upon the Scottish Poetry Including the Poetry of Burns’ by James Currie, which is included in *The Works of Robert Burns: Containing his Life* (1835) edited by Lockhart and Currie, Black discloses an intense sense of crisis, that the language, culture, and national identity of Scotland could be lost amid the tumults and drastic changes, which were occurring across the whole region of Europe on an unprecedented scale. Black also emphasises the capacity of literature: which, with the help of the sublime landscapes which physically continue to exist in reality, can help to perpetuate the nation. Black thus views and uses fairies as a device of blessing, mythifying and perpetuating the locality and homeland; as a device which can reinforce the bond between the land and the nation. His creation of a utopian fairyland in the *FC*, which is clearly a mirror image of Scotland, is an act intended to mythify and perpetuate the nation.

For fairy land (say poems) is an isle,
Where nature wears an everlastin’ smile;
Peacefu’ it lies, mid ever placid seas,

Or scarcely ruffled by the western breeze;
 Where sweetly dashin' water-falls are seen,
 An' bow'rs, an' groves o' everlivin' green. (Black, *FC* 121)

The fairyland depicted here, imagined as an 'island' with 'dashin' water-falls' and 'everlivin' green' is an idealised representation of Scotland. Protected by 'the western breeze', the 'fairyland' enjoys a milder climate, presumably because Ireland geographically serves as a windbreak wall: the geographical presence of Ireland possibly exerts a greater influence upon the climate of South West Scotland in particular, where the *FC* is set. The fairyland created here, framed by the abundantly used expressions representing life, peace and eternity, including 'everlasting' and 'everliving', embodies Black's patriotic feeling, who once mentioned 'The peculiar right a Scotchman has to adopt the fairy way of writing' (Black, 'Dissertation I' 3).

As argued earlier, while the main body of the text creates an enchanted textual realm where the fantastical, the real, and the historical coexist in a magical realist manner, the prefatory dissertations are thoroughly rational, disenchanting, and demythifying. They boldly and radically deconstruct fairies, exposing, to borrow David Lodge's words, 'nuts and bolts'(11) of fairy belief. The amalgamation of disparate genres in the *FC* thus generates unusual tensions. Furthermore, through the repeated emphasis on the artificiality and inventedness of fairies, Black perhaps implicitly discloses the artificiality and constructedness of national culture, tradition, and identity, all of which were just in the making in his time on an unprecedented scale.

I shall not examine at present whether thus making Scotland the scene of astonishing productions and supernatural events, be owing to the wild romantic beauties of the country, or to its remoteness, and the

supposed uncivilized condition of its inhabitants. Probably its remoteness from the more early cultivated parts of Europe, and its being so little known, was the principal reason for it is natural for a poet to place his wonders in distant and unknown lands. [...] But whatever be the cause of our picturesque and sublime country being made use of in this manner, to *furnish out* wild descriptions, a Scotsman has certainly fully as great a right as any one to make use of any advantage *furnished by his situation* compensating his proximity to the scenery by justness of description. I may be pardoned, therefore, if in a Drama, written in the dialect of the country, and of which the scenes are laid in the most romantic situation perhaps in Scotland, I may be pardoned if I have introduced some personages [i.e. fairies] who, though now reckoned supernatural existed once (if ancient tale [i.e. Chaucer, 'Wife of Bath's Tale'] can be in aught believed) in great abundance. The time unfortunately being past when people 'Employ'd the power of fairy hands/ To raise the ceilings fretted height' [...]. (Black 'Dissertation I': 7-8, emphasis added)

Clearly, Black here alludes to 'Wife of Bath's Tale': 'In th'olde days of the King Arthour, [...] / All was this land fulfild of fayerye, / The elf-queen with hir joly companye / Daunced ful ofte in many a grene mede. / This was the olde opinion, as I rede' (857-62). It is highly significant that at the outset of the extract, Black challenges and de-constructs the by then established and romanticised association of Scotland with fairies, exposing and emphasising the fictionality of the conception that Scotland is a land of fairies, or in Lang's words, 'the fairy knowe of the North'. In a

manner strikingly contrasting with the attitudes of Scott and Lang, who were very eager to embrace and reproduce the romanticising association, Black thoroughly disenchant and de-fashions the Scottish nation. He reduces supernatural beings and superstitious phenomena, into metonymies of wild landscape, distance from other countries, and the supposed backwardness of the nation. It is indeed surprising that immediately after he has thus de-constructed and dis-encharnted the stereotypical conception of Scotland as ‘a fairy knowe of the North’, Black sets out to repeat the same elf-fashioning process which he has just de-constructed and criticised. With a paradoxical and sarcastic self-consciousness, Black replicates and reinforces the stereotypical and artificial association of Scotland with fairies. Black’s contradictory, sarcastic, and self-reflexive creation of fairy writing in spite of his awareness of its artificiality implicitly reveals his response to the on-going, enlightening and modernising process of the creation of ‘North Britain’ which was, arguably in reality, no other than the process of anglicisation. Though he is fully aware of the artificiality and deceptiveness of the whole process, he cannot but help participate in it, like numerous other Scottish intellectuals eager to learn the English language and repress their Scottishness. Like Scott, Hogg and Lang, Black found an outlet for his dilemma and frustrations with regard to the perceived dissolution of Scottishness, in the act of writing. It had to be ‘fairy’ writing, because such ‘backward’ emotional repulsion toward the modernising process, underpinned by Scottish patriotic feeling, could not be expressed in other more ‘authentic’ genres intended for serious, intellectual and middle class readership who would be eager to gain attractive positions promised by the British Empire, through the suppression of Scottishness.

Significantly, Black claims, in the above extract, that he is justified writing a

pastoral drama with fairies because he is 'a Scotsman'. This statement suggests that Black is motivated to write a fairy drama not from any interest in fairies, but from national concerns: Black wrote the *FC* because he was a Scotsman, wished to explore national issues, and reinforce, mythify and perpetuate Scottish national identity. Black is fully aware that fairies are purely imaginary beings, and that the association between fairies and Scotland is fabricated and arbitrary. Nevertheless, he dares to replicate and reinforce the association, because such association grants Scotland a distinguished national culture and character, with a 'long' tradition and history authorised by numerous deities, which might serve to legitimate the nation.

To repeat, Black's purpose of writing the *FC* is *not*, as J. M. Barrie and his character Peter Pan might have wished, to save *fairies* from sinking into oblivion. Instead, Black is consistently focused on saving *the Scottish nation* from sinking into oblivion, by reinforcing and emphasising its 'national character' and 'tradition', even though he actually considers them to be fake and forged. Significantly, Black repetitively uses the expression 'furnish' in his description of traditional fairy belief in various countries. His use of the word 'furnish' discloses how Black was aware of the artificiality and inventedness of the widely accepted link between fairies and the Scottish nation. His writing of the *FC* could be interpreted as what Letley calls 'a positive gesture of well-meaning resistance, and a mark of authentic commitment to Scotland' (Letley, *Gault* 7).

Supporting his argument with abundant literary quotations, including those from works by English authors, Black even justifies strengthens the association of fairies and Scotland:

Besides these arguments, deduced from the example of the poets and

the remarks of critics, the very country in which I was born had a tendency to direct my attention to this subject [fairies]. Collins, in his fine ode on the superstition of the highlands, observes to Mr Home, on his return to Scotland:

'Tis Fancy's land on which thou set'st thy feet,
Where still 'tis said the fairy people meet,
Beneath each birken shade on mead and hill.

Indeed it is extremely worthy of being remarked, that Scotland has ever been considered as the country of strange productions, of enchantment, and of romance. The Caledonian forest was a favourite place for the Paladines, the Knights of the Round Table, and other testy gentlemen, to exercise their valour in. The caves of our country are represented by the romantic writers as infested with dragons, and its seas with orks.

Shakespeare considered the heaths of Scotia as the scenery best fitted for the introduction of his weird sisters, (and to pass from ancient to modern writers) the Abbe de Lille in a late poem *L'homme de Champs*, tells a pretty long and not very natural story of a young shepherdess named Egeria, who lived with her father in one of the floating islands of Scotland, as if floating islands were as common in this country as reindeer are in Lapland. [...] Nor is it only the poets who have peopled our country with 'gorgons and hydras and chimeras dire;' but I have remarked that even the philosophers and divines of other countries are willing to consider Scotia as abounding in

anomalous productions. Thus De Maillet, in his *Telliamed*, endeavouring to prove that men originally had tails, says, ‘There are a great number of these men in Ethiopia, Egypt, the Indies, England and *especially Scotland* [emphasis by the author] according to all relations [...]’. (Black, ‘Dissertation I’ 7-8)

As this chapter has demonstrated, the very basic settings, constituents, and medium of the *FC* are underpinned by cultural nationalist ideologies. To be more precise, Black’s choices of fairies as the subject of his pastoral drama, of Scots as the language used, and of the Falls of Clyde as the location, are all clearly motivated by cultural nationalist anxieties under threat. While the *FC* can thus be safely regarded as a piece of national writing, it is significant that Black’s contradictory treatment of fairies in the paratexts and main body of the *FC* renders the work profoundly problematic and ambiguous. In particular, the coexistence of Black’s disenchanted awareness of the artificiality of fairy belief in the prefatory dissertations, and his simplistic replication and reinforcement of those fairy representations which he perceives to be artificial in the main body of the text, is exceptionally contradictory. This section explores the reason why Black dared to create a work of fairy writing, regardless of his distanced attitude toward fairies. It argues that Black purposefully deployed fairies as a device to explore, mythify and perpetuate Scottish national identities. Like Scott and Lang, Black was aware that fairies can serve as an effective device which can help to culturally legitimate and perpetuate a nation. Imagined as a form of deity which is specifically linked to a particular land, fairies justify and reinforce the bond between a land and a nation in a manner similar to the theory of the divine right of kings: fairies

mythify the nation, fabricating an illusion that the nation is authorised by deities. Perceived as ancient beings, the ‘traditional’ fairies ‘characteristic to’ the nation help to antiquate and culturally legitimate the nation, as ‘antiquity’ is one of the most powerful factors which make a nation legitimate. As a powerful iconic symbol, supposedly representing the voices of the people, it can help to nurture and unify collective identities; regarded as a product of ‘folk’ and ‘local’ imagination, it can serve to arouse patriotic feelings among the people. Being an emblem of ‘tradition’ and ‘culture’ unique to the nation, fairies also create the illusion that the nation has a unique and distinguished *national culture*: another powerful factor which legitimates a nation in the Romantic period.

Letley aptly argues that the Scots language is ‘used for the fundamental bond’ with the character’s ‘home country, her relationship with the land, her deepest feeling deriving from childhood experiences, and her desires, her sexuality’ (Letley, Galt xi). Presumably sharing a similar approach, Nicholas Howe, in his *Migration and Mythmaking in Anglo-Saxon England*, maintains that

[A] cultural myth is most dramatically visible when evoked at a moment of crisis. For it will then display a note of urgency as it summons the identity of its culture. [...] An origin myth becomes an account of that ancestral past which, despite any evidence to the contrary, gives a group its irreducible common identity. And, for the Anglo-Saxons, there was considerable evidence that they were a loose amalgam of shifting kingdoms and dialect groups rather than a cohesive people’ (Howe 5)

I argue that fairies in nineteenth century Scottish literature are devised to play the same

roles as ‘language’ and ‘myth’ as analysed by Letley and Howe. Writing fairies is an act of creating modern myths, and thereby, a means to perpetuate the Scottish nation, whose state was legally lost and disappeared after 1707. By deliberately elf-fashioning Scotland, the authors of fairy writing forged, mythified and perpetuated the national identity of Scotland, which in reality can be perceived as a hybrid of various different ethnic and dialect groups, far from being a monolithic and unified community. Further, Hogg’s metaphorical depiction of Scotland as an innocent girl who is overjoyed when she meets the beautiful but dark and colonising ‘Queen of Night’, is probably intended to strengthen people’s sympathy with the Scottish nation. In this way, nation building occurring in fairy writing is profoundly self-reflexive and complicated. While implicitly criticising and subverting the artificiality and deceptiveness of the newly created images of ‘Britain’ and ‘North Britain’, they also take part in the process of creation. In addition, they replicate exactly the same process within Scotland, constructing another artificial identity: the national identity of Scotland.

The crucial feature of Black’s *FC* which makes an exceptional national writing does not lie in its deployment of fairies, but the author’s detached, dis-enchanted and self-reflective awareness that he is creating and reinforcing something forged. This overlaps with Fiona Stafford’s view of the ‘modern myth making’:

The growing recognition of modern myths has done much to challenge the traditional view that European myth-making has died out in the seventeenth century. [...] An awareness of its own fictionality is characteristic of the modern myth, frequently investing it with irony, or a sense of failure, and above all a need for self-verification. (Stafford, *Last* 6-7)

Black's act of mythmaking is distinguished in that he possessed and displayed what Stafford calls 'an awareness of fictionality' saturated by irony. Black's self-reflexive and often ironic awareness of the roles of poets and bards in the creation of an imagined community presumably overlaps with Hogg's self-consciousness, which will be explored in the following chapter. Black and Hogg stand in a stark and significant contrast with Scott and Lang, both of whom occupied a significant place in the London publishing market and literary world, and whose works of fairy writing do not display such self-consciousness and irony regarding the fictionality of fairies and national identity.

To conclude, numerous works of Scottish fairy writing explored in the thesis serves to reveal complex and concealed emotional responses towards the nation and the union, and especially towards the loss of the state and fear of dissolution. It also shows the self-reflexiveness of some people participating in the process of nation building occurring in Britain after the union. Their strategy to perpetuate the Scottish nation was elf-fashioning: romanticising and mythifying the nation, hiding it in the subliminal realm depicted as 'wild', 'distant', 'illogical', 'immaterial' but 'immortal'.

Chapter Three: James Hogg

3.1 Introduction

The works by James Hogg (1770-1835) present those issues which bear a profound significance in literary studies. During his life time, and in particular during the collection and literarisation of the traditional Border ballads by the antiquarians including Scott, the controversy regarding authorship, editorship and appropriation occurred. Douglas S. Mack observes that one significant reason for Hogg's ambiguous attitude toward Scott is the issue of authenticity and appropriation. According to Mack, Hogg was critical of Scott's appropriation of the collected material, often from his mother. In spite of his antipathy towards Scott's appropriation of the original material, Hogg also created a variety of original fairy narratives inspired by the ballad, 'Thomas the Rhymer'. For instance, 'The Hunt of Eildon', a relatively unexplored work, is fundamentally a prosaic adaptation of the ballad.

While Margaret Hogg, his mother, thus witnessed the very process of conversion of orality into writing, Hogg himself experienced profound critical neglect which lasted for a quite long time even after his death, except for the exceptional rediscovery by André Gide (1869-1951) in 1947 (Groves vii). One remarkable example can be found in Andrew Lang's treatment of Hogg's works. Originally a Borderer born and raised in Selkirk, receiving education at Edinburgh Academy, Lang occupied authoritative positions both in the Oxonian academia and the literary world in London, thus staying at the very centre of the literary world of the British Empire. While Lang emotionally respected Scott, wrote about him and even edited the Border edition of his works, he entirely neglected Hogg's works. Nevertheless, a movement

of revaluation started from the 1960s onward, culminating in the foundation of the Hogg Society (1981) and the periodicals *Newsletters* (1984-89) and *Studies in Hogg and His World* (1990-). Further, his works are currently undergoing the process of canonisation: the Stirling/South Carolina Research edition is being published, amounting to thirty-four volumes. While the new edition reveals the significance of the transatlantic cultural link between Scotland and the North American continent, it might also echo the politically devolving processes in Britain.

Mack has been playing an initiative role in revaluating Hogg's works, and has been paying constant attentions to his works. The revival of interest in the author was also perceived outwith Scotland as early as 1991, when Kazuhisa Takahashi published an article entitled 'The Ettrick Shepherd, or, the Rhetoric of a Shepherd: a Study on the Revaluation of James Hogg' in Tokyo.⁴⁹ Thus, the history of the creation and reception of Hogg's works foregrounds the vitally significant issues which have been receiving much attention in a diverse range of literary studies, not limited to the Scottish ones: authorship, editorship, orality/writing and authenticity/forgery issues, critical neglect and revaluation, trans-Atlantic relations, international reception of literary works, devolution and canon-making.

Arguably, recent canon-making projects might also echo the attempts of 'folk revival' to collect, re-create, and appropriate the oral tradition during the Romantic period. The materials provided by the Hogg family, once converted from orality into writing, are again being transformed: from neglected works to canonical national literature.

3.2 Farewell to Knowledge: a Subversive Exploration of the Origin of the Fairies

That said, the vital significance of Hogg's elaborately elf-fashioned national tale does not lie in such a peculiar history of its reception, but in the central and peculiar roles fairies are given in the mythography. Further, the inscription of Hogg's self-reflexiveness as a poet, or a maker, of the national mythography in the narrative is another distinguishing feature. It overlaps with the ironic self-consciousness of Black, who replicated the process of creating artificial fairy writing in spite of his relative lack of interest in fairies, as well as his recognition of its fabricated-ness. Furthermore, it also shares similarities with Edmund Spenser who, as Mathew Woodcock aptly points out, inscribed his self-consciousness as a myth-maker in the figure of the poet character employed in his panegyric epic *The Faerie Queene*. Thus the Hoggian epic *The Queen's Wake* overlaps with *The Faerie Queene* not only in its epical genre and deployment of a Queen as the central character, but also in its inscription of the shepherd poet in the work as a projection of himself.

In addition, Hogg also shaped a 'Fairy King':

The Knight of Dumblane from that day forth
 Never utter'd word upon the earth;
 But moved about like a spirit in pain
 For certain days, then vanish'd again.
 And was chosen, as my old legend says,
 The patriarch King of the Scottish Fays (*Origin* 168)

These lines, extracted from a verse 'Origin of Fairies', relate a curious phenomenon. 'The Knight of Dumblane', a Scottish nobleman, is made the 'King of the Scottish Fays'. Notably, fairies are often imagined as forming a political community in the

traditional belief, art and literature in Britain. In addition to Queen Mab, Titania and Oberon are also sovereigns. Joseph Nobel Paton, in his paintings *The Reconciliation and Quarrel of Oberon and Titania* (1847, 1849), depicted them as imperial sovereigns, through the portrayal of a variety of numerous small-shaped fairies surrounding them, each representing a different race and evoking the people in imperial colonies. If one applies Bown's formulation that the diminished size of fairies represents deprived power, Paton's creation of numerous tiny fairies of different race obviously metaphorises colonial oppression and deprivation.⁵⁰ In Robert Kirk's work, fairies form a 'commonwealth', and traditional ballads 'Thomas the Rhymer' and 'Tam Lin' employ a Fairy 'Queen'. Following, and reinforcing the tradition, Hogg also places Fairy Queen characters in a number of his works. For example, in 'Superstition', he writes: 'In Caledonia's glens there once did reign/ A Sovereign of supreme unearthly eye;/ No human power her potence could restrain,/ No human soul her influence deny' (Hogg, 'Superstition' 67). In 'Origin of the Fairies', Hogg adds a new twist to the traditional association, in that he characterises the 'Fairy King' as a spirit which was originally, but is no longer, a human being, a Scotsman, and a Knight. While Hogg thus strengthens the traditional association between fairies and political communities, he also emphasises the another well-known association between Scotland and fairy belief. He reinforces the romanticised conception of the Scottish nation as, to borrow Andrew Lang's words, 'a fairy knowe of the North', elf-fashioning the Scottish nation in order to mythify, romanticise and immortalise it. Yet, he also emphasises the imagery of absence, disappearance, loss and emptiness, through the recurrent portrayal of their departure.

Fairy narratives by Hogg are commonly shaped as national mythography. Even though, as in the case of 'Kilmeny' and 'The Pilgrim of the Sun', the narrative is

chiefly set in transcendental and heavenly space, it is pinned down to Scotland through evoked memories of both a personal and the national past, together with the pin-point references to the Scottish geographic features, place-names and historic figures: ‘The spirits show her[Kilmeny] scenes of Scotland, and she finds that “her heart to that land did cleave”’; she sees the rise and fall of Mary Queen of Scots and the ravages of war with England’ (Gilbert, ‘Abduction’ 44). As the succinct summary by Gilbert suggests, both direct and indirect allusions to Mary Queen of Scots are characteristically and recurrently employed in Hogg’s fairy writing, and serve to evoke the sense of Scottishness. Further, the use and defence of the Scottish language, often accompanied by strong antipathy toward the English language, is also often employed to link the narrative to Scotland and Scottishness. For instance, the following conversation takes place in *Eildon*:

‘Are ye gaun to keep on at bletherin’ English? Tell me, ye see—for if ye be, I’m gaun to clatter nane to ye.’

‘Dear Croudy, I have often told you that there is not such a thing as English and Scotch languages; the one is merely a modification of the other, a refinement as it were’—

‘Ay, an *exaltation* like—ation! ation! I’m sure nae Scot that isna a fool wad ever let that sound, *ation*, come out o’ his mouth.’ (*Eildon* 252)

In this extract even Mumps, a character speaking in English, persuasively tells Croudy that English and Scots share a common root, in a similar fashion to Scott’s argument in the *Minstrelsy* demonstrating the similarities between English and Scottish fairy belief. However, Mumps’ well established argument fails to be accepted by Croudy. Here, the

tension between the English speaking intellectual and Scots speaking shepherd is satirically epitomised. Further, the tension between the enlightened knowledge and the supernatural, as well as the helplessness of knowledge, is also implied. As this chapter discusses the issue more in depth later, the tension between knowledge and the supernatural bear profound significance in Hogg's fairy and national tale.

The 'Origin of Fairies' is an exceptionally significant verse in that it challenges the intellectuals' attempts to rationally explain, as well as suppress, fairies within their logical 'dissertations'. As exemplified by Scott's 'Introductory Essays' and Black's 'Dissertations', these pedantic prose narratives, which discuss the questions regarding the possible origins of fairies, are overtly armed with knowledge and various scholarly skills, and considers the question from the perspectives of etymology, genealogy, philology and literary studies. Hogg's treatment of the same topic, the question of where fairies came from, stands in a stark contrast with these 'intellectual' approaches. Apparently, Hogg's employment of a verse form instead of prose could be viewed as resistant to the intellectuals' approaches to explain fairies with knowledge and reason. There are obvious echoes of Hogg's voice in the following extract, which sceptically criticise the inefficacy of knowledge: 'There is no phenomenon in nature less understood, and about which greater nonsense is written, than dreaming. It is a strange thing. [...] and how can he [a philosopher] define that ethereal part of it, wherein the souls holds intercourse with the external world?' (Hogg, 'George Dobson' 118).

As commented upon by Suzanne Gilbert, Hogg's narrative is often characterised by the lack of explanation. The intertextuality and contrast between Hoggian 'Origin of Fairies' and intellectual dissertations by Scott and Black suggest that Hogg repulsed the attempts to 'explain' fairies, and the noticeable absence of

explanation in his works is probably intentional and strategic.

In 'Old David', the song Hogg assigns to the Ettrick Bard in *The Queen's Wake*, Hogg portrays fairies as evil and threatening kidnappers; in a note to the poem, however, he laments, 'The fairies have now totally disappeared, and it is a pity they should; for they seem to have been the most delightful spirits that ever haunt the Scottish dells. [...]' In the notes, Hogg draws no conclusions about where the [abducted] real-life' missing individuals have been during their absence; rather, he underscores the mystery. The absence of explanation creates an uneasy tension between poem and notes, and the two narrative voices play against each other, heightening the uncanny effect of the poem, [...]. (Gilbert, 'Abduction' 45)

In 'Abduction', the sense of loss and absence is intensified by the curious tension between the poem and the note. In the poetic part of 'Abduction', fairies have a strong though mysterious presence as kidnappers who threaten to take humans away. On the other hand, the 'note' rationally confirms and emphasises that fairies do not exist any longer. The 'absence' of explanation and the 'absence' of fairies here curiously overlap with each other, implying what a crucial place these two concepts occupied in the contemporary writing. The absence of the explanation—or, established and accepted truth within a community, at the same time heightens the sense of absence within the Scottish nation, metaphorising its loss of the monarch, parliament and independence.

In addition, in *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, one might find another example of Hogg's satiric critique of the antiquarians' way of explaining fairies. As the essays by

Scott and Black exemplify, a euhemerizing approach was commonly used to analyse the origin of fairies, often bringing a conclusion that indigenous people and outlaws, living in margins of societies and communities, came to be called and imagined as fairies. In his creation of 'fairies' in *Bodsbeck*, Hogg obliquely alludes to the euhemeristic approach. In the work, fairies, in the literal sense, do not exist at all, though the traditional belief in them haunts the narrative throughout the novel. The novel starts in an almost conventional fashion: there is a rumour of fairies having been seen by some villagers. Also in the conventional manner, some characters believe in the rumour, while others are doubtful. Like 'traditional' fairies, the Bodsbeck fairies intervene in the life of villagers, occasionally 'borrowing' their food. Later it is revealed that the 'fairies' are actually human, a group of covenanters fleeing from persecution. Significantly, the concept of 'fairies' are used in the novel to disguise the identity of covenanters who have played significant roles in the Scottish history. 'Fairies' serve as a slang among a few villagers willing to support them, to shelter and protect them from persecution. It is profoundly significant that Hogg associates even such 'figurative' fairies with the Scottish nation. Furthermore, the discovery of the identity of 'fairies', which discloses that they were after all human beings, is indeed disenchanting. It empathically foregrounds the absence of 'real' fairies, those supernatural and magical ones, in Scotland. As the story develops, the covenanters leave the village. As both 'real' and 'fake' fairies vanish from it, the village is haunted by an unbearable sense of emptiness.

3.3 Vanishing Fairies and Absence of Explanation:

Sense of Emptiness in the 'Elfin Athens of the North'

Genre-mixing, a significant common feature of fairy writing by Scott and Black, is also employed by Hogg in his creation of fairy narrative, though in a more experimental and metafictional fashion. *The Queen's Wake*, the national epic containing 'Kilmeny', is a noticeable example which is described by Suzanne Gilbert as comprising 'puzzling' and 'discrepant' juxtapositions of disparate genres: 'Hogg's notes to "Kilmeny" and other poems in *The Queen's Wake*, are written in a narrative voice very different from that of the poem. [...] The same puzzling dichotomy, the same discrepancy between poem and notes occurs elsewhere [in poems other than 'The Witch of Fife']' (Gilbert, 'Abduction' 45). The epic thus draws its readers' attention to the question of how its text, as well as its elfin constituents, is constructed. Again, Hogg's method of writing fairies overlaps with Spenser's strategy which 'invites interpretation' with its 'hermeneutic framework' he places his fairy queen:

[Book one of *The Faerie Queene*] obviously provides the ready model of a form that actively invites and requires interpretation beyond the literal level of the narrative. It is into such a formal and hermeneutic framework that Spenser places his fairy queen. Her only appearance placed within a 'dream or vision', the fairy queen is naturally established as an object to be deconstructed. (Woodcock 101)

Significantly, the genre-mixing by Scott, Black and Hogg also serves as a kind of 'hermeneutic framework' which is aimed at the disenchantment, or the deconstruction of the fairy characters employed in their works.

The Queen's Wake depicts, to borrow Dunnigan's words, imaginary 'bardic'

competitions ‘orchestrated’ by Mary Queen of Scots. Dunnigan rightly argues that the competitions constitute an evidence of ‘the poem’s characteristic blurring of temporal and historic boundaries’ and also an ‘sign’ of ‘Hogg’s own poetic “feigning” or dreaming’, since there is ‘little historical proof’ that she held such a poetic contest (Dunnigan, ‘Hogg, Fairies and Mary Queen of Scots’ 3). Through the creation of the pseudo-historic but imaginary bardic competitions, and situating Mary Queen of Scots at the centre stage, Hogg epitomises, and perhaps justifies, the act of creating national culture. Significantly, the presence and roles of the poets depicted in the epic also implicitly foreground that literary figures and artists were complicit in cultural nation building, and that they were aware of their roles in the fabricating process. Furthermore, through his meta-fictionally experimental fairy narrative, Hogg consciously emphasises not only the artificiality but also the repressiveness and multi-layeredness of national narrative, invoking the invisible, repressed and un-narrated dimensions of nation-building. Thus, though it is complicit in the cultural nation building process called ‘European Folk Revival’, which was then in vogue among various enthusiastic intellectuals and antiquarians across Europe including Scott, Hogg’s fairy narrative also serves as a critique of the process. One example can be found in ‘Smithy Cracks’, wherein Hogg playfully satirises the act of ‘forgery’ which typically accompanied the act of collecting, editing and communicating orally-related ‘strange’ tales: ‘Well, out with this strange story of yours. I do not promise to credit it, but shall give it a patient hearing, *provided you swear that there is no forgery in it*’ (‘Smithy Cracks’ 171). In several different works of fairy writing, Hogg criticises and subverts the intellectuals and antiquarians, as well as their intellectual way of treating the supernatural subject.

For my part, I do not understand it [dreaming], nor have I any desire to do so; and I firmly believe that no philosopher that ever wrote knows a particle more about it than I do, however elaborate and subtle the theories he may advance concerning it. [...] No, no; the philosopher know nothing about either; [...] It is on this ground that I like to contemplate, not the theory of dreams, but the dreams themselves. (Hogg, 'George Dobson' 118-119)

Further, as the following section argues, their use of Enlightened knowledge and the English language are often poignantly criticised, with the uselessness of knowledge emphatically foregrounded.

One might contend that the issues regarding presence and absence, visibility and invisibility, and materiality and immateriality is a typical feature of fairy narrative. Another important feature is the 'selectiveness' of fairies, in that not everyone can see them. Their ambiguous visibility and 'mode of existence', together with their selectiveness regarding the question of who can see them, often provides sources of inspiration for the authors of supernatural stories in the late nineteenth century in particular. For instance, works including 'The Library Window' (1881) in *The Stories of Seen and Unseen* (1885) by Margaret Oliphant (1828-1997) and *The Turn of Screw* (1898) by Henry James (1843-1916), revolve around the blurred border between presence and absence, and that between the visible and invisible.⁵¹ Back in the Romantic period, fairies and ghosts are also employed in order to dramatise the question regarding identity and existence, which are emphatically explored in Hogg's fairy writing. Further, in 'Smithy Cracks', questions and answers regarding the rumoured appearance of a ghost are repeated in a manner similar to the Beckettian theatre of

absurdity, foregrounding the themes of dis-communication, the inexplicability of the world, and the absence of absolute truth.

‘Have you heard anything of the apparition which has been seen about Wineholm Place?’ [...] ‘Na, I never heard o’ sic a thing as yet,’ [...] ‘but I wadna wonder muckle that the news should turn out to be true.’ [...] ‘This story about the apparition,’ quoth the smith. ‘What story?’ said the Dominie. [...] ‘What story?’ reiterated the Domine. [...] “‘Have *you* ever seen this ghost that there is such a noise about?’ ‘Ghost? Na, goodness to be thankit, I never saw a ghost in my life, save aince a wraith. What ghost do you mean?’ ‘So you never saw nor heard tell of any apparition about Wineholm-place, lately?’” (Hogg, ‘Smithy Cracks’ 163-165, the author’s emphasis)

The dramatization of dis-communication can be seen as a common feature which can also be found in Scott’s works: ‘Communication, the cultural embedding of language, and problems arising from failures of understanding are constant themes within Scott’s writing of borderlands. Again, this constitutes a response to debatable issues within Edinburgh intellectual circles’ (Oliver 45). Here again, the ‘constant’ motif of dis-communication foregrounds the absence of the absolute truth, also suggesting that knowledge is not always able enough to find it.

Fairies in Hogg’s work often disturb and disrupt the peaceful harmony of the ‘well regulated village, and [...] sober community’ (Hogg, ‘Smithy Cracks’ 170) which is a community backed up by the Enlightened knowledge and religion. ‘George Dobson’s Expedition to Hell’, for example, clearly implies the limit of medicine. Here the narrator emphatically negates philosophers’ ability to understand and explain what

dream and sleep are. The dark and ambiguous world of spirits, which cannot be enlightened and explained, is suggestive of the limit of Enlightenment. Further, the helplessness of medicine in dealing with the supernatural is also emphatically depicted: '[T]he Doctor held up his hands, as if palsied with astonishment, and uttered some fervent ejaculations. "I'll go with you straight," said he, "before I visit another patient. This is wonderfu'! It is terrible! [...] Oh this is wonderful; this is wonderful!" (Hogg, 'George Dobson's Expedition to Hell' 125). In addition, the limit of religion is also implied:

The wife ran for a clergyman of famed abilities to pray and converse with her husband, in hopes by that means to bring him to his senses, but after his arrival, George never spoke more, save calling to his horses, as if encouraging them to run with great speed, and thus in imagination driving at full career into hell, he went off in a paroxysm after a terrible struggle, precisely within a few minutes of twelve o'clock. (Hogg, 'George Dobson's Expedition' 119-129)

In this way, inexplicable fairies and apparitions, blurring the border between visibility and invisibility, and existence and non-existence, disrupt and challenge Enlightenment. They even serve to disclose its deceptiveness and emptiness:

'What story?' reiterated the Dominie. 'For my part I related no story, nor have ever given assent to a belief in such story that any man has heard. Nevertheless, from the results of rationalisation, conclusions may be formed, though not algebraically, yet corporately, by constituting a quality, which shall be equivalent to the difference, subtracting the less from the greater, and striking a balance in order to

get rid of any ambiguity or paradox.’ (Hogg, ‘Smithy Cracks’ 164)

Compared with works by Scott and Black, fairies and fairylands thus play far more crucial roles in the writing of Hogg. Hogg wrote far more experimental, meta-fictional and multi-layered fairy narratives, and fairies act as a crucial instrument in his radical construction of innovative national narrative. While the centrality of fairies in his fairy writing is noticeable, it is significant that fairies were also crucial to the construction of Hogg’s self-image. In his well-quoted phrase, revealing his ambivalent attitude towards Scott, Hogg identifies himself as ‘a king o’ the mountains an’ fairy school’: “Dear Sir Walter ye can never suppose that I belong to your school o’ chivalry? Ye are the king o’ that school but *I’m the king o’ the mountain an’ fairy school which is a far higher ane nor yours*” (Hogg, *Anecdotes of Scott* 61, emphasis added). Here Hogg succinctly manifests that fairies and mountains are vitally important constituents in his construction of self-identity. In his writing, fairies often represent self rather than other, while a fairyland also embodies his own nation.

Hogg thus strategically chose fairies as the vehicle with which he sought to define and create Scottishness. Such an attempt by Hogg, to conceive and express the idea of Scottishness with its cultural character, profoundly echoes those attempts, by the intellectuals contributing to the development of Scottish Enlightenment, who also sought to celebrate and mythify the Scottish nation as the ‘Athens of the North’. Thus, though Hogg was critical of the treatment of fairies by the antiquarians largely based in Edinburgh, ironically they shared a similar kind of cultural nationalistic motivation. If one could contend that ‘fairy’ and ‘Enlightenment’ constitute two iconic symbols of Scottish culture, the implication of the two significant motifs in Hogg’s fairy writing—that is, the disappearance of fairies and the absence of knowledge—is indeed

profound. Fairies and Explanations, by their disappearance, form an invisible orchestra, whose tunes metaphorise the loss of national culture.

3.4 Aerial Fairies, Slipping Identities and Etherealised Scotland:

Preoccupations with Land and Nation

Fairy narratives by Hogg are exceptionally saturated with strong preoccupations with land. In the textual place created in his narrative, whose density is disproportionately uneven, land is represented as either excessively solid or immaterial. Furthermore, compared with those by Scott, Black and Lang, Hogg's fairy writing is the most crowded with numerous and various fairy characters, though often the absence of fairies is emphatically depicted. Through his experimental and metafictional writing, Hogg more empathically disclosed the artificiality and repressive force in the processes of construction of a national literature.

It is my contention that the density of the textual space created within Hogg's fairy writing is typically uneven. The textual space is characteristically and problematically etherealised and immaterialised, often except for land; the solidity of land is often emphasised, evoking the sense of disproportion and unevenness within the texture of the narrative.

Another significant feature of Hogg's fairy narratives is that they are intentionally 'Scotticised', nationalised and localised. They are often forcedly linked to Scotland and various places in it, through their setting and allusions to place-names:

‘Who scalp’d the brows of old Cairngorm,

And scoop’d these ever yawning caves?’

‘Twas I, the Spirit of the Storm!’

He waved his sceptre north away,' (Hogg, 'Storms' 20)
 'He ['a wight. "the beautiful stranger"] turned his face
 Unto the eastern streamers sheen,
 He seemed to eye the ruby star
 That rose above the Eildon green (Hogg, 'The Pilgrims of the Sun' 5)
 Then the Fairies boun' to ride,
 And the Elves of Ettrick's greenwood shaw;
 And aye their favourite rendezvous
 Was green Bowhill and Carelha (Hogg, 'The Pilgrim of the Sun' 4)

As these abundant examples indicate, the textual geography of Hogg's fairy narratives tends to be located in Scotland. Even though an ethereal fairyland is evoked, it is pinned down to Scotland through the mentioning of place names which exist in Scotland in reality. While human characters often suffer from sense of directionlessness, becoming incapable to recognise familiar places, landmass, rivers, and other geographical features are depicted as solid. They are the only constituent of the narrative which is confirmed in its materiality, reality and existence.

'The Pilgrims of the Sun' is a vitally important work which presents significant characteristics of Hoggian fairy writing. The significance of the 'uncanny' in Hogg's works in general has been widely recognised. Ian Duncan, in particular, rightly emphasises the significance of the uncanny in his 'national narrative' ('The Upright Corpse' 29). However, Duncan's argument that 'At the origin and end of Hogg's versions of a national narrative, we find the uncanny figure of a corpse, dead-yet-alive or marvellously preserved, *irreducibly material*' ('The Upright Corpse' 29, my emphasis) is refutable. As this chapter demonstrates, the texture of Hogg's national

mythography, which characteristically employs fairies and fairylands as its key constituents, is far from 'irreducibly material'. On the contrary, careful reading of works such as 'The Pilgrims of Sun' suggests that, in his mythographic national writing, which typically employs fairies, the land and people of Scotland are characteristically, and recurrently, depicted as immaterial, ethereal and subtilized. For instance, in *Pilgrim*, 'revels of fairies were held on the lea; /And heard their small bugles, with *eirysome* croon,/ As *lightly* they rode on the beam of the moon' (*Pilgrim* 38).

Compared with the works by Scott and Black, the texture of Scott's national fairy writing is distinguished by its lack of materiality. Often described by scholars as 'transcendental' and 'heavenly' (Douglas Mack on *Kilmeny*) with 'airy ethereality' (Dunnigan on *Queen's Wake*),⁵² the textual space in his national fairy writing is peculiarly etherealised; the land depicted in it appears to be dissolving, representing the fear that the Scottish nation is itself subtilized and dissolving. In the peculiarly immaterialised portrayal of Scotland in Hogg's fairy writing, nothing is solid except for the dead body, and the gems decorating it:

Mary's winding-sheet was lined
 With many fringe of the gold refined!
 That in her bier behoved to be
 A golden cross and rosary;
 Of pearl beads full many a string,
 And on every finger a diamond ring, (*Pilgrims* 40)

Ironically, the sense of density and materiality are most intensified in the scene of death and burial. The aching hearts of human characters are also solidly depicted as having 'turned to stone':

O! but their[Mary's mother and other maidens] hearts were turned to
stone,

When they saw her stretched on the sward alone;

Prostrate, without a word or motion,

[.]

They laid their hands on her cheek composed;

But her cheek was cold and her eye was closed;

[.]

That[wail of sorrow] startled the hinds on the braes of Yarrow.

(*Pilgrims* 38-39)

Another argument by Duncan is also refutable. He argues that 'the culture industry of romance revival turns out to be the exhumation and profanation of a corpse rather than the resurrection of a national *Geist*' ('The Upright Corpse' 29). Duncan is right in that he places the 'cultural industry of romance revival' in the context of Romantic cultural nationalism. His indirectly expressed argument, that the immortalization of national character was the chief purpose of romance revival, is also convincing. Nevertheless, in his argument quoted here, Duncan seems to fail to recognise that collection and appropriation of oral traditions served as a strategic *method* to perpetuate national identity in the Romantic period. If 'exhumation and profanation' in Duncan's claim are equivalent to 'collection and appropriation', Duncan seems to be arguing that collection and appropriation are the unexpected and undesired *outcome* of the 'romance revival', rather than a strategically chosen method.

Like so many fairy narratives created in the nineteenth century Scotland,

Hogg's fairy writing also foregrounds anxieties and concerns pertaining to the question of national identity. Significantly, one distinguishing feature of his fairy narrative lies in his strong preoccupations with the land, which underlie his construction of peculiar textual space, whose density tends to be uneven. While the overall texture of the narrative tends to be immaterial and etherealised, land evoked in it tends to be either excessively solid, or exceedingly insubstantial, often lacking in the sense of stability. Although Hogg's fairy narrative is most crowded with a variety of numerous kinds of elves and fairies, with animated landscape haunted by spirits, it is always saturated with a sense of emptiness, absence and immateriality. Its linguistic texture is crowded with the abundant use of those expressions such as 'subtilize', 'dissolve', 'fading' and 'melting'. Fairies emphatically foreground the sense of insecurity and vulnerability regarding, to borrow Fielding's words, 'apprehension of the local' and 'spatial locatedness': 'In Hogg's stories, the supernatural is often what undercuts apprehension of the local' (*Geography* 163); 'Local traditions, in Hogg, can challenge the spatial locatedness altogether' (Fielding, *Geography* 163).

Significantly, the immaterialised, etherealised and dissolving land, which is often unidentifiable even to its inhabitants, could be interpreted as an embodiment of his anxiety and fear regarding the state-less situation of Scotland, to which Hogg seems to have responded most acutely. In her study examining the 'spatial identity' in Hogg's 'arctic writing', Fielding aptly argues that 'locality' is problematically depicted in Hogg's works: 'This apparently local story troubles the idea of locality itself, and Hogg moves gleefully between a set of apparently recognisable local Scottish Border places and the local hero's own difficulty in recognising them' (*Geography* 164). The 'troubled' idea of locality and 'unrecognisable' familiar places, together with the

aerialised Scotland conjured in Hogg's fairy narrative, are dramatizations of anxieties resulting from the Act of Union. As a shepherd making a living in the Borders, the region which was historically the site of conflicts and cattle stealing between the two nations, Hogg seems to have possessed a far more solid and realistic sense of fear, regarding the potential danger of losing land resulting from the abolition of the Scottish Parliament. Such fear and preoccupations regarding land are projected onto the depictions of subtilized landmass, vanishing fairies, and the human characters' loss of ability to recognise familiar places. For example, in 'The Pilgrims of the Sun', Mary, a human girl from Scotland, an oblique allusion to Mary Queen of Scots, travels to the heavenly sphere guided by a mysterious spirit. High above the earth, in the middle of nowhere, she finds her homeland suddenly unidentifiable:

'In such a wilderness of moving spheres,
Thou shouldst mistake the world that gave thee birth.
Prepare to wonder, and prepare to grieve:
For I perceive that thou has deemed the earth
The fairest, and *the most material part*
Of God's creation. (*Pilgrim* 15, my emphasis)

Here, the earth, which has until then been perceived as the 'most material part of God's creation', suddenly loses its materiality. Furthermore, the world, as well as the individual self are also exceedingly 'subtilized' and begin to 'dissolve': 'Pass we on/
Around this glorious heaven, till by degrees/ *Thy frame and vision are so subtilized*' (*Pilgrims* 16).

Fielding aptly argues that 'dissolution of structures of locating' characterises 'Hogg's norths', and that 'the unknowability of place through relational identity'

collapses ideas ‘as much about a global spatiality as about local Border spots’ (Fielding, *Geography* 165). It is my contention that the ‘collapsed’ ideas about spatiality, as well as the crises of ‘spatial identity’ constituting a significant feature of Hogg’s fairy writing, are the embodiment of the anxieties regarding the above-mentioned loss of the Scottish state. Hogg’s fairy writing thus reveals the problematic relationships between land and people in the post-Union Scotland, which also echoes the fear of the loss and dissolution of national identity.

Arguably, the Pilgrim offers a kind of consolation, or a means of negotiation, to those who suffer from losing spatial identity:

Mark yon cloudy spot,
Which yet thine eye hath never rested on;
And though not long the viewless golden cord
That chains it to this heaven, ycleped the sun,
It seems a thing subordinate—a sphere
Unseemly and forbidding—‘Tis the earth.’
Down sunk the virgin’s eye—her heart seemed wrapped
Deep deep in meditation—while her face
Denoted mingled sadness. (*Pilgrims* 15-16)

Through the emphasis of the connectedness of heaven and the earth, linked together by the godly invisible ‘gold chain’, the spirit consoles Mary. The spirit thus cures her of the ‘sadness’ arising from the loss of her spatial identity, the fundamental ability to identify her familiar homeland. Arguably, the sadness of Mary could perhaps metaphorise the confusion and unrest experienced by the Scottish people after the loss

of their own active Parliament: as the historical event legally converted their nation into an unknown one, it potentially threatened the preservation of all the laws and rules made by the former Parliament, as well as all the proprietorship guaranteed by it. As the story develops, the Scotland evoked in *Pilgrim* is increasingly immaterialised, and the distance between the characters and the nation becomes greater: ‘Far far away, through regions of delight/ They journeyed on—not like the earthly pilgrim,/ Fainting with hunger, thirst, and burning feet,/ But leaning forward on the liquid air’ (*Pilgrim* 16). The greater distance between Scotland and its people, the immaterialised land, and the loss of the ability to recognise familiar locality together metaphorise various kinds of ‘losses’, which were presumably perceived by people in the post-union Scotland.

3.5 The Ship and the Ruby: Representation of the British Empire

In ‘The Pilgrims of the Sun’, Hogg represents the British Empire in a most innovative fashion. At the same time, he also portrays how Scotland is being incorporated in it:

Before the tide, before the wind,
 The ship speeds swiftly o’re the faem;
And the sailor sees the shores fly back,
And weens his station still the same:
 She[Mary] did not linger, she did not look,
 For in a moment they were gone;
But she thought she saw her very form
Stretched on the greenwood’s lap alone.
 [.....]

Beyond that speed ten thousand times,
 By the marled streak and the cloudlet brown,
 Past our aerial travellers on
 In the wan light of the waning moon. ('Pilgrims of the Sun' 6)

The fast-moving ship, an all too famous icon of the British Empire, metaphorises the blistering speed with which the historical process is evolving. Scotland is also changing as a constituent of the Empire ('a sailor'), perhaps irreversibly, despite naïve hopes to retain its old self ('And the sailor sees the shores fly back,/And weens his station still the same'; 'But she thought she saw her very form/ Stretched on the greenwood's lap alone'). The irreversibility of history, together with the impossibility of retrieving the old Scotland despite the innocent hope of its inhabitants, is further implied:

They turned their eyes to the heaven above,
 Above the stars blazed bright as they drew nigh;
 And they looked to the darksome world below;
 But all was grey obscurity.
 They could not trace the hill nor dale,
 Nor could they ken where the greenwood lay
 But they saw a thousand shadowy stars,
 In many a winding watery way; (Hogg, 'Pilgrim of the Sun' 6)

The blazing and dazzling sky, reigned over by 'the Queen of Night/ in all her solemn majesty' (7) clearly metaphorises the prosperous future of the British Empire. The seemingly brilliant picture is effectively contrasted with the 'grey obscurity' of 'the darksome world', whose geographic features are no longer identifiable by its inhabitant

Mary: the human protagonist of the poem alluding to Mary Queen of Scots. The 'obscurity' represents the loss of identity, which was the price Scotland had to pay, for the dazzling prosperity promised by the union. While the 'blazing stars' could be perceived as the dazzling and prosperous visions of future, the 'thousand shadowy stars' in 'many' of the Scottish rivers can be read as a metaphor of the darker reality brought to the thousands of people in Scotland by the Union. Furthermore, the figure of an innocent Scotland being colonised is also inscribed in Mary's overjoyed response upon her encounter with the Queen of Night: 'O! Mary's heart was blithe' (Hogg, 'Pilgrim of the Sun' 7). Needless to say, the Queen of Night represents Queen Elizabeth I; the aspect of the monarch as an emblem of coloniser is implied by the characterisation of her as a Queen of 'Night' and 'shadowy stars'. Thus, the process of the union and internal colonisation, which were irreversibly inseparable from the loss of and detachment from the old nation, is epitomised, with an emphasis of the apparently innocent joy of Scotland: 'The lovely youth beheld with joy/That Mary loved such scenes to view; And away, and away they journeyed on, /Faster than wild bird ever flew' (Hogg, 'Pilgrim of the Sun' 7). In addition, as the Queen of the Night and the (shadowy) stars represent Queen Elizabeth whose known feature was her red hair, the 'ruby star' mentioned in the following extract also metaphorises her: 'the ruby star that rose above the Eildon green' (Hogg, 'Pilgrim of the Sun' 5). As the 'Eildon green' is the critical symbol of national identity evoking the Fairy Queen in 'Thomas the Rhymer', the presence of the ruby star above it can be interpreted as the English desire of colonisation which spots Scotland as one of its targets.

Although the textual world is increasingly etherealised and becoming transcendental, somehow it is pinned down to Scotland:

'[T]ell me which of all these worlds I see
 Is that we lately left? For I would fain
 Note how far more extensive 'tis and fair
 Than all the rest—little, Alas! I know
 Of it, save that it is a right fair globe,
 Diversified and huge, and that afar,
 In one sweet corner of it lies a spot
 I dearly love—where Tweed from distant moors
 Far travelled flows in murmuring majesty;
 And Yarrow rushing from her bosky banks,
 Hurries with headlong haste to the embrace
 Of her more stately sister of the hills.
 Ah! yonder 'tis!—Now I perceive it well,'
 Said she with ardent voice, bending her eye
 And stretching forth her arm to a broad globe
 That basked in the light—'Yonder it is!
 I know the Caledonian mountains well,
 And mark the moony brae and curved heights
 Above the lone Saint Mary. (Hogg, 'Pilgrim of the Sun' 14-15)

The long extract is clearly underpinned by a desire and longing to preserve a kind of tie to the old Scotland, in the rapidly changing Empire, in which Scottish people are also playing active roles. Such sentimentalist depictions could, perhaps, explain the reason why 'Thomas the Rhymer' has remained so popular and unforgotten.

The main plot of 'Thomas the Rhymer' is the abduction from his homeland to

an unknown territory by a strange but enchanting Fairy Queen, into a realm which is so strange and unreal. The ballad, thus, emphatically foregrounds nostalgic feelings towards the nation to which the protagonist wishes to return, but cannot do so, because of the spell of the Fairy Queen. Perhaps this could have been exactly what some Scottish people felt, when their nation suddenly became a different one. Further, Thomas' return to his home after seven years have passed, might also had an effect of evoking a hope that the good and old Scotland could one day be recovered.

To conclude, fairy writing by Hogg, which is far more experimental and innovative, captured the atmosphere of Scotland in the aftermath of its union with England, foregrounding, in particular, the sense of loss. His fairy-national narratives are saturated with the motifs of disappearance, immaterialised nation, journey or abduction from familiar and solid earth, into a transcendental, vast, immaterial, and directionless 'otherworld' or 'nowhere'. In addition, a hidden hope of the eventual return to the homeland is also subtly inscribed. In 'The Pilgrim of the Sun', there is a scene in which a monk attempts robbery. He assumes that the corpse is dead, and tries to steal the gems and jewels which decorate it:

He[a monk committing theft] stooped in the grave and he opened the
bier;

And he took the jewels, of value high,

And he took the cross, and the rosary,

And the golden heart on the lid that shone,

And he laid them carefully on a stone.

[.....]

He drew a knife from his baldrick gray,

To cut the rings and fingers away.
 He gave one cut—he gave but one—
 It scarcely reached into the bone:
 Just then the soul, so long exiled,
 Returned again from its wandering wild
 [.]
 Loud shrieked the corpse [of Mary] at the wound he gave,
 And, rising, stood up in the grave. (Hogg, 'Pilgrim of the Sun' 41)

However, the corpse is not actually dead. With her 'loud shriek', the corpse of
 Mary—obliquely, Queen of Scots—is revived.

3.6 Part I Conclusion

Through the interpretation of the works by Walter Scott, James Hogg and John Black, Part I has argued the following four theses: first, fairy writing in Scotland in the Romantic period operated as a site whereby authors could undertake original as well as innovative literary experiments. Second, the said sub-genre is profoundly diverse and complicated. It often characteristically involves repetitive and contradictory processes and motifs of dis-enchantment and re-enchantment, which revolve around the dichotomies of denial and/or affirmation of the presence and/or absence of fairies. Third, though it ostensibly embodies a distant and forgotten past, Scottish romantic fairy writing is a remarkably modernised sub-genre. It is framed by, responds to, or even serves to frame contemporary conceptions and discourses including those of the vernacular, antiquity, tradition and language which were characteristically held, in the literatures and cultures of the Romantic period, as aesthetic values as well as indexes of

cultural autonomy. Fairies in Scottish Romantic writing can therefore be perceived as a mirror of modernity, rather than that of antiquity, and are junctions of various contemporary and competing ideologies and discourses.

Finally, and most significantly, fairy narratives by these authors can be interpreted as an invisible, alternative and repressed layer of Romantic nation-writing. They constitute a crucial, though neglected, thread of Romantic cultural nationalist discourses which have been revealed, by recent studies including those by Pittock, to have been far more complicated and polyphonic ‘in an intensified Bakhtinian sense’, with a ‘tension between what at times seem almost deliberately “anglopetal” and “anglofugal” representations’ (*Irish and Romantic Nationalism* 7). Numerous examples quoted in the earlier chapters suggest that fairy narratives by the three authors were often quintessentially nationalised: in spite of their apparent other-worldliness, remoteness and ethereality, fairies and fairylands depicted by them are inseparably pinned down to Scotland in reality. They pivot around the concerns, confusions, dilemmas and desires regarding the status, place and identity of the Scottish nation: the state-less nation which, after the passage of approximately 100 years following the Act of Union, was experiencing, instead of hypothesising, the reality of the Union in a diverse range of dimensions and scales in everyday life. Thrown into the gigantic as well as intricate processes of *British* nation building, which involved invention, resistance and reflux as Pittock persuasively argued in his *Inventing and Resisting Britain* (1), the Scottish nation witnessed changes in the way its own self-definition was imagined and represented. It is my contention that under such circumstances, fairy narratives had a peculiar capacity to serve as a dimension whereby authors could voice their ambivalent and emotional responses, confusions and resentment toward the

on-going processes of British nation building. Though, in the particular cases of Scott, they often ambivalently carry conflicting Unionist sentiments and cultural nationalist dilemmas, they tend to reveal cultural nationalist ideological underpinnings.

Given above argument, Part I has contended that fairy writing by the authors explored can be interpreted as a form of national myth-making, commonly but with a varying degree underpinned by a particular desire to symbolise, celebrate and perpetuate conceptions of Scottishness and Scottish cultural autonomy. Their act of myth-making, however, is not straightforward, but is intricately accompanied by confusion, irony and self-reflexiveness; their mythic fairy narratives are overtly disrupted, deconstructed and demythified. Through the paratextual 'Introductory essays' which disrupt, explain and disenchant the main body of the text, and through the ironic inscriptions and depictions of the figures of a poet in the main body of the text, which are in fact self-portrayal of the authors, their works of fairy writing foreground the constructedness of the myths they create, and disclose the artificiality of the very act of myth-making.

How, then, did the above-mentioned aspects of Romantic fairy writing in Scotland change, or remain unchanged, as the latter half of the long nineteenth century unfolded? Under the disparate cultural, social and political climates in the Victorian period, with significant transitions in the constructions of Britishness and Scottishness, what kinds of fairy narratives were created? How did they predict, respond to or resist the changed environment, and how did they represent Scotland? Considerations of these questions, through a comparison of the Romantic fairy narratives and the Victorian ones, do not merely deepen the understanding of Scottish Romantic fairy writing. They also help to reveal hidden layers of the genre of British national tale,

and those of the processes of British nation building in the nineteenth century. As examples of fairy narratives discussed in the previous chapters suggest, the genre of national tale in nineteenth century Britain does not only comprise realistic genres including historical writing and realist novel, but in fact involves magical and invisible ones as represented by fairy writing. Bearing these in mind, Part II will seek to undertake a comparative case-study through the examination of the works by a Scottish and Victorian literary figure who stands in the curious position in the spectrum of Scottish fairy writing: Andrew Lang.

Part II: The Victorian Period

The purpose of Part II is to deepen the understanding of the multi-faceted spectrum of Scottish fairy writing created during the long nineteenth century through shifting its scope from the Romantic period to the Victorian age, as well as from the homeland to a diaspora, by devoting particular attentions to the oeuvre of Andrew Lang (1844-1912) as a contrastive case study. It contends that in the Victorian period, fairy writing retained its capacity to serve as a neglected yet crucially significant layer of Scottish nation writing. With a number of distinctively original works woven by those authors who placed themselves outside of Scotland and had greater involvement with the British Empire, the sub-genre of Scottish fairy writing in the Victorian period experienced significant transitions in its primary concerns as well as in the representations of Scotland and Scottish national identity.

Within a different historical, cultural and geopolitical milieu, authors in the Victorian period gave birth to a rich and diverse range of fairy narratives which, charged with disparate kinds of curiosities and preoccupations, form a striking contrast with Romantic fairy writing. Although their Scottish origin has tended to be overlooked, the achievements of Scottish authors clearly occupy crucially significant places in the history of Victorian British fairy writing. As argued in the following sections, a surprisingly large number of influential authors who emblematised Victorian British fairy writing were from Scotland. Given their influential presence in the genre, together with their often subtle as well as problematic inscriptions of Scottishness in their narratives, it would be even possible to claim that an invisible thread of Scottish nation writing is interwoven within the undercurrent of Victorian British fairy writing, serving as one of its hidden yet key constituents.

Through the prism of Langian works, Part II will explore the inscriptions of Scottishness and personalised national identities in Victorian Scottish fairy narratives while illuminating the contrast, as well as profound echoes, between Romantic fairy writing and the Victorian one. In so doing, it will also demonstrate that conspicuous changes took place in the sub-genre of Scottish fairy writing: the changes in the immediate concerns, themes, motifs and settings employed within the narratives, which are accompanied by the recategorisation of the sub-genre of fairytales specifically as a genre for children, and the shifts in the representations of Scotland and Scottishness including perceptions, confusions, dilemmas and expressions regarding national identity.

Representations of fairies in Victorian British literature and culture have become a topic receiving much attention by recent and often interdisciplinary scholarship, which include prominent studies by Nicola Bown, Diane Purkiss and Carole Silver.⁵³ With abundant examples and analyses, these studies have persuasively demonstrated that fairies permeated Victorian British literature and culture at an unprecedented scale. The rise and maturity of children's as well as fantasy literatures overlapped the pervasive popularity of fairies in the Victorian culture. Often excessively visualised as well as commodified, a plethora of fairy narratives was widely circulated and served to accommodate various kinds of responses to modernity, foregrounding, as Bown argues, the 'fear and anxiety' towards contemporary issues including industrialisation, material culture and urbanisation (*Fairies in Nineteenth Century Art and Culture* 1, 17).

Yet, the fact that a prodigiously large number of the most original, as well as

canonised, works of fairy writing in the Victorian Britain was created by Scottish authors has tended to be overlooked. The list of the names of those artists, who have profoundly influenced various kinds of fairy writing created by subsequent generations up to the present day, is indeed phenomenal: it includes Lang, George Macdonald (1824-1905), Robert Louis Stevenson (1850-1894), James Mathew Barrie (1860-1937), Joseph Noël Paton (1859-1928), Richard Doyle (1824-1883) and Arthur Conan Doyle (1859-1930). While their Scottish roots have often been overlooked, it has been even more ignored that those Scottish authors emblematising 'British' fairytales often inscribed in their multi-layered narratives their confusions and dilemmas regarding their homeland and their *personal* national identity. Entangled with the perceptions of their own complicated national identity, together with a contradictive sense of rootedness intertwining with rootlessness, they envisioned Scotland as increasingly distant, unreal, nostalgic, artificial and even reductively stereotypical. Britain, in particular the contemporary city scape of London, with the dazzling prosperity as well as the darker shadows of the British Empire, instead emerged as their seemingly primary subject-matter depicted in their fairy narratives with a stronger sense of reality. Nostalgisation of Scotland and its loss of reality within the narrative, together with the apparent shift of the textual topography from Scotland toward Britain, are significant changes which occurred in the genre of Scottish fairy writing during the Romantic-Victorian transition. If, as Bown emphatically argues, one significant role of fairy writing is its capacity to mirror the authors' responses toward the present (*Fairies in Nineteenth Century Art and Literature* 163), it could be argued that the above mentioned changes detected in Scottish fairy writing metaphorise a significant transition in, and the complexity of, national consciousness of Victorian intellectual elites who

played greater roles in the British Empire. Modernity, industrialisation and urbanisation in the extra-textual world, together with their apparent self-fashioning as British and cosmopolitan, came to be more consciously foregrounded in their narratives; Seemingly, Scotland left the centre-stage of their writing, though it continued to underlie and haunt in the undercurrent.

Bearing these in mind, I place a particular emphasis in that Lang played a peculiar role as a diasporic intellectual who was partially assimilated to the British elite culture, occupied a considerably influential place in the academia as well as literary world in late Victorian Britain, and was involved in the processes of re-imagining and re-construction of Scottishness which were arguably undertaken outside of Scotland during the period. There is profound complexity in Lang's attitudes toward Scotland; Distanced and alienated from Scotland as well as from the immediate political concerns of Scott and his successors, Lang nostalgically idealised Scotland and its traditional culture. Whilst he even self-fashioned himself as British in some instances, Scotland continued to haunt his literary engagements. Lang considerably contributed to the preservation and circulation of Scottish literary works through the re-publication and edition of works by Robert Kirk and Walter Scott. In this aspect, it would be even possible to claim that Lang played a certain role in the re-creation of Scottishness in Victorian Britain, and that his narratives revolving around fairies, often imbued with cultural nationalistic impulses undercut by negotiating dilemmas, can be interpreted as a neglected dimension of Scottish nation writing.

It is my contention that in Victorian Scottish fairy narratives, issues regarding national identity are often perceived to be more personal, rather than collective. For

instance, Langian fairy narratives are often characteristically underpinned by an ambivalent self-consciousness regarding his own nationality. This stands in a stark contrast with the Romantic authors explored in Part I, who were primarily preoccupied, driven by a sense of urgency, with the need to recreate and perpetuate a collective identity of the Scottish nation as a whole. Scottish Victorian fairy narratives thus capture the significant changes in the representations of Scottishness which arguably occurred in the aftermath of Romantic-Victorian transition. In this aspect, Lang and his narratives stand in a curious intersection between discourses and cultures.

As the Romantic period turned to the Victorian age, the representations of Britishness and Scottishness arguably experienced certain transitions. As Linda Colley closes her study *Britons: Forging the Nation 1707-1837* with the year 1837, the process of modern British nation building presumably saw completion by mid nineteenth century. Towards the close of the Victorian period, conceptions of British national identity were recurrently cemented, recreated and reinforced, driven in part by the expansion of the British Empire which increasingly involved and ostensibly subsumed Scottish, as well as Irish and Welsh intellectual elites who chose to place themselves at the centre of the Empire. While the process was also accompanied by the growing shadow of decline, cracks and contradictions within it, the presence of the Other, including the potential threat from Nazi Germany, also promoted the need to reinforce the conceptions of British national identity, prompting the act of self-fashioning as British amongst the people in the British Isles. Scotland, in contrast, was increasingly romanticised, and was enclosed as well as repressed within the illusory realm: the widespread and influential popularity of the *Waverly Novels*, which had by then acquired canonicity, was undeniably one of the chief factors which drove the processes

of romanticisation.

A drastic shift occurred to the topography in which authors of Scottish fairy writing positioned themselves. An unneglectable number of them chose to place themselves in the Briticised paradigm beyond Scotland. Lang, Barrie and Arthur Conan Doyle were drawn to the magnetism of London, and occupied influential positions in the academia and literary world in it. This resulted in the perceptions and expressions of their own national identity often in a complicated fashion. Addressing British readers, Lang often referred to himself as 'English' in his writing, though he also frequently emphasised his Scottish origin. Arthur Conan Doyle, who served as an advocate of the British policy during the Boer War and the First World War, and whose son Kingsley died from influenza aggravated by war wounds in the British army (Edwards n.pag),⁵⁴ clearly had a stronger self-consciousness as 'British'.

While serving as an arena for these Scottish authors, the imperial capital also played a crucial role as their sources of imagination, immediate subject matters, metaphors and backgrounds which frame their narratives. At the same time, as revealed by the correspondences between Lang and Stevenson, these London-based Scottish authors knew each other, and arguably formed a kind of literary diaspora, with their roots as well as *absence* from Scotland serving as the bond which connected them to each other. Yet, though Stevenson also wrote in, and of, London at the earliest stage of his writing career, he eventually chose to exile himself in Samoa beyond the periphery of the British Empire. In the former generation, George MacDonald also experienced life in London, and was extensively involved with its literary world; his friends included John Ruskin (1819-1900), William Morris (1834-1896), Edward Burne-Jones (1833-1898), Thomas Carlyle (1795-1881), Matthew Arnold (1822-1888),

and Charles Dodgson [Lewis Carroll] (1832-1898) (Sadler, n.pag).

With their increased distance from Scotland, greater involvement with the British Empire, and arguably growing self-consciousness as British, these Scottish authors often represented Scotland as a more distant, unreal, vague and immaterial realm while vividly depicting London with a stronger sense of reality, solidity, density and materiality. Lang's works can specifically be seen as a convergence of the range of literary, cultural as well as academic currents generated in the late Victorian London: recategorisation and infantilisation of fairytales interacting with the development of children's literature, visualisation and commodification of fairy narratives culminating in the flood of 'Fairy Books' as a popular 'Christmas gift', and the rise of the new academic disciplines of folklore and anthropology underpinned in part by nationalist as well as imperialist ideologies. Lang's works also echo the widespread popularity of occultism and Freudian psychology, both of which fascinated adult intellectuals, and directed their gazes from the industrialised, urbanised, materialised and visualised exteriors of the city of London toward the invisible, immaterial, unexplored, inexplicable and innermost realm of humanity.

Before starting explorations of Langian fairy narratives in detail, it is vital to overview several characteristics of Victorian fairy writing, with a mentioning of monumental works and instances. Gradually enclosed within the nursery though also addressing adult readers, the genre of fairy writing in the Victorian period was increasingly infantilised into often didactic tales for children. A flood of banal fairytales, which merely imitated and reproduced common plots and motifs in previous works, was created and circulated. Parodies of stereotyped tales were also created;

The Magic Fishbone (1867) by Charles Dickens (1812-1870) can be interpreted as critique of modernity, mammonism, materialism and industrialisation, as well as a satire of conventional fairytales which were in vogue in the Victorian literary market. *The Puck of Pooks Hill* (1906) by Rudyard Kipling (1865-1939) also parodies and satirises the established conventions of fairytales which were shaped under the profound influence of the Grimms' tales as well as Shakespearean fairy drama.

Through a series of his outstandingly original works, MacDonald made an extensive contribution to the radical development and sophistication of the genre of children's as well as that of fantasy literature. While writing stories for children including *The Princess and the Goblin* (1872), MacDonald refined fantasy literature into a more 'serious' genre for the modernised adult readership in his contemporary world, from his earliest work of novelistic fantasy: *Phantastes: A Faerie Romance for Men and Women* (1858). With profound underpinnings of Christianity, MacDonald's narratives are also subtly imbued with traditional Scottish fairy belief, though MacDonald displays distinguished originality in his treatment of borrowed motifs. A strong sense of modernity often shapes MacDonald's fantastical narratives specifically in the following two aspect: realistic and often dystopian depictions of the world of humanity accompanied by a poignant critique of contemporary society, and the uneven and disrupted density of the textual space constructed within the narrative. In *At the Back of the North Wind* (1871), for instance, the world in reality, in which the child characters including the protagonist live and work, is vividly as well as solidly depicted with a strong sense of realism; contemporary social issues including poverty and child labour are foregrounded and critiqued. Scotland, together with a seductive fairy queen character and the plot of abduction of the male protagonist, is obliquely inscribed in *At*

the Back of the North Wind as an ethereal, transcendental, distant and heavenly space. What makes MacDonald's construction of textual space striking is its uneven as well as disrupted density: while the world in reality, often depicted as a dystopian place for children, is presented as solid and materialistic, the other world is exceedingly immaterialised and etherealised. The contrast between the two worlds in terms of spatial density arguably foregrounds rupture and disharmony in modern society, specifically emphasising the increased disruption and distance between the heaven and the human world.

Grotesqueness is a feature which was repetitively emphasised in Victorian fairy depictions: *Goblin Market* (1862) by Christina Rossetti (1830-1894) and Richard Doyle's fairy illustrations, which were first published as *In Fairyland* (1870) with a poem by William Allingham (1824-1889), and later republished as *Princess Nobody* (1884) with Lang's tale, are notable examples. The development of photography, which gave rise to new forms of representation and drastically undermined the established modes of perception, description and communication, led to the creation of the photographs of 'Cottingley Fairies' (1917), one of the most peculiar events in the history of fairy writing. Fake photographs of fairies taken by Elsie Wright and Frances Griffiths provoked a scandalous phenomenon in which adult intellectuals including Arthur Conan Doyle were seriously involved and completely deceived.

One remarkable feature of the fairy discourses in nineteenth-century Britain is that it was adults, rather than children, who displayed a stronger preoccupation with fairies.⁵⁵ The authorship and readership of fairies included intellectuals, journalists and publishers. Ruskin, for instance, often playfully wrote about fairies and fairyland, and repeatedly suggested that his friend Kate Greenaway (1846-1901), who tended to

draw illustrations of children and young women, should draw fairy illustrations. Jack Zipes, in his Preface to *The Oxford Companion to Fairy Tales*, argues that ‘Victorian England’ was ‘an unusual time for fairylore’ because ‘many people from all social classes seriously believed in the existence of fairies, elves, goblins [...]’, and that ‘their beliefs’ were ‘manifested in the prodigious amount of fairy stories, paintings, operas, plays, music, and ballets from the 1820s to the turn of the century’ (xxvii). Zipes’ comment that Victorians ‘seriously believed in the existence of fairies’ would require careful reconsideration. It would be more accurate to say that Victorian attitude toward fairies was in fact a complicated mixture of doubt and a hint of hope, which was underpinned by their belief in the existence of fairies *in the past*, as well as by a disenchanted awareness of the absence of fairies from the present reality. They were fascinated by fairies because they perceived fairies as beings which had already been extinct, or were on the verge of being lost, from their own world. Some of them even held that they were purely imaginary in the first place. Walter Hepworth, for instance, wrote his definition of the ‘fairy’ for the ninth edition of *Encyclopædia Britannica* (1878) in a disenchanted and euhemerist view echoing Scott and Black’s descriptions: ‘In early times, when so much of the energy of man was not, as now, applied to practice, it seems to have found a natural outlet in the imagination’ (854). In *The Art of England* (1884), a collection of lectures given in Oxford, Ruskin also implies that fairies are imaginary beings: ‘at the present day, for the education or the extinction of the Fancy, we are absolutely left to our choice’ (331). Significantly, Ruskin in this extract seems to be more concerned with the loss of imagination and people’s ability to imagine. For him, the extinction of fairies is significant because it metaphorises the loss of imagination from modern society. In a letter addressed to Greenaway dated 6th

January, 1879, Ruskin playfully asks her the same question which Peter Pan, a character created two decades later by Barrie, asks his audience: ‘Do you believe in Fairies?’ (qtd. in Greenaway 69). The question, profoundly multi-layered, crystallises that Victorians doubted, rather than believed in, the existence of fairies; though faintly, the question is also imbued with a hope that there may be surviving ones. It also calls into question whether the respondents are sufficiently innocent to believe in fairies; If uttered in a tone of irony, it satirizes and even ridicules the whole phenomenon of the so-called Victorian cult of fairies.

Numerous scholars, including Bown and Stella Beddoe, argue that the disappearance of fairies is a traditional view of fairies not limited to that of Victorians. They tend to mention Chaucer’s ‘The Wife of Bath’s Tale’ in which its eponymous heroine laments as follows: ‘In th’olde days of the King Arthour, [...] / All was this land fulfild of fayerye, / The elf-queen with hir joly companye / Daunced ful ofte in many a grene mede. / This was the olde opinion, as I rede’ (Chaucer, *The Canterbury Tales*: 857-62, emphasis added). This passage is crucially significant in considering the history of representations of fairies in British literature. It foregrounds the peculiarity of fairies as a subject-matter: fairies have always served to represent something which once existed in the idealised past and yet is lost from the disenchanted present world. While Beddoe states that fairies had already been regarded as ‘fled’ in as early as the fourteenth century (23), Bown gives a more penetrating insight:

The fairies have been leaving since time immemorial. They had gone by the end of the fourteenth century, for Chaucer’s Wife of Bath speaks of their departure; then Richard Corbet bade them farewell in

the sixteenth century; they were again said to have disappeared in the late eighteenth century. The departure of the fairies is a tradition in itself, a genre of lament for the passage of time and the loss of innocence. Fairies always belong to yesterday, because today's world is corrupt, sophisticated, urbane and disenchanted. [...] The fairies leave at times of change and trouble when the stable order of society is pulled into a new shape, [...] when the present pulls away from the past and people become conscious of the rapid pace of social change. (*Fairies in Nineteenth Century Art and Literature* 163)

To examine the representations of the fairies in the Victorian period, therefore, it is not sufficient to end the discussion with the mentioning of the 'disappearance' of the fairies. It is vital to consider the questions of how the Victorians perceived, represented, explained and responded to the disappearance of fairies, and what kinds of factors, sentiments and conceptions are ascribed to their extinction. As Bown argues, the disappearance of fairies in the Victorian period was largely ascribed to the Industrial Revolution (*Fairies in Nineteenth Century Art and Literature* 39-41).⁵⁶ It was accompanied by a strong sense of loss, a longing for 'an older, rural world which was being destroyed by industrial modernity' (Bown, *Fairies in Nineteenth Century Art and Literature* 41). Fairies were thus perceived to symbolize the old and innocent world. Drawing a picture of a past in which their ancestors believed in fairies, Victorians actually lamented the loss of innocence and imagination, which Ruskin expressed as 'the extinction of the Fancy' (331).

In the famous scene in *Peter Pan* (1904), the eponymous protagonist calls for the child audience's belief in fairies to save the dying Tinker Bell ('[Tinker Bell]

says—she says she thinks she could get well again if children believed in fairies! [...] Do you believe in fairies? Say quick that you believe! If you believe, clap your hands!’ [136]). The scene ironically reveals the author’s recognition that even children have lost the innocence and imagination to believe in fairies:

Barrie himself must have anticipated that Peter’s injunction ‘Say quick that you believe!’ would not work for every child, for it is followed by this stage direction. ‘(Many clap, some don’t, a few hiss. [...])’ The idea that children’s disbelief in fairies would bring their concerned guardians to their sides is comical, but it implies that there is something wrong with a child who does not respond to Peter’s appeal. (Bown, *Fairies in Nineteenth-Century Art and Literature* 173)

Bown’s observation foregrounds adults’ strong preoccupation that children should believe in fairies, as well as their realistic awareness that some children had ceased to do so. The utterance of the question of ‘Do you believe in fairies?’, together with the forced positive response to it, ironically crystallises a wide-spread disenchantment from fairies even amongst children. Such a view of children would have been unbearable for some Victorian adults, who clung to an idealised view of children as innocent and full of imagination. In ‘To the Five: A Dedication’, for example, Barrie wrote about the Davies children, whom he adopted and supported:

One by one as you swung monkey-wise from branch to branch in the wood of make-believe you reached the tree of knowledge. [...] A time came when I saw that No.1 [George Davies], the most gallant of you all, ceased to believe that he was ploughing woods incarnadine,

and with an apologetic eye for me derided the lingering faith of No.2 [Jack Davies]; when No.3 [Peter Davies] questioned gloomily whether he did not really spend his nights in bed. (75-76)

It seems that adults had a more sentimental attachment to fairies. For them, children's faith in fairies represents innocence which is doomed to be lost as they grow up. At the same time, some adults typically liked to imagine themselves as retaining childlike innocence; it could be even said that adults' fascination with fairies, which characterises Victorian culture, is haunted by their strong preoccupation with the lost innocence and childlikeness from their own selves.

A conception of infantilised adults, or the 'grown-up people with children's minds', is a typical characteristic of Victorian fairy writing. William Thackeray (1811-1863) playfully as well as somewhat ironically describes *The Rose and the Ring* (1854, hereafter *Rose*) as 'A Fireside Pantomime for Great and Small Children' (*Rose* 213) on its title page; MacDonald once indicated that 'I do not write for children, but for the childlike, whether of five, or fifty, or seventy-five' (qtd. in McGillis vii). Often, books about fairies and fairytales for children were not merely intended for child readers, but also for adults, as Dinah Craik (1826-1887) writes: 'This is meant to be the best collection attainable of that delight of all children, and of many grown people who retain the child-heart still—the old-fashioned, time-honoured classic Fairy-tale' (vii). Persistently, Victorian adults craved for what fairies and fairylands represent, driven by a strong longing for what they and their world have lost for the sake of progress.

As mentioned earlier, a mixture of faint hint of hope, belief or doubt that there might still be surviving fairies somewhere in the present world had also lingered. It occasionally resurfaced and exploded in provocative instances as exemplified by the

photographs of ‘The Cottingley Fairies’, which caused a cultural phenomenon which could even be termed as a mass hysteria. Together with the popularity of occultism, the phenomenon reveals that, despite the modernisation of society as well as the advances in sciences and technology, Victorian consciousness was not entirely disenchanted. Instead, it swayed between an awareness of disenchantment and a desire for re-enchantment.

It is of note that Arthur Conan Doyle is a figure who was somewhat strangely entangled with the web of fairy narratives. While Richard Doyle, his grandfather, drew a series of influential fairy illustrations, Arthur Conan Doyle was involved in the scandalous incident of Cottingley fairy photographs⁵⁷. At a considerably early stage of the history of photography, the incident disclosed the problematic artificiality, fictionality and unreliability of photography as a medium. The incident perplexed Victorians because the medium conveying the images of fairies was photography, a medium shaped by the up-to-date technology which is supposed to portray nothing but fact and reality.

While evoking and renewing the traditional question of whether fairies exist or not, the incident subversively challenged the well-established dichotomy of fact and fiction. The incident can be evaluated as even more radical in that such a highly educated intellectual elite as Doyle was entirely deceived by the photographs forged by Elsie Wright and Frances Griffiths, uneducated and underage girls belonging to working class families.

By the time of the incident in 1917, fairy writing had long ceased to be a site of radical literary experimentation, becoming banal and stereotypical imitations of previous works. The emblematic question uttered by Peter Pan, which asks whether

the child audience believed in fairies, reveals that fairies were on the verge of extinction even in children's imagination; fairies had become a banal and worn-out subject-matter while even children were losing the innocence to believe in them. The incident of Cottingley fairies made afresh people's interest in fairies, can be seen as a peculiar envoy of the rich and original history of fairy narratives in nineteenth century Britain. Its echo can be detected in Angela Carter's magical realist creation of Fevvers, a winged aerialist in *Nights of the Circus* (1984): a novel set in the fin-de-siecle of nineteenth century. In a fashion echoing the Cottingley photographs, Fevvers' wings disrupt the border between fact and fiction, provoking a sensational phenomenon. The figure of Fevvers can be interpreted as a magnified negative-image of stereotypical depictions of Victorian fairies as small, lovely, feminine and winged beings dancing in the moonlight.⁵⁸ Fevvers thus subverts and de-mythifies Victorian fairy discourses, challenging, at the same time, a Victorian view of ideal women which was projected to the figure of small, feminine and powerless fairies.

Like Barrie, Lang recurrently lamented the loss of people's belief in fairies. In contrast with Barrie who was specifically obsessed with the children's loss of faith in fairies, Lang's attention tends to be directed toward the loss of the belief from the modern society in a 'grown-up' era. In his Prefaces to the 'Fairy Books', Lang repeatedly draws a picture of the people in the past, the primitive era 'when science did not exist, and magic took the place of science' (*Preface to Grey* xiii). He depicts them as bright and innocent, with their belief in fairies as the proof of their innocence, and opposes them to the people in the disenchanted modern world who have ceased to believe in fairies.

Further, his fairy narratives reveal that Lang is intensely preoccupied with the typically Victorian conception of infantilised adults. The motif of adults who retains childlike innocence can frequently be found in his writing. As an influential scholar, Lang frequently read fairytales pedagogically, in a dis-enchanting fashion. Nevertheless, he claimed, in a rather illogical and emotional argument, that the practice of 'scientific and literary' reading of fairytale can be undertaken 'without losing the heart of childhood'.⁵⁹ While often consciously describing himself as an adult with 'the heart of childhood', he declared that his fairy books were not merely for children, but also for 'grown-up people who have not forgotten how they once were children' (*Preface to Green* x). Richard Le Gallienne, in his review of *The Green Fairy Book* (1892) in *The Illustrated London News* dated Nov. 26, 1892, praises Lang as 'a notable benefactor to those who would regain their lost fairyland' (678). Lang, thus, did not only 'reflect' the cultural phenomenon of 'adults with a child's heart', but he even initiated and amplified it, through his enormously popular Fairy Books which served as a door for adult readers to re-enter and re-cover the enchanted realm of their lost and innocent childhood.

By the end of the eighteenth century, stereotypical associations of Scotland with fairies and the supernatural, together with connotations of its backwardness, had already been established (Henderson and Cowan 27). For instance, John Stoddart, an Englishman who visited Scotland in 1799-1800, noted that his encounter with the traditional supernatural belief was an essential part of his Scottish experience, which was in fact 'a confirmation of the backwardness of the place' (Henderson and Cowan 27). Its landscape, in particular, was seen as imbued with fantastical imaginations,

making ‘the Scots a more “superstitious” race: “the scenery here is very favourable to the excursive flights of the imagination”’ (Henderson and Cowan 27). While Henderson and Cowan presume that such a view ‘would later be embraced by Scott’ (27), there is no doubt that Lang, who greatly respected Scott, also cherished it to a considerable degree.

Such a romanticised view of Scotland obviously contradicts with a realistic view of nineteenth-century Scotland. A recent study by Ian Duncan, et al, suggests that nineteenth-century Scotland was a place of modernity and political ambivalence which actively functioned as a part of the ‘imperial economy’; it served as a ‘coloniser’, while it has a long history of being ‘colonised’ (Duncan, et al, Introduction 2). Further, far from being a monolithic entity as a ‘periphery’, Scotland comprised an internal dichotomies of coloniser/colonised and centre/periphery in itself, with the Highlands and Lowlands (Duncan, et al, Introduction 2). Despite the stereotypical association of the nation with ‘backwardness’, Scotland played a distinctive role to prompt and drive the process of modernisation in the wider region of Europe; it produced many key inventions, including the steam engine, which triggered the industrial revolution: ‘[A] universal modernity’ and ‘a national past’ can therefore be defined as ‘distinctively Scottish inventions’ which Scott’s historical novels combined (Duncan, et al, Introduction 3).

As demonstrated in the following sections, Lang’s representations of Scotland in his fairy writing are profoundly complicate. Although they ostensibly appear to be hardly realistic, they are implicitly underpinned by a strong sense of realism, from which Lang craves to escape. Perhaps refusing to face the ‘real’ side of Scotland, as well as that of the British Empire, Lang may have contributed to the recreation and

reinforcement of the stereotypically utopian images of his homeland which he longed for, and at the same time, desired to escape from.

Chapter Four: Andrew Lang

4.1 Introduction

This chapter explores fairy narratives woven across diverse genres by Andrew Lang (1844-1912). Through paying primary attentions to his original literary works including fairytales for children (*Princess Nobody* [1884], *The Gold of Fairnilee* [1888], *Prince Prigio* [1889], *Prince Ricardo* [1893] and *Tales of a Fairy Court* [1907]),⁶⁰ as well as poems, it will explore the inscriptions of national consciousness and dilemmas in his narratives, which Lang voiced as a poet and story-teller, rather than as an editor, scholar or folklorist. It is my contention that there is a profound disparity in Lang's attitude and construction of self-image between artistic writing (including poems and original fairytales) and non-fictional writing (including essays, prefaces and introductions). In particular, though both are intended for child readers, there is a significant difference, even a rupture, in his attitude toward national issues between the original fairytales and the 'Fairy Books' (1889-1910).⁶¹ As demonstrated later in this chapter, while Lang often discloses patriotic sentiments for Scotland and even cultural nationalist biases in original fairytales, he exhibits a more controlled view as a cosmopolitan in the 'Fairy Books'.

In order to consider the contrast between Lang's artistic and non-fictional narratives, this chapter will also explore his writings in other genres including articles for periodicals, essays and letters. A number of 'paratextual' materials in Gérard Genette's sense, including Prefaces and Introductions which Lang wrote for his 'Fairy Books' and other works of his own, as well as for other authors' books, will also be explored. Though classified as 'para' texts, Lang often extensively displayed his talent

in them; some of these works are often regarded as of considerable literary value. In his obituary article for Lang, for instance, Joseph Jacobs (1854-1916) wrote that Lang's 'wide knowledge and keen appreciation of literature' found 'an especially appropriate field in the many introductions he wrote for other men's books', and named Lang's introduction and notes written for the works of Walter Scott and Charles Dickens as 'of more serious value' (368-369). Addressed to readers, and children in particular, the Prefaces to the 'Fairy Books' often serve as an alternative outlet to his formal literary work, in which Lang could voice his thoughts in a more informal manner. In order to deepen the understanding of Langian narratives, therefore, it is vitally important to include the paratextual materials within the scope of study.⁶²

It should be noted that despite the long-lasting popularity of the 'Fairy Books' which undeniably served to perpetuate Lang's name in the history of children's literature, it would be reductive to regard Lang simply as a 'benefactor' for the readership of the juvenile genre. Though the 'Fairy Books' may ironically have led to the association of Lang 'exclusively' with children's literature, he was originally an author for adult readership. A majority of his writing, comprising essays, poetry and literary reviews, together with non-fictional fairy narratives, was intended for adults.

A Selkirk-born Borderer initially educated at Edinburgh Academy and the University of St Andrews, Lang went on to study and teach in the University of Oxford (Donaldson n.pag). Later he based himself in London, occupying influential positions as a scholar of literature, historian and journalist, as well as an editor for the publisher Longman, the publisher once called 'Lang's company'. Involved in the creation of the new academic discipline of anthropology, Lang witnessed the coinage of the new

conception 'folklore', and took part in the process of the evolution of 'antiquarians' into 'folklorists'.⁶³ Lang also prompted the significant paradigmatic shift in the academic methodology of reading mythic, traditional and 'folk' materials from philological interpretation toward anthropologic analysis, which paid its particular attention to the way customs, manners and taboos were represented.

In stark contrast with Scott, Black and Hogg, Lang was distanced from Scotland in multiple aspects. Lang placed himself in late Victorian London and Oxford during most of his writing career, and therefore wove his narratives in a strikingly disparate political, social and cultural milieu. It is significant that Lang was also more distanced, in terms of time, from the historic event of the Union of Scotland and England (1707), as well as from the subsequent confusions and concerns incurred by the loss of the independent state in the lingering aftermath of it, which were presumably experienced by those Romantic poets who lived and wrote in Scotland after roughly one hundred years passed since the incident, and witnessed the 'reality' brought by the Act of Union. As demonstrated in Part I, they were far more highly alert of the dissolution of Scotland and Scottishness with a greater sense of immediacy. As demonstrated in this chapter, these distances obviously affect the representations of Scotland and the conceptions of his national identity in Langian narratives.

Roger Lancelyn Green aptly calls Lang 'the master of Fairyland' (80): the countless number of works across the myriad of genres, which were incessantly created throughout his writing career, consistently pivoted around fairies as the primary subject-matter, together with ghosts, myths, magic, and supernatural phenomena which also constituted his lifelong fascinations. In his forties, which witnessed the critically

well-documented ‘golden age’ of children’s literature (Manlove 9),⁶⁴ Lang began to write and edit children’s books by the urge of a publisher, and specifically chose the sub-genre of fairytale.

Lang’s five original fairytales can be categorised into two groups: the *Princess* and the trilogy of the ‘Chronicles of Pantouflia’, comprising *Prigio*, *Ricardo* and the *Fairy Court* vividly as well as materialistically mirror the city scape and commodity culture of Victorian London under the considerable influence of Thackeray. *Fairmilee* is an outstandingly exceptional fairytale which melancholically envisions Scotland in the past, with allusions to Scott, Scottish landscape and traditional fairy belief. His edition of the ‘Fairy Books’, a series of anthologies of fairytales for children, perpetuated his name in the history of children’s literature. Edited from a mixture of imperialist and cosmopolitan perspectives, the ‘Fairy Books’ included and mixed tales of oral tradition as well as ‘literary’ tales by modern authors, sourced from various regions of the world.

The contrast between the overwhelming success of ‘Fairy Books’ and the modest popularity of his original fairytales is striking; ‘Fairy Books’ enjoyed a great popularity, remain in print and, to a degree, still enjoy the readership of children.⁶⁵ Lang himself was obviously aware of this, as he jokingly, yet with a hint of pathos, calls his own tales ‘poor things’:

One nymph who, like the rest [of the ‘ladies’ around Lang], could not keep off the horrid topic of my occupation, said ‘You never write anything but fairy books, do you?’ A French gentleman, [...] once sent me a newspaper article in which he had written that I was exclusively devoted to the composition of fairy books, and nothing

else. [...] In truth I never did write any fairy books in my life, except 'Prince Prigio,' 'Prince Ricardo,' and 'Tales from a Fairy Court'—that of the aforesaid Prigio. I take this opportunity of recommending these fairy books—poor things, but my own—to parents and guardians who may never have heard of them. (*Preface to Lilac* vi)

Yet, though overshadowed by the hugely successful 'Fairy Books', Lang's original fairytales are crucially significant in that they serve to accommodate and reveal profoundly complicated attitudes of Lang towards Scotland and Britain. From his original fairytales emerges Lang's self-portrayal, ostensibly imbued with the fascination with the dazzling cultural wealth of the British Empire, but entangled with a sense of alienation from, as well as nostalgic longing for, his homeland. Contradictively, a desire to escape from his homeland which he craves for so strongly is also subtly inscribed in his original tales. Such attitudes would have been repressed in other kinds of writing including the 'Fairy Books' and a number of introductions and prefaces accompanying them, where Lang disguised himself as a cheerful grandfatherly figure who introduces the tales to child readers in a kind and humorous fashion:

The stories in this Fairy Book come from all quarters of the world. [...] [A]ll people, black, white, brown, red, and yellow, are like each other when they tell stories; for these are meant for children, who like the same sort of thing, whether they go to school and wear clothes, or, [...] live on grubs and lizards and hawks and crows and serpents, like the little Australian blacks. (*Preface to Brown* vii-viii)

Obviously exhibiting a cosmopolitan attitude, Lang in this extract treats the tales, which

are sourced from oral traditions and literatures originating in various regions in the world, as though they were equivalent of customs, manners and cultures. His perception of traditional lore as a distinctive national or regional character echoes the fundamental view of Scottish Romantic antiquarians including Scott and Black, who sought to collect and preserve local ballad with a strong desire to discover and perpetuate Scottishness. Further, this way of perception was also largely shared by Lang's contemporaries, who were involved in the British folklore movement at large: John M. MacKenzie, for instance, argues that the Victorians 'almost always placed' their debates and visions within 'a global context' and regarded themselves as 'the first generations who could truly embrace the world, travel freely within it, dominate it, classify it, visualise it, think about it and ultimately, transform it' (8).

Despite Lang's seemingly cheerful and benevolent cosmopolitan argument, which states that 'all people are like each other', his 'Fairy Books' are no other than the product of British imperialism. Many of the stories collected in the 'Fairy Books' were brought from the British colonies, through various imperial infrastructures and institutions; the numerous collections of international fairytales edited by the members of the Folklore Society including Lang can be viewed as a miniature of the British Museum, crystallising the imperial curiosity and desire to explore, discover, possess and confine those materials belonging to the Other, through collection, translation, classification and appropriation. While 'Fairy Books' thus foreground the intertwining cosmopolitanism and imperialism underpinning the practice of the Victorian folklorists, Lang's original fairytales further disclose his more complicated dilemmas regarding his own national identity.

Lang has not generally been accorded his due critical recognition as a novelist or poet. Many of the most popular books he produced were editions and collections of works by other writers; 'Fairy Books', above all, almost entirely eclipsed his activities in other genres.⁶⁶ Consequently, little critical attention has been paid toward Lang's original literary works; he has tended to be dually neglected by the scholars in Scottish literature as well as by the academics in English literature. Apart from a little number of studies conducted in the field of children's literature, the very few studies sparing focus on Lang have tended to consider his achievements either from the perspectives of anthropology and folklore studies, or from those of Victorian cultural and bibliographic studies. Only a handful of studies have devoted attentions to Lang's artistic writing.

As exemplified by the plaque placed on the wall of his former residence in 1 Marloes Road, Kensington, Lang has been regarded as a 'man of letters', a 'literary figure', a distinguished 'folklorist' and the 'editor' of the 'Fairy Books', who produced writing about literature, not literature itself.

The crucial lack of edited primary materials no doubt has been, and will continue to be, an obstacle for the study of Lang. In 1946, Green published his invaluable informative bibliographic study of Lang's life and works,⁶⁷ in which he rightly pointed out that there were no collected and scholarly editions of Lang's writings, even in the genre of essays and poems which he evaluated as more important.⁶⁸ It is indeed unfortunate that the situation remains unchanged at the close of 2013.

It is ironic that Stevenson, who is said to have once envied Lang for having far more opportunities to publish than himself (Calder n.pag), has accumulated multiple editions of collected works, while Lang has turned out to have none. The only

exception is *The Poetical Works of Andrew Lang* (1923), a selection of his poems by Leonora Blanche Lang (1851-1933).⁶⁹ Green emphatically denies that it can be regarded as ‘a standard collection’, claiming that it is ‘sadly lacking in the essentials of a collected edition’ with over two hundred poems and verses excluded or overlooked (218). That her edition does not include information of the sources and first publication dates of the poems must be regarded as another shortcoming. Leonora’s edition is, however, invaluable, because it is still the only extant collection of Lang’s poems.

This critical lacuna might in part be caused by Lang’s ‘versatility’: his diverse and prolific output makes the task of collation and collection difficult, as Leonora herself comments in her Preface to *Poetical Works*.⁷⁰ A great number of his writings remain scattered in journals, newspapers and books, many of which tend to be either out of print, lost or classified as ‘rare books’. In addition to poems, fairytales, articles, essays and scholarly writings, Lang wrote countless prefaces and introductions, often for books by other authors, some of whom seems to have wished to have Lang’s name and writing in their book as a kind of ‘imprimatur’: as Leonora writes, a poem of Lang’s ‘might be written at the entreaty of a lady who is convinced that “a poem of yours, dear Mr. Lang, will ensure the sale of our Bazaar book”’ (Leonora Lang, Preface to *Poetical Works* vii).⁷¹

There are several distinctive features in Lang’s writing in general. Lang profoundly, and perhaps emotionally to an excessive degree, respected Walter Scott. His fairy writing is resonant with Scott’s influence; Under the strong influence of Scott’s historical novels in particular, Lang often shaped his fairy narratives as a site to

explore and negotiate issues regarding Scotland and Scottishness, though those issues were not always placed at the centre stage of his writing. Further, it should be noted that although Lang deeply respected Scott, as well as Dickens and Thackeray, he entirely overlooked Hogg, never mentioned Black, and arguably, does not seem to have paid much attention to MacDonald, though he created a rich variety of most original fantastical writing in Lang's time, some of which are considerably inspired by traditional Scottish belief. If we consider that Hogg wove a variety of narratives dealing with fairies, and he was, like Lang, born and raised in the Border region, it is peculiarly unreasonable that Lang never mentioned him in his fairy writing. Lang's neglect of Hogg is strikingly disproportionate with his enthusiastic references to Scott; Lang mentions Scott even in *Fairnilee*, a fairytale for children which he deliberately set in the Borders as a homage to Scott. Given Lang's influence in the late Victorian academia and literary world, as well as his supposed role in the Victorian reception of Scottish literary works, it would be highly possible that Lang was complicit in, and even reinforced, the long-standing critical neglect of Hogg's works and achievements.

Although Lang emulated Scott's historical novel to a considerable degree, his fairy narratives explore far more various and contemporary issues: imperialism, modernisation, industrialisation, urbanisation and commercial culture, vogue in the publishing world, and preoccupations with children and the unconscious, together with the rise of occultism as well as anthropology. Further, his narratives specifically encapsulate the significant shifts which characterise the way fairies were represented in Victorian Britain. In Victorian fairy writing, the characteristically magical powers of fairies were increasingly materialised; Instead of being represented as immaterial 'power' or transcendental 'phenomenon', their fantastical abilities were often

represented as things and gifts. Reflecting the vogue of sending gifts, Christmas presents in particular, Victorian fairy narratives are crowded with magical objects and fairy gifts including magical carpets and telescopes, which are inspired by various kinds of tales and commodities brought from colonies of the British Empire. It may be of note that Lang's books for children, including the 'Fairy Books' and original fairytales, were also one of the emblematic commodities representing the Victorian vogue for Christmas and gift culture which also involved the publishing world; with the beautiful illustrations and decorations as well as the enjoyable yet didactic contents, Lang's books were seen as attractive presents.

In addition, instead of the fairy queen characters, which enjoyed their prosperity in the Romantic fairy writing, fairy 'godmothers' took over the centrality previously accorded to fairy queens. Motifs of immigration also haunt the Victorian fairy writing; One significant example is Lang's *Fairnilee*, an untypical fairytale which Lang claimed to be a 'real' fairytale, and was dedicated to his nephew and niece who emigrated to Australia.

Ann C. Colley, in her study on the nostalgia and recollection in Victorian culture, aptly writes: '[Victorian authors] experience loss and at moments feel alienated from their homeland and their origins by virtue of distance, age, or alteration. All of them intermittently suffer from a desire for reunion, for some point of correspondence between their present and their past, their immediate surroundings and home' (3). Significantly, in her analysis of the Victorian discourse on nostalgia, Colley employs the vocabulary which are typically used for the debate of national identity in Scottish literary studies: 'homeland', 'alienation', 'reunion' and 'synthesis'. The fact that

Colley devotes considerable attention to Stevenson in her study implies that the Victorian discourse on nostalgia and a sense of loss intersects with the post-union Scottish discourse on the loss of the independent state, which was often imbued with a sense of alienation both from the old homeland and the new settlement. In a manner echoing Stevenson, Lang's narratives can also be regarded as an intersection between the above-mentioned Victorian and Scottish discourses. While nostalgia undoubtedly serves as a key motif in Langian fairy narratives, nostalgic sentiment craving for the lost childhood and that for the lost old Scotland fade into one another in his writing, and their crosscurrents are often characteristically undercut by ambiguity, contradiction and duality.

According to Leonora, Lang once said that 'My mind is gay but my soul is melancholy' (Preface to *Poetical Works* v). The comment is significant in that it echoes the terminology which has been repeatedly employed for the analysis of Scottish literature almost as an established consensus, since the creation of the conception of 'Caledonian Antisyzygy' by G. Gregory Smith. In numerous studies in Scottish literature after Smith, those terms including 'ambivalence', 'contradiction', 'paradox', 'split' and 'a Jekyll-and-Hyde dualism' have increasingly been employed for textual analysis, and various forms of textual inscriptions of the identity crises perceivedly caused by the political, cultural and psychological tensions between Scotland and the British Empire have often been a focus of criticism. For instance, Douglas Gifford argues, with invocations from Tom Nairn, that the 'real paradox' of nineteenth-century Scotland lies in 'its separation of its sense of historical identity from its practical involvement with England', which is '[a] separation of Scotland's heart from its head' (Nairn 150; qtd. in Gifford, Introduction 4). Gifford also suggests: 'perhaps the

Anglicised voice of Victorian Scotland is constantly undercut by an older, rougher, and often vernacular assertion that the professed new and improved identity is not the real essence of the country' (Introduction 8).

In this context, Lang obviously can be viewed a representative figure of what Fielding calls 'British Scotland' (*Writing* 9): Like John Campbell Shairp (1819-1885), a Scottish literary scholar who was elected professor of poetry at Oxford, the position formerly held by Matthew Arnold (1822-1888) (Ovenden n.pag), Lang acquired an administrative position in the 'Imperial Britain' through his outstanding 'literacy', which Fielding defines as 'a passport to the markets and administrative positions of Imperial Britain' (*Writing* 8).⁷² He eventually became 'an Oxford don' (Fielding, *Writing* 138), and later had an influential place in the London publishing world, largely writing in Standard English as a man of letters with a sophisticated taste.

An established critical consensus amongst the very few scholars paying attention to Lang maintains that he overtly regarded himself as English. He has frequently been regarded as one of the Scottish writers who 'often [described] themselves publicly as English' (Crawford 150), and Robert Gordon Cant calls Lang 'a Scottish borderer by birth' who was directed towards an 'English rather than a Scottish' setting. Indeed, in *The Library* (1881), a bibliographic work, Lang even calls England 'our country'.⁷³ His closest publisher was Longmans, Green, and Company; in his poem 'Beauty and the Beast' (1884), which was included in the Christmas Number of *Longman's Magazine*, Lang indicates that his intended readers were 'English children'.⁷⁴

Nevertheless, it is my contention that Lang's perception and representation of

his national identity are profoundly complicated and ambiguous. Traces in his writing suggest that Lang often changed the national identity with which he fashioned himself according to occasion. It should also be noted that 'national' identity could be no more than one of several kinds of identities with which he defined himself. Numerous examples explored in the following sections reveal that a self-consciousness as Scots continuously underlies his fairy narratives as an undercurrent and occasionally resurfaces. Lang frequently expressed himself as Scots though he might have been selective about when and where he should do so. Further, the biographical facts that Lang often went to Ascot with an expectation that he might hear spoken Scots (Green), while he regularly returned to Scotland every winter (Campbell, 'Nineteenth-Century Non-Fictional Prose'), obviously reveal that he was never entirely detached from it. As mentioned earlier, Lang formed a network of Scottish literary figures in London, which included Stevenson and Barrie. His letters addressed to Stevenson reveal his nostalgic as well as patriotic feelings toward an idealised Scotland, though his works of fairy writing disclose more ambiguous attitudes. Even Cant admits: 'That he [Lang] had a deep attachment to Scotland throughout his life is undeniable, but it was retrospective, selective, and sometimes downright contrary' (3).

Nevertheless, it is my contention that the significance of Lang lies in his very absence from Scotland, in the 'retrospectiveness' and 'selectiveness' with which he represented it, and in his oscillation between the two pivotal topographies of his imagination: the Scotland of the past and the London of the present, both of which, in different ways, were represented by Lang as an otherworld haunted by fairies, where his longing for enchantment, an awareness of the disenchanting reality and a strong desire for re-enchantment overlap and fuse with each other.

Eleanor Bell points out that ‘there is a certain factor of reducibility at work [in approaches in Scottish studies], where texts produced by Scottish authors must in the first instance be explained in terms of their Scottishness’ (2). An examination of Lang’s works in terms of their purported ‘Scottishness’ could easily court this danger, as he was clearly rooted in late Victorian English culture. This thesis, however, does not attempt to endorse the reductive reading of ‘Scottishness’ of which Bell writes, by discussing the question of ‘Scotland’ in Lang’s fairy literature simply because he was of Scottish birth. Nor does it aim merely to spot the ‘borrowed’ elements from traditional Scottish literature and culture in Lang’s narratives. Instead, it considers Lang’s significance and role in the processes of the diasporic re-creation of Scottishness which were arguably undertaken outside Scotland in the Victorian period, which presumably involved Britishised Scottish elites; in doing so it aims to disclose a neglected layer of Scottish nation writing, and bridge a crucial lacuna in the previous scholarship of the sub-genre which has tended to exclude, from the scope of study, those Scottish who, like Lang, planted themselves in the centre of the British Empire, self-fashioned themselves as British, and yet re-imagined Scotland and Scottishness with a profound complexity.

If it can be hypothesised that some of the processes of the construction of post-Union discourses revolving around Scotland, including the re-imagining of Scottishness and re-creation of Scottish national tale, were in part undertaken outside of Scotland by those who placed themselves beyond it, Lang is indeed a vitally significant figure. Arguably, Lang’s successful career through the Snell exhibition, which led him to study at Oxford and then toward an influential place as a man of letters at the centre of the British Empire, can be seen as a model path which a number of post-Union

Scottish adolescents would have aspired to follow. Lang's ambiguous fairytales, which in fact are ambivalent national tales, can be seen as a neglected part of Scottish nation writing in late Victorian period, woven by those elites who acquired influential positions in various kinds of institutions of the British Empire, found themselves distanced as well as alienated from both their homeland and new settlement, and formed profoundly complicated perceptions of national identity. An examination of Lang's writing, therefore, is helpful to consider the question of how Scottish national identity, both at national and personal levels, were conceived and envisioned by those diasporic Scottish intellectuals in the Victorian period; it may also shed a light to the question of in what way and to what extent Scottishness during the period was imagined and envisioned outside of Scotland, by those who were absent and away from it.

It could be conceived that certain features of the Borders region in nineteenth century, where Lang was born and raised, affected his identity formation, intensifying his self-image as ambivalent. Fielding defines nineteenth-century Scotland as 'a country that was constantly redefined its own internal borders and divisions, its relationship with England, its place within Britain and in Europe' (*Writing* 19); arguably, the Border region bears such characteristics at an amplified scale. Itself being a 'border', the district had historically long been threatened by the conflict between England and Scotland (Oram 42-43); the region can be perceived as a liminal district characterised by contradiction, ambiguity and duality. In Langian fairy narratives, with *Fairnilee* as an distinguished example specifically set in the Borders region, above-mentioned images of Victorian Britain, British Scotland and the Borders region overlap, contradict and conflict with each other. It could be claimed that Lang

dramatized those overlapping images and sought for synthesis through his fairy writing, in which he created two entirely disparate fairylands, and in which he would often rewrite and redefine ‘internal borders’, or historical relationships between Scotland and England, in a fashion echoing Scott’s historical novels.

In his argument on fairy belief, Lang revealed a Scottish cultural nationalist bias: he claimed that fairies in traditional Scottish belief are ‘genuine’ ones as opposed to the ‘Wrong fairylands’ created by his contemporaries (*MFT* 714). As a source of inspiration for his original fairytale, Lang specifically drew on ‘Thomas the Rhymer’ and ‘Tam Lin’, two emblematic ballads of Scotland collected by Scott in the *Minstrelsy*. Yet, though Lang’s creation of a fairy queen character in *Fairnilee* obviously echoes those ballads, it is profoundly ambiguous: While the figure of dark fairy queen metaphorises Mary Queen of Scots and symbolises the Scottish nation, it is imbued with imageries of death, repression and imprisonment. It is my contention that those deadly figures of fairies and the dystopian fairyland in Langian fairytale metaphorise Scotland and its people in reality, instead of evoking imaginative pictures of fantasy. Lang’s conscious employment of the traditional motif of liberation of the male protagonist from the dark fairyland implies that though Lang often romanticised Scotland as ‘a fairy knowe of the north’ (‘Tusitala: R. L. S.’ 145), and repeatedly expressed a nostalgic longing for it, Lang unconsciously desired to escape from the contemporary Scotland existing in reality, into the physically distant London, or into the illusory and idealised Scotland in the past; If Lang had a hidden desire to escape from reality, the reality was synonymous with the contemporary Scotland. Given that Langian disenchanted and deadly fairyland is a mirror-image of Scotland in reality, his original fairytales can be viewed as a work of realism; they are a product of escapist realism, rather than escapist

fantasy.

On the other hand, the protagonist's 'return' to his home in the Border region, as well as his 'escape' from a deadly Queen, may also be interpreted as Lang's own return from London, suggesting that London also served as a kind of seductive yet disenchanting 'fairylane' for Lang. His conscious use of the motif of disappointment with fairylane may perhaps reflect his own disillusionment with London and the British Empire, with their splendour and modernity, and with the gloriously successful futures at various imperial institutions which were implicitly promised to Scottish intellectual elites since the Act of Union. This way of reading suggests that Lang's dark, seductive yet perilous fairy queen represents the queen of the British Empire as well, specifically alluding to Queen Victoria in her famous mourning dress. It may be concluded, then, that Langian fairy narrative is, in the deepest layer, underpinned by a peculiar impulse of realism which recognises the reality and yet seeks to escape from it.

4.2 Lang and the Scottish Tradition

Lang's fairy writing provides important material for the study of fairytale, in nineteenth-century British literature in general. By revealing the nature of the fairytales which were circulating in the period in Britain, and exploring questions of authorship and readership, Lang's work can be understood within a broader literary context. The fact that both Lang and William Allingham (1824–1889), two pre-eminent literary figures, themselves wrote 'fairy literature' reveals that it had an important place in the late Victorian aesthetic and intellectual consciousness. Green calls Lang's 'Fairy Books' 'entirely responsible' (82) for the flourishing of books about fairies and fairytales in the contemporary book market. Perhaps the same might be

said of Lang's contribution to the circulation of Scottish literature and Scottish fairy belief at this time.⁷⁵ For example, the nineteenth century witnessed two republications of the tract (MS 1691) written by Robert Kirk (1644-1692). Today the work is known as *The Secret Commonwealth of Elves, Fauns and Fairies*, but different editors have given different titles to it, according to their own interests. Walter Scott and Robert Jamieson are said to have been involved with the creation of the first printed edition in 1815. The supposedly original title which Scott's edition is entitled was *Secret Commonwealth or, a Treatise displaying the Chiefe Curiosities as they are in Use among diverse of the People of Scotland of this Day: SINGULARITIES for the most Part peculiar to that Nation*. It is, however, now widely known by the title given by Lang (Warner ed, *The Secret Commonwealth* 2).

Lang edited the second edition (1893), and entitled it as *The Secret Commonwealth of Elves, Fauns, & Fairies: a Study in Folk-lore & Psychical Research*: a title which reflects his own curiosities which were shared by many contemporary Victorians: curiosities towards the new-born disciplines of anthropology and folklore, together with those towards Freudian psychology as well as occultism.⁷⁶

Kirk, a Gaelic scholar and minister at Aberfoyle, Scotland, in the seventeenth century, was among the first 'to make the Bible accessible to Highlanders' by his translation into Gaelic. This continued to be distributed after his death 'in spite of opposition in England because it might encourage Gaelic' (Stott n.pag), making him a highly important figure in the construction of Scottish national identity.

Not only did Kirk have 'a keen interest' in fairy superstitions, he was also one of the pioneers of the project 'to record highland folk-beliefs', and is considered to be the first person who used the 'English or Scots' expression 'fairy tale' (Henderson and

Cowan 8).⁷⁷ *The Secret Commonwealth*, a written record of local fairy belief, describes the characteristics of fairies such as their living place, appearance, behaviour, and manner of speaking. It is an extremely important work because it provides ‘an unrivalled corpus of information and a rare insight into various aspects of belief in the latter half of the seventeenth century’ (Henderson and Cowan 17). In writing this book, Kirk drew upon ‘oral informants and local traditions in the manner of a modern folklorist’ (Henderson and Cowan 8).

After Kirk’s death, a legend was woven that he did not die but wandered in fairyland for ever, because he was taken away by fairies whose secrets he had betrayed: which, together with his book, attracted many ‘distinguished folklorists’ (Stott n.pag). While these ‘distinguished folklorists’ obviously include Lang, who was one of the founding members of the Folk-lore Society, it should be noted that curiosity about the book could not have been aroused without its republications by Scott and Lang: they revived the book by their printed editions. After having had his attention drawn to Kirk’s tract by Patrick Graham (1750–1835), a successor of Kirk at Aberfoyle (Stott n.pag), Scott then produced his edition of *The Secret Commonwealth* from a manuscript copy preserved in the Advocates’ Library in Edinburgh, and mentioned him in *Rob Roy* (1818). His edition was probably the first printed one, as Lang declares that it was not likely that there existed any printed version before Scott’s (‘The History of the Book and Author’ 19). Almost eighty years later, in 1893, Lang republished the book again as the ‘second edition’. Without the initial revival of the tract by Jamieson and Scott through the creation of their printed edition, *The Secret Commonwealth* is likely to have been forgotten; at the same time, there is no doubt that Lang’s republication also contributed to its preservation. Since only one hundred copies were printed for Scott’s

edition, very few of them have survived until today, and presumably even until Lang's time. On the other hand, five hundred and fifty copies were printed for Lang's edition, which would undeniably have enabled wider circulation of the book as well as the survival of a larger number of copies.⁷⁸

The fact that Kirk's tract on fairies was not revived until the nineteenth century is of striking importance. While it corresponds to the fascination with fairies in Britain after the 1870s, it reveals the significance and persistence of Scottish cultural nationalism in the process. Scott's republication of the book occurred in 1815, three years after the publication of Jacob and Wilhelm Grimm's *Kinder- und Hausmärchen*: the model for the endeavour of 'the quest for national identity and cultural purity that began in the late eighteenth century [Europe]' (Schacker 2). Although not examined before, there is no doubt that Scott's republication of Kirk's work reflects the cultural nationalist movement which was, as in other parts of Europe, 'fuelled by the "discovery" of popular culture' by "intellectuals . . . from the upper classes"' (Burke 216, qtd. in Schacker 2).

Needless to say, Lang must have been well aware of the significance of Kirk's work and of its republication. His own edition of *The Secret Commonwealth* is, therefore, strong evidence of how Lang himself sought to place himself in Scottish literary history. For Lang, it was an important book in three respects: it was one of the earliest written works concerning Scottish fairy belief; it was written by a Gaelic scholar; thirdly, and most importantly, its first printed edition was produced by Scott, who considerably influenced Lang throughout his life.⁷⁹ In his own works, the traces of his predecessor's work are particularly prominent where he wrote about Scotland.

As a scholar of literature, as well as a reader, Lang greatly respected Scott, and

was proud of being from the same district (the Borders) as Scott. In his introduction to *The Works of Robert Louis Stevenson*, edited and published after the death of Stevenson, one of his most treasured friends, Lang sentimentally writes: '[Stevenson] and I had a common forebear with Sir Walter Scott, and were hundredth cousins of each other' (xiii, qtd. in Green 1). In 'To Sir Walter Scott, Bart' (1891) in *Letters to Dead Authors*, Lang passionately writes:

If some Circe had repeated in my case her favourite miracle of turning mortals into swine, and had given me a choice, into that fortunate pig [which, by his will, had never been severed from Scott's company], blessed among his race, would I have been converted! You, almost alone among men of letters, still, like a living friend, win and charm us out of the past; and if one might call up a poet, as the scholiast tried to call Homer, from the shades, who would not, out of all the rest, demand some hours of your society? (140)

Lang industriously edited and promoted Scott's works. He produced the 'Border edition' and provided introductory essays and notes to editions of, for example, *The Antiquary* (1898), *The Heart of Midlothian* (Border ed, 1893), *The Lyrics and Ballads of Sir Walter Scott* (1894), and *The Poetical Works of Sir Walter Scott, Bart* (1898); he also wrote about Scott at length in *Sir Walter Scott and the Border Minstrelsy* (1910). Scott indeed occupied a special place in Lang's imagination. Scott was not merely an author whom Lang admired, but he was closely bound up in Lang's ideas about his own national identity. In 'Twilight on Tweed', Lang writes:

Three crests against the saffron sky,
Beyond the purple plain,

The dear remembered melody
 Of Tweed once more again.
 [.]
 Like a loved ghost thy fabled flood
 Fleets through the dusky land;
 Where Scott, come home to die, has stood,
 My feet returning stand.
 [.]
 Twilight, and Tweed, and Eildon Hill,
 Fair and thrice fair you be;
 You tell me that the voice is still
 That should have welcomed me. (32-33)

The Borders landscape nostalgically represented here, constructed through images of the River Tweed, Eildon Hill, and Scott himself, and through allusions to the ballad ‘Thomas the Rhymer’, and its concept of deadly fairies, creates a crucial topography related to both Lang’s childhood and his life-long fascination with fairies. He persistently recreates the landscape, which he calls ‘home’ in the poem, in his other writing such as the poem ‘Twilight in Tweed’, and in his fairytale *Fairnilee*. Lang was born and spent his childhood in Selkirk in the Borders district, which lies by the Tweed, and is a place closely related to Scott (Green 1-5): he worked as the Sheriff-Depute of the Shire, and Lang’s grandfather, also Andrew Lang, was Sheriff-Clerk during most of Scott’s term of office (Green 4), and is likely to have been one of the people who wrote a letter in 1838, after Scott’s death, in order to raise funds for the erection of Scott’s statue in Market Cross, Selkirk.⁸⁰ Eildon Hill, not far from Selkirk, is one of the most

famous of ‘fairy hills and fairy glens’ in Scotland (Henderson and Cowan 9). It is the place where ‘true Thomas’ in ‘Thomas the Rhymer’ was said to have encountered the perilous fairy queen (Henderson and Cowan 9). The ballad narrates how Thomas the Rhymer was taken away by her to the dark and deadly fairyland; one of its variants was collected by Scott in his *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*. It underlies the nostalgic landscape of the poem quoted above, which is strangely coloured with images of ghostliness and death, reminiscent of ‘Thomas the Rhymer’. It is indeed crucial in shaping Lang’s idea of fairies and fairyland, as he regarded its depiction of them as ‘genuine’, and wrote a fairytale (*Fairnilee*) largely inspired by it.

In his writing in various genres, Lang alluded to Scotland, and described it as, for example, ‘a northern land’ (‘Romance’ 137) and ‘a fairy knowe of the north’ (‘Tusitala: R. L. S.’ 145); the North Sea was mentioned as ‘the grey North Ocean’ (‘*Almæ Matres*’ 3). Even in the prefaces and introductions intended for child readership, Lang also inscribed Scotland and its history:

There are plenty of kings and queens in the fairy tales, just because long ago there *were* plenty of kings in the country. A gentleman who would be a squire now was a kind of king in Scotland in very old times, and the same in other places. These old stories, never forgotten, were taken down in writing in different ages, but mostly in this century, in all sorts of languages. (Introduction to *The Arabian Nights Entertainments* ix-x, the author’s emphasis)

Considering that the text he introduces here is *The Arabian Nights Entertainment*, and that the purpose of the passage is to describe characteristics of fairytales in general, there is no specific need to refer to Scotland here in particular. Protagonists of other

nationalities, including the animals and fairies of imaginary nations, could have been the subject of this description. Lang, however, deliberately employs ‘a Scottish gentleman’, of an independent, pre-Union of the Crowns, or perhaps medieval Scotland. The degeneration of a king into a squire particularly foregrounds the loss of the Crown and therefore independence of Scotland, with an ironical effect. Likewise, in his preface to *The Nursery Rhyme Book* (1897), which is a collection of nursery rhymes in Britain, he introduces a Scottish nursery rhyme:

In Scotland an old fellow will take a child on his knee for a ride, and
sing—

‘This is the way the ladies ride,

Jimp [*graceful*] and sma’ [*slender*], —’

A smooth ride, then a rough trot, —

‘This is the way the cadgers [*an itinerant dealer*] ride,

Creels [*a deep basket for carrying fish etc*] and a’ [*all*]!’ (8)

By the phrase ‘In Scotland’, Lang delineates a boundary between Scotland, his country, and England, where his readers are from, and presents Scotland as ‘foreign’ with a ‘distinctive’ tradition of its own.⁸¹

Poetry is the genre in which Lang was most noticeably stimulated by Scotland, especially the imaginative landscape associated with fairies, which Lang tends to represent as intrinsically poetic, romantic, and nostalgic. In ‘Romance’, he writes:

My Love dwelt in a northern land.

A gray tower in a forest green

Was hers, and far on either hand

The long wash of the waves was seen,

And leagues on leagues of yellow sand,
The woven forest boughs between! (137)

In the poem Lang romantically constructs a landscape, which is evocative of St. Andrews, with a hint of nostalgia, and implicitly associates it with fairies. He often describes the city as ‘gray’, and the seashore of St. Andrews as ‘yellow sand’,⁸² alluding to the fantastical scenes in which Ariel sings with spirits in Shakespeare’s *The Tempest* (1611):

*Come unto these yellow sands,
And then take hands:
Curtstied when you have, and kiss'd
The wild waves whist,
Foot it featly here and there;
And, sweet sprites, the burthen bear.* (1.2.375-386)

The scene, with the song and the fairy character, was outstandingly popular in the Victorian period, and were frequently visualised; Above all, *Come Unto These Yellow Sands* (1842), one of a series of fairy painting by Richard Dadd, is an important example of Victorian visual art portraying fairies. Likewise, many of his poems are inspired by Scotland, its landscape, history, and writers, where Lang consciously writes in Scots, as in ‘Ballade of the Tweed’:

There’s Ettrick, Meggat, Ail, and a’ [*all*],
Where trout swim thick in May and June;
Ye’ll see them take in showers o’ snaw [*snow*]
Some blinking, cauldrie [*cold*] April noon:
Rax [*stretch*] ower the palmer and march-broun,

And syne [*afterwards*] we'll show a bonny [*excellent*] creel,
 In spring or simmer [*summer*], late or soon,
 By fair Tweed-side, at Ashiesteel! (28)

‘Oh, What Should I Do There?’, a poem probably written after the death of John Shairp, reveals Lang’s ambiguous identity, possibly as well as alienation.⁸³

Oh, what should I do there,
 In the lately vacant chair
 Of Mr. Matthew Arnold, by the Isis [*an alias for the Thames in Oxford*] stream?

Where, instead of cushat [*wood-pigeon*]’s coos
 Is the plashing of canoes,
 And the coaches curse the crews and the coxes scream.
 [.]

I should much prefer to daunder [*to stroll, saunter*],
 Where the sheep and shepherds wander,
 And muse, and maybe maunder, by the Tweed. (10)

The poem dramatises Shairp’s delight, excitement and nervousness at his appointment, which probably is his most triumphant moment. Lang consciously situates the main protagonist and the event in a Scottish context: depicting Shairp as a person who thinks of Scottish landscape opposed to Oxford and expresses his emotions in Scots (‘daunder’) at the most triumphant moment in his life. There is no doubt a reflection of Lang himself in his portrayal of Shairp, because there are many features common between them as a Scottish outside Scotland primarily in that they won what Fielding calls ‘administrative positions of Imperial Britain’ through their distinctive literacy

which served as a 'passport' (*Writing* 8). While they were both distanced from Scotland, Shairp is said to have enjoyed walking, especially in the Highlands, and in the countryside on the Yarrow in the Borders, and to have been inspired to take up poetry by the Scottish landscape (Ovenden n.pag). In spite of the triumphant mood of the poem, there is a hint of homesickness and alienation: while he is distanced from Scotland, he is also estranged from Oxford as represented by his use of Scots.

Lang's use of Scots, as well as his exploration of Scottish identity, connect with the 'revival of written Broad Scots' in literature from the eighteenth century, by Allan Ramsay, Robert Fergusson, and Robert Burns, which occurred as a counter movement to the decline of Scots as the official language, as a result of the Treaty of Union of 1707 (Corbett, et al 12). Like Lang, earlier writers had a readership 'largely schooled in written English' (Corbett, et al 12). While they increased the 'accessibility' of Broad Scots for 'an English-reading market', ironically they had 'the unfortunate effect of suggesting that Broad Scots was not a separate language system, but rather a divergent and inferior form of English' (Corbett, et al 12-13). If these revivalists were conscious of the English readers in terms of 'accessibility', there was another group, 'others in the middle and upper classes', who were conscious of them from an opposite direction: instead of emphasising the Scottishness of their language, figures such as David Hume and James Boswell 'sought to eradicate traces of Broad Scots, first from their writing and then, up to appoint, from their speech' (Corbett, et al 13), obviously seeking for 'Britishness'. While Lang's use of Scots in his poems would ostensibly place his work in the revivalist category, it was limited to genres such as poems and children's literature in which he largely wrote with nostalgia. For other genres (such as scholarly writings) it is highly possible that he did eradicate traces of

Scots in his writing; or, it is even possible that, through his middle-class education in Scotland, his written language would not contain Scots elements from the first place. Thus, national identity and the class identity, both of which are two kinds of politically charged identity discourses, converge in Lang's choice of the language with which he writes; while issues of the nation and class, together with the psychological practice of repression and self-fashioning, overlap with each other in it, Lang more consciously foregrounds those issues regarding Scotland and Scottishness, to the extent that he, though arguably, distorts the reality of what language Scottish intellectuals used. Thus, Shairp's utterance forged by Lang in 'Oh, What Should I Do There?' embodies the implicit tension between languages and classes, together with Lang's practice of distortion.

The dichotomy of orality and literacy for Lang is analogous to that of Scots and Standard English, to that of Scotland and London, and to that of childhood and adulthood. As a child Lang spoke in Scots ('As a lad at Clifton [Lang] had said to his nurse: "D'ye ken [*know*] what I would do with thae [*those*] waterfalls if they wes mine? I'd let them bide [*remain in a certain state*]"' [Webster 3]), and when he was in London as an adult, he took greatest pleasure in visiting Wimbledon Common to hear the accents of 'my native tongue'.⁸⁴

It should be noted, at the same time, that 'standard English' is originally a product of Scotland, representing a contradiction in the notion of 'Scottishness' which includes both centre and periphery, colonising as well as being colonised, Scotland and Britain. The opposition between Scots and standard English, therefore, in fact manifests the contradictory nature of 'Scottishness', rather than being a projection of the national conflict between Scotland and England. It is perhaps such contradictory

aspects of ‘Scottishness’ that Lang attempted to negotiate through his writing often with a relatively neutral attitude.

Lang enjoyed the friendship of many contemporary Scottish authors, Stevenson in particular. In a letter to Stevenson written from his winter house in St Andrews, Lang writes:

I wish you expectorated novels, or spun them like the girl in the Fairy Tale. Did Nutt ever send you the Secret Commonwealth, dedicated to you in immortal verse? [...] Barrie has been here, a weird looking little cove he is. He is not what you call a lady’s man: he looks like a changeling. I like the changeling. (‘Letter to R. L. Stevenson: 3 March 1894’ 143).

This letter reveals a network of literary figures around Lang, all of whom were concerned with a particular mode of late Romantic Scottish literature and in particular with fairy belief. ‘Secret Commonwealth’ refers to Lang’s edition of Kirk’s work; ‘Nutt’, or Alfred Nutt was a publisher, folklorist, and Celtic scholar (Dorson 202), who was one of the core members of the Folk-Lore Society. His most important literary productions included ‘Studies on the legend of the holy grail, with special reference to the hypothesis of its Celtic origin’ (*Folk-Lore Record*, 23, 1888), studies on Celtic languages, Celtic and Gaelic literature, and an annotated edition of Matthew Arnold’s *Study of Celtic Literature* (1910) (Tedder and Basu n.pag). His publishing house, David Nutt, was ‘known for its educational and foreign lists’, which ‘sponsored numerous titles on folklore, frequently at a loss which Alfred had to recoup on more popular titles’ (Dorson 202). It published works from medieval Scotland as well as England (such as the collection of unedited Scottish Gaelic texts known as *Waifs and*

Strays of Celtic Tradition (1889-95), *The Northern Library* of Old Norse texts, and the *Tudor Library* of rare sixteenth-century works) and collections of fairytales such as *The Grimm Library* (Tedder and Basu n.pag). Works by Alfred's contemporaries including journals of the Folk-Lore Society which he co-founded, collections of fairytales by Joseph Jacobs (1854–1916) such as *Celtic Fairy Tales*, *English Fairy Tales*, and *Indian Fairy Tales*, and Lang's edition of *The Secret Commonwealth* were also published by his house. Needless to say, the 'Barrie', who looked like a changeling, was J. M. Barrie, who later created his own fairy-tales such as *Peter Pan*.

In the letter, Lang is very eager that Stevenson should read his edition of *The Secret Commonwealth*, into which he had inserted two poems of his own: 'The Fairy Minister: In Memory of the Rev. Robert Kirk' (1893), and 'Dedication to Robert Louis Stevenson' (1893) who was in Vailima, Samoa (Mayhew n.pag) when the poems were written. In 'The Fairy Minister', alluding to Kirk's legend, Lang foregrounds the disappearance of fairies:

He [Kirk] heard, he saw, he knew too well

The Secrets of your fairy clan;

You stole him from the haunted dell,

Who never more was seen of man,

Now far from heaven, and safe from hell,

Unknown of earth, he[Kirk] wanders free.

[.]

For we have tired the Folk of Peace [*fairies*];⁸⁵

No more they tax our corn and oil;

Their dances on the moorland cease,

The Brownie stints his wonted toil.

No more shall any shepherd meet

The ladies of the fairy clan,

Nor are their deathly kisses sweet

On lips of any earthly man. (Lang 'The Fairy Minister' 9)

A strong sense of loss and absence, as well as a peculiar nostalgia for the deadly fairies saturates the poem. It is addressed to fairies and dedicated to Kirk, both of whom are depicted as 'departed' from the world where Lang stands. The repetition of the strong phrases 'No more' stresses their disappearance without any possibility of return. The past, in contrast to the modern present, is depicted as colourful and vivid, animated by the presence of fairies (though, paradoxically, they are deadly and dangerous beings). The fairyland he depicts is a liminal, ambivalent and purgatorial space which is neither earth, nor hell, nor heaven, possibly overlapping the imagery of Borders between Scotland and England. In 'Dedication to Robert Louis Stevenson', Lang addresses Stevenson, who was also far away from Scotland when he wrote it:

O Louis! You that like them maist [*most*],

Ye're far frae [*from*] kelpie [*a water demon*], wraith [*an apparition of a living or dead person*], and ghaist [*ghost*],

And fairy dames, no unco [*strange*] chaste,

And haunted cell.

Among a heathen clan ye're placed,

That kens [*tells, shows*] na [*no*] hell! ('Dedication to

Robert Louis Stevenson' 7)

The poem reveals how significantly fairies serve in the construction of the imagery of

the ‘homeland’ for Lang and Stevenson: Lang’s depiction of their ‘homeland’ here is shaped by nothing but allusions to Scottish fairies, such as kelpie, wraith and ghaist. The use of Scots also suggests that Lang and Stevenson shared interest and enthusiasm concerning Scotland and its fairy beliefs. Lang wrote at least two other poems for Stevenson (‘Ballant o’ Ballantrae: To Robert Louis Stevenson’ and ‘Tusitala: R. L. S.’), in both of which he uses Scots. ‘Tusitala: R. L. S.’ was probably written shortly after Stevenson’s death in 1894 in Samoa. In the poem, Lang laments that ‘We spoke of a rest in a fairy knowe [*knoll*] of the north, but he, / Far from the firths [*estuaries*] of the east, and the racing tides of the west, / Sleeps in the sight and the sound of the infinite southern sea’ (‘Tusitala: R. L. S.’ 145): Scotland emerges as a place which haunts both Lang and Stevenson’s consciousness, continuously inviting both authors to return there before their death. Significantly, the ‘Scotland’ Lang depicts tends to be a distant place, either in the sense of time or space; variously associated with ballads, dead authors, and his own childhood as well as their own death. Lang’s Scotland is therefore conceived as a place which cannot be described within the conventions of literary realism; it is a place, belonging to a distant past of fairies and childhood, infused with romanticism and nostalgia, with a sense of loss, disappearance, absence, departure, and death. His choice of poems and children’s literature for Scottish subjects reflects such attitude of his toward Scotland as well as the distance between him and Scotland.

Having thus addressed the significance of Scotland in Lang’s works, the importance of London must be repeated. It was in the rapidly changing, or ‘progressing’ metropolis with its vigorous publishing market that Lang incessantly produced books, and his five original fairytales reflect his response to a contemporary world which was becoming rapidly modernised: which suggest that he was undeniably

fascinated by the metropolis, though generally viewed it satirically. These tales, at the same time, reveal his continuous oscillation between the two topographies. Only one of his five original fairytales (*Fairnilee*) is set in Scotland, while the other four tales were deeply inspired by contemporary London even though they are set in fictional countries. They are written under the strong influence of William Thackeray: another novelist whom Lang had highly respected from his childhood. Lang therefore created two entirely different kinds of fairylands: one is a subterranean, deadly, and perilous one shaped by traditional Scottish fairy belief, under the influence of Scott; the other is gay, burlesque, and rural one modelled after Thackeray's *Rose*, the kind of fairyland which enjoyed popularity in Victorian London.

These five fairytales thus uncover two contentious aspects of his identity (Lang as a Scot, and Lang as a Victorian Briton, as represented by his admiration of both Scott and Thackeray) and oscillation between the two topographies of Scotland and London. At the same time, all of them contain elements of *both* sides. The images of commodity culture and the urban landscape of Victorian London recur in all five fairytales, and in all of them except for *Princess*, Lang consistently deploys Scottish landscape, fairy belief, history, language, and culture. For example, Prince Ricardo fishes for salmon in the river in Pantouflia, though the country is set in middle Europe, a castle in *Fairy Court* is described as being 'as big as Arthur's Seat [in Edinburgh]' (*Fairy Court* 90), some characters are dressed in tartan ('Well, you [Prigio] look very fine in the uniform of a colonel of the Scottish Guard—green, white, and red!' [*Fairy Court* 111]), and Scottish royal figures such as James VI and Charles Edward Stuart appear in the stories as characters: 'Then [Prigio] took the falcon on his wrist, and set the fairy timepiece to 1586—Reign of James VI. [...] These manners amazed Prigio,

but now he was quite certain that he was in Scotland, and that the young man with the falcon was James VI' (*Fairy Court* 143-44); 'I [Prince Ricardo] just take my seven-league boots, run over to Rome, pick up Prince Charles, put him on the magic carpet, fly to London, [...] set him down on the throne of his fathers' (*Ricardo* 115). Even *Princess*, which ostensibly appears to be the least Scottish tale, is strikingly connected to Scotland by Lang's dedicatory poem, which is one of the few examples in which he addresses Scottish readers: 'To all you babes at Branxholm Park, / This book I dedicate'; 'When weary winter comes, and hark! / The Teviot roars in "spate"; / When half you think you'll need the Ark, [...] Think of the Prince and of his mate' ('To All You Babes at Branxholm Park' v). These features suggest that they are in fact Lang's attempts to negotiate the contradiction within himself, as represented by the marriage of Scottish Randal and English Jeanie in *Fairnilee*.

Lang claims that his creation of *Fairnilee* was also directly promoted by a publisher: in a letter to Stevenson written on the 27 November 1887, Lang writes, 'I'm doing a very silly thing—a Child's Romance, "Randall & Jean". I can neither write romance, nor for children, but a publisher *tempted* me' ('Letter to R. L. Stevenson: 27 November 1887' 111 my emphasis). Although Lang here pretends to be reluctant and indifferent to writing for children, the number of his books for children, together with his prefaces addressing child readers in an affectionate tone, reveals how enthusiastic he actually was in writing and editing for children.

Although Lang did not begin to write for children until in his forties, he proved as prolific in the new genre as he had been in all others: writing five original stories as well as editing a number of collections of stories. Fairies and fairy-tales served as the central subjects of his writing for children. All of his original pieces are concerned

with fairies: *Princess*, the first work by Lang for children, is a story written after Doyle's fairy illustrations, comprises a romantic adventure of an ugly prince (Prince Comical) in search of a lost princess ('Princess Niente', meaning 'Princess Nobody') who finally defeats the 'Yellow Dwarf' who kidnapped Niente, marries her and is transformed into a fine prince with the help of his insect friends and the fairy godmother of the princess. Likewise, the 'Chronicles of Pantouflia', three stories (*Prigio*, *Ricardo*, and *Fairy Court*) set in a country called 'Pantouflia', with Prigio and his son Ricardo as the central characters, are also 'rich in romantic adventure' (*Preface to Lilac* vi) with fairy godmothers, fairy gifts, and hostile giants. Written in a burlesque, comic, and often ironical tone influenced by Thackeray, these four stories follow the conventions of Victorian fairytales first set by Edgar Taylor's translation of Grimm's fairytales, sharing with the latter the characteristics of readability, moral didacticism, and the eradication of cruelty (Shacker 13-45). *Fairnilee* is also a story about fairies, but it is an entirely different kind of fairytale. Written in a style influenced by Scott's historical novels, it creates a dark and deadly fairyland with perilous fairies, underpinned by traditional Scottish fairy beliefs. A large proportion of Lang's collections of stories were of fairytales (the 'Fairy Books') with few exceptions, such as: *The Nursery Rhyme Book*, a collection of nursery rhymes, and *The Animal Story Book*, a compilation of both fictional and non-fictional stories about animals. While almost all of his books for children published by Longmans were illustrated by Henry J. Ford, Richard Doyle was a significant artist for Lang, even though he belonged an earlier generation: Lang often wrote texts *accompanying* his illustrations (*Princess* and the poem 'Beauty and the Beast'). Doyle's birth from Irish parents might have helped nurture a cultural affinity for him in Lang, but it is more likely that he was attracted to Doyle's method of fairy

illustration, while the fact that Doyle had also worked with his favourite authors such as Thackeray and Dickens constitutes another probable reason. Lang's interpretation of Doyle's depiction of fairyland in *Princess* is, however, reductive and distorting. As this chapter explores below, he intentionally distorts grotesqueness and subversive features inherent in Doyle's illustrations, converting them to moral didacticism.

4.3 Disenchanted Fairies: *The Princess Nobody*

Doyle's thirty-four fairy illustrations for *In Fairyland*, for which Lang wrote the story of *Princess*, are not only considered as his most famous work (Trimpe 58) but as 'the greatest illustrated Victorian book of fairies', whose 'fanciful, personal, exuberant fairy world' is 'still the visual reference point for contemporary images of fairies' (Susina, "Like the Fragments of Coloured Glass in a Kaleidoscope" 101). Doyle's fairyland seems to lie not in a wilderness, but in a field, hidden by green grasses with very small fairies, which tend to be depicted as childlike or feminine, with wings resembling those of birds and insects, and large ears. Among the trees, mushrooms, birds and insects such as butterflies and snails, fairies indulge in dancing, flying, sleeping, and playing tricks on these small animals, creating a world of what Bown calls 'escapist fantasy' (Bown 1).

It should be noted, however, that Doyle's depiction of fairyland is not a utopia detached from reality. It actually is a miniature negative image of that reality, containing certain elements of political implication and grotesqueness. The fairies in the illustration form a 'court', a society with monarchy and hierarchy. The costumes of the fairies indicate their class, power, and wealth; some fairies wear crowns which indicate their nobility, while others wear red caps, so can be identified as 'common

fairies'. There are also representations of malice and violence: some expressions and behaviours of the fairies appear to be unequivocally wicked, as Carol Silver points out:

Fairy sadism [...] is repeatedly depicted in Victorian painting. Richard (Dicky) Doyle's chubby, charming little elves, with their penchant for mischief, are, on closer examination, revealed as compassionless and cruel. [...] One elf savagely kicks a beetle, another beats his snail on the horns to persuade it to move, a third, mature elf raises his fist to strike the bird on which he rides. (157-58)

Although ostensibly there do not seem to be any fairies representing poverty in Doyle's illustration, it is possible to interpret the tortured animals and insects (which are even denied to share human likenesses with the fairies) as representative of the lower classes. The fairies often steal eggs from birds, rides on a snail, or torture an insect, representing violence and robbery carried out by upper classes.

As has already been mentioned, Lang was required to write a story which would accompany these fairy illustrations. Lang often divides Doyle's large panoramic and spectacular illustration into smaller fragments, and thereby constructs a chronological narrative; for instance, a story of Prince Comical. Prince Comical saves Princess *Niente*, meaning 'Princess Nobody' from an ugly Dwarf who claims that he has the right to have the Princess because he granted the King's wish to have a baby (i.e. Princess Nobody). During his adventure, Prince Comical was helped by Black Beetle, Daddy Long Legs and the fairy godmother of the Princess.

Lang seems to have liked and respected Doyle's illustrations, as he modestly writes in the dedication poem placed at the beginning of *Princess*: 'ne'er I'll match the

drawings great— / The works of DICKY DOYLE!'; 'please, don't say I desecrate / The works of DICKY DOYLE!' ('To All You Babes at Branhholm Park' v). There are, however, discordance and contradiction between his text and Doyle's illustrations in *Princess*, as pointed out by Susina:

But neither the poem [by Allingham] or the fairy tale [*Princess*], do justice to these [Doyle's] spectacular images. Considerable tension remains between the text and illustration, with the prose detracting from rather than adding to the illustrations. Doyle's illustrations stand alone as a powerful visual statement that resists verbal attempts to control them or render them into a coherent narrative. ("Like the Fragments of Coloured Glass in a Kaleidoscope" 101)

The formidable gap between Lang's fairyland and Doyles is caused by the very difference in their ideas about how fairies should be represented. The 'tension' and 'split' between the text and image call for the examination of Lang's own views on fairies. For example, although all the fairies in Doyle's illustrations appear to be of the same species, Lang names one of them as 'a Dwarf', suggesting that such a figure was indispensable in his construction of a fairytale. Likewise, there are apparently no human beings in Doyle's illustrations—all the human-like characters are as tiny as snails, and some of them have wings. Lang, however, rather forcibly interprets female fairies as the 'Princess Nobody', even though there is a crucial contradiction in that, because the illustrated figures were winged. He also creates a 'fairy godmother', although there is no motherly figure in Doyle's illustrations. In doing so, Lang divides the characters into two dichotomous groups of good and evil, and applies basic formulations from traditional fairytale to his own narrative: a didactic narrative

concluded by a happy ending, in which characters of honesty, kindness, diligence and wisdom are rewarded after going through a series of trials and errors. At the same time, Lang converts the everlasting violence and cruelty pervasive in Doyle's fairies to the sole deed of the wicked Dwarf, who is annihilated by Prince Comical, or of the stupid princes, who receive punishments for that afterwards. In short, Lang entirely softens and appropriates the cruel elements of Doyle's fairyland, disarming the dangerous fairies into harmless creatures.

A most significant sense evoked by *Princess* is the sense of loss, absence, and disappearance of fairies. As the name of the Princess is 'nobody', Prince Comical literally seeks 'nobody'. When he finds her, he breaks a taboo that 'Princess Nobody' must not be called by her true name. As a result, 'Princess Nobody' disappears, suggesting that Prince Comical can only be united with 'Nobody', never allowed to do so with a 'Somebody'.

Underlying Lang's deployment of 'nobody' is a persistent elegiac tone. While he starts the tale by a conventional formula of 'Once upon a time', he quickly foregrounds the disappearance of the fairies in his own time: 'Once upon a time, when Fairies were much more common than they are now, there lived a King and Queen' (*Princess* 1).

'Fairy godmothers', together with the 'fairy gifts' which they give the human godchildren, are popular motifs used in the 'literary fairy tale' of the Victorian period. *Fairy Gifts or a Wallet of Wonders* (1875) by Kathleen Knox, for example, comprises five short stories with girl protagonists who are all given a fairy gift from their common godmother: Fairy Rubinetta. As the illustrations of the 'fairy godmothers' in these tales reveal, they were often illustrated as caring old women, slightly shorter than the

female protagonists, wearing pointed hats, eyeglasses, cloaks, and even blooms: apparently represented as closer to witches than fairies.⁸⁶ Lang obviously follows such a convention in his original fairytales by employing a fairy godmother in *Princess* and so many fairy gifts in *Fairy Court*, although he adds an ironical twist resembling Thackeray's method, with too many fairy gifts, and not too caring a fairy godmother.

4.4 A 'Real' Fairytale: *The Gold of Fairnilee* (1888)

Published six years after the appearance of the 'Modern Fairy Tale', *The Gold of Fairnilee* seems to be an experimental work where Lang puts his ideals into practice. The fairies and fairyland of *Fairnilee* correspond to his idea of the 'genuine' described in 'Modern Fairy Tale', in contrast to the stereotypical versions of the period. In a letter to R. L. Stevenson written on 27th November 1887, Lang describes *Fairnilee* as follows: 'It's just after Flodden—the boy goes into the *real* old Fairy Land,—not an Oberon & Titania affair, but where True Thomas went, Hell, in fact' ('Letter to R. L. Stevenson: 27 November 1887' 111 my emphasis). Here Lang affirms that the fairyland in the story is actually a hell, and at the same time reveals his cynical attitude toward the abusive use of fairies from *A Midsummer Nights' Dream* in fairy representations.

Fairnilee is by far Lang's most exceptional and important work, resulting from his strategic writing of 'Scotland' within its imaginative world. It is also an outstandingly unusual Victorian fairytale. Lang employs the history, landscape, language, and ballads of the Borders district for the key components of the story, together with allusions to Scott, whom Lang admired and respected throughout his writing life. In so doing, he rewrites the past of the Borders, and reconstructs the

relationship between Scotland and England, together with their ‘union’: obviously in an attempt to negotiate contradictions and conflicts resulting from the Union of the Crowns. The tale explores how Randal, a Scottish boy and son of a ‘laird’ (*landlord*), is taken away by a Fairy Queen, and is eventually saved by Jean, an English girl who was brought up by Randal’s family. The plot, together with the characterisation of the female central character, clearly echoes ‘Tamlane’, a ballad in which Janet saves her lover from the Fairy Queen, as well as Scott’s *The Heart of Midlothian* (1818), in which Jeanie pleads Queen Caroline in order to rescue her sister from the prison.⁸⁷

Unlike the other four stories, the topography of *Fairnilee* is set in an actual place in the Scottish Borders of the past: Fairnilee, at the time of the Battle of Flodden (1513). ‘Fairnilee’, meaning ‘the Fairies’ Field’ (*Fairnilee* 15), is the place where Lang used to love to play in his childhood (Green 6). The Eildon Hills also appear in this tale as the location where the fairy gold is hidden. Lang clearly connects the story with personal memories of the Borders district which were shaped both orally (by ballads) and in literary terms (by Scott), as well as by his memory of treasure hunt with his brother in his childhood as the ‘Dedication’ placed at the beginning of its original edition (1888) indicates: ⁸⁸

Dedication

To Jeanie Lang, Lappa,

Dear Jeanie,

For you, far away on the other side of the world, I made this little tale
of our own country.

Your father and I have dug for treasure in the Camp at Rink, with our
knives, when we were boys.

We did not find it: the story will tell you why.

Are there Fairies as well as Bunyips in Australia? I hope so.

(*Fairnilee* [1888 ed])

As a result, an entirely different fairytale from other Victorian ones, or even from Lang's own, is created, with wholly different representations of fairies and fairyland. Alluding to Scottish legends and fairy beliefs, the supernatural phenomena and fairies in *Fairnilee* differ from those in other stories. Instead of eccentric but good-willed fairy godmothers and the tiny and mischievous fairies deployed in other tales, it employs Scottish traditional fairies: dangerous, heathen, and deadly fairies, such as the fearful, tall and wingless Fairy Queen who would imprison Christian knights, and devilish changelings: 'there she [Tibby Dickson] saw an awful sight—not her own bairn [*child*], but a withered imp, with hands like a mole's, and a face like a frog's, and a mouth from ear to ear, and two great staring eyes' (*Fairnilee* 30-31). Unlike the bright, fantastical and humorous fairylands of the other four stories, the fairy realm in *Fairnilee* is a dark subterranean place with shadows of death and paganism. Lang also represents magic power differently. While Prince Prigio and Prince Ricardo use magical objects given by fairies, such as 'the magic spy-glass' (*Prigio* 32) and 'the magic crystal' (*Ricardo* 83) with which they see distant places, Randal in *Fairnilee* uses the supernatural power of second sight for the same purpose, which is a supernatural phenomenon traditionally associated with Scotland. More significantly, it is mentioned in Kirk's *The Secret Commonwealth*, as Lang describes in his definition of the term in the eleventh edition of *Encyclopædia Britannica*:

Though we hear most of the second sight among the Celts of the Scottish Highlands (it is much less familiar to the Celts of Ireland),

this species of involuntary prophetic vision, whether direct or symbolical, is peculiar to no people. [...] The literature of second sight is not insignificant. [*The Secret Commonwealth*] of the Rev. Mr Kirk (1691), edited by Sir Walter Scott in 1815 (a hundred copies), and by Andrew Lang in 1893, is in line with cases given in ‘Trials for Witchcraft’ (cf. Dalyell’s *Darker Superstitions of Scotland*, and Wodrow’s *Analecta*). (‘Second Sight’)

On the night of the fourth of September, in the year 1513, the day of the battle of Flodden, Randal sees his father dead in battle by his second sight:

One evening Randal looked up suddenly from his play. It was growing dark. [...] [Randal] looked up, and there was his own father! He was riding all alone [...]. The spear in his father’s hand was broken, and he had no sword; and he looked neither right nor to left. His eyes were wide open, but he seemed to see nothing. [...] [Randal’s father] did not look as if he heard [Randal], or knew he was there, and suddenly he seemed to go away, Randal did not know how or where. (*Fairnilee* 18)

If Lang’s other four stories are written in a Thackerian style—burlesque, ironic and moralistic to some extent—the tone of the narrative of *Fairnilee* is closer to that of Scott’s historical novels. Significantly, the story ends with his very name: ‘As for Randal and Jean, they lived to be old, [...] and the Tweed goes murmuring past their grave, and past the grave of Sir Walter Scott’ (*Fairnilee* 64). As the blood relationships between the characters in the *Rose* and ‘Chronicles of Pantouflia’ connect Lang’s story with Thackeray’s, so does the river Tweed in *Fairnilee* link Randal and

Jean, the central characters, with Walter Scott.

The Battle of Flodden serves as a key-constituent event of the text. Although the actual battlefield is far away from Fairnilee, the main stage of the story, the battle haunts the text, affecting the fate of the individual characters. The story starts from the eve of the Battle, in which Randall's father is killed; Randall has a prophetic vision of his father's death. The story is framed by the imagery of death, blood, and national conflict:

Randall remembered his father's going to fight the English, and how he came back again. [...] The mist looked like armies of ghosts, [Randall] thought, marching, marching through the pines [...]. [Randall's father] had a helmet on his head, and a great axe hanging from his neck by a chain, and a spear in his hand. [...] Then the sky turned as red as blood, in the sunset, and next it grew brown, like the rust on a sword [...]. (*Fairnilee* 17)

These characteristics corroborate that Lang wrote the story by using the model of Scott's historical novels, such as *The Heart of Midlothian*, in which the fate of fictional characters interacts with historical events. The tension between the two nations is present in the text of *Fairnilee* as well, though in a different scale and style. In *Fairnilee*, it is represented on two historically attested levels: the Battle of Flodden, which is a historical and 'official' conflict between the two nations, and the more common, local and mundane incidents of cattle stealing. The descriptions of the English and the Scottish stealing each other's cattle in turn, and of the Scots burning houses in England out of revenge, seem to be based on historical incidents in the locality.

One night Randal was awoken by a great noise of shouting; he looked out of the window, and saw bright torches moving about. [...] He thought the English had come. So they had; not the English army, but some robbers from the other side of the Borders. At that time the people on the south side of Scotland and the north side of England used to steal each other's cows time about. When a Scottish squire, or 'laird', like Randal's father, had been robbed by the neighbouring English, he would wait his chance and drive away cattle from the English side. (*Fairnilee* 21)

It should be noted that here Lang adopts a relatively neutral and dispassionate attitude. Without being patriotically partial to the Scottish side by glorification and exoneration, he let both sides commit thefts: the Scottish and the English steal each other's cattle. Instead of creating a binary opposition of good and evil, Lang's attitude is detached and balanced. The incident whereby the Scottish people, though accidentally, kidnap Jean from the English village, subtly echoes and reverses the imagery of Mary, Queen of the Scots, who was taken to England. While Mary, the Scottish queen, was 'abducted' by the English government, Jean, the English girl, is taken to Scotland, and by her marriage to Randall, is likely to stay there until her death. Although there is a striking difference in that Jean was treated as a member of the family, the motif of the kidnap of a woman who is never allowed to return home can be found in the two incidents. Considering that Mary traditionally serves as an icon of Scottish nationalism, conveying the image of Scotland as exemplar of a 'tragic' fate and England as perpetrator of 'cruelty' and 'violence', Lang's creation of a reverse image suggests that he does not intend to have recourse to such 'iconic' and symbolic oppositions.

Furthermore, Lang does not end the story with the triumph of Scotland and defeat of England, or vice versa, but reconciles the conflict by the marriage of Randall and Jean, who are in true love with each other. His creation of the character Jean, which echoes Scott's Jeanie, is indeed significant: as Gifford argues, Jeanie represents integrity. Being 'the one person', who achieves 'balance, integration and peace', she converts 'villains and enemies into helpful friends or harmless opponents' and shows 'from where will come a Scottish and British regeneration' (Gifford, 'Myth, Parody and Dissociation' 223). Lang's Jean also brings peace and integration. She restores peace and wealth, and converts the English (herself) from an 'enemy' to a 'wife'. Both Jeanie and Jean liberate the central character (Effie and Randal) from imprisonment by a 'Queen': while Queen Caroline represents England, the deadly Fairy Queen possibly represents Scotland, as well as its history and nationalism, both of which are depicted here as having an effect of imprisonment upon the Scottish people.

The tension between England and Scotland haunts the level of the language in the text as well, surfacing as the coexistence of the two languages in the text: Standard English and Lowland Scots. For example, old Simon Grieve, one of the servants, speaks in Scots: 'Yon [*that*] bairn [*child*] will be a bonny [*excellent*] mate for you, Maister [*master*] Randal. [...] 'Deed [*indeed*], I dinna [*don't*] think her kin will come speering after her at Fairnilee' (*Fairnilee* 23). Treatment of the two languages in nineteenth-century Scottish literature has been one of central issues discussed by critics. It involves the problem of where—between the two languages and nations—the authors should place themselves, as well as how they should represent Scotland. At the same time, it can serve as an artistically effective device to dramatise conflict and division within characters' inner selves (Letley xi). As Emma Letley argues, Scots is often

associated with ideas of childhood, homeland, and friendship, as well as exoticism, the sense of which is increased when no translation is provided (xi). Standard English, on the other hand, is linked with ‘an overlay of an alien culture’, schooling, intellectual ability, and repression of natural feelings (Letley xi). The two languages are often deployed to ‘mark social distinctions’, with Scots spoken by ‘lower class characters’ (Letley 283).

Lang indeed employs Scots to mark social distinctions. It is servants such as the nurse and Simon who speak in the Scots language, while Lady Ker and Randal, Scottish characters from the ‘upper’ class, speak in Standard English with very few Scots words. At the same time, the depiction of the Scottish upper class as speakers of Standard English inevitably foregrounds duality and ambiguity within their own cultural, and therefore national, identity: which Lang, from the Scottish middle class, would also have experienced.

The narrator’s seemingly neutral position, possibly reflecting Lang’s, may reflect the ambiguous identity of Lang. It basically chooses to narrate in Standard English, eradicating Scots from the narrative: ‘What she [the old nurse] said we will put in English, not Scotch as she spoke it’ (*Fairnilee* 30), seemingly distancing itself from the Scottish side. However, characters’ words uttered in Scots are sometimes quoted in Scots or translated. Considering that Scott’s narrators do not provide translations of Scots words in the texts, Lang’s narrator is more conscious of his English readers, and more eager to make Scots accessible by providing translations for some phrases. At the same time, by *not* providing a translation for other phrases, Lang’s narrator distances the narrative from the English side, rendering the narrative relatively foreign. While such an inconsistent distance between the narrator and the two languages reveals

Lang's contradictory identity, it also represents a dilemma shared by many Scottish authors, including Scott and Stevenson, as to how they should treat Scots in their writing.

In *Fairnilee* Lang creates a scene of the old nurse's tale-telling by the fireside, a scene closely associated with childhood recollection and oral tradition. She relates stories about fairies and their treasures, including taboos in dealing with them, to the children by the fireside: 'Then [Randal and Jean] sat by the nursery fire; and those were almost the pleasantest hours, for the old nurse would tell them old Scotch stories of elves and fairies, and sing them old songs'; 'Other stories the old nurse had, about hidden treasures and buried gold'; "'But they do not like to be called fairies. [...] So you must always call them 'good neighbours' or 'good folk', when you speak of them'" (*Fairnilee* 30).

As in 'Thomas the Rhymer', Randal returns from Fairyland seven years after his disappearance. Lang, however, adds a new twist to the incident. Interestingly, it is Jean who saves Randal from imprisonment in the Scottish Fairyland: 'her goodness and her courage had saved him, for he was a christened knight, and not a man of the fairy world. And he had taken his own form again beneath her hand, when she signed with the Cross, and here he was, safe and happy, at home at Fairnilee' (*Fairnilee* 52). The picture of a Scottish man saved by an English woman, and of the happy union of them, suggests Lang's attitude toward the relationships between Scotland and England which was perhaps a desire for reconciliation. Moreover, by depicting Scottish as masculine, and English as feminine, Lang reversed the traditional 'gender' identities of the two nations. The story ends happily, Randal and Jean are married, and with the help of the fairy gift and wisdom of the nurse, they discover the hidden gold—which

restores peace in Fairnilee.

The narrator, however, does not place Randal and Jean's marriage at the end of its narrative. After the description of the happy union, it jumps three hundred years later, and returns from past to present (sometime in the nineteenth century after Walter Scott's death). In so doing, the narrator emphasises the sense of death, loss, and absence, which in fact saturates multiple layers of the text: the story starts with Randal's father's death, and the Fairy Queen and her Fairies are associated with death. Even the happiest ones such as Randal and Jean have to die before the narrator ends the narrative. By such deployment of death in the text, the narrator foregrounds the sense of loss, which it declares at the beginning of the story: 'So there is nothing but emptiness in the old house where Randal lived with Jean, three hundred and sixty years or so before you were born' (*Fairnilee* 15). In addition, it repeatedly refers to the absence of fairies and fairy beliefs in his present time: '[P]eople believed in fairies, as you shall hear, when Randall was a boy, and even when my father was a boy' (*Fairnilee* 15), 'It is a pity there are no such bogles now!' (*Fairnilee* 27-28); making a striking contrast to their lively existences in the past: "'Everybody knows there's fairies'", said the old nurse' (*Fairnilee* 30). Such narrative acts of the narrator seem to reflect Lang's view of modernity as emptiness, with a shadow of death, and deprived of the belief in fairies and all that it represents.

4.5 Fairy Gifts and Commodity Culture:

'Chronicles of Pantouflia' and *The Rose and the Ring*

'Chronicles of Pantouflia', the three stories *Prince Prigio*, *Prince Ricardo*, and *Tales of a Fairy Court*, are set in a fictional country called 'Pantouflia' with central

characters such as Prince Prigio and his son Ricardo. In *Prigio*, the protagonist Prince Prigio is given ‘too much cleverness’ by a fairy on his birth, while other fairies give him a wide variety of fairy gifts created in fairytales deriving from various different cultures. The fairy gift—excess of cleverness—turns out to be harmful to the prince, rather than being beneficial, because it disgusts other people, including his own father, to the extent he is hated by everyone except his mother. Because of his ‘cleverness’, Prigio does not believe in fairies or monsters, and therefore, when his country is threatened by a monster, he does not set out to defeat it simply because he does not believe in its existence. However, such an unbelieving and ‘un-princelike’ prince comes to be a proper one, by falling in love with a princess, learning to believe in fairies, and going through adventures, and finally becomes accomplished enough to be the future king.

Ricardo follows *Prigio*’s pattern of setting and development. Ricardo, the son of Prigio, is also an anti-hero, who is engrossed in romantic adventures with the help of a number of fairy gifts. He appears to be a brave and romantic hero, saving countless princesses and killing countless monsters, but it is soon disclosed that he is actually far from being respectable. He in fact depends on his powerful fairy gifts, which make his tasks extremely easy, and therefore he cannot win any success without them. Making a striking contrast to Prigio who reads too much to believe in fairies, Ricardo despises reading and indulges in magical adventures. As the story develops, contrary to Prigio, Ricardo learns to recognise the importance of knowledge and learning, and acquires the power to defeat monsters without the aid of the fairy’s gifts. These two tales convey Lang’s moralistic message to take the path between fantasy and reality, between dreaming and learning. Lang also satirises one aspect of commodity culture by depicting human beings who lose their competence as a result of their reliance upon

materials, as well as a child spoiled by gifts: this overlaps with ‘Little Georgy’ of *Vanity Fair*, who is pampered by ‘adult, inappropriate, and corrupting presents’ such as Jane Osborne’s gold watch (Hardy 106).

Fairy Court comprises additional episodes to *Prigio* and *Ricardo*, with the same central characters. It is the least attractive story among the five fairytales by Lang, for the princes are already fully developed at the beginning of the story, and therefore are psychologically uninteresting characters. There are, however, two points which are remarkable in the story: ‘The Fairy Timepiece’ which functions as a time-machine,⁸⁹ and the motif of the disenchantment of giants as explored later.

Far from hiding his indebtedness in order to emphasise his originality, Lang rather seems to want Thackeray’s influence on him to be noticed, by overtly declaring that his stories are sequels to the *Rose*. ‘Pantouflia’ echoes Thackeray’s ‘Panflagonia’ in the *Rose*, and the central character Prigio (hence, his son Ricardo as well) is presented as the descendant of Giglio in the *Rose*, reinforcing the intertextuality between the two works: ‘The royal family of Pantouflia had long been on the best terms with the fairies, for they were descended from the celebrated Queen Cinderella, the ancestress of King Giglio, whose history is told in a book called “The Rose and the Ring”’ (*Fairy Court* 86). Where he mentions Giglio in *Prigio*, he even draws attention to it by a footnote: ‘The history of this prince [Giglio] may be read in a treatise called *The Rose and the Ring*, by W. M. Thackeray’ (*Prigio* 52). Written in a comic and ironic tone, starting with entirely conventional fairy gift on the prince’s birth which subjects him to an ordeal (‘a little misfortune’ [the *Rose*] which literally plunges Giglio into a great misfortune of losing their parents and kingdom; ‘too much cleverness’ [*Prigio*] which

renders Prigio an overwhelmingly unpleasant figure, disliked by his people), and ending happily with the marriage of the prince and the a suitable princess, Lang obviously borrows basic setting, devices, and development from the *Rose*.

The Rose was one of Lang's favourite books throughout his life from childhood.⁹⁰ He reiterated favourable comments on it: 'the best of modern nursery novels—that untiring favourite, *The Rose and the Ring*' [Introduction to *Red* xiv]; 'This book [the *Rose*] he [Lang] thinks quite indispensable in every child's library, and parents should be urged to purchase it at the first opportunity, as without it no education is complete' (*Preface to Yellow* xi). Written in a burlesque and cynical tone, it is a romantic comedy with two princes, two princesses, Fairy Blackstick, and her fairy gifts: the rose, the ring, and two 'little misfortunes'. Prince Giglio and Princess Rosalba, two authentic successors to the thrones in two countries (Panflagonia and Cream Tartary), are both given 'a little misfortune' from Fairy Blackstick on their birth.⁹¹ Separated from their parents, they are deprived of their kingdoms by their uncles and cousin. The story depicts the process by which these two heirs grow up, and finally have their thrones restored as well as finding their true lovers.

The *Rose* is not a work frequently discussed by critics, probably because it was written for children. Juliet McMaster, however, argues that it shares typical 'Thackerayan concerns' with human beings as 'ordinary', with 'their pretensions and eccentricities', and depicts the world in the same way as his realistic novels (such as *Vanity Fair*), with devices of style and structure common to other works by him (165). In fact, in spite of being a 'fairytale', it is not an escapist fantasy, but is underpinned by a strong sense of realism. Although ostensibly it is light, comic and sarcastic, the story in fact conveys a moralistic message: the two princes finally acquire the power

necessary to restore their thrones not by totally relying upon the magical power of the fairy gifts, but from their own good nature, effort and wisdom. This suggests that Thackeray was directing his readers toward practical strategies necessary to cope with real situations. Furthermore, Thackeray, with *Vanity Fair*, is considered as a representative figure who was motivated by ‘a penetrating anxiety’ that mid-Victorian novelists’ ‘social and moral world was being reduced to a warehouse of goods and commodities’ (Miller 6). The same anxiety can be discovered in the *Rose*, where Thackeray creates a dramatic scene of objectification in which the Fairy Blackstick transforms Gruffanuff to a brass door knocker:

[A]s the Fairy waved her wand over him [Gruffanuff], he felt himself rising off the ground, and fluttering up against the door, and then, as if a screw ran into his stomach, he felt a dreadful pain there, and was pinned to the door [...]. He *was* turned into metal! He was, from being *brazen, brass!* He was neither more nor less than a knocker! And there he was, nailed to the door in the blazing summer day, till her burned almost red-hot; and there he was, nailed to the door all the bitter winter nights, till his brass nose was dropping with icicles. [...] As for his wife, she did not miss him [...]. (*Rose* 233-34, the author’s emphasis)

Andrew H. Miller argues that in the last image of *Vanity Fair*, the characters ‘retreat into materiality’ (49)—from human characters into puppets. A similar dramatisation of objectification occurs in the *Rose* as quoted here. Strikingly, in *Fairy Court*, Lang creates a similar event in which Hexenhausen’s wife is objectified into a weathercock, obviously a variant of Thackeray’s door knocker:

‘She [Hexenhausen’s wife] is not *dead*, said Hexenhausen. ‘But how changed! [...]’ [...] ‘In yonder glittering weathercock who but a husband could recognise his once beautiful and tender, and still beloved, *wife*? [...] [T]he enchanter [...] turned my dear wife into the weathercock on the top of the steeple, because she would not listen to his prayers and desert me for him. [...] There she is’ (he waved his hand towards the now distant steeple) ‘and here am I!’ (*Fairy Court* 125, the author’s emphasis)

This example reveals that what Lang appreciated in Thackeray’s writing, and wished to model his own after, is his satirical representation of reality in a romantic fairytale to reveal anxiety caused by the commodity culture of the modern world. Lang even intensifies this sense of anxiety of objectification by employing, an often excessive amount of, fairy gifts.

The indirect influence of the *Rose* can be found in other stories as well, even in *Fairnilee*, which is completely different in setting, narrative, and its type of fairies. The fairy bottle in the tale in fact is a variant of the fairies’ gifts in Thackeray’s tale, which create illusion and disillusion. In the *Rose*, if someone wears the fairy ring or carries the fairy rose, it makes him/her beautiful, attractive, and loved by all the people of the opposite sex. However, if he/she takes of the ring, or ceases to carry the rose with them, the illusion is broken:

[Countess Gruffanuff] spied something glittering [the fairy ring] on the pavement, and bade the boy [...] to go and pick up the article shining yonder. He was an ugly little wretch, [...] and yet, when he had taken up the ring [...] and was carrying it to his mistress, she thought

he looked like a little Cupid. He gave the ring to her; [...] so she put it in her pocket. ‘O mum!’ says the boy, looking at her, ‘how—how beyoutiful [sic] you do look, mum, to-day, mum!’ ‘And you too, Jacky’, she was going to say; but, looking down at him—no, he was no longer good-looking at all—but only the carrotty-haired little Jacky of the morning. (*Rose* 257-59)

This scene, in which the fairy’s ring is transferred from Jacky and Countess Gruffanuff, offers a comic depiction. Fairy objects in *Fairnilee* have similar functions related to illusion: the surface of the Wishing Well, which deceptively shows such beautiful illusions, and the fairy’s bottle, which has a power to break them:

[Randal] had gone to the Wishing Well, and wished to see the Fairy Queen and Fairyland. And he had seen the beautiful castle in the well, and a beautiful woman’s face had floated up to meet his on the water. [...] [Randal and the Fairy Queen] came into the light, and into the beautiful garden that lies round the castle of the Fairy Queen. There they lived in a noble company of gallant knights and fair ladies. All seemed very mirthful, and they rode, and hunted, and danced; and it was never dark night, nor broad daylight, but like early summer dawn before the sun has risen. (*Fairnilee* 50)

Randall, however, finds a fairy’s bottle which contains the water that has the power to destroy the false illusion, in this case, the ‘glamour’ (*Fairnilee* 51)—a Scots word meaning ‘magic, enchantment, witchcraft’—in Fairyland. Disenchanted Randall’s eyes, the bottle reveals the truth:

‘That ugly bottle looked like gold and diamonds when I found it in

Fairyland', said Randal, 'and the water in it smelled as sweet as roses. But when I touched my eyes with it, a drop that ran into my mouth was as salt as the sea, and immediately everything changed: the gold bottle became this glass thing, and the fairies became like folk dead, and the sky grew grey, and all turned waste and ugly.' (*Fairnilee* 54-55)

In spite of such similarities between the function of the fairy objects, there is a significant difference between the two texts. While the result of the disillusion is described comically in the *Rose*, it has a horrifying effect in the *Fairnilee*, with the revealed reality represented as a dystopian, heathen, and deadly world, populated by fairies who have 'hollow faces and unhappy eyes' (*Fairnilee* 51):

And when Randal touched his eyes with it, lo, everything was changed in a moment. [...] The Fairy Queen, that had seemed so happy and beautiful in her bright dress, was a weary, pale woman in black, with a melancholy face and melancholy eyes. She looked as if she had been there for thousands of years, always longing for the sunlight and the earth, and the wind and rain. There were sleepy poppies twisted in her hair, instead of a golden crown. [The knights and ladies] looked but half alive; and some, in place of their gay green robes, were dressed in rusty mail, pierced with spears and stained with blood. [...] their festivals were not of dainty meats, but of cold, tasteless flesh, and of beans, and pulse, and such things as the old heathens, before the coming of the Gospel, used to offer to the dead. (*Fairnilee* 50-51)

In ‘Chronicles of Pantouflia’, Lang creates a comic effect by his intentional overuse of fairy gifts. While the *Rose* deploys only two of them (the rose and the ring), ‘Chronicles of Pantouflia’ comprises a variety of fairy gifts from fairytales from all over the world, ranging from Aladdin’s magical carpet, the cap of darkness which makes the wearer invisible, the winged shoes of swiftness, the wishing-cap, the sword of sharpness, to the Fairy Timepiece which functions as a time-machine. Significantly, all the gifts are parcelled and labelled, often with advertising phrases, thus intensifying the aspect of commoditisation:

There they [the fairies’ christening presents] lay, scattered about, and Prigio picked up one of the parcels and looked at it. IT was addressed—

To His Royal Highness,

Princes Prigio.

The Shoes of Swiftness.

With the best wishes of the

Fairy Fastfoot.

[...] Then there were two bottles marked, ‘Why Die? Drink the Water of Life from the Enchanted Well of Zem Zem.’ There was a lovely ivory telescope, ‘Prince Ali’s Telescope. Warranted to see at any distance, and through all obstacles.’ (*Fairy Court* 99)

The texts are thus literally crowded out by the luxury of fairy gifts, although not all of these are fully used. This excess overlaps with the impression of ‘crowdedness’ which many Victorian fairy paintings give: ‘Many of the works of Richard and Charles Doyle and of Noel Paton are every bit as crowded as W. P. Frith’s *Derby Day* [...] and

Railway Station [...] and equally teem with drama and emotion, essential components of the crowded canvas' (Maas 11). Such imagery of super-abundance that Lang shared with his contemporaries, might be considered a projection of the modern London landscape, which was rapidly changing with increased urbanisation. The textual space is filled with objects and systems of the modern world, such as toys, a dolls' house, a cheque-book, and post services, all the luxury of which Lang indulges in describing in material detail. When Grogno, Prigio's father encounters the giant, he is made to stay in a doll house of the giant's daughter:

[The giant's little girl] had a very fine and large dolls' house—the drawing-room was about as big as an ordinary bedroom. [...] 'We shall put the biggest doll's bed in the drawing-room of your dolls' house, and he will sleep there. It is a very fine and large doll's house' [...] Rather an extravagant present from an old friend—Polyphemus; [...] Silver dishes you see, in the dolls' house, and silver cups' (*Fairy Court* 91, the author's emphasis)

The 'royal cheque-book' in *Prigio* is issued from 'The Bank of Pantouflia, Falkenstein Branch', and is 'bound in red morocco, was brought in by eight pages, with ink and a pen' (*Prigio* 60-61). All the fairy presents are delivered in parcels, presumably by post, and often characters need an address to communicate with each other: 'I'd *sent* him [a colt] sooner, [...] if I had known your *address*' (*Fairy Court* 106 my emphasis). Together with the fairy objects, some that are used to overcome temporal and physical distance (the magical carpet and Fairy Timepiece), are linked to the idea of speed, transport, and travel which, although in some senses traditional fairytale *topoi*, may mirror the industrialisations and transport developments of Lang's period.

When Prigio sets the fairy watch to the 'Twentieth Century', modern time is depicted as follows:

'This is odd', said Prigio. 'I wonder what 'Twentieth Century' will be like?'

So he set the watch to Twentieth Century.

Buzz! What a noise of wheels! Faugh! what a horrid smell of petrol!

Prigio ran to the window and looked out. Motors, things he had never dreamed of, were rushing up to the palace door full of tourists in black goggles, with red Travellers' Guides in their hands. (*Fairy Court* 101)

The twentieth-century landscape depicted here is busy, noisy and crowded, full of strange objects. By increasing the number of fairy objects, and by writing additional episodes, both of which help to reveal his views of modernity, Lang seems to have deviated from Thackeray's track. It should also be noted that these descriptions unavoidably associate the story with the material world of nineteenth-century London: busy, chaotic, alive, unlike the melancholic world in *Fairnilee*, which is set in a Scotland of the past. Strikingly, Lang lets Prigio utter following words: 'Oh this will never do! [...] I have had too much of the Twentieth Century' (*Fairy Court* 102).

In spite of his modelling them after Thackeray's works, there is a striking originality in Lang's tales: comical dramatisation of the loss of fairy belief, which he sentimentally lamented elsewhere as discussed above. *Prigio* starts from a strong denial of fairy belief by the Queen, mother of Prigio:

[The Queen] did not believe in fairies: she said that they had never existed. [...] Then [the King] waited a little, and remarked: ‘The fairies, of course, you have invited? It has always been usual in our family, on an occasion like this; and I think we have neglected them a little of late.’ ‘How *can* you be so *absurd*?’ cried the Queen. ‘How often must I tell you that there are *no* fairies?’ (*Prigio* 3-4, the author’s emphasis)

Lang indeed paints a comical picture by exaggerating the Queen’s insistence on the non-existence of fairies. As the story develops, she actually encounters fairies and magical objects, though she refuses to admit it to an absurd extent:

[S]uddenly the air was filled with a sound like the rustling of the wings of birds. [...] [W]hen the Queen looked up, lo and behold! On every seat was a lovely fairy green, dressed in green, each with a *most interesting-looking parcel* in her hand. [...] But the Queen, though she saw them distinctly, took no notice of them. You see, she did not believe in fairies, nor in her own eyes, when she saw them. So she talked across the fairies to the King, just as if they had not been there;’ but the King behaved as politely as if they were *real*—which, of course, they were. (*Prigio* 5, the author’s emphasis)

Ironically, the Queen, against her will, takes a ride on the flying carpet, on which she comments as follows: ‘Nonsense! [...] a story out of the Arabian Nights is not suited for a modern public and fails to win aesthetic credence’ (*Prigio* 53). After the ride, in a shocked state, she mutters: ‘I shall waken presently; this is nothing out of the way for a dream. Dr Rumpfino ascribes it to imperfect nutrition’ (*Prigio* 51). Forming a

counterpart to the Queen, Prince Prigio is also depicted as a person who does not believe in fairies because of his ‘cleverness’: ‘[Prigio] didn’t believe in fairies, or Firedrakes, or caps of darkness, or anything nice and impossible, but only in horrid useless facts, and chemistry, and geology, and arithmetic, and mathematics, and even political economy’ (*Prigio* 67). It should be noted that knowledge and science, as represented by books, are clearly opposed to fairy beliefs: ‘I [Prigio] fancied that there was no such thing as a Firedrake: he’s not in the Natural History books; and I thought the boys were only making fun, and would be back soon, safe and sound. How horrid being too clever makes one!’ (*Prigio* 33). The establishment of such opposition suggests that Lang ostensibly dislikes ‘cleverness’. In spite of his strong attachment to books and reading, they are treated rather cynically in *Prigio*: nobody, except for the Queen and Prigio, enter the Library.

Significantly, if one reads *Prigio* as an educational novel, the greatest ‘education’ Prigio undergoes is to learn to believe in fairies. At the beginning of the story, he cannot set out to hunt for the monstrous Firedrake, who has killed his two brothers, not because of any hardships, but because of his disbelief that such a thing ever exists: ‘the Prince [Prigio], who was lying on the sofa doing sums in compound division, for fun, said in the politest way: “Thanks to the education Your Majesty ahs given me, I have learned that the Firedrake, like the siren, the fairy, and so forth, is a fabulous animal which does not exist”’ (*Prigio* 11). Once he has a ‘revelation’ that they actually exist, he defeats the monster extremely easily with the help of the fairy gifts, as well as his ‘cleverness’, which enables him to make use of them effectively:

The Prince sat down and thought and thought; [...] At last he jumped up and rushed into the library, where nobody ever went except

himself and the Queen. There he turned the books upside down, in his haste, till he found an old one [...]. In that book, Prince Prigio fancied he would find something he half remembered, and that would be of use to him. And he did! (*Prigio* 33)

Here Lang defends ‘cleverness’ and ‘knowledge’, as well as books. Such defence of knowledge and reading is repeated in *Ricardo*, where Ricardo’s laziness in reading and learning is problematised, and in contrast, Prigio’s wisdom is stressed: ‘Then [Prigio] remembered how, in an old Italian poem, he had read about all the strange lumber-room of odd things which is kept in the moon. That is the advantage of reading: *Knowledge is Power*; and you mostly get knowledge that is really worth having out of good old books which people do not usually read’ (*Ricardo* 155, the author’s emphasis).

Books in ‘Chronicles of Pantouflia’ are indeed ambivalent. While they are opposed to fairies in *Prigio*, they are on the side of fairies in Prince Ricardo, appearing as ‘fairy books’: books containing fairytales. The library can also be ambivalent space. As already mentioned, the Library is used by only the most unpopular and absurd characters in *Prigio*. In *Ricardo*, on the other hand, the library, filled with ‘fairy books’, is used by the wise and respected king (Prigio): ‘The King [Prigio] and Queen [Rosalind] were sitting in the royal library, of which the shelves were full of the most delightful fairy books in all languages, all equally familiar to King Prigio’ (*Ricardo* 79). Making a clear contrast to Prigio, the greatest ‘education’ for Ricardo in the story is to learn the importance of learning. In writing ‘Chronicles of Pantouflia’, Lang thus shifts his mode from satire to didacticism—from creating caricatures of adults who do not have a childlike heart, to emphasising the importance of learning.

Another significant deviation by Lang from the *Rose* is the disenchantment and diminution of the giants. In *Fairy Court*, when Prigio and his brother visit the giant's palace in order to defeat him, the brother falls in love with the giant's daughter, who is three times as tall as him. Prigio uses his wishing cap and reduces giant's daughter's size in proportion to his brother, and they make a good match. The giant himself agrees to move to Pantouflia, and one day asks Prigio to reduce her size as well. In the end, with the help of the wishing cap, all three members of the giant's family—the giant, his wife, and his daughter—are made as tall as ordinary human beings. While the dangerous giants are thus reduced in their size, they are also tamed and dis-enchanted, to become finally as harmless and powerless as other subjects under the control of Prigio (the future king) and his brother (the husband of the giant's daughter).

Bown suggests that the scale of fairyland had a peculiar significance in the nineteenth-century culture: regarding themselves as makers and masters, but at the same time fearing that they were relatively dwarfed by modernity, Victorians produced and were fascinated by toy theatres and miniature fairies.⁹² Fairy paintings served as 'a pictorial and metaphorical form of the persistent uncertainties about the true size of human form' (Bown 82). All fairy paintings had to negotiate questions of scale: 'those which include both humans and fairies require the artist to have made a decision about the relative sizes of humans and fairies; and those who depict fairies alone involve deciding how large the fairies are in relation to their background' (Bown 75).

As Bown argues, while many fairy paintings from the 1830s and the 1840s exemplify a preoccupation with scale, Richard Dadd gave 'the most acute rendering to the exaggeration of scale' (75).⁹³ The subject of Dadd's paintings, Shakespeare's *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, also involves the problem of scale in fairy representation.

As pointed out by Avery, Shakespeare depicted fairies as ‘diminutive and picturesque, with pretty garden names’ (69) and in doing so ‘softened’ the image of British fairies which were formerly regarded as malevolent spirits, associated with witchcraft, and characterized by the size of a small man. Fairies in Dadd’s paintings, therefore, are under a double spell of diminution: first by Shakespeare who miniaturized them, and then by Dadd.

In *Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland* (1865), Alice repeatedly changes her size by drinking and eating. The change in her size confuses her identity as a little girl. She doubtfully says, ‘I—I’m a little girl’ (Carroll 76), and the pigeon denies her being a little girl because of her size. She is relieved when she resumes her ‘right size’ (Carroll 77), that of a little girl. In *Fairy Court*, as well, these problems concerning fairies, human beings, and their scale are dramatised. Grogno, Prigio’s father, is first ‘dwarfed’ when he visits the giant’s palace and sleeps in their doll’s house. When Prigio visits the giants, this time, the giants are ‘dwarfed’ by the wishing cap. Obviously as the giants get smaller, they lose their power and dangerousness, and are softened and domesticated. The loss of dangerousness echoes Lang’s declaration in *Preface to Yellow* that giants have ‘all died out’ (xi): and reveals, here again, his minute care in presenting his stories for children as ‘harmless’ and ‘moralistic’.

While Lang explores the problem of the presentation of his fairies in terms of scale, he also makes use of the motifs of disproportion. Prigio’s gift of ‘too much cleverness’ makes a striking contrast with the gift of ‘a little misfortune’ in the *Rose*, producing contrary effects (either excessively beneficial to the extent that it turns out to be harmful, or, apparently harmful, but ultimately leading to a good outcome). The manner in which ‘The Magician Who Wanted More’ and ‘The Giant Who Does Not

Know When He Has Had Enough', two enemies of Prigio and Ricardo, are finally defeated might be seen as reflecting Lang's own anxiety caused by the increasing materialisation and objectification of 'modern' life, without any visible limit, of his own time.

4.6 Part II Conclusion

This chapter has attempted a re-evaluation of Lang's roles and narratives, by according a new significance to Lang, as a vitally important figure who played crucial roles in the processes of diasporic re-imagining of Scottishness, which is a neglected yet significant layer of post-Union Scottish nation writing. It has drawn attention to the roles of the Briticised elites who acquired administrative positions in the British Empire through their literacy, were enchanted as well as dis-encharnted by both their homeland in Scotland and new settlement in the British Empire, and were entangled with an overlapping sense of loss and a craving for re-enchantment.

This chapter has also pointed out a rupture in Lang's attitudes towards national issues between his artistic and non-fictional writing, and argued that while Langian artistic narratives are apparently underpinned by Scottish cultural nationalism, his non-fictional writing tends to display a cosmopolitan attitude; yet, both kinds of his writing in fact reveal a profound complicity. Despite its other-worldly appearance, Langian fairy narratives are saturated by a strong sense of realism, which paradoxically drove him to escape from reality. The seductive as well as dystopian fairyland metaphorises, for Lang, both contemporary Scotland and the British Empire, from which he is alienated, desires to be seduced, and craves to escape. Langian fairytales can thus be perceived as a crystallisation of escapist realism, rather than fantasy.

Conclusion

This thesis finally contends that fairy writing in nineteenth century Scotland is a neglected part of the European cultural nationalist discourse, as well as that of the processes of the creation of British identity. It reveals complexities, confusions, dilemmas and strategies, as well as self-consciousness of those who were involved in the processes of national myth-making, with the desire to immortalise and perpetuate their nation which appeared to be ‘dissolving’.

The act of writing fairies in nineteenth century Scotland was a strategic and subversive mode of writing, which served as a site of literary experimentation which accommodated various kinds of authors’ responses to a wide range of contemporary issues. In the Romantic period, in particular, fairy writing acted as a means of national myth-making, often aimed at the re-creation and perpetuation of national identity. In this sense, it played a significant role in Scotland in particular, because the nation experienced historically unusual vicissitude through its longstanding and peculiar relationship with England. The formation of the British Empire gave it a new, and dual identity of ‘North Britain’, which transformed the nation into both a coloniser and colonised at the same time. As a result, various responses toward their nation and the union profoundly caused in writers emotional turmoil which were overtly, or covertly, manifested in various form of cultural artefact.

As exemplified by the ‘novel’, which can be viewed as a genre wielding a stronger presence in ‘British’ culture, canonised literary genres were chiefly intended for the English and ‘gentleman’ readership, even though some of the most influential works were written by Scottish authors including Scott. Arguably, canonical literary

genres were increasingly being anglicised, though they subtly retained ‘ambivalence’ or forcefully suppressed any trace of Scottishness. In such a national and cultural climate, saturated both with the Enlightened cosmopolitanism supporting the union, and ‘backward’ and ‘nostalgic’ Scottish cultural nationalism, fairy writing played a vital role in accommodating concerns and anxieties which could not be voiced in other genres of writing in Standard English. Its marginality as a genre, together with the traditionally constructed association between fairies, deities and magic, helped to mythify the nation, its culture and its identity which, as people including Scott feared, were rapidly ‘dissolving’.

The Scottish myth-making process was a literary one, in which various authors wrote creatively, allowing the imagination its full play, though never completely detached from the traditional fairy belief handed down in the locality. They constructed figures of fairies and fairylands, embodying their anxieties of existence, often pathetic sense of loss, absence, emptiness and directionless-ness, and fear of disappearance and dissolution, which were all linked to the historic loss of the state following the Act of Union. Significantly, a desire to perpetuate the nation within a symbolic sphere of fairyland, is a common feature which underpins the works of Scott, Black, Hogg and Lang.

Scottish fairy writing created in the romantic period makes a significant contrast with the folk revival movement in Germany, which is emblematised by the popular tale collections by the Brothers Grimm. While the Brothers Grimm were more concerned with the preservation of orality in its ‘authentic’ and ‘pure’ condition, Scottish authors showed exceedingly inconsistent and contradictory attitudes toward the issue of authenticity and invention. Although they often seem to have valued

authenticity, they were generally more attentive in the invention of their original fairy writing. Furthermore, they very often conflated ‘authentic’ traditional material and their invented ‘fake-lore’ together, composing ‘hybrid’ mixture of disparate genres. Because these hybrid texts were far from seamless, they were often forcefully stitched together by the rationally and pedantically written ‘dissertations’, creating an apparently unified whole. Containing tensions and conflicts within it, and an ineradicable sense of artificiality, these unified ‘books’ often metaphorise the union of the two nations.

Thus, genre-mixing and its exposed artificiality constitute another important feature of Scottish fairy writing. Together with the contradictory attitudes toward the issue of authenticity, the artificiality of the collections of fairy narratives foregrounds the fabrication which occurred during the processes of British nation making. In addition, Scottish fairy writing also reveals its authors’ often sarcastic self-reflexiveness as the poet, and maker, of artificial national mythography. It also sheds a new light to the study of cultural nationalism, by disclosing the self-consciousness of those involved in the promotion of cultural nationalist discourse.

Strong preoccupations with the land, in particular, haunt the works of Black and Hogg. The disappearing fairies and elusive fairy queens who haunt subterranean realms, together with the immaterialised and etherealised homeland, were frequently depicted in the works of fairy writing explored in this study. While they metaphorise the loss of the state, the rightful monarch, and the old national identity, they also serve to symbolically immortalise the Scottish nation through mythification and romanticisation within the subliminal textual layers of fairy writing.

Fairy writing in nineteenth century Scotland thus served as a peculiar site which accommodated various, often ambiguous and often subversive, creative

responses to the processes of creating new national identities occurring in post-union Britain. It served as a neglected, yet crucially important undercurrent of nation writings and discourses of Scotland as well as Britain.

To conclude, fairies do not exist, but they haunt. As Bown aptly argues, they are projections of self, rather than the other. They are obscure and ambiguous, blurring borders between reality and fantasy, visibility and invisibility, authenticity and forgery, and presence and absence. When such traditional associations between fairies and the issues of existence, identity, and perception are placed in the nationalist context, they reveal the ambiguity and artificiality of national identity as a cultural artefact. Metaphorizing and revealing the repressed and un-narrated layers of 'national tale', fairy writing serves to represent the fabrication and multi-layered ness of Romantic cultural nationalist discourse.

Though numerous intellectuals have attempted to explain and define the word 'fairy', it still remains unclear and ambiguous. The word 'fairy' could have a peculiar capacity as a verbal Pandora's box or *tamatebako* (Urashima's casket), whose appearance might be enchanting, but its invisible contents turn out to be perilous. Such feature of the word may overlap with the concepts of 'nation' and 'national identity'. Though, for some people, these might appear to be glorious and sacred, and seem to contain something significant, the questions of what they really are, and what they essentially contain, remain mysterious.

Notes

¹ Hereafter, *The Lay of the Last Minstrel* will be abbreviated as the *Lay*, *The Lady of the Lake* as the *Lake*, and *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft* as *Demonology*. *Black Dwarf* and *The Monastery* will be parenthetically mentioned as *Dwarf* and *Monastery* respectively.

² See Andrew Sanders, 'Utter Indifference?: the Anglo-Saxons in the Nineteenth-century Novel'.

³ For instance, appropriations of Anglo-Saxons, underpinned by anglo-saxonism, have been repeated in English literature from the thirteenth to the twentieth century. See Scragg, Donald. and Carol Weinberg, eds. *Literary Appropriations of the Anglo-Saxons from the Thirteenth to the Twentieth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2000.

⁴ See Scragg, Donald, and Carol Weinberg, eds. *Literary Appropriations of the Anglo-Saxons from the Thirteenth to the Twentieth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2000.

⁵ Jennifer Schacker, *National Dreams: the Remaking of Fairy Tales in Nineteenth-Century England* (Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2003). This study is invaluable in that it considers the cultural nationalistic ideological underpinnings of fairytales circulated in nineteenth-century England. Its inclusion of Croker suggests that Shacker's work does not only foreground the imperialist ideology imbuing 'English' fairytale circulations, but also reveals, perhaps unconsciously, a problematic aspect of 'Englishness' which arguably overlaps with, or is even synonymous of, 'Britishness'. Considering its coverage of materials, perspectives, and the supposed

readership of the tales mentioned in it, it would be more appropriate to regard it as a work exploring a British cultural phenomenon, rather than confining it to England.

⁶ Significantly, much later, Andrew Lang also occupied an important place in the London literary world; many authors eagerly asked him to write recommendations for their books, so that they will be well sold.

⁷ This information is provided by the Hans Christian Andersen Museum in Odense, Denmark. Scott's influence on Andersen is also mentioned in several very recent studies: "'His pirates had forey'd on Scottish hill': Scott in Denmark with an Overview of his Reception in Norway and Sweden" by Jørgen Erik Nielsen, 'European Reception of Scott's Poetry: Translation as the Front Line' by Tom Hubbard, and "'Scotland is Scott-Land': Scott and the Development of Tourism' by Alastair Durie.

⁸ Murray Pittock ed, *The Reception of Sir Walter Scott in Europe* (London: Continuum, 2006). This collection of essays is revealing in that it epitomises new critical impulse in the study in Scottish literature, which attempts to employ new perspectives 'beyond' Scotland, situating Scottish literature within wider international contexts rather than confining it to contradictions within it. It contains, however, serious omission of the relationship between Scott and the Grimms. It does not refer to the Grimms except only once, where Tom Hubbard, in his essay concerning European reception of Scott's poetry, merely states the fact that Wilhelm Grimm translated three songs from the *Minstrelsy* into German (272), without further analysis. In addition, Parson's study focusing on the representations of the supernatural in Scott's works, which examines materials from various genres including the correspondence, does not mention the Grimms at all. Very recently, the critical gap was filled by Dunnigan's study: 'The Enchanted Worlds of Scott, Scotland, and the Grimms', in Gerard

Carruthers, et al, eds, *Scotland and the Nineteenth Century World* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2011). Unfortunately I have not been able to access the material because, as of 25 August 2012, the book has not been available in any of university library in Japan.

⁹ Seize, Gabriele Von. *Die Bruder Grimm: Leben-Weit-Zeit* [*The Brothers Grimm: Life-World-Time*] (1984). I referred to a Japanese translation: Seize, Gabriele Von. *Grimu Kyoudai: Shougai, Sakuhin, Jidaji*. Trans. Masafumi and Mariko Takagi. Tokyo: Seitosha, 1999. Print.

¹⁰ See Zipes, *The Brothers Grimm* 109, 113.

¹¹ See Cairns Craig, 'Scotland and Hybridity' which reevaluates Colin Kidd's *Subverting Scotland's Past: Scottish Whig Historians and the Creation of an Anglo-British Identity, 1689-c.1830* (1993).

¹² See Ellis 96-100.

¹³ Emily Lyle identifies the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century as the time of 'the first wave of collecting' of Scottish ballads (Introduction to *Scottish Ballads* 9). Further, it is worthy of note that she suggests that some of the ballads including 'Thomas the Rhymer' were not known to exist before the eighteenth century, though 'there is a romance-prophecy of the fourteenth century *Thomas of Erceldoune* which may embody parts of an earlier form of a ballad' (ibid 10).

¹⁴ See also Eric Hobsbawn and Terence Ranger, eds, *The Invention of Tradition* (First published in 1983. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1996) and Ian Duncan, *Scott's Shadow: the Novel in Romantic Edinburgh* (Princeton: Princeton UP, 2007).

¹⁵ On Scott's role in the 'spread of tartan mania', see Trevor-Roper 210-11.

¹⁶ In this thesis *Memoirs of the Life of Sir Walter Scott, Bart* by J G Lockhart is

parenthetically mentioned as *JGL*.

¹⁷ Woodcock used this expression for the discussion of Spenser's *Faerie Queen*. See *Fairy in the Faerie Queen: Renaissance Elf-Fashioning and Elizabethan Myth-Making* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004).

¹⁸ Hereafter, the ballad 'Thomas the Rhymer' and 'Tam Lin' will be abbreviated to *Rhymer* and *Tamlin* respectively. Scott's editions of these ballads will be parenthetically mentioned as follows: 'Part First', 'Part Second' and 'Third Part' of *Thomas* as *STRI*, *STRII* and *STRIII*; introductory essays to each of these parts as *ITRI*, *ITRII* and *ITRIII*; 'The Tale of Tamlane' as *STL*. Introductory essay to 'The Tale of Tamlane' ('On the Fairies of Popular Superstition') will be referred to as *On the Fairies*, and parenthetically as *OF*.

¹⁹ 'The reader will do well to compare this early essay with Sir Walter Scott's fourth letter on Demonology, 1830, where he will find the Author's opinions on several points considerably modified' (*JGLN* II: 300). In this thesis, Lockhart's Notes on the *Minstrelsy* is parenthetically mentioned as *JGLN*.

²⁰ In her recent study on the Scottish ballad tradition, Emily Lyle names *Rhymer*, 'King Orfeus', 'Sir Colin' and 'Tam Lin' as the most significant ballads with regard to fairies. See Lyle, *Fairies and Folk: Approaches to the Scottish Ballad Tradition* (2007).

²¹ On the friendship between Jamieson and Scott, as well as Jamieson's literary contributions, see Harriet Harvey Wood, 'Scott and Jamieson: The Relationship between Two Ballad-Collectors' (*Studies in Scottish Literature* 9[1971-2]: 71-96).

²² In his observation of the indispensable role of culture in the process of nation-formation, Smith argues that the nation 'signifies a cultural and political bond,

uniting in a single political community all who share an historic culture and homeland' (*National Identity* 14-15), and that:

[N]ations must have a measure of common culture and a civic ideology, a set of common understanding and aspirations, sentiments and ideas, that bind the population together in their homeland. [...] In the Western model of national identity nations were seen as *culture communities*, whose members were united, if not made homogeneous, by common historical memories, myths, symbols and traditions. [...] Historic territory, legal-political community, legal-political equality of members, and common civic culture and ideology; these are the components of the standard, Western model of the nation. [...] They have remained vital elements, albeit in somewhat altered form, in most non-Western conceptions of national identity. (Smith, *National Identity* 11, my emphasis)

Although his definition of national identity is comprehensive, Smith's use of the term the 'Western' is contentious, particularly in the cases of Scotland and Ireland. It overlooks the complexity of national identities in Scotland and Ireland. Furthermore, its broad grouping of the 'West' could also be problematic, overlooking various cultural differences and tensions even within Britain. Scott, for example, often associated Scotland with Scandinavian nations, forming a group of 'Northern' nations as opposed to 'Southern' ones. On the anomalousness, as well as the complexity, of Scottish identity, Ian Duncan, et al, argue that Scotland 'occupies an anomalous position in the topology of post-colonialism—shifting between the coordinates of colonized and colonizer', and 'itself reproduced the split condition both of an imperial great Britain

and of the nascent world-system of which Britain was the political-economic core' (Introduction to *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism* 2).

Smith regards the nations in Eastern Europe and Asia as 'ethnic nations', which stand opposed to the 'Western' ones, and argues that 'lexicographers, philologists and folklorists have played a central role in the early nationalisms of Eastern Europe and Asia' (*National Identity* 12), by inadequately drawing examples from Ireland and Norway: nations which are not convincingly classified as Eastern European, nor Asian nations, though they may be considered as ethnic ones. Further, Smith's observation overlooks the fact that the discipline of folklore study, saturated with cultural nationalistic ideology as well as the imperialist one, was developed by antiquarians in nineteenth century Britain, with the term 'folklore' coined by William Thoms.

²³ Here I intentionally use the term 'antiquarian' instead of 'folklorist', as the latter had not yet been coined at the time of the publication of the *Minstrelsy*.

²⁴ One significant example of their antipathy can be found in the controversy aroused by Andrew Lang's 'Fairy Books', which mixed traditional lores and literary tales together within the same volume.

²⁵ Woodcock used these expressions in his study on Spenser's *Faerie Queen*.

²⁶ As noted by Lyle, Scott identified this source as 'Mrs. Smith of Long Newton' much later, in a letter of 2 November 1822 (*Fairies and Folk* 9).

²⁷ See Trumpener.

²⁸ Concerning the vogue for the national epic which features Alfred the Great, see Pratt, 'Anglo-Saxon Attitudes?: Alfred the Great and the Romantic National Epic'.

²⁹ It is of note that Spenserian epic indeed stands in an ambivalent as well as awkward position: whilst it can be defined as a vernacular epic as opposed to classic

ones from an anglo-centric perspective, it is regarded as much the hegemonic classic canon as Greco-Roman epics from a Scotto-centric one.

³⁰ With regard to Mary, Queen of Scots and Hogg's representation of the Fairy Queen in *The Queen's Wake*, see, 'Fairy Tales and Scottish Culture' by Sarah Dunnigan.

³¹ 'The scholarship on this subject [national identity in the context of British history] points emphatically to the sixteenth century. Historians have long recognized that the Tudor period saw the creation of what Geoffrey Elton calls "the modern sovereign state", in which "a self-contained national unit came to be, not the tacitly accepted necessity it had been for some time, but the consciously desired goal"' (Barczewski 3).

³² It is of note that the idea of the theory of animism, as pointed out by Silver, was later proposed by Edward Burnet Tylor, the founder of anthropology and predecessor of Andrew Lang, as important to the study of fairy lore, in his *Primitive Culture* (1871). See Silver 44-45.

³³ This famous scene depicting the River Spirit and the Mountain Spirit, as well as another scene in which the Goblin Page appears, were set to music ('The Goblin Page, Scene from *The Lay of the Last Minstrel*' [1813] and 'The Spirit Scene, "Is it the Roar of Teviot's Tide"' [c1835], both composed by John Clarke-Whitfeld). Together with the musical adaptation of Scott's translation of Goethean 'Erl-King' by Augusta Cowell (c1835), these examples demonstrate that fairies were not limited to the realm of literature but served as an important subject in different genres during the nineteenth century, and even acted as a medium by way of which different genres intersect.

³⁴ Whilst it has often been argued that the presence of the Other helps to construct a collective identity in general, Linda Colley, under the considerable influence

of Benedict Anderson's definition of the nation as artefact, regards 'Great Britain' as 'an invention forged above all by war': 'Time and time again, war with France brought Britons, whether they hailed from Wales or Scotland or England, into confrontation with an obviously hostile Other and encouraged them to define themselves collectively against it' (5). Similarly, in her definition of (Scottish) Wars of Independence, Fiona Watson writes: 'The Scots had forged a firm national identity for themselves out of the crucible of war' (336).

³⁵ Ashliman, however, suggests that though the word etymologically originated from the Old Norse *dvergr*, they were not originally small: 'It is nowhere stated in earlier sources that such beings were small in stature, although in recent centuries this quality has evolved into such an important characteristic that the word *dwarf* has come to be a synonym for *small*' (Ashliman 3, italicised by the author).

³⁶ The ballad of 'The Wee Wee Man' is the only example in the Child ballad corpus of small fairies. In every other case the ballad fairy is of human size. [...] [The Wee Wee Man] recalls a creature similar to the dwarf, gnome or kobold found in Teutonic and Scandinavian traditions. His hideous appearance and superhuman strength [...] add credence to this theory. [...] [S]olitary male fairies were usually regarded as plain, ugly, or misshapen in some way. (HC 55)

³⁷ Such depiction of giants and dwarfs is later emulated by Andrew Lang, who created a giant and a dwarf who both abducted the lover of the protagonist.

In ['The Maner of the Crying of ane Playe'] the dwarf, who arrived in Scotland 'with a whirlwind', declared he was 'the nakit Blynd Hary', engendered from a race of giants and mythical heroes, and a recent returnee from Fairyland. [...] Yet this dwarf also resembles a

shape-shifting, tutelary figure akin to a brownie or Robin Goodfellow. [...] Like most of his [Billie Blin's] kind [Billie Blin] could perform superhuman tasks and usually attached himself to a particular family until offended in some way and it was time to move on. (*HC* 49-50)

There is some evidence that smallness was characteristic of some fairies, for example brownies, or the 'peedie' folk of the Northern Isles, a suggestion which receives some support from Scandinavian and Germanic parallels. But what seems most probable is that we are dealing here with competing traditions. [...] It also seems likely that, as a general rule, fairies became smaller the further they receded into the past, an idea which is hardly surprising given that human beings always seem to believe, often erroneously, that their ancestors were of smaller stature than themselves. (*HC* 56-57)

³⁸ The *CSE* defines the word as a synonym for 'glamour'

³⁹ Hereafter, *The Monastery* is parenthetically mentioned as *M*.

⁴⁰ D'Arcy supports his argument with the mentioning of several previous studies which also consider the critical years for Scott :

[Graham McMaster noted that] '[t]he optimism, the belief in progressive improvement, which he [Scott] had assumed to be his own, began to disappear about 1816, and by the end of 1818, the disillusionment was complete.' This is well before 1824, the date implied by Christopher Harvie who claims that in Scott's last years, whenever he 'allowed rein to his subconscious, a vision of Scotland

emerges which is vivid, nationalistic, and sombre', [...]. Caroline McCracken-Flesher dates Scott's disillusionment with the Union even later, to the events of 1825-26, which include his bankruptcy, the death of his wife, and the London Parliament's attempts to interfere in Scotland's banking system [...]. (D'Arcy 31-32)

See Harvie, Christopher. 'Scott and the Image of Scotland'. *Sir Walter Scott: The Long-Forgotten Melody*. Ed. Alan Bold. London: Barnes and Noble, 1983. 17-42; McCracken-Flesher, Caroline. 'Pro Patria Mori: Gendered Nationalism and Cultural Death in Scott's "The Highland Widow"'. *Scottish Literary Journal* 21.2 (1994): 69-78; McMaster, Graham. *Scott and Society*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1981.

⁴¹ Sutherland further suggests that *Ivanhoe* was 'largely responsible' for 'injecting consciousness of race (and a sizeable dose of racism)' into 'the popular British mind' (Sutherland 229, qtd. Sanders 158). Sanders denies this view, though he argues that the novel influenced 'British, American and European ideas of racial and national identity' (158). Racial bias can be detected in *The Monastery* as well, in the representation of Halbert as an Anglophobic character.

⁴² For the role of the vernacular Bibles in the creation of national consciousness during the Reformation period, originating from Luther's translation, see Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities* (revised ed), 37- 46.

⁴³ This comment by Finkelstein originally concerns a particular case of Margaret Oliphant's construction of Scottish identity in the *Blackwoods Magazine*.

⁴⁴ See Sarah Dunnigan, 'Return of the Repressed' (2004).

⁴⁵ The editorship of the 1815 edition is indeed obscure. Whilst the actual

book of the 1815 edition contains no information pertaining to the editorship, the NLS catalogue indicates that the editor was Robert Jamieson. This contradicts with the consensus formed by the majority of the historical editors of *SC* (i.e. Lang, Sanderson, Stewart, and Hunter) that it was edited by Scott. Lang seems to have firmly believed that Scott was the editor. As Hunter points out, Lang wrote in *Cock Lane and Common-Sense* (1896):

In 1691 he [Kirk] finished his *Secret Commonwealth of Elves, Faunes and Fairies*, whereof only a fragment has reached us. It has been maintained that the book was printed in 1691, but no mortal eye has seen a copy. In 1815 Sir Walter Scott printed a hundred copies from a manuscript in the Advocates' Library in Edinburgh. He did not put his name on the book, but Charles Kirkpatrick Sharpe, in a note on his own copy, affirms that Sir Walter was the editor. (235)

To this description, Lang adds the footnote: 'A copy presented by Scott to Sir Alexander Boswell of Auchinleck is in the author's possession; it bears Scott's autograph' (235). Sanderson, the editor of the 1976 edition, points out that both the compiler of the *Fasti Ecclesiae Scoticae* and Maclean (a twentieth century scholar) named Scott as the editor of the 1815 edition. Sanderson also mentions Jamieson as a possible transcriber:

From what is known of Scott's activities and practice at this time, it seems likely that the manuscript was transcribed by someone on Scott's instructions, [...] The identity of the transcriber, like the whereabouts of the transcript, is not known; but Robert Jamieson the ballad-collector, who collaborated with Scott in compiling, amongst

other things, the *Illustrations of Northern Antiquities* (1814), is a likely candidate. (22)

Wood also writes that Jamieson often undertook tasks of transcription on behalf of Scott, who was too busy to do it himself. Thus, the possibility of Jamieson's playing a participatory role in the creation of the 1815 edition cannot be eliminated. It is indeed significant that the NLS catalogue ascribes the editorship to Jamieson—who eagerly and obsessively aspired for the post of Keeper at the Advocates' Library, but was rejected.

⁴⁶ In his Introduction to *Tamlane*, Scott mentions the legend of 'the fairy *Melusina*' (ITL 310-311, the author's italics).

⁴⁷ The definition of the term 'Second Sight' in *OED* cites Andrew Lang's description.

⁴⁸ On the appropriation of fairytales by Nazis, Niles argues as follows: '[T]he Nazis' appropriation of the Grimm's collection of fairytales into a kind of national Bible represented a repudiation of internationalism, a celebration of rural values, and a claim regarding the antiquity and value of native German traditions, hence the status of the German *Volk*' (Niles 216).

⁴⁹ Kazuhisa, Takahashi. '*Etorikku no Hitsujikai, Arui wa, Hitsujikai no Retorikku: Jeimuzu Hoggu no Fukken o Megutte* [The Ettrick Shepherd, or, the Rhetoric of a Shepherd: a Study on the Revaluation of James Hogg]'. *Eigo Seinen/Rising Generation* 137.1 (1991): 19-21. In Japanese.

⁵⁰ In this colonial aspect, fairy writing overlaps with travel writing, a genre which is also about explorations in the 'other world', encountering 'strange' people, discovering 'magical treasures', and experiencing different flow of time, as well as

about the question of when and how to return 'home'. See, for example, Clark, Steve, ed. *Travel Writing and Empire* (1999).

⁵¹Aileen Christianson employs the metaphors of 'ghost', 'seen and unseen' and 'lost and found' to reveal an unrecognised dimension of women's writing in the nineteenth century. She uses the concepts to represent and explore the ambiguous modes of existence and visibility, of female writers and their works. See, for example, 'Jane Welsh Carlyle: Imaginary Letters and Ghost Publications' (2007).

As Gillian Avery argues, there have been scholarly recognitions that women writers in the century were generally more interested in ghosts, and were relatively indifferent to fairies. There are, however, abundantly exceptional works including *The Goblin Market* by Christina Rossetti, *The Fairy Book* by Mrs Mulock[Dinah Craik], collection of fairytales edited by Maria Edgeworth, and various illustrations of flower fairies for children's books by female illustrators. Though fairies and ghosts are overlapping concepts, there are significant differences between them in the degree they are associated with humanity, death, house, family, deity, antiquity, and nature. Further, with the exception of Rossetti's work, fairy writing by women tended to be intended for child readers often for didactic purposes, while ghost stories targeted adult readership and explored the issues regarding gender and identity. The contrast between the 'fairy way of writing' and the 'ghost way of writing' by women writers is a topic worth examining.

⁵² Douglas Mack reads *Kilmeny* as a transcendental text evoking heavenly sphere. Sarah Dunnigan discussed ethereality of *Queen's Wake* in 'Hogg, Fairies, and Mary Queen of Scots', a paper presented at Hogg Conference held in Stirling University in August 2007.

⁵³ Bown, Nicola. *Fairies in Nineteenth-century Art and Literature*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2001. Print; Purkiss, Diane. *At the Bottom of the Garden: A Dark History of Fairies, Hobgoblins, and Other Troublesome Things*. New York: New York UP, 2001. Print; and Silver, Carole. *Strange and Secret Peoples: Fairies and Victorian Consciousness*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1999. Print.

⁵⁴ For the biographical details including Doyle's 'enthusiastic' support of the British efforts and policies during the wartime, see an *ODNB* entry by Owen Dudley Edwards:

Conan Doyle enthusiastically supported the British effort in the South African War and served as a doctor in the volunteer-staffed Langman Hospital in 1900, after which he defended British policy if not always British practice in *The Great Boer War* (1900) and in *The War in South Africa: its Cause and Conduct* (1902). The latter, translated into many foreign languages and braille, became the major international advocate of the British case in the controversial war, and bowing to his mother's insistence a somewhat reluctant Conan Doyle accepted a knighthood for it in 1902. Hitherto his finest work on warfare in modern fiction had been 'The Green flag' and 'The Lord of Chateau Noir', short stories portraying Irish mutiny in British imperial ranks in the 1880s and French guerrilla resistance after German conquest in 1870. (Edwards, n.pag)

⁵⁵ See Bown, *Fairies in Nineteenth-Century Art and Literature*, 1.

⁵⁶ Bown argues: 'It is a little-known *fact* that the industrial revolution caused the extinction of the fairies. That the coming of the factories should have coincided with the departure of the fairies was no accident'; 'the idea that the factories had driven away the fairies was a powerful one which resonated widely in Victorian culture' (Bown 39-41 emphasis added).

⁵⁷ With regard to the incident, it is vital to consider *The Coming of Fairies* (1922), Doyle's own account of it. Bown also offers an insightful examination of the incident. See Bown, *Fairies in Nineteenth-Century Art and Literature*, 187-196.

⁵⁸ Avery argues that the convention in the representation of fairies as small, lovely, and mischievous creatures, which was established by Shakespeare, lingered until the nineteenth century, in which fairies were depicted as tiny, powerless, and reduced to beautiful and feminine appearances (69).

⁵⁹ In the Introduction to *Blue*, which was included only in the limited editions, Lang stated as follows:

Perhaps it seems almost as cruel to apply the methods of literary criticism as of science to Nursery Tales. He who would enter into the Kingdom of Faery should have the heart of a little child, if he is to be happy and at home in that enchanted realm. But I trust that one may have studied fairy tales both scientifically and in a literary way, without losing the heart of childhood, as far as those best of childish things are concerned. (Lang, Introduction to *Blue* xiii).

⁶⁰ Hereafter, Lang's original fairytales will be respectively abbreviated as follows: *Princess Nobody*: *Princess*; *The Gold of Fairnilee*: *Fairnilee*; *Prince Prigio*: *Prigio*; *Prince Ricardo*: *Ricardo*; *Tales of Fairy Court*: *Fairy Court*.

Two editions of *Fairnilee* will be used in this chapter. Gillian Avery's edition (1967) will be the main source, except for a few cases which refer to the poem 'Dedication' included only in the original edition (1888).

⁶¹ Hereafter, each of Lang's 'Fairy Books' will be abbreviated by reference to their colours in italics except when first mentioned.

⁶² As explored in Part I, Scott also seems to have developed an original and metafictional use of paratext, specifically to disenchant the enchanting contents within the main body of the text. It could be possible that Lang, who deeply respected Scott, also had a peculiar attachment to the paratext as a kind of micro-genre and personal space, and often deliberately used them to voice his more private thoughts. Arguably, Genettian definition of a paratext as a ‘threshold’ and an ‘undefined zone’ between the inside and the outside (1-2) may overlap with the geopolitical characteristics of the Border region which presumably exerted a profound influence on Lang’s identity formation.

⁶³ Lang’s contribution to folklore studies is remarkable: he was one of the earliest ‘folklorists’ who co-founded and served as the President and Vice-President of the Folk-lore Society. Lang also joined the Society of Psychical Research shortly after its formation in 1882, where he was its chairman in 1911–12 (Donaldson n.pag)

⁶⁴ Manlove defines the ‘Golden Age’ of British children literature as the period between 1890 and 1924 (9). Likewise, Laura M. Zaidman regards the period from 1880 to 1914 as the ‘dynamic period of literature and illustration for children’ (xi). Both definition covers the period in which Lang wrote for children.

⁶⁵ This was predicted by Green: ‘Besides his poetry, Lang deserves to be remembered for his children’s books. It is not likely that the fairytales which he edited for Longmans (i.e. the ‘Fairy Books’) will ever be forgotten’ (218).

⁶⁶ For example, Percy Muir comments: ‘Lang earns a high place in the revival of the fairytale, less so for those he wrote himself’ (107); ‘the immortality of his tales is tenuous. For us he is possibly more important as an influence, a background, than for what he wrote himself’ (154).

⁶⁷The following list comprises the main studies of Lang after Green's: Eleanor Langstaff's *Andrew Lang* (1978), a biography and bibliography with some analysis on his works; Jan Susina's "'Like the Fragments of Coloured Glass in a Kaleidoscope': Andrew Lang Mixes Up Richard Doyle's *In Fairyland*" (2003), which in fact places more focus on Richard Doyle in examining the discordance between his illustrations and Lang's text in *Princess*; and Eric Lawrence Montenyohl's Ph.D dissertation, 'Andrew Lang and the Fairy Tale' (1986) are the few exceptional studies which offer a textual analysis or critique of his literary works. Two studies in Scottish literature include discussion on Lang: Robert Crawford's *Devolving English Literature* (2000) considers the problem of Lang's national identity and Scotland through the analysis of his anthropological works and editions of Scott; Penny Fielding's *Writing and Orality* (1996) points out the significance of books for Lang as a symbol of elitism. Oscar Maurer's 'Andrew Lang and Longman's Magazine, 1882-1905' (1955) and Margaret Beetham's 'The Agony of Aunt, the Romancing Uncle and the Family of Empire: Defining the Sixpenny Reading Public in the 1890s' (2000) discuss Lang's position as an influential figure in the late nineteenth-century literary world; and Ronald Gordon Cant's *The Writing of Scottish History in the Time of Andrew Lang* (1978) probes Lang's attitude toward Scotland in his historical writings such as *History of Scotland* (1900-07). Recent studies on Victorian fairies and supernatural such as Roger Luckhurst's 'Knowledge, Belief and the Supernatural at the Imperial Margin' (2004) also usually refer to Lang. *"Taste of the World": a Re-evaluation of the Publication History and Reception Context of Andrew Lang's Fairy Book Series, 1889-1910* (2012), a very recent dissertation by Sara Hines, is fully devoted for the exploration of Lang's edition of the 'Fairy Book' placed within a wider cultural context of late Victorian bibliographic

and publication history. In addition, “Writing the Borders: Fairies and Ambivalent National Identity in Andrew Lang’s *The Gold of Fairnilee*” (2008) by Yuki Yoshino, part of which is revised and incorporated in this chapter, might also be mentioned.

⁶⁸ ‘That Lang’s poetry is now so little known seems to be due (apart from the present trend of critical taste against most poetry of his type and period) to the lack of any standard collection. [...] [A] collection or selection of Lang’s essays would also be worth making, and besides their very real value as ‘human pleasure’, would go far towards reinstating him as a critic of considerable importance.’ (Green 218-20)

⁶⁹ Leonora Blanche Lang, *née* Leonora Blanche Alleyne, youngest daughter of C. T. Alleyne of Clifton and Barbados, married Lang in 1875 (Green 41). Her enduring contribution to the editorial work of Lang’s Fairy Books did not receive deserving attention until Sara Hines’s *Taste of the World: a Re-evaluation of the Publication History and Reception Context of Andrew Lang’s Fairy Book Series, 1889-1910* (2013) shed more light on her role.

⁷⁰ ‘As to the topics treated in the poems, they really seem without limit, and the multiplicity of his interests earned for him the epithet of “versatile”, a name which he particularly detested, without ever explaining why. But this very variety of subjects has materially increased the difficulty—already considerable—of editing the poems. You never knew where to have him—or to look for him. He might publish one set of verses in a sporting paper on Friday, and another set in an organ of wholly opposite views on Saturday; the political opinions they represented were nothing to him as long as he was allowed to express himself on a cricket match or a ghost or the rare edition of a book.’ (Leonora Lang, Preface to *Poetical Works* v-vi)

⁷¹ On such a function of his name, Fielding comments: ‘Lang’s influence as a

reviewer and cultural arbiter was considerable, and his good opinion of a text was a valuable market asset' (*Writing* 137-138).

⁷² Fielding writes: 'Within Scotland, literacy itself was seen as a passport to the markets and administrative positions of Imperial Britain' (*Writing* 8).

⁷³ 'In bibliography, in the care for books *as* [the author's emphasis] books, the French are still the teachers of Europe. [...] Twenty books about books are written in Paris for one that is published in England. In *our country* [my emphasis] Dibdin is out of date (the second edition of his 'Bibliomania' was published in 1811) [...]' (Lang, *Library* 4-5).

⁷⁴ 'And here, for English children, here / By him [Richard Doyle] who best knew Fairyland, / Are drawn the gentle Beauty dear / And (changed by the enchanter's wand) / The Beast, unbending o'er his bier'. In her edition of the poem, Leonora adds a footnote: "'Him who best knew Fairyland" is Dicky [Richard] Doyle, whose picture of Beauty and the Beast these verses illustrate. (See Christmas Number of *Longman's Magazine* for 1884.)' (Lang, 'Beauty and the Beast' 130).

⁷⁵ Lizanne Henderson and Edward J. Cowan aptly name Lang the person who 'is generally credited with being the first to truly popularise some of the traditional material which he described as fairy tales' (9).

⁷⁶ The supposedly original title which Scott's edition is entitled was *Secret Commonwealth or, a Treatise displaying the Chiefe Curiosities as they are in Use among diverse of the People of Scotland of this Day: SINGULARITIES for the most Part peculiar to that Nation*. It is, however, now widely known by the title given by Lang (Warner ed, *The Secret Commonwealth* 2).

⁷⁷ The *OED* definition of 'fairy-tale', though, quotes Horace Walpole's usage of

the term in 1749 as the earliest example.

⁷⁸ In Lang's edition, there is an indication that 'Five hundred and fifty copies of this Edition have been printed, five hundred of which are for sale', though Cunninghame Graham edition states that five hundred copies were printed for the second edition (i.e. Lang's edition). His edition is still in print, with its reprint in 1933 (by R. B. Cunningham Graham) and 2005 (by Alan Richardson), though three other editions have been published: Stewart Sanderson's (1976), Michael Hunter's (2001), and the latest one by Marina Warner (November 2006).

⁷⁹ While both Scott and Lang might have regarded Kirk as 'Scottish' in a broader sense, it should be noted that Kirk would not necessarily have regarded *them* in the same way. Throughout its history, Scotland had not always been a 'single concrete entity', but a variety of images of 'Scotland' and 'Scottishness' had been created and recreated (Broun et al 1). It was not until the wars of independence that the idea of the Scots as 'a wholly individual and distinct people on a par with the Irish, English and Welsh' was articulated (Broun et al 3), and even in the nineteenth century, the Highlanders—from which Kirk derived—had their own sense of historical identity (Broun et al 3). While Kirk was the author of the first complete metrical psalter in Gaelic, with his parish in Aberfoyle which was 'entirely Gaelic speaking' (Stott n.pag), both Scott and Lang were from the Borders district in the Lowlands, which had an entirely different history as well as language (Lowland Scots) from Highlands.

⁸⁰ The letter, bearing a Galashiels postmark of 10th July 1838, is signed by three people: Eben Clarkson, John Campbell and Andrew Lang. Since the Andrew Lang discussed in this chapter was born in 1838, it is obvious that he did not sign the letter.

⁸¹ Jennifer Schacker, invoking Peter Sahlin and Linda Colley, argues that

national identities are ‘formed through the delineation of boundaries (geographical, cultural, social, moral)’: ‘The process is more often the result of encounter with or reaction to “an obviously alien ‘Them’” than it is the product of “cultural consensus at home”. Folklore books, specifically collections of popular tales, provided many such encounters.’ (3).

⁸² For example, ‘St. Andrews by the northern sea, / A haunted town it is to me!/
A little city, worn and grey, / The grey North Ocean girds it round’ (Lang, ‘*Almae Matres*’ 3); ‘Farewell the long line of the violet hills / Beyond the yellow sand, / The wide brown level that the water fills / Between the sea and land’ (Lang, ‘The End of the Term: St. Andrews’ 18).

⁸³ Because Leonora does not give sources and original publication date of the poems in *Poetical Works*, it is uncertain under what circumstances Lang wrote the poem.

⁸⁴ ‘I am never so happy as when I cross the Tweed at Berwick from the south, or go on the links at Wimbleton Common and hear the accents [...] of my native tongue’ (qtd. in Buchan 19).

⁸⁵ ‘Folks of Peace’ is one of the euphemisms for fairies in Scotland. Other common euphemisms are: the good neighbours, the good people, the honest folk, the fairfolk, the green goons, the gentry, the little people, the forgetful people, the still people, the restless people, the seelie and unseelie court, and the people of peace (Henderson and Cowan 14).

⁸⁶ *Fairy Gifts* is illustrated by Kate Greenaway. As Greenaway is generally said to have never drawn fairies, the book is indeed exceptional. Her illustration of ‘Fairy Rubinetta’, however, almost looks like a witch with a pointed hat, eyeglasses, and a

bloom. John Proctor's illustration of Cinderella's fairy godmother in *Dean's Fairy Book* (1892) by F. G. Green (F.G.Green 46) is another example of the witch-like fairy godmother.

⁸⁷ As 'Dedication' indicates, 'Jean' also alludes to 'Jeanie' Lang, Lang's niece in Australia, to whom he dedicates the story.

⁸⁸ Avery's edition in 1967 omits this dedication.

⁸⁹ H. G. Wells' *The Time Machine* was published in 1895. As 'The Fairy Timepiece' does not appear in *Prince Prigio* (1889) and *Prince Ricardo* (1893), but only in *Tales of a Fairy Court* (1906), it is likely that Lang invented it after reading *The Time Machine*.

⁹⁰ Green writes:

In reading, his most important finds at this time [at Edinburgh Academy] were Thackeray and Tennyson. Even earlier he had made surreptitious attempts to read *Vanity Fair*, when that book was still considered unsuitable for a boy of ten. A little later he found *Pendennis* and *The Newcomes*, but the most important find occurred in 1855, or early the following year, when *The Rose and the Ring* first appeared. 'It was worth while to be twelve years old, when the Christmas books were written by Dickens and Thackeray. I got hold of *The Rose and the Ring* I know, and of the *Christmas Carol*, when they were damp from the press'; and the former of these remained ever Lang's favourite among literary fairy stories, the supreme example of its kind. (16)

⁹¹ Thackeray's 'Cream Tartary' no doubt alludes to 'Great Tartary' in *The Arabian Nights*.

⁹² Lang does not deploy such tiny fairies in his own fairytales, except for *Princess*. However, as the illustrations were drawn before Lang's text was written, it was Doyle who chose the figures rather than Lang himself.

⁹³ Dadd was among those figures who contributed to the revival of the fairies in the nineteenth century through his paintings of *MND*. In her radio play *Come Unto These Yellow Sands* (1985), Angela Carter satirizes the nineteenth-century ways of depicting fairies, foregrounding the typical miniaturization. She reconstructs Dadd's fairy paintings in which she features Titania in Dadd's painting as being frustrated by her size and appearance. Titania complains that the objects in the painting are constricted by the painter with an 'odd' taste, have been scaled down from their original size, and forced to pose in 'odd costumes and dispositions'. Bown argues that the figures of the tiny, feminine and beautiful fairies in the nineteenth century reflect cultural perspectives which would threaten to diminish women both in size and power into a 'caricature of femininity' constructed by male preoccupation, which 'required women to be innocent and diminutive in relation to men' (14).

Bibliography

I. Primary Sources

1. Works by Walter Scott

- Scott, Walter. *The Black Dwarf*. 1816. Ed. Peter Garside. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1993. Print.
- . *The Doom of Devorgoil, a Melo-drama*. 1830. Reprint. Whitefish: Kessinger, 2008. Print.
- . 'The Erl-King'. 1797. Scott *Poetical Works* 443.
- . 'Essay on the Imitations of the Ancient Ballad'. Scott *Minstrelsy* IV: 1-52.
- . Introduction to *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*. Scott *Minstrelsy* I: 55-176.
- . Introduction to *The Monastery* (1830). Reprinted in Scott *Monastery* (Border ed) xxi-xxxix.
- . 'Introduction to the Tale of Tamlane: On the Fairies of Popular Superstition'. Scott *Minstrelsy* II: 300-87.
- . 'Introductory Remarks on Popular Poetry'. Scott *Minstrelsy* I: 1-54.
- . *The Lady of the Lake*. 1810. Scott *Poetical Works* 121-82.
- . *The Lay of the Last Minstrel*. 1805. Scott *Poetical Works* 3-43.
- . 'Letter from Sir Walter Scott to the Author of the Irish Fairy Legends'. 27 April 1825. Croker 342-44.
- . *The Letters of Sir Walter Scott*. Ed. Herbert Grierson. London: Constable, 1932-37. 12 vols. *The Walter Scott Digital Archive, University of Edinburgh*. Web. 5 Apr 2007.
- . *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft*. 1830. Ed. P. G. Maxwell-Stuart.

- London: Wordsworth in Association with the Folklore Society, 2001. Print.
- . *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*. With Notes and Introduction by Sir Walter Scott. 1802. Ed. Thomas F Henderson. Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, 1932. In 4 Vols. Print.
- . *The Monastery*. 1820. Ed. Andrew Lang. Border ed. London: John C Nimmo, 1893. Print.
- . *The Monastery*. 1820. Ed. Penny Fielding. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2000. Print.
- . 'On the Fairies of Popular Superstition'. Introduction to 'The Tale of Tamlane'. Scott *Minstrelsy* II: 300-388.
- . *Peveiril of the Peak*. 1822. Ed. Alison Lumsden. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2007. Print.
- . *The Pirate*. 1822. Eds. Mark Weinstein and Alison Lumsden. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2001. Print.
- . *The Poetical Works of Sir Walter Scott. Including Introduction and Notes*. London: Frederic Warne, [ca1867]. Print.
- . Preface to *The Lay of the Last Minstrel* [2nd ed]. Walter Scott, *The Lay of the Last Minstrel, a Poem*. 2nd ed. London: Longman, Hurst, Rees and Orme, 1805. 7.
- . 'The Shepherd's Tale'. 1799. Lockhart 85-86.
- . *The Supernatural Short Stories of Sir Walter Scott*. Ed. Michael Hayes. London: John Calder, 1977. Print.
- . 'To Archibald Constable'. 12 January 1820. Scott *Letters* VI: 111. *The Walter Scott Digital Archive*. University of Edinburgh Library. Web. 20

June 2007.

- . 'To Edgar Taylor, Esq'. 16 January 1823. Taylor (1888) 305-06.
- . 'To Mr [Jacob] Grimm'. 29 Apr 1814. Scott *Letters* III: 434-39. *The Walter Scott Digital Archive*. University of Edinburgh Library. Web. 5 Apr 2007.
- . 'Wandering Willie's Tale'. 1824. *The Supernatural Short Stories of Sir Walter Scott*. Ed. Michael Hayes. London: John Calder, 77-97. Print.

2. Works by John Black

- Black, John. 'Dissertation I: On Fairies'. Black 3-17.
- . 'Dissertation II: On the Scottish Language'. Black 19-32.
- . 'Dissertation III: On Pastoral Poetry'. Black 33-60.
- . *The Falls of Clyde, or, The Fairies; A Scottish Dramatic Pastoral. In Five Acts. With Three Preliminary Dissertations*. Edinburgh: William Creech; London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, and Orme, and J.Murray, 1806. Collection of National Library of Scotland. Print.
- . *The Falls of Clyde, or, The Fairies; A Scottish Dramatic Pastoral. In Five Acts. With Three Preliminary Dissertations*. Edinburgh: William Creech; London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, and Orme, and J.Murray, 1806. Google Books: Collection of Stanford University Library. Web. 10 August 2012.
- . 'Notes to Dissertation I.' Black 61-73.
- . 'Notes to Dissertation II.' Black 74-81.
- . 'Notes to Dissertation III.' Black 82-101.

3. Works by James Hogg

- Hogg, James. 'All-Hallow-Eve'. *Dramatic Tales*. By the Author of *The Poetic Mirror*[James Hogg]. Vol.2. Edinburgh: James Ballantyne; London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, and Brown, 1817. 3-134. Print. 2 vols.
- . *Anecdotes of Scott*. Ed. Jill Rubenstein. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2004. Print.
- . 'The Bogle O'the Brae: a Queer Courting Story.' *The Club Book: Being Original Tales by James, Picken, Galt, Power, Jerdan, Gower, Moir, Cunningham, Hogg, Ritchie &c*. Ed. The Author of Dominie's Legacy [Andrew Picken]. New York: Harper Brother, 1836. 221-239. Print.
- . *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*. 1818. Ed. Douglas S Mack. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic, 1976. Print.
- . 'George Dobson's Expedition to Hell, and the Souter of Slkirk'. Hogg *Shepherds* 118-141.
- . 'The Haunted Glen'. Hogg *Midsummer* 79-100.
- . 'The Hunt of Eildon. Ancient.' James Hogg, *The Brownie of Bodsbeck and Other Tales*. Vol.2. Edinburgh: William Blackwood; London: John Murray, 1818. 229-344. Print. 2 vols.
- . 'Love's Jubilee'. Hogg *Queer* 120-124.
- . 'The Mermaid'. Hogg *Midsummer* 101-104.
- . *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*. Eds. Jill Rubenstein, Gillian Hughes and Meiko O'Halloran. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2008. Print.
- . 'The Origin of the Fairies'. Hogg *Queer* 157-169.
- . 'The Pilgrims of the Sun'. Hog *Midsummer* 3-50.

- . 'Smithy Cracks'. Hogg *Shepherd's* 163-178.
- . 'Storms'. Hogg *Shepherd's* 1-21.
- . 'Superstition'. Hogg *Midsummer* 67-73.
- . *Queen Hynde*. Eds. Suzanne Gilbert and Douglas S Mack. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1998. Print.
- . *The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Tale*. Ed. Douglas S Mack. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2005. Print.
- . *The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Tale* [1813]. 1813. Ed. Douglas S Mack. Hogg, *Wake* 1-190.
- . *The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Tale* [1819]. 1819. Ed. Douglas S Mack. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2005. Hogg, *Wake* 192-398.
- . *A Queer Book*. Ed. Peter D Garside. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2007. Print.
- . 'The Royal Jubilee: a Scottish Mask'. *The Bush aboon Traquair and The Royal Jubilee*. Ed. Douglas S Mack. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2008. 113-154. Print.
- . *The Shepherd's Calendar*. Ed. Douglas S Mack. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2002. Print.
- . 'Superstition and Grace: an Unearthly Ballad'. Hogg *Queer* 189-196.
- . *Winter Evening Tales*. 1820. Ed. Ian Duncan. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2004. Print.

4. Works by Andrew Lang

- Lang, Andrew, ed. *The Animal Story Book*. London: Longmans, Green, 1896. Print.

- , ed. *The Blue Fairy Book*. Limited ed. on large handmade paper. No. 48 of 113 Copies Printed. Introduction by Andrew Lang. London: Longmans, Green, 1889. Print.
- , ed. *The Blue True Story Book*. London: Longmans, Green, 1896. Print.
- . *The Book of Dreams and Ghosts*. London: Longmans, Green, 1897. Print.
- . *Books and Bookmen*. New York: Coombes, 1886. Print.
- , ed. *The Brown Fairy Book*. London: Longmans, Green, 1904. Print.
- . *Cock Lane and Common-Sense*. 1895. London: Longmans, Green, 1901. Print.
- . Comment on *The Secret Common Wealth of Elves, Fauns, & Fairies: a Study in Folk-lore & Psychical Research*. Kirk 19-61.
- , ed. *The Crimson Fairy Book*. London: Longmans, Green, 1903. Print.
- . *Custom and Myth*. 2nd ed. London: Longmans, 1885. Print.
- . 'Dedication to Joan, Toddles, and Tiny'. Lang *Yellow* vii.
- . 'Dedication to Robert Louis Stevenson'. Kirk 7-8.
- . 'Editorial'. *Folk-Lore* Vol. I 1-3.
- . *Essays in Little*. London: Henry, 1891. Print.
- . 'Fairy'. *Encyclopædia Britannica*. 11th ed. 1910. Print.
- . 'The Fairy Minister'. Kirk 9.
- . 'Ghosts Up To Date'. *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*. Jan 1894: 47-58. Print.
- . 'Ghosts Before the Law'. *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*. Feb 1894: 210-222. Print.
- . *Grass of Parnassus: Rhymes Old and New*. London: Longmans, Green, 1888.

Print.

- . *The Gold of Fairnilee and Other Stories*. 1888. Ed. and Introduction by Gillian Avery. London: Victor Gollancz, 1967. Print.
- , ed. *The Grey Fairy Book*. London: Longmans, Green, 1900. Print.
- , ed. *The Green Fairy Book*. Limited ed. on large handmade paper. No. 82 of 150 Copies Printed. London: Longmans, Green, 1892. Print.
- . *History of English Literature from Beowulf to Swinburne*. London: Longmans, Green, 1912. Print.
- . *A History of Scotland from the Roman Occupation*. Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1902-1903. Print.
- . Introduction to *The Blue Fairy Book*. Lang *Blue* xi-xxii.
- . Introduction to *The Monastery*. Walter Scott, *The Monastery*. Border ed. London: John C. Nimmo, 1893. Vol. I: ix-xxxix. Print.
- . Introduction to *Perrault's Popular Tales*. By Charles Perrault. Ed. Andrew Lang. Oxford: Clarendon, 1888. Print.
- . Introductory Essay and Notes on *The Bride of Lammermoor: and, The Black Dwarf*. By Sir Walter Scott, Bart. Border ed. London: John C. Nimmo, 1893. Print.
- . Introductory Essay and Notes on *Castle Dangerous*. By Sir Walter Scott, Bart. Border ed. London: John C. Nimmo, 1894. Print.
- . *Letters on Literature*. London: Longmans, Green, 1889. Print.
- . *The Library: with a Chapter on Modern Illustrated Books*. London: Macmillan, 1881. Print.
- , ed. *The Lilac Fairy Book*. Longmans, Green, 1910. Print.

- . 'Literary Fairy Tales': Introduction to *Little Johannes*. Eeden v-xix.
- . *Magic and Religion*. London: Longmans, Green, 1901. Print.
- . 'Mythology and Fairy Tales'. *The Fortnightly Review*. May 1873: 618-31. Print.
- . *Old Friends: Essays in Epistolary Parody*. New ed. London: Longmans, Green, 1893. Print.
- , ed. *The Olive Fairy Book*. New York: Longmans, Green, 1907. Print.
- , ed. *The Orange Fairy Book*. London: Longmans, Green, 1906. Print.
- , ed. *The Pink Fairy Book*. London: Longmans, Green, 1897. Print.
- . *The Poetical Works of Andrew Lang*. Edited by Leonora Lang. 4 vols. London: Longmans, Green, 1923. Print.
- . Preface to *Yellow*. Lang *Yellow* ix-xi.
- . *Prince Prigio and Prince Ricardo*. 1889 and 1893. Introduction by Roger Lancelyn Green. Illustrations by D. J. Watkins-Pitchford. London: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1961. Print.
- . *The Princess Nobody*. 1884. Lang *The Gold of Fairnilee and Other Stories* 65-82.
- , ed. *The Red Fairy Book*. London: Longmans, Green, 1890. Print.
- . *Sir Walter Scott and the Border Minstrelsy*. 1910. Teddington: Echo, 2007. Print.
- , ed. *The Violet Fairy Book*. London: Longmans, Green, 1901. Print.
- , ed. *The Yellow Fairy Book*. London: Longmans, Green, 1894. Print.

5. Primary Sources by Other Authors

- Barrie, James M. *Peter Pan and Other Plays*. Ed. Peter Hollindale. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1995. Print.
- . 'To the Five: A Dedication'. Barrie 75-86.
- Burns, Robert. 'On the Late Captain Grose's Peregrinations through Scotland, Collecting the Antiquities of that Kingdom'. 1789. *Poems by Robert Burns: with an Account of his Life and Miscellaneous Remarks on his Writings*. Vol.I. Edinburgh: Trustees of the Late James Morison. 1811. 2 vols. Print. 317-320.
- Carter, Angela. *Come unto These Yellow Sands*. 1985. Carter *The Curious Room: Plays, Film Scripts and an Opera* 33-59.
- . *The Curious Room: Plays, Film Scripts and an Opera*. Ed. with production notes by Mark Bell. London: Chatto & Windus, 1996. Print.
- Child, Francis James, ed. *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*. 1882-98. New York: Dover, 1965. 5 Vols. Print.
- Chaucer, Geoffrey. 'Sir Topaz'. *The Canterbury Tales*. Trans. David Wright. 1986. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1998. 167-73. Print.
- Clarke-Whitfield, John. 'The Goblin Page, Scene from *The Lay of the Last Minstrel*, for Two Trebles & a Bass, with an Accompaniment for the Piano Forte'. London: Preston, 1813. Print.
- . 'The Spirit Scene, "Is it the Roar of Teviot's Tide"'. A Glee for Four Voices. The Poetry from *The Lay of the Last Minstrel*'. London, c1835. Print.
- Cowell, Augusta. 'The Erl King. A Song. The Words Translated from the German by Sir Walter Scott'. London, c1835. Print.

- Craik, Dinah. *Olive*. 1850. Ed. Cora Kaplan. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1999. Print.
- Croker, Thomas Crofton. *Fairy Legends and Traditions of the South of Ireland*. 1825-28. London: John Murray, 1834. Print.
- Cunningham, Allan. 'Character of the Scottish Lowland Fairies'. Cunningham *Nithdale* 293.
- , ed. *Remains of Nithdale and Galloway Song*. London: T. Cadell & W. Davies, 1810. Print.
- Currie, James. 'Essay upon the Scottish Poetry Including the Poetry of Burns'.
Robert Burns. *The Works of Robert Burns: Containing his Life. The Poetry and Correspondence of Dr Currie's Edition*. Eds. John Gibson Lockhart and James Currie. New York: William Pearson, 1835. 84-97. Print.
- Dickens, Charles. *Hard Times*. London: Macmillan, 1985. Print.
- . *The Magic Fishbone*. Seattle: Create Space Independent, 2012. Print.
- Doyle, Arthur Conan. *The Coming of the Fairies*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1922. Print.
- Eeden, Frederick Willem van. *Little Johannes*. Trans. Clara Bell. Introduction by Andrew Lang. London: William Heinemann, 1895. Print.
- Fairy Tales, or, the Court of Oberon: Containing Thirteen Choice Pieces*. Frontispiece Signed, Drawn & Engraved by C. Thomson. Glasgow: Richard Griffin, 1824.
- Fouqué, Friedrich de la Motte. *Undine*. 1811. Trans. Carol Tully. Tully *Romantic Fairy Tales* 53-125.
- Grimm, Jacob and Wilhelm. 'Snow White and Rose Red'. 1857. Trans. Jack Zipes. Zipes *Tradition* 774-78.
- Harvie, Christopher. 'Scott and the Image of Scotland'. *Sir Walter Scott: The*

Long-Forgotten Melody. Ed. Alan Bold. London: Barnes and Noble, 1983.
17-42. Print.

Jacobs, Joseph. *Celtic Fairy Tales.* London: David Nutt, 1892. Print.

---. *English Fairy Tales.* London: David Nutt, 1890. Print.

---. *Indian Fairy Tales.* London : David Nutt, 1892. Print.

Keightley, Thomas. *The Fairy Mythology: Illustrative of the Romance and
Superstition of Various Countries.* London: G. Bell & Sons, 1850. Print.

Kirk, Robert. *An Essay of the Nature and Actions of the Subterranean (and for the
Most Part,) Invisible People, Heretofore Going under the Name of Elves,
Faunes, and Fairies, or the Lyke among the Low-Country Scots, as they are
Described by Those Who Have the Second Sight, and Now to Occasion Further
Inquiry, Collected and Compared, by a Circumspect Inquirer Residing among
the Scottish-Irish in Scotland.* [Ed. Sir Walter Scott and Robert Jamieson?].
London: Longman, et al, 1815. Print.

---. *The Secret Commonwealth.* Ed. Angela Secret. Llandogo: Old Stile, 2005.
Print.

---. *The Secret Common-Wealth & A Short Treatise of Charms and Spels.* Ed.
Stewart Sanderson. The Folklore Society Misteltoe Ser. London: D. S.
Brewer, 1976. Print.

---. *The Secret Commonwealth of Elves, Fauns and Fairies.* Ed. R.B. Cunnighame
Graham. Reprint of 1893 ed. Stirling: Eneas Mackay, 1933. Print.

---. *The Secret Commonwealth of Elves, Fauns and Fairies.* In *Robert Kirk: Walker
between Worlds.* Ed. R. B. Sanders. Shaftesbury: Element, 1990. Print.

---. *The Secret Commonwealth of Elves, Fauns and Fairies.* Ed. Marina Warner.

- New York: New York Review, 2007. Print.
- . *The Secret Commonwealth of Elves, Fauns, & Fairies: A Study in Folk-Lore & Psychical Research*. Ed. Andrew Lang. Second ed. London: David Nutt, 1893. Print.
- . *The Secret Commonwealth or a Treatise Displaying the Chief Curiosities among the People of Scotland as They Are in Use to This Day: Being for the Most Part Singular to that Nation*. In *The Occult Laboratory: Magic, Science and Second Sight in Late Seventeenth-Century Scotland*. Ed. Michael Hunter. Woodbridge: Boydell, 2001. Print.
- . *Secret Commonwealth or A Treatise Displaying the Chief Curiosities as They Are in Use among Divers of the People of Scotland to This Day; Singularities for the Most Part Peculiar to that Nation*. Ed. David Williams. Toddington: Helios, 1964. Print.
- . *The Secret Lives of Elves & Fairies: from the Private Journal of the Rev. Robert Kirk*. Ed. John Matthews. London: Godsfield, 2005. Print.
- Kipling, Rudyard. *Puck of Pook's Hill*. Looe: Stratus, 2009. Print.
- Lodge, David. *The Art of Fiction*. London: Secker and Warburg, 1992. Print.
- MacDonald, George. *The Fantastic Imagination of George MacDonald, Volume I: Essays, The Portent, At the Back of the North Wind, The Flight of the Shadow*. Landisville: Coachwhip, 2008. Print.
- . *The Fantastic Imagination of George MacDonald, Volume II: Phantastes, The Carasoyne, The Wise Woman, Lilith*. Landisville: Coachwhip, 2008. Print.
- . *The Fantastic Imagination of George MacDonald, Volume III: The Princess and the Goblin, The Princess and Curdie, The Light Princess, The History of*

- Photogen and Nycteris, Short Stories*. Landisville: Coachwhip, 2008. Print.
- Manlove, Colin, ed. *An Anthology of Scottish Fantasy Literature*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1996. Print.
- McCracken-Flesher, Caroline. 'Pro Patria Mori: Gendered Nationalism and Cultural Death in Scott's "The Highland Widow"'. *Scottish Literary Journal* 21.2 (1994): 69-78. Print.
- McMaster, Graham. *Scott and Society*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1981. Print.
- Pope, Alexander. *The Rape of the Lock*. 1714. Ed. Elizabeth Gurr. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1990. Print.
- Rossetti, Christina. *Goblin Market*. 1862. Illustrated with etchings by Martin Ware. London: Gollancz, 1980. Print.
- Schetky, John, and James Heats. *Illustrations to Walter Scott, Lay of the Last Minstrel: Consisting of Twelve Views on the Rivers Bothwick, Ettrick, Yarrow, Tiviot [sic], and Tweed. Engraved by J. Heats, R.A. from Designs Taken on the Spot by John C. Schetky*. London: Longman, Hurst, Rees and Orme, 1810. Print.
- Shakespeare, William. *A Midsummer Night's Dream*. 1600. The Arden Shakespeare. Ed. Harold F. Brooks. 1979. London: Thomson Learning, 2004. Print.
- . *Tempest*. 1623. Ed. Stephen Orgel. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2008. Print.
- Spenser, Edmund. *The Faery Queen: Edited from the Best Editions with Memoir, Notes, and Glossary*. London, Chandos Classics, 1879. Print.
- 'Tam Lin'. Ed. Francis James Child. Child I: 335-58.
- Taylor, Edgar. *German Popular Stories and Fairy Tales*. London: Baldwyn, 1823. Print.

- . *German Popular Stories and Fairy Tales. As Told by Gammer Grethel. From the Collection of MM. Grimm. With Illustrations from Designs by George Cruikshank and Ludwig Grimm.* 1839. Rpt. London: George Bell & Sons, 1888. Print.
- . Preface to *German Popular Stories and Fairy Tales as Told by Gammer Grethel.* Taylor iii-vii.
- Thackeray, William Markpeace. *The Rose and the Ring or the History of Prince Giglio and Prince Bulbo.* 1854. The Works of William Makepeace Thackeray. Vol IX: *The Christmas Books of Mr. M. A. Titmarsh etc.* Introduction by Anne Ritchie. Illustrations by William Thackeray and Richard Doyle. London: Smith, Elder: 1898. Print.
- ‘Thomas the Rhymer’. Ed. Francis James Child. Child I: 317-29.
- Tolkien, John Ronald Reuel. *The Lord of the Rings.* 2nd ed. London: Allen & Unwin, 1968. Print.
- Tully, Carol Lisa, ed. *Romantic Fairy Tales.* London: Penguin, 2000. Print.
- Weber, Henry. Letter to Jacob Grimm. 3 May 1814. Brill 501-02.

II. Secondary Sources

- Alexander, Michael. *Medievalism: the Middle Ages in Modern England.* New Haven: Yale UP, 2007. Print.
- Alker, Sharon, and Holly Faith Nelson, eds. *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author.* Farnham: Ashgate, 2009. Print.

- Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. Revised ed. London; New York: Verso, 2006. Print.
- Ashliman, D. L. *Fairy Lore*. Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood, 2006. Print.
- Avery, Gillian. 'British and Irish Fairy Tales'. *Zipes Oxford Companion* 66-78.
- Bhabha, Homi, K. *The Location of Culture*. London: Routledge, 1994. Print.
- . 'Narrating the Nation'. Hutchinson 306-12.
- , ed. *Nation and Narration*. Oxford: Routledge, 1990. Print.
- Barczewski, Stephanie L. *Myth and National Identity in Nineteenth-Century Britain: the Legends of King Arthur and Robin Hood*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2000. Print.
- Beddoe, Stella. 'Fairy Writing and Writers'. Martineau 22-31.
- Bellamy, Liz. 'Regionalism and Nationalism: Maria Edgeworth, Walter Scott and the Definition of Britishness'. *The Regional Novel in Britain and Ireland, 1800-1990*. Ed. K. D. M. Snell. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1998. 54-77. Print.
- Bloedé, Barbara. 'The Witchcraft Tradition in Hogg's Tales and Verse'. *Studies in Hogg and his World* 1(1990): 92-102. Print.
- Branny, Andrzej. 'Walter Scott's *The Monastery* and the Myth of Romantic Middle Ages'. *Kwartalnik Neofilologiczny* 32.4 (1985): 393-404. Print.
- Brill, Edward V K. 'The Correspondence Between Jacob Grimm and Walter Scott'. *Hessische Blätter für Volkskunde* 54 (1963): 489-509. Print.
- Brown, Mary Ellen. 'Placed, Replaced, or Misplaced?: the Ballads' Progress'. *The Eighteenth Century* 47.2-3 (2006): 115-29. *Project Muse*. 5 May 2008.
- 'Biography of Hans Christian Andersen'. An Item on Display. The Hans Christian

- Andersen Museum, Odense. Print.
- Bottigheimer, Ruth B, ed. *Fairy Tales and Society: Illusion, Allusion, and Paradigm*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 1986. Print.
- Bown, Nicola. *Fairies in Nineteenth-century Art and Literature*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2001. Print.
- , Carolyn Burdett, and Pamela Thurschwell, eds. *The Victorian Supernatural*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2004. Print.
- Bowra, C. M. *From Virgil to Milton*. 1945. Rpt. London: Macmillan, 1967.
- Briggs, Julia. *Night Visitors: Rise and Fall of the English Ghost Story*. London: Faber and Faber, 1977. Print.
- Briggs, Katharine M. *The Anatomy of Puck: an Examination of Fairy Beliefs among Shakespeare's Contemporaries and Successors*. 1959. London: Routledge, 2003. Print.
- . *A Dictionary of British Folk-Tales in the English Language*. 1970. London: Routledge, 2004. 2 Vols. Print.
- . *The Dictionary of Fairies: Hobgoblins, Brownies, Bogies and Other Supernatural Creatures*. London: Allen Lane, 1976. Print.
- . 'Fairies'. *A Dictionary of Fairies: Hobgoblins, Brøwnies, Bogies and Other Supernatural Creatures*. By Katharine Briggs. London: Allen Lane, 1976. Print.
- . *The Fairies in Tradition and Literature*. 1967. London: Routledge, 2002. Print.
- . 'The Influence of the Brothers Grimm in England'. *Hessische Blätter für Volkskunde* 54 (1963): 511-24. Print.

- . *The Vanishing People: A Study of Traditional Fairy Beliefs*. London: B. T. Batsford, 1978. Print.
- Broun, Dauvit. *Scottish Independence and the Idea of Britain: from the Picts to Alexander III*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2007. Print.
- , R. J. Finlay, and Michael Lynch, eds. *Image and Identity: the Making and Re-making of Scotland through the Ages*. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1998. Print.
- Buchan, David. 'Hogg and Folktales'. *Studies in Hogg and his World* 4(1993): 91-93. Print.
- Butler, Marilyn. *Jane Austen and the War of Ideas*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1988. Print.
- . *Romantics, Rebels and Reactionaries: English Literature and its Background 1760-1830*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1981. Print.
- Campbell, Ian. 'Enlightenment (1660-1843): the Novel'. Lynch *Oxford Companion* 138-40.
- . 'Nineteenth-Century Non-Fictional Prose'. *The History of Scottish Literature. Vol.III*. Ed. Douglas Gifford. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988. 169-187. Print.
- , ed. *Nineteenth-Century Scottish Fiction: Critical Essays*. Totowa, NJ: Barnes & Noble, 1979. Print.
- Cameron, Keith, ed. *National Identity*. Exeter: Intellect, 1999. Print.
- Carruthers, Gerard, David Goldie, and Alastair Renfrew. Introduction. Carruthers *Beyond Scotland* 11-15.
- , David Goldie, and Alastair Renfrew, eds. *Beyond Scotland: New Contexts for*

- Twentieth-Century Scottish Literature*. New York: Rodopi, 2004. Print.
- , and Liam McIlvanney, eds. *The Cambridge Companion to Scottish Literature*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2012. Print.
- , and Alan Rawes, eds. *English Romanticism and the Celtic World*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2003. Print.
- , and Christopher Whyte. 'Enlightenment and Vernacular'. Gifford et al *Scottish Literature* 105-118. Print.
- Christianson, Aileen. 'Gender and Nation: Debatable Lands and Passable Boundaries'. *Across the Margins: Cultural Identity and Change in the Atlantic Archipelago*. Eds. Glenda Norquay and Gerry Smith. Manchester, Manchester UP, 2002. 67-82. Print.
- . 'Jane Welsh Carlyle: Imaginary Letters and Ghost Publications'. *Carlyle Society Papers* 16 (2007): 16-33. Print.
- Clark, Steve. *Travel Writing and Empire: Postcolonial Theory in Transit*. London: Zed, 1999. Print.
- Clery, E. J. *The Rise of Supernatural Fiction: 1762-1800*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1995. Print.
- Cohen, Jeffrey Jerome. *Of Giants: Sex, Monsters, and the Middle Ages*. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P, 1999. Print.
- Colley, Ann C. *Nostalgia and Recollection in Victorian Culture*. Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1998. Print.
- Colley, Linda. *Britons: Forging the Nation 1707-1837*. 1992. Second ed. New Haven: Yale, 2005. Print.
- Colloms, Brenda. 'Gould, Sabine Baring- (1834-1924)'. *Oxford Dictionary of*

- National Biography*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004. Online ed. 2006. Web. 20 Jan 2006.
- Corson, James C. *Notes and Index to Sir Herbert Grierson's Edition of the Letters of Sir Walter Scott*. Oxford: Clarendon, 1979. Print.
- Cottom, Daniel. 'Sir Walter Scott and the Spirit of the Novel'. G. A. Rosso and Daniel P. Watkins, eds. *Spirits of Fire*. New Jersey: Associated UP, 1990. 131-52. Print.
- Craig, Cairns. *The Modern Scottish Novel: Narrative and the National Imagination*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1998. *NetLibrary: Edinburgh University Library eContent Collection*. OCLC. 2001-2008. Web. 15 Oct 2008.
- . 'Otherwords: Devolution and the Scottish Novel'. Carruthers *Companion* 261-274.
- . 'Scotland and Hybridity'. Carruthers *Beyond Scotland* 229-51.
- . 'Scott's Staging of the Nation'. *Studies in Romanticism* 40.1 (2001): 13-28. Web. 10 May 2008.
- Crawford, Robert. *Devolving English Literature*. Second ed. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2000. Print.
- . 'Scottish Literature and the English Studies'. *The Scottish Invention of English Literature*. Ed. Robert Crawford. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1998. 225-244. Print.
- Cullen, Emily. 'Functions of the Harper Bard Trope and Icon in Constructions of Irish and Scottish Identity'. *The Enclave of My Nation: Cross-currents in Irish and Scottish Studies*. Eds. Shane Alcobia-Murphy and Margaret Maxwell. Aberdeen: AHRC Centre for Irish and Scottish Studies, 2008. 75-92. Print.

‘Cultural Nationalism’. *The Oxford English Dictionary Online*. 2008. Web. 10 Oct 2008.

‘Culture’. *The Oxford English Dictionary Online*. 2008. Web. 25 Oct 2008.

Daiches, David. ‘Scott’s Achievement as a Novelist’. *Walter Scott: Modern Judgements*. Ed. Devlin, D. D. London: Macmillan, 1968. 33-62. Print.

---. ‘Scott’s Waverley: The Presence of the Author’. *Nineteenth-Century Scottish Fiction*. Ed. Ian Campbell. Manchester: Carcanet New, 1979. Print.

Davidson, H. R. Ellis. *Myths and Symbols in Pagan Europe: Early Scandinavian and Celtic Religions*. New York: Syracuse UP, 1988. Print.

Davis, Leith. *Acts of Union: Scotland and the Literary Negotiation of the British Nation 1707-1830*. Stanford: Stanford UP, 1998. Print.

---. ‘The Aftermath of Union’. *Carruthers Companion* 56-70.

---, et al, eds. *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2004. Print.

D’Arcy, Julian Meldon. *Subversive Scott: The Waverley Novels and Scottish Nationalism*. Reykjavík: U of Iceland P, 2005. Print.

Desmond, Adrian. ‘Huxley, Thomas Henry (1825–1895)’. *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004. Online ed. 2006. Web. 20 Jan 2006.

‘Disenchant’. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2006. Web. 10 March 2006.

Donaldson, William. ‘Andrew Lang (1844-1912)’. *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004. Online ed. 2005. Web. 20 Dec 2005.

- Duff, David. *Romanticism and the Uses of Genre*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2009. Print.
- , and Catherine Jones, eds. *Scotland, Ireland, and the Romantic Aesthetic*.
Lewisburg: Bucknell UP, 2007. Print.
- Duncan, Ian. Introduction to *Ivanhoe*. *Ivanhoe*. Walter Scott. Oxford: Oxford
UP, 1998. vii-xxvi. Print.
- . Introduction to *Winter Evening Tales*. Hogg *Winter* xi-xli.
- . 'Scott and the Historical Novel: a Scottish Rise of the Novel'. Carruthers
Companion 103-116.
- . 'Scott, Hogg, Orality and the Limits of Culture'. *Studies in Hogg and his World*
8 (1997): 56-74. Print.
- . *Scott's Shadow: the Novel in Romantic Edinburgh*. Princeton: Princeton UP,
2007. Print.
- . 'The Upright Corpse: Hogg, National Literature and the Uncanny'. *Studies in*
Hogg and his World 5 (1994): 29-54. Print.
- . 'Walter Scott, James Hogg and Scottish Gothic'. *A Companion to the Gothic*.
Ed. David Punter. Oxford: Blackwell, 2000. 71-80. Print.
- , et al. Introduction to *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*. Davis *Scotland*
1-19.
- Dundes, Alan. 'Fairy Tales from a Folkloristic Perspective'. Bottigheimer 259-269.
- Dunnigan, Sarah M. 'Away with the Fairies and Back Again: (Re) reading Robert
Kirk'. *Edinburgh Review* 132 (2011): 57-66. Print.
- . 'Enchanting the Nation: Scottish Fairy Tale Collectors and Creators in the Early
Nineteenth Century'. Unpublished Paper. 'The European Folk Revival,
1760-1914': International Interdisciplinary Conference. Sheffield: Centre for

- Nineteenth-Century Studies, U of Sheffield. 7 September 2007. [This paper is consulted and quoted with the author's permission]
- . 'The Enchanted Worlds of Scott, Scotland, and the Grimms'. *Scotland and the Nineteenth Century World*. Eds. Gerard Carruthers, et al. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2011. 249-270. Print.
- . 'Fairy Tales and Scottish Culture'. Lecture for the University of Glasgow. Glasgow: U of Glasgow. 11 May 2007. Unpublished Paper. [This paper is consulted and quoted with the author's permission]
- . 'Hogg, Fairies, and Mary Queen of Scots'. Hogg Conference. Stirling: U of Stirling. Aug 2007. Conference Paper. [This paper is consulted and quoted with the author's permission]
- . 'Literary Metamorphoses: the Reframing of Enchantment in Cromeck, Cunningham, and Chambers'. *The Voice of the People: Writing the European Folk Revival, 1760-1914*. Eds. Matthew Campbell and Michael Perraudin. London: Anthem, 2012. Print.
- . 'Return of the Repressed'. Carruthers *Beyond* 112-131.
- . *The Scottish Ballads*. Glasgow: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2005.
- . "'Strange Stories': Collecting, Translating, and Imagining Mermaids in Early Nineteenth-Century Scotland'. *Sun Yat-sen Journal of Humanities* 30 (2011): 19-46. Print.
- Durie, Alastair. "'Scotland is Scott-Land': Scott and the Development of Tourism'. *Pittock Reception* 313-322.
- 'Dwarf'. *The Oxford English Dictionary Online*. 2009. Oxford UP. Web. 10 Jan 2009.

- Edwards, Owen Dudley. 'Doyle, Sir Arthur Ignatius Conan (1859–1930)'. *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Online ed. 2013. Oxford UP. Web. 7 July 2013.
- 'Elf'. *The Oxford English Dictionary Online*. 2009. Oxford UP. Web. 10 Jan 2009.
- Ellis, John. *One Fairy Story Too Many: The Brothers Grimm and Their Tales*. Chicago, U of Chicago P, 1983. Print.
- Empson, William. 'Elizabethan Spirits'. William Empson, *Essays on Renaissance Literature Vol.II: The Drama*. Ed. John Haffenden. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1994. 155-169. Print.
- . "The Spirits of the *Dream*". William Empson, *Essays on Renaissance Literature Vol.II: The Drama*. Ed. John Haffenden. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1994. 170-248. Print.
- Eriksonas, Linas. *National Heroes and National Identities: Scotland, Norway and Lithuania*. Brussels: P.I.E.-Peter Lang, 2004. Print.
- 'Faery'. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web. 24 Oct 2005.
- 'Fairy'. *Britannica Concise Encyclopedia*. 2005. Encyclopædia Britannica Premium Service. 2005. Web. 24 Oct 2005.
- 'Fairy'. *Columbia Encyclopedia*. 6th ed. 2005. *Encyclopedia.com*. Web. 24 Oct 2005.
- 'Fairy'. *Encyclopædia Britannica*. 1st ed. 1771. Print.
- 'Fairy'. *Encyclopædia Britannica*. 14th ed. 1929. Print.
- 'Fairy'. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web.

10 Jan 2009.

‘Fairy-tale’. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005.

Web. 24 Oct 2005.

Fielding, Penny, ed. *The Edinburgh Companion to Robert Louis Stevenson*.

Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2010. Print.

---. ‘Essay on the Text’. *Scott Monastery* (2000), 355-400. Print.

---. ‘Living, and Life-Like: Stories and Things in The Three Perils of Man’.

Studies in Hogg and his World 5 (1994):70-81. Print.

---. *Scotland and the Fictions of Geography: North Britain 1760-1830*. Cambridge:

Cambridge UP, 2008. Print.

---. *Writing and Orality: Nationality, Culture, and Nineteenth-Century Scottish Fiction*.

Oxford: Clarendon, 1996. Print.

Finkelstein, David. ‘Long and Intimate Connections’: Constructing a Scottish Identity

for Blackwood’s Magazine. *Nineteenth-Century Media and the Construction*

of Identities. Eds. Laurel Brake, Bill Bell and David Finkelstein.

Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2000. 326-38. Print.

The Folk-Lore Society. *Folk-Lore: A Quarterly Review of Myth, Tradition, Institution,*

& Custom. Vol. I. London: David Nutt, 1890. Print.

---. *Folk-Lore: A Quarterly Review of Myth, Tradition, Institution, & Custom*. Vol.

II. London: David Nutt, 1891. Print.

---. *Folk-Lore: A Quarterly Review of Myth, Tradition, Institution, & Custom*.

Vol. III. London: David Nutt, 1892. Print.

---. *Folk-Lore: A Quarterly Review of Myth, Tradition, Institution, & Custom*.

Vol. IV. London: David Nutt, 1893. Print.

- . *Folk-Lore: A Quarterly Review of Myth, Tradition, Institution, & Custom*. Vol. V. London: David Nutt, 1894. Print.
- . *Folk-Lore: A Quarterly Review of Myth, Tradition, Institution, & Custom*. Vol. VII. London: David Nutt, 1896. Print.
- . *Folk-Lore: A Quarterly Review of Myth, Tradition, Institution, & Custom*. Vol. XII. London: David Nutt, 1902. Print.
- . *The Folk-Lore Journal*. Vol. VII. London: Elliot Stock, 1889. Print.
- . *The Folk-Lore Record*. Part I. London: Folk-Lore Society, 1878. Print.
- Fontana, Ernest. 'Rosetti's Carlisle Wall and Scott's Lay of the Last Minstrel'. *The Victorian Newsletter* 86 (1994): 23-30. Print.
- Frantzen, Allen J. *Desire for Origins: New Language, Old English, and Teaching the Tradition*. New Jersey: Rutgers UP, 1990. Print.
- Fraser, James G. *The Golden Bough*. London: MacMillan, 1922. Print.
- . 'Taboo'. *Encyclopædia Britannica*. 9th ed. 1878. Print.
- . 'Totemism'. *Encyclopædia Britannica*. 9th ed. 1878. Print.
- Gamer, Michael. *Romanticism and the Gothic: Genre, Reception, and Canon Formation*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2000. Print.
- Garside, Peter, D. 'Essay on the Text'. Scott *Black Dwarf*, 125-74.
- . Introduction to *A Queer Book*. Hogg, *Queer* xi-xxxvii.
- . 'Popular Fiction and National Tale: the Hidden Origins of Sir Walter Scott's *Waverley*'. *Nineteenth Century Literature* 46.1 (1991): 30-53. Web. 10 July 2008.
- Gellner, Ernest. *Nations and Nationalism*. New York: Cornell UP, 1983.
- . 'Nationalism and High Cultures'. Hutchinson 63-70.

- Gere, Charlotte. 'In Fairyland'. Martineau 62-73.
- Gifford, Douglas, ed. *The History of Scottish Literature. Vol. III: Nineteenth Century*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988. Print.
- . *James Hogg*. Edinburgh: Ramsay Head, 1976. Print.
- , and Alan Riach. 'Making Poetry out of Scotland'. Introduction to *Scotlands: Poets and the Nation*. Eds. Douglas Gifford and Alan Riach. Manchester: Carcanet, 2004. xvii-xxxv. Print.
- , et al, eds. *Scottish Literature*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2002. Print.
- Gilbert, Robert A, ed. *Victorian Sources of Fairy Tales*. Bristol: Thoemmes, 2003
- Gilbert, Suzanne. 'Hogg's "Kilmeny" and the Ballad of Supernatural Abduction.' *Studies in Hogg and His World* 8 (1997): 42-55. Print.
- . 'James Hogg and the Authority of Tradition'. Alker and Nelson 93-110.
- 'Glamour'. *Concise Scots Dictionary*. 1985. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2005. Print.
- 'Glamour'. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web. 24 Oct 2005.
- 'Gnome'. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web. 10 Jan 2009.
- 'Goblin'. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web. 10 Jan 2009.
- Gomme, Robert. 'Gomme, Sir (George) Laurence (1853–1916)'. *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004. Online ed. 2005. Web. 20 Dec 2005.

- Goslee, Nancy Moore. *Scott the Rhymer*. Kentucky: Kentucky UP, 1988. Print.
- Graham, R. B. Cunninghame. Introduction to *The Secret Commonwealth of Elves, Fauns, & Fairies: a Study in Folk-lore & Psychical Research*. Kirk 11-18.
- ‘Gramarye’. *Concise Scots Dictionary*. 1985. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2005. Print.
- ‘Gramarye’. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web. 12 Dec 2008.
- Green, Roger Lancelyn. *Andrew Lang: A Critical Biography with a Short-title Bibliography of the Works of Andrew Lang*. Leicester: E. Ward, 1946. Print.
- . Preface. Green vii-xi.
- Greenblatt, Stephen. *Renaissance Self-Fashioning: from More to Shakespeare*. 1980. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1984. Print.
- . ‘Wild Bill’. *London Review of Books* 16.20(1994): 31-32. Web. 15 Jan 2013.
- Groves, David. Introduction. James Hogg, *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*. Ed. David Groves. Edinburgh: Canongate, 1991. Print.
- Häcker, Martina. ‘Literary Dialects and Communication in *The Tale of Old Mortality* and *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*’. *Studies in Hogg and his World* 8(1997): 1-11. Print.
- Harkin, Patricia. ‘The Fop, the Fairy, and the Genres of Scott’s *Monastery*’. *Studies in Scottish Literature* 19 (1984): 177-93. Print.
- Harmish, Samuel W. Jr. ‘James Hogg: The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner and Manufactured Tradition’. *Studies in Hogg and his World* 17 (2006): 36-48. Print.
- Harris, Jason Marc. *Folklore and the Fantastic in Nineteenth-Century British Fiction*.

- Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008. Print.
- . 'National Borders, Contiguous Cultures, and Fantastic Folklore in Hogg's *The Three Perils of Man*'. *Studies in Hogg and his World* (14) 2003: 38-61. Print.
- Harrison, Robert. 'Black, John (1783–1855).' Rev. M. Clare Loughlin-Chow. *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004. Online ed. 2005. Web. 15 Aug 2012.
- Hartland, E. Sydney. 'Report on Folk-tale Research'. *Folk-Lore* Vol. II.
- . 'Report on Folk-tale Research'. *Folk-Lore* Vol. III.
- . 'Report on Folk-tale Research'. *Folk-Lore* Vol. IV.
- Henderson, Lizanne. 'The Road to Elfland: Fairy Belief and the Child Ballads'. *The Ballad in Scottish History*. Ed. Edward J. Cowan. Edinburgh: Tuckwell, 2000. 54–72. Print.
- , and Edward J. Cowan. *Scottish Fairy Belief: A History*. East Linton: Tuckwell, 2001. Reprint. East Linton: Tuckwell, 2004. Print.
- Henderson, Thomas F. 'Editor's Prefatory Note'. *Scott Minstrelsy* I: ix-xxxv.
- . Notes on *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*. *Scott Minstrelsy* passim.
- Hepworth, Walter. 'Fairy'. *Encyclopædia Britannica*. 9th ed. 1787. VIII: 854-855. Print.
- Hines, Sara. 'Collecting the Empire: Andrew Lang's Fairy Books (1889-1910)'. *Marvels & Tales* 24.1(2010): 39-56. Web. 16 July 2012.
- . *Taste of the World: a Re-evaluation of the Publication History and Reception Context of Andrew Lang's Fairy Book Series, 1889-1910*. 2012. 2nd ed. Diss. U of Edinburgh, 2013. Web. 1 Dec 2013.

- ‘History of Europe’. *Britannica Online*. Library ed. 2008. *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Web. 10 Oct 2008.
- ‘Hobgoblin’. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web. 10 Jan 2009.
- Hobsbawm, Eric, J. *Nations and Nationalism since 1780: Programme, Myth and Reality*. 1990. Second ed. Rpt. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2000. Print.
- , and Terence Ranger, eds. *The Invention of Tradition*. 1983. Canto ed. Rpt. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1996. Print.
- Howe, Nicholas. *Migration and Mythmaking in Anglo-Saxon England*. New Haven: Yale UP, 1989. Print.
- Hubbard, Tom. ‘European Reception of Scott’s Poetry: Translation as the Front Line’. *Pittock Reception* 268-284.
- Hughes, George E.H. *Reading Novels*. Nashville: Vanderbilt UP, 2002. Print.
- Hughes, Gillian. *James Hogg: a Life*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2007. Print.
- Hunter, Michael. Introductory Notes on the Texts [of Robert Kirk’s *Secret Commonwealth*]. *The Occult Laboratory*.
- Hutchinson, John. *The Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism: the Gaelic Revival and the Creation of the Irish Nation State*. London: Allen & Unwin, 1987. Print.
- , and Anthony D. Smith, eds. *Nationalism*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1994. Print.
- ‘Identity’. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web. 10 Oct 2008.
- Jackson, Russel. ‘Shakespeare’s Fairies in Victorian Criticism and Performance’. *Martineau* 38-45.

- Kerkering, Jack. "'We are Five-and-Forty': Meter and National Identity in Sir Walter Scott". *Studies in Romanticism* 40.1 (2001): 85-98. Web. 8 May 2008.
- Kidd, Colin. *Subverting Scotland's Past: Scottish Whig Historians and the Creation of an Anglo-British Identity, 1689-c.1830*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1993. Print.
- . *British Identities before Nationalism: Ethnicity and Nationhood in the Atlantic World, 1600-1800*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1999. Print.
- Krappe, Alexander H. 'Folklore and Mythology'. Maria Leach 403-408.
- Lamboune, Lionel. 'Fairies and the Stage'. Martineau 46-53.
- Lamont, Claire, and Michael Rossington, eds. *Romanticism's Debatable Lands*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007. Print.
- Langstaff, Eleanor De Selms. *Andrew Lang*. Boston: Twayne, 1978.
- Leach, MacEdward. 'Fairy'. Maria Leach 363-65.
- Leach, Maria. *Dictionary of Folklore, Mythology and Legend*. New York: Funk and Wagnalls, 1949. 2 vols. Print.
- Lee, Yoon Sun. 'Giants in the North: Douglas, the Scottish Enlightenment, and Scott's *Redgauntlet*'. *Studies in Romanticism* 40.1 (2001): 109-21. *Literature Online*. Web. 8 May 2008.
- Leith, Davis. *Acts of Union: Scotland and the Literary Negotiation of the British Nation, 1707-1830*. Stanford: Stanford UP, 1998. Print.
- . 'The Aftermath of Union'. Carruthers *Companion* 56-70.
- Letley, Emma. *From Galt to Douglas Brown: Nineteenth-Century Fiction and Scots Language*. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic, 1988. Print.
- Lincoln, Andrew. 'Walter Scott and the Birth of the Nation'. *Romanticism* 8.1

- (2002): 1-17. Print.
- . *Walter Scott and Modernity*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2007. Print.
- Lockhart, John Gibson. *Memoirs of the Life of Sir Walter Scott, Bart.* 1836. New ed. Edinburgh: Robert Cadell, 1842. Print.
- . Notes on *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*. *Scott Minstrelsy* passim.
- Luckhurst, Roger. 'Knowledge, Belief and the Supernatural at the Imperial Margin'. Bown, Burdett, and Thurschwell 197-216. Print.
- Lüthi, Max. *The European Folk Tale: Form and Nature*. Trans. John D Niles. Bloomington: Indiana UP, 1982. Print.
- Lyle, Emily. 'The Burns Text of Tam Lin'. *Scottish Studies* 15 (1971): 53-65. Print.
- . *Fairies and Folk: Approaches to the Scottish Ballad Tradition*. Trier: WVT, 2007. Print.
- . Introduction to *Scottish Ballads*. *Lyle Ballads* 9-19.
- , ed. *Scottish Ballads*. Edinburgh: Canongate, 1994.
- Lynch, Michael. 'National Identity: 1500-1700'. *Lynch Oxford Companion* 439-41.
- , ed. *The Oxford Companion to Scottish History*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2001. Print.
- . *Scotland: a New History*. 1991. Pimlico ed. Rpt. London: Pimlico, 2008. Print.
- Maas, Jeremy. 'Victorian Fairy Painting'. *Martineau* 10-21.
- Mack, Douglas S. 'Hogg's Bardic Epic: Queen Hynde and Macpherson's *Ossian*'. Alker and Nelson 139-156.
- . 'Hogg and Angels'. *Studies in Hogg and his World* 15(2004): 90-98. Print.

- . Introduction to *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*. Hogg, *Brownie of Bodsbeck* ix-xix.
- . Introduction to *The Queen's Wake*. Hogg, *Wake* xi-ixxxvi.
- . Introduction to *The Shepherd's Calendar*. Hogg, *Calendar* xi-xxxix.
- . 'Notes on the Text'. Hogg, *Brownie of Bodsbeck* xx-xxvii.
- Manlove, Colin, ed. *An Anthology of Scottish Fantasy Literature*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1996. Print.
- . Introduction to *An Anthology of Scottish Fantasy Literature*. Manlove *Anthology* 7-18.
- . *Scottish Fantasy Literature: A Critical Survey*. Edinburgh: Canongate Academic, 1994. Print.
- Manning, Susan. 'Antiquarianism and the Scottish Science of Man'. Davis *Borders* 57-76.
- . 'Walter Scott, Antiquarianism and the Political Discourse of the *Edinburgh Review*, 1802-11'. *British Romanticism and the Edinburgh Review: Bicentenary Essays*. Eds. Massimiliano Demata and Duncan Wu. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2002. 102-23. Print.
- Martineau, Jane, ed. *Victorian Fairy Painting*. London: Royal Academy of Arts, 1997. Print.
- Mason, Roger A. 'National Identity: from the Wars of Independence to John Mair'. Lynch *Oxford Companion* 438-39.
- Mayhew, Ernest. 'Robert Louis Stevenson (1850-1894)'. *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. 2004. Online ed. 2005. Web. 20 Dec 2005.
- McCracken-Flesher, Caroline. 'The Fourth Peril of James Hogg: Walter Scott and the

- Demonology of Minstrelsy'. *Studies in Hogg and His World* 11 (2000): 39-55. Print.
- . *Possible Scotlands: Walter Scott and the Story of Tomorrow*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2005. Print.
- McLane, Maureen N. 'Dating Orality, Thinking Balladry: of Milkmaids and Minstrels in 1771'. *The Eighteenth Century* 47.2-3 (2006): 131-49. *Project Muse*. Web. 10 May 2008.
- . 'The Figure Minstrelsy Makes: Poetry and Historicity'. *Critical Inquiry* 29.3 (2003): 429-52. Print.
- McNeill, Marian, F. *The Silver Bough*. 1956. Edinburgh: Canongate, 2001. Print.
- . *The Silver Bough: a Four Volume Study of the National and Local Festivals of Scotland*. 1957. Rpt. Glasgow: William MacLellan, 1977. Print.
- Merton, Ambrose [William J Thoms]. 'Folk-Lore'. *The Athenæum* 22 Aug 1846: 862-63. Print.
- Michaelis-Jena, Ruth. *The Brothers Grimm*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1970. Print.
- Millgate, Jane. 'Scott's *Lay of the Last Minstrel*: the History of a Book'. *European Romantic Review* 13.3 (2002): 225-38. Print.
- Mitchell, Jerome. *Scott, Chaucer, and Medieval Romance: A Study of Sir Walter Scott's Indebtedness to the Literature of the Middle Ages*. Kentucky: UP of Kentucky, 1987. Print.
- Morrison, John. *Painting the Nation: Identity and Nationalism in Scottish Painting, 1800-1920*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2003. Print.

- Morton, Timothy. 'John Clare and the Question of Place'. Lamont and Rossington 105-117.
- Murray, Damien. *Romanticism, Nationalism and Irish Antiquarian Societies, 1840-80*. Maynooth: Dep of Old and Middle Irish, National U of Ireland, 2000. Print.
- Nairn, Tom. *After Britain: New Labour and the Return of Scotland*. London: Granta, 2000. Print.
- Nash, Andrew. 'Victorian Scottish Literature'. Carruthers *Companion* 145-158.
- 'Nation'. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web. 10 Oct 2008.
- 'National Identity'. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web. 10 Oct 2008.
- 'Nationalism'. *Britannica Online*. Library ed. 2008. *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Web. 10 Oct 2008.
- 'Nationalism'. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web. 10 Oct 2008.
- 'Nationalize'. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web. 25 Oct 2008.
- The National Library of Scotland. 'An Essay of the Nature and Actions of the Subterranean (and for the Most Part,) Invisible People, Heretofore Going under the Name of Elves, Faunes, and Fairies, or the Lyke among the Low-Country Scots, as they are Described by Those Who Have the Second Sight, and Now to Occasion Further Inquiry, Collected and Compared, by a Circumspect Inquirer Residing among the Scottish-Irish in Scotland'. Record of Online Catalogue. Web. 12 Nov 2007.

- Nielsen, Hans Frede. 'Jacob Grimm and the "German Dialects"'. *The Grimm Brothers and the Germanic Past*. Ed. Elmer H Antonsen. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 1990. Print.
- Nielsen, Jørgen Erik. "'His pirates had forey'd on Scottish hill': Scott in Denmark with an Overview of his Reception in Norway and Sweden'. *Pittock Reception* 251-267.
- Nikolajeva, Maria. 'Hans Christian Andersen'. *Zipes Oxford Companion* 13-14.
- Niles, John D. 'Appropriations: A Concept of Culture'. *Anglo-Saxonism and the Constitution of Social Identity*. Eds. Allen J. Frantzen and John D. Niles. Gainesville: UP of West Florida, 1997. 202-228. Print.
- O'Halloran, Meiko. "'Circling the Pales of Heaven": Hogg and Otherworld Journeys from Dante and Byron'. Hogg *Midsummer* lxxvii-ci.
- . 'Hogg, Queen of Scots, and the Illustrations to *The Queen's Wake*. Hogg, *Wake* lxxxvii-cxiii.
- Oliver, Susan. "'Looking Back upon a Highland Prospect": Scott, *The Lady of the Lake*, and the Lowland/Celtic Fringe'. Lamont and Rossington 39-51.
- Parsons, Coleman O. 'Association of the White Lady with Wells'. *Folk-lore* 44.3 (1933): 295-305. *JSTOR*. Web. 14 Jan 2009.
- . *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction*. Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1964. Print.
- Pittock, Murray, G. H. *Celtic Identity and the British Image*. Manchester: Manchester UP, 1999. Print.
- . 'Enlightenment, Romanticism and the Scottish Canon: Cosmmopolites or Narrow Nationalists?' *Carruthers Companion* 86-102.

- . 'Introduction: Scott and the European Nationalities Question'. *Pittock Reception* 1-10.
- . *Inventing and Resisting Britain: Cultural Identities in Britain and Ireland, 1685-1789*. Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1997. Print.
- . 'James Hogg: Scottish Romanticism, Song, and the Public Sphere'. Alker and Nelson 111-122.
- , ed. *The Reception of Sir Walter Scott in Europe*. London: Continuum, 2006.
- . *Scottish and Irish Romanticism*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2008. Print.
- 'Physical Culture'. *Britannica Online*. Library ed. 2008. *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Web. 10 Oct 2008.
- Porter, Roy and Miculáš Teich, eds. *Romanticism: in National Context*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1988. Print.
- Pratt, Lynda. 'Anglo-Saxon Attitudes?: Alfred the Great and the Romantic National Epic'. Scragg and Weinberg 138-56.
- Propp, Vladimir. *Morphology of the Folktale*. Second ed. Trans. Laurence Scott. Ed. Louis A. Wagner. Austin: U of Texas P, 1968. Print.
- Punter, David. 'Scottish Gothic'. Carruthers *Companion* 132-144.
- Purdie, Rhiannon, and Nicola Royan, eds. *The Scots and Medieval Arthurian Legend*. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 2005. Print.
- Purkiss, Diane. *At the Bottom of the Garden: A Dark History of Fairies, Hobgoblins, and Other Troublesome Things*. New York: New York UP, 2001. Print.
- Quint, David. *Epics and Empire: Politics and Generic Form from Virgil to Milton*. Princeton: Princeton UP, 1993. Print.
- Ralston, W. R. S. 'Notes on Folk-Tales'. *The Folk-Lore Record*. Part I.

- Reitemeier, Frauke. 'The Reception of Sir Walter Scott in German Literary Histories, 1820-1945'. *Pittock Reception* 95-116.
- Renan, Ernest. 'Qu'est-ce qu'une nation?' Trans. Hutchinson and Smith 17-18.
- 'Reply: J. O. The "Falls of Clyde," Etc.' *Notes and Queries* 8 March 1862: 194. Web. 5 June 2012.
- Rose, Carol. *Spirits, Fairies, Gnomes, and Goblins: an Encyclopedia of the Little People*. 1996. Oxford: ABC-CLIO, 1998. Print.
- Rowland, Ann Wierda. "'The Fause Nourice Sang': Childhood, Child Murder, and the Formalism of the Scottish Ballad Revival'. Davis *Borders* 225-44.
- Said, Edward, W. *Orientalism*. 1978. 25th Anniversary ed. New York: Vintage, 2003. Print.
- Sadler, Glenn Edward. 'MacDonald, George (1824-1905)'. *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004. Online ed. 2005. Web. 15 Nov 2013.
- Sandner, David. 'Supernatural Modernity in Walter Scott's *Redgauntlet* and James Hogg's *Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*'. *Extrapolation* 48.1(2007): 73-84. Literature Online. Web. 19 Sep 2008.
- Saunders, Andrew. 'Utter Indifference?: the Anglo-Saxons in the Nineteenth-century Novel'. Scragg and Weinberg 157-73.
- Schacker, Jennifer. *National Dreams: The Remaking of Fairy Tales in Nineteenth-Century England*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2003. Print.
- Scragg, Donald and Carole Weinberg, eds. *Literary Appropriations of the Anglo-Saxons from the Thirteenth to the Twentieth Century*. Cambridge:

- Cambridge UP, 2000. Print.
- ‘Second Sight’. *Oxford Dictionary of English*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2005.
- Seize, Gabriele Von. *Grimu Kyoudai: Shougai, Sakuhin, Jidaji* [*Die Bruder Grimm: Leben-Weit-Zeit (The Brothers Grimm: Life-World-Time)*]. In Japanese. The Original German Edition Published in 1984. Trans. Masafumi and Mariko Takagi. Tokyo: Seitosha, 1999. Print.
- Sherbo, Arthur. ‘Thoms, William John (1803–1885)’. *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: Oxford U P, 2004. Online ed. 2005. Web. 26 Feb 2006.
- Shippey, Tom. ‘A Revolution Reconsidered: Mythography and Mythology’. Shippey 1-28.
- , ed. *The Shadow-Walkers: Jacob Grimm’s Mythology of the Monstrous*. Arizona: Arizona Board of Regents, 2005. Print.
- Silver, Carole G. ‘Sir Walter Scott’. *Zipes Oxford Companion* 456.
- . *Strange and Secret Peoples: Fairies and Victorian Consciousness*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1999. Print.
- Smith, Anthony D. *Myths and Memories of the Nation*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1999.
- . *National Identity*. 1991. U of Nevada P ed. Reno: U of Nevada P, 1993. Print.
- Sorensen, Janet. ‘The Debatable Borders of English and Scottish Song and Ballad Collections’. Lamont and Rossington 80-91.
- Stafford, Fiona, J. *The Last of the Race: the Growth of a Myth from Milton to Darwin*. Oxford: Clarendon, 1994. Print.
- . ‘Writing on the Borders’. Lamont and Rossington 13-26.

- Stewart, Marion. 'King Orpheus'. *Scottish Studies: the Journal of the School of Scottish Studies, University of Edinburgh* 17 (1973): 1-16. Print.
- Stott, Louis. 'Kirk, Robert (1644–1692)'. *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004. Online ed. 2005. Web. 20 Dec 2005.
- 'Supernatural'. *Oxford English Dictionary*. 2nd ed. 1989. *OED Online*. 2005. Web. 24 Oct 2005.
- Takahashi, Kazuhisa. 'Etorikku no Hitsujikai, Arui wa, Hitsujikai no Retorikku: Jeimuzu Hoggu no Fukken o Megutte [The Ettrick Shepherd, or, the Rhetoric of a Shepherd: a Study on the Revaluation of James Hogg]'. *Eigo Seinen/Rising Generation* 137.1 (1991): 19-21. Print.
- . 'Etorikku no Hitsujikai, Arui wa, Hitsujikai no Retorikku [*The Ettrick Shepherd, or, the Rhetoric of a Shepherd*]'. *Eigo Seinen/Rising Generation* 143.1 (1997): 2-4; 143.2 (1997): 78-80; 143.3 (1997): 118-120, 143.4 (1997): 190-192, 143.5 (1997): 250-252; 143.6 (1997): 321-323; 143.7 (1997): 382-384; 143.8 (1997): 466-68; 143.9 (1997): 545-547; 143.9 (1997): 594-596, 143.11 (1998): 654-656; 143.12 (1998): 712-714; 144.1 (1998): 41-43; 144.2 (1998): 107-109; 144.3 (1998): 158-160; 144.4 (1998): 210-212; 144.5 (1998): 275-277; 144.6 (1998): 344-346; 144.7 (1998): 414-416; 144.8 (1998): 472-474; 144.9 (1998): 532-534; 144.10 (1999): 610-12; 144.11 (1999): 640-42; 144.12 (1999): 762-64. Print.
- . *Etorikku no Hitsujikai, Arui wa, Hitsujikai no Retorikku [The Ettrick Shepherd, or, the Rhetoric of a Shepherd]*. Tokyo: Kenkyusha, 2004. Print.
- 'Thomas Rhymer'. Manlove *An Anthology of Scottish Fantasy Literature* 29-31.
- Thompson, Stith. 'Fairy Tale'. Maria Leach 365-66.

- Thoms, William J. Preface. *The Folk-Lore Record* Part I xiii-xvi.
- Tolkien, John Ronald Reuel. 'On Fairy-Stories'. 1938. An Andrew Lang Lecture
Delivered before the University of St. Andrews. *Tree and Leaf*. By J R R
Tolkien. London: George Allen & Unwin, 1964. 11-70. Print.
- Trevor-Roper, Hugh. *The Invention of Scotland: Myth and History*. New Haven;
London: Yale UP, 2008. Print.
- Trimpe, Pamela White. 'Victorian Fairy Book Illustration'. Martineau 54-61.
- Trumpener, Katie. *Bardic Nationalism: The Romantic Novel and the British Empire*.
Princeton: Princeton UP, 1997. Print.
- Tully, Carol Lisa. *Creating a National Identity: A Comparative Study of German and
Spanish Romanticism with Particular Reference to the Märchen of Ludwig
Tieck, the Brothers Grimm and Clemens Brentano, and the costumbrismo of
Blanco White, Estébanez Calderón, and López Soler*. Stuttgart: Verlag
Hans-Dieter Heinz, 1997. Print.
- . Introduction to *Romantic Fairy Tales*. Tully *Romantic Fairy Tales* vii-xx.
- Warrack, John. 'Fairy Music'. Martineau 32-37.
- Watson, Fiona. 'Wars of Independence'. *Lynch Companion* 333-36.
- Wickman, Matthew. 'The Emergence of Scottish Studies'. Carruthers *Companion*
248-260.
- Williams, Lynn. 'National Identity and the Nation State: Construction, Reconstruction
and Contradiction'. Cameron 7-18.
- Wood, Harriet Harvey. 'Scott and Jamieson: The Relationship between Two
Ballad-Collectors'. *Studies in Scottish Literature*. 9 (1971-2): 71-96.
Print.

- Woodcock, Matthew. *Fairy in The Faerie Queene: Renaissance Elf-Fashioning and Elizabethan Myth-Making*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. Print.
- Woolf, Stuart, ed. *Nationalism in Europe, 1815 to Present: a Reader*. London: Routledge, 1996. Print.
- Yoshino, Yuki. "Writing the Borders: Fairies and Ambivalent National Identity in Andrew Lang's *The Gold of Fairnilee*". *The Enclave of My Nation: Crosscurrents in Irish and Scottish Studies*. Eds. Shane Alcobia-Murphy and Margaret Maxwell. Aberdeen: Arts & Humanities Research Council Centre for Irish and Scottish Studies, 2008. 227-241. Print.
- Zipes, Jack. *Breaking the Magic Spell: Radical Theories of Folk and Fairy Tales*. 1979. Revised and Expanded ed. Kentucky: UP of Kentucky, 2002. Print.
- . *The Brothers Grimm: from Enchanted Forests to the Modern World*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2002. Print.
- . *Fairy Tales and the Art of Subversion*. Second ed. New York: Routledge, 2006. Print.
- , ed. *The Great Fairy Tale Tradition: from Straparola to Basile to the Brothers Grimm*. New York: W. W. Norton, 2001. Print.
- . Introduction. *Zipes Oxford Companion* xv-xxxi.
- , ed. *The Oxford Companion to Fairy Tales: the Western Fairy Tale Tradition from Medieval to Modern*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2000. Print.
- , ed. *Victorian Fairy Tales: the Revolt of the Fairies and Elves*. 1987. New York: Routledge, 1991. Print.